

THE JOURNAL OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

Volume 53:1 • Spring 2025

A Journal of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics • www.aslme.org



55 Academic Research Integrity Investigations Must be Independent, Fair, and Timely
Matthew Schrag, Kevin Patrick, and Elisabeth Bik

59 Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public
Ivan Oransky and Adam Marcus

64 Segregate Assessment of Data Validity from the More Complex Issue of Fraud
Garret A. FitzGerald

67 Fostering Accountability: How Institutions Can Promote Research Integrity with Practical Tools and Knowledge
Julia L. Briskin and C.K. Gunsalus

SYMPOSIUM

Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity

GUEST EDITED BY Holly Fernandez Lynch, Emily A. Largent, Matthew S. McCoy, and Steven Joffe

1 Advancing Trust in Science: Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity
Holly Fernandez Lynch, Emily A. Largent, Matthew S. McCoy, and Steven Joffe

6 An Insider's Perspective on How to Reduce Fraud in the Social Sciences
Max H. Bazerman

11 Misconduct Detection — Evolving Methods & Lessons from 15 Years of Scientific Image Sleuthing
Paul S. Brookes

22 Retractions of COVID-19-Related Research Publications During and After the Pandemic
Ellie Rose Mattoon, Arturo Casadevall, and Ferric C. Fang

29 Systematic Reviewers Have an Obligation to Promote Research Integrity
Lisa Bero

35 Research Misconduct and Medical Journals
Howard Bauchner, Robert Steinbrook, and Rita F. Redberg

41 Managing Multi-Institutional Jurisdiction in Cases of Research Misconduct
Leslie Thornton, Devin Cohen, Mark Barnes, and Barbara E. Bierer

47 Defamation Claims Arising from Research Misconduct Cases: Best Practices for Institutions
Nathaniel Jaffe, Minal Caron, Lauren Walsh, Barbara Bierer, and Mark Barnes

Plus more inside...

ISSN: 1073-1105

 **CAMBRIDGE**
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics (JLME): Material published in *The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* (JLME) contributes to the educational mission of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME), covering public health, health disparities, patient safety and quality of care, and biomedical science and research, and more.

The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics is published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics.

ISSN: 1073-1105

E-ISSN: 1748-720X

Copyright © 2025, the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics. All rights reserved. No portion of the contents may be reproduced in any form without written permission from the publisher

Printed in the USA by The Sheridan Group

Editorial Office

Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1704, Boston, MA 02215 USA
Phone: 617-262-4990; Fax: 617-437-7596
E-mail: publications@aslme.org

Letters to the Editors: Comments on articles in the Journal should be addressed to the Editor at the editorial office or emailed to publications@aslme.org

Submission Guidelines: For submission guidelines, please contact the editorial office at publications@aslme.org or go to cambridge.org/jlme/submit

Supplements: Initial inquiries should be directed to the Editor at the editorial office or emailed to publications@aslme.org

Subscribe or Recommend a Subscription to your Librarian: Go to cambridge.org/jlme/subscribe or email subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada or Mexico) or journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere).

Copyright and Permissions: To request permission for republishing, reproducing, or distributing material from this journal, please visit the desired article at cambridge.org/jlme and click "Rights & Permissions." For additional information, please see cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

Advertising and Reprints: Contact ad_sales@cambridge.org. Acceptance of advertising in this journal in no way implies endorsement of the advertised product or service by Cambridge University Press, the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics or the journal editor(s). We reserve the right to reject any advertising it deems as inappropriate for this journal.

Member Subscription Information: American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics member inquiries, change of address, back issues, claims, and membership renewal requests should be addressed to Membership Director, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1704, Boston, MA 02215; telephone: (617) 262-4990. Requests for replacement issues should be made within six months of the missing or damaged issue. Beyond six months and at the request of the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, the publisher will supply replacement issues when losses have been sustained in transit and when the reserve stock permits.

