

Social Philosophy & Policy

The Good Life and the Human Good

CONTENTS

L. W. SUMNER	Two Theories of the Good	1
LAWRENCE C. BECKER	Good Lives: Prolegomena	15
AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY	The Advantages of Moral Diversity	38
JOHN KEKES	On There Being Some Limits to Morality	63
WARREN QUINN	Rationality and the Human Good	81
JUDITH JARVIS THOMSON	On Some Ways in Which a Thing Can Be Good	96
JAMES GRIFFIN	The Human Good and the Ambitions of Consequentialism	118
JULIA ANNAS	The Good Life and the Good Lives of Others	133
THOMAS HURKA	Virtue as Loving the Good	149
SHELLY KAGAN	The Limits of Well-Being	169
FRANK I. MICHELMAN	Legalism and Humankind	190

Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor: Ellen Frankel Paul

Associate Editors: Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

Managing Editor: Harry Dolan

Social Philosophy and Policy Center

Editorial Board

David Braybrooke
Dalhousie University

Baruch Brody
Rice University

James Buchanan
*Center for Study of Public Choice,
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman
Yale University

Maurice Cranston
London School of Economics

Jack Douglas
*University of California,
San Diego*

Richard Epstein
University of Chicago Law School

James Fishkin
University of Texas, Austin

Antony Flew
Social Philosophy and Policy Center

Charles Fried
Harvard Law School

Martin Golding
Duke University

John Gray
Jesus College, Oxford University

Gilbert Harman
Princeton University

Seymour Martin Lipset
Stanford University

Eric Mack
Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield
Harvard University

Wallace Matson
University of California, Berkeley

Jan Narveson
University of Waterloo

Robert Nozick
Harvard University

Nicholas Rescher
University of Pittsburgh

David Sidorsky
Columbia University

Hillel Steiner
University of Manchester

James Q. Wilson
*University of California,
Los Angeles*

Leland B. Yeager
Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Editorial Office: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information: See inside back cover.

Copyright © 1992 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/92 \$5.00+ .00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

CONTRIBUTORS

L. W. Sumner is Professor and Chair at the Department of Philosophy, University of Toronto. He was educated at the University of Toronto and Princeton University, and is the author of *Abortion and Moral Theory* (1981) and *The Moral Foundation of Rights* (1987). He is currently working on a book on the nature of welfare and its place in ethical theory.

Lawrence C. Becker is Professor of Philosophy and Kenan Professor of Humanities at the College of William and Mary. He is the editor, with Charlotte Becker, of the forthcoming *Encyclopedia of Ethics*, and the author of several books, including *Property Rights* (1977; 1980) and *Reciprocity* (1986; 1990).

Amélie Oksenberg Rorty is the Matina Horner Visiting Distinguished Professor at Radcliffe College and Professor of Philosophy at Mt. Holyoke College. She has published widely in the philosophy of mind, the history of philosophy, and moral psychology. Many of her articles appeared in a collection, *Mind in Action* (1988). She has edited *The Identities of Persons* (1976), *Essays on Aristotle's Ethics* (1980), and *Essays on Aristotle's Poetics* (1992). She was the recipient of a John S. Guggenheim Fellowship in 1990–91.

John Kekes is Professor of Philosophy and Public Policy at the State University of New York at Albany. He is the author of *A Justification of Rationality* (1976), *The Nature of Philosophy* (1980), *The Examined Life* (1987), *Moral Tradition and Individuality* (1989), and *Facing Evil* (1990).

Warren Quinn served as Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the Philosophy Department at the University of California, Los Angeles. He wrote numerous articles on topics in meta-ethics, ethical theory, and normative ethics. Some of his papers appeared in *The Philosophical Review*, *Philosophy & Public Affairs*, and *Philosophical Studies*.

Judith Jarvis Thomson is Laurance S. Rockefeller Professor of Philosophy at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Her essay in the present volume is part of a longer work in progress on the metaphysics of moral requirement. Her earlier books include *Acts and Other Events* (1977), *Rights, Restitution, and Risk* (1986), and *The Realm of Rights* (1990).

CONTRIBUTORS

James Griffin is Reader in Philosophy, Oxford University, and Fellow of Keble College. He is the author of *Well-Being* (1986) and is now working on various subjects, including moral realism, consequentialism, and human rights.

Julia Annas is Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University. She has published widely in ancient philosophy and is the author of *An Introduction to Plato's Republic* (1981), *Aristotle's Metaphysics: Books M and N* (1976), and (with Jonathan Barnes) *The Modes of Scepticism: Ancient Texts and Modern Interpretations* (1985). She is working on a book on ancient ethical theory. For ten years she has been the editor of *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*.

Thomas Hurka is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Calgary. His main research interest is moral theory, especially perfectionist moralities. He has published articles in *Ethics*, *The Journal of Philosophy*, *Mind*, and *Social Theory and Practice*; his book *Perfectionism* is forthcoming from Oxford University Press. He is also part of a multidisciplinary research team working on the ethics of global warming. Since 1989, he has written a weekly philosophy column for *The Globe and Mail*, Canada's national newspaper.

Shelly Kagan is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He works primarily on the foundations of normative ethics and is currently writing an introductory textbook for this area. His first book, *The Limits of Morality* (1989), attacked the widely held view that there are limits to the sacrifices that morality can demand of us, and that certain acts are morally off-limits, even if performing them would lead to better results overall. His essay in this collection is an initial foray into a larger project on the nature of well-being. He has taught previously at the University of Pittsburgh.

Frank I. Michelman is Professor of Law, Harvard University. He has published extensively on constitutional law, property law, general legal theory, and connections among these fields and those of political and moral theory.

*The editors deeply regret
the death of Warren Quinn on September 18, 1991.
This volume is dedicated to his memory.*