Claims or Change of Address for Non-Members: Should be directed to subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada or Mexico) or journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere).

Discover the Entire JLME Back Archive: cambridge.org/jlme/read

THE JOURNAL OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

VOLUME 53:1 • SPRING 2025

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Aaron S. Kesselheim, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.

INTERIM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Katie Kenney Johnson, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, USA

INTERIM MANAGING EDITOR

Nicole Gustas

BOARD OF EDITORS

Jacob M. Appel, MD, MFA,
MPH, MPhil
Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai

Kiarash Aramesh, MD, PhD
*The James F. Drane Bioethics Institute,
PennWest University*

Sydney A. Axson, PhD, MPH,
MHS, RN
Pennsylvania State University

Leila Barraza, JD, MPH
*University of Arizona, Mel and Enid
Zuckerman College of Public Health*

Benjamin A. Barsky, JD, PhD
UC Law San Francisco
Nir Ben-Moshe, PhD
University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign

Barbara Pfeffer Billauer, BS, JD
The Institute of World Politics

Lori Bruce, DPhil, HEC-C
Yale University

Daniel Buchman, MSW, PhD
Centre for Addiction and Mental Health

Eric Caplan, PhD
Wesleyan University

Stephanie Solomon Cargill, PhD,
MSPH
Albany Medical College

Anthony Ciolli, LL.M., JD, MBE
Supreme Court of the Virgin Islands

Brietta Clark, JD
LMU Loyola Law School

Ellen Wright Clayton, MD, JD
Vanderbilt University School of Medicine

Carl H. Coleman, JD
Seton Hall University School of Law

Jonathan Crane, MPhil, PhD
Emory University

Parker Crutchfield, PhD
*Western Michigan University Homer Stryker
M.D. School of Medicine*

Peter DePergola, PhD, ThDc, MTS,
HEC-C, CT
*University of Massachusetts Chan Medical
School – Baystate*

Doron Dorfman, LL.B., LL.M., JSM, JSD
Seton Hall Law School

Jennifer Dvorak, PhD
Canterbury Christ Church University

Rachel Fabi, PhD
SUNY Upstate Medical University

William Feldman, MD, DPhil, MPH
Harvard Medical School

Linda C. Fentiman, JD, LL.M.
*Elisabeth Haub School of Law,
Pace University*

Jill A. Fisher, PhD
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Jacqueline Fox, JD, LL.M.
University of South Carolina

Barry Furrow, JD
Drexel University Earle Mack School of Law

Ezra Gabbay, MD, MS, FACP
Weill Cornell Medicine

Lance Gable, JD, MPH
Wayne State University Law School

Rupali Gandhi, MD, JD
Advocate Children's Hospital

Jeremy Garrett, PhD
Children's Mercy Bioethics Center

Roy Gilbar, LL.B., LL.M., PhD
*School of Law, Netanya Academic College,
Israel*

Al O. Giwa, LL.B., MD, MBA, MBE
*Cincinnati VAMC/University of Cincinnati
College of Medicine*

Melissa Goldstein, JD
*George Washington University Milken
Institute School of Public Health*

Lawrence O. Gostin, JD, LLD (Hon.)
*Georgetown University Law Center,
Johns Hopkins University*

Jed Adam Gross, JD, MPhil
University Health Network

Meghan Halley, PhD, MPH
*Stanford University Center for
Biomedical Ethics*

Ann M. Heesters, PhD
University Health Network

Blake Hereth, PhD
*Western Michigan University Homer Stryker,
MD, School of Medicine*

Laura Hermer, JD, LL.M.
Mitchell Hamline School of Law

James G. Hodge, Jr., JD, LL.M.
*Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law,
Arizona State University*

Sharona Hoffman, JD, LL.M., SJD
*Case Western Reserve University School of
Law*

Dana Howard, PhD
The Ohio State University

Ana Smith Iltis, PhD
Wake Forest University

Louise King, MD, JD
Brigham and Women's Hospital

Peter Koch, PhD
Villanova University

Aaron Levine, MPhil, PhD
School of Public Policy, Georgia Tech

Abigail E. Lowe, PhD
*College of Public Health, University of
Nebraska Medical Center*

Susanna Marinelli, JD, PhD
*School of Law, Polytechnic University of
Marche, Italy*

Wendy K. Mariner, JD, LLM, MPH
Boston University School of Public Health

Matthew McCoy, PhD
University of Pennsylvania

Maxwell J. Mehlman, JD
Case Western Reserve University

Benjamin Mason Meier, JD, LLM, PhD
University of North Carolina — Chapel Hill

Eric M. Meslin, PhD
*University of Toronto Dalla Lana School of
Public Health*

Somayeh Momenyan, PhD
University of British Columbia

E. Haavi Morreim, JD, PhD
University of Tennessee College of Medicine

Jean O'Connor, JD, MPH, DrPH
Econometrica, Inc.

Christopher Ogolla, MPH, JD, LLM
*Barry University Dwayne O. Andreas School
of Law*

Anthony W. Orlando, PhD
California State University, Pomona

Efthimos Parasidis, JD, MBE, BA
Ohio State University

Wendy E. Parmet, JD
Northeastern University School of Law

Govind Persad, PhD, JD
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Jordan Potter, PhD
Community Health Network

Marc A Rodwin, JD, PhD
Suffolk University Law School

Jason L. Schwartz, PhD, MBE
Yale School of Public Health

Scott Schweikart, JD, MBE
American Medical Association

Michael Sinha, JD, MPH
Saint Louis University School of Law

Hunter Jackson Smith, MPH, MBE
*DoD Global Emerging Infections
Surveillance Branch*

Stephe Smith, JD, PhD
Cardiff University

Daniel P. Sulmasy, OFM, MD, PhD
Georgetown University

Michael R Ulrich, JD, MPH
Boston University School of Public Health

Gvidas Urbonas, PhD
Lithuanian University of Health Sciences

Liza Vertinsky, PhD, JD
*University of Maryland Francis King Carey
School of Law*

Steven D. Waldman, JD, MBA
Society for Pain Practice Management

Lindsay F. Wiley, JD, MPH
University of California — Los Angeles

Susan M. Wolf, JD
University of Minnesota Law School

Y. Tony Yang, ScD, LLM, MPH
The George Washington University

Ruqaijah Yearby, MPH, JD
*Moritz College of Law, The Ohio State
University*

Rocksheng Zhong, MD, MHS
University of Texas Medical Branch

THE JOURNAL OF
LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

Volume 53:1 • Spring 2025

Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity

Guest Edited by Holly Fernandez Lynch, Emily A. Largent, Matthew S. McCoy,
and Steven Joffe

Symposium Articles

- 1 Advancing Trust in Science: Institutional Obligations to Promote Research Integrity**
Holly Fernandez Lynch, Emily A. Largent, Matthew S. McCoy, and Steven Joffe
- 6 An Insider's Perspective on How to Reduce Fraud in the Social Sciences**
Max H. Bazerman
- 11 Misconduct Detection — Evolving Methods & Lessons from 15 Years of Scientific Image Sleuthing**
Paul S. Brookes
- 22 Retractions of COVID-19-Related Research Publications During and After the Pandemic**
Ellie Rose Mattoon, Arturo Casadevall, and Ferric C. Fang
- 29 Systematic Reviewers Have an Obligation to Promote Research Integrity**
Lisa Bero
- 35 Research Misconduct and Medical Journals**
Howard Bauchner, Robert Steinbrook, and Rita F. Redberg
- 41 Managing Multi-Institutional Jurisdiction in Cases of Research Misconduct**
Leslie Thornton, Devin Cohen, Mark Barnes, and Barbara E. Bierer
- 47 Defamation Claims Arising from Research Misconduct Cases: Best Practices for Institutions**
Nathaniel Jaffe, Minal Caron, Lauren Walsh, Barbara Bierer, and Mark Barnes
- 55 Academic Research Integrity Investigations Must be Independent, Fair, and Timely**
Matthew Schrag, Kevin Patrick, and Elisabeth Bik
- 59 Why Universities Should Make Misconduct Reports Public**
Ivan Oransky and Adam Marcus
- 64 Segregate Assessment of Data Validity from the More Complex Issue of Fraud**
Garret A. Fitzgerald
- 67 Fostering Accountability: How Institutions Can Promote Research Integrity with Practical Tools and Knowledge**
Julia L. Briskin and C.K. Gunsalus
- 74 The Need for Prospective Integrity Standards for the Use of Generative AI in Research**
Kayte Spector-Bagdady

Independent Articles

- 80 **Folsom Transplant Blues: What is Wrong With Offering the Incarcerated Shorter Sentences for Donating Organs and Bone Marrow?**
Andreas Albertsen and Jens Damgaard Thaysen
- 87 **Commentary**
A Pound of Flesh: The Complex Demands of Incarcerated Individuals Seeking Sentence Reduction
Rachel E. Sweeney
- 89 **Origin of “Conscientious Objection” in Health Care: How Care Denials Became Enshrined into Law Because of Abortion**
Christian Fiala, Joyce Arthur, and Amelia Martzke
- 103 **Commentary**
How Catholic Health Systems Made “Conscientious Objection” Unconscionable
Lori Freedman and Maryani Palupy Rasidjan
- 106 **Genome Editing in Medicine: A Scoping Review of Ethical, Bioethical, and Medico-Legal Implications**
Filippo Gibelli, Giovanna Ricci, and Paolo Bailo
- 115 **Global Legal Environment for LGBTQ+ Sexuality and Public Health**
Matthew M. Kavanagh, Varsha Srivatsan, Florence Riako Anam, Ludo Bok, Luis Gil Abinader, Agrata Sharma, Catherine Grant, Yu Wei Chen, and Sharonann Lynch
- 134 **Commentary**
The Advantages of Scientific Legal Mapping
Scott Burris
- 137 **FDA Advisory Committee Review of Supplemental Indications and Reasons for Non-Approval, 2008-2022**
Audrey D. Zhang, Nikhil Chaudhry, Reshma Ramachandran, Joseph S. Ross, and Jason L. Schwartz
- 145 **Commentary**
What Can We Learn from Patient Input at FDA Advisory Committee Meetings?
Leah Z. Rand and Daniel Eisenkraft Klein
- 147 **Negotiating Medicare Drug Prices: A New Attempt to Control Purchase Prices**
Marc A. Rodwin
- 158 **Patent Thickets and Product Hops: Challenges and Opportunities for Legislative Reform**
William B. Feldman
- 164 **Commentary**
The Innovation/Access Tradeoff, Part 1000
Michael A. Carrier

Columns

- 168 **Health Policy Portal**
Certification Marks for Supporting Generic Drug Quality
Lars Lindgren, Aaron S. Kesselheim, and S. Sean Tu

- 171 ***Public Health and the Law***
Legal Underpinnings of the Great Vaccine Debate of 2025
James G. Hodge, Jr.
- 176 ***Teaching Health Law***
Training Bioethics Professionals in AI Ethics: A Framework
Etienne Aucoin and Alexei Grinbaum
- 184 ***Global Health Law***
Strengthening Global Health Security Under the Biden-Harris Administration
Loyce Pace and Susan C. Kim

Student Writing Contest Winner

- 188 **Plea Bargains as Drivers of Incarceration-Related Health Outcomes**
Riley Smith

Letters

- 197 **Comment on “Vaccine Procurement: The Changes Needed to Close Access Gaps and Achieve Health Equity in Routine and Pandemic Settings”**
Hinpetch Daungsupawong and Viroj Wiwanitkit
- 198 **Response to Comment**
Shawn H.E. Harmon, Janice E. Graham, and Ksenia Kholina