

# BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory  
with open peer commentary  
Volume 36 | Issue 4 | August 2013 | ISSN: 0140-525X

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editors

Paul Bloom  
Barbara L. Finlay

**URL:** <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

**E-mail:** [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Journals Department  
Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of The Americas  
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

## Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

## Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

## Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin  
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## Editorial Board

### *Affective Neuroscience*

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

### *Atypical Neurodevelopment*

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

### *Behavioral Neurogenetics*

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

### *Cognitive and Decision Sciences*

Nick Chater/University College London

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

### *Cognitive Neuroscience*

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

### *Evolution of Brain and Cognition*

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

### *Evolution of Cognition*

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

### *Philosophy of Science*

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

### *Primate Cognition*

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

### *Social Cognition*

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

### *Social Cognitive Neuroscience*

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

### *Vision, Language and Computation*

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

## FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2013. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 36 (2013) for *institutions* is US \$1288.00 for print and online and US \$1055.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £759.00 for print and online and UK £624.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$374.00 for print and online and US \$337.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £219.00 for print and online and UK £199 for online only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$250.00 (UK £124.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.org](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org); in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk). *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

**Institutional subscribers:** Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

---

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 36:4 August 2013

<b>Pickering, M. J. &amp; Garrod, S.</b> An integrated theory of language production and comprehension	329
<b>Open Peer Commentary:</b>	
<b>Aitken, K. J.</b> It ain't what you do (it's the way that you do it)	347
<b>Alario, F.-X. &amp; Hamamé, C. M.</b> Evidence for, and predictions from, forward modeling in language production	348
<b>Bowers, J.</b> How do forward models work? And why would you want them?	349
<b>Chang, F., Kidd, E. &amp; Rowland, C. F.</b> Prediction in processing is a by-product of language learning	350
<b>de Ruiter, J. P. &amp; Cummins, C.</b> Forward modelling requires intention recognition and non-impooverished predictions	351
<b>Dell, G. S.</b> Cascading and feedback in interactive models of production: A reflection of forward modeling?	351
<b>Dick, A. S. &amp; Andric, M.</b> The neurobiology of receptive-expressive language interdependence	352
<b>Dove, G.</b> Intermediate representations exclude embodiment	353
<b>Echterhoff, G.</b> The role of action in verbal communication and shared reality	354
<b>Festman, J.</b> The complexity-cost factor in bilingualism	355
<b>Fowler, C. A.</b> An ecological alternative to a "sad response": Public language use transcends the boundaries of the skin	356
<b>Hartsuiker, R. J.</b> Are forward models enough to explain self-monitoring? Insights from patients and eye movements	357
<b>Hickok, G.</b> Predictive coding? Yes, but from what source?	358
<b>Howes, C., Healey, P.G.T., Eshghi, A. &amp; Hough, J.</b> "Well, that's one way": Interactivity in parsing and production	359
<b>Jaeger, T. F. &amp; Ferreira, V.</b> Seeking predictions from a predictive framework	359
<b>Johnson, M. A., Turk-Browne, N. B. &amp; Goldberg, A. E.</b> Prediction plays a key role in language development as well as processing	360
<b>Kashima, Y., Bekkering, H. &amp; Kashima, E. S.</b> Communicative intentions can modulate the linguistic perception-action link	361
<b>Kreysa, H.</b> Preparing to be punched: Prediction may not always require inference of intentions	362
<b>Krishnan, S.</b> A developmental perspective on the integration of language production and comprehension	363
<b>Laurent, R., Moulin-Frier, C., Bessière, P., Schwartz, J.-L. &amp; Diard, J.</b> Integrate, yes, but <i>what</i> and <i>how</i> ? A computational approach of sensorimotor fusion in speech	364
<b>Mani, N. &amp; Huettig, F.</b> Towards a complete multiple-mechanism account of predictive language processing	365
<b>McCauley, S. M. &amp; Christiansen, M. H.</b> Toward a unified account of comprehension and production in language development	366
<b>Meyer, A. S. &amp; Hagoort, P.</b> What does it mean to predict one's own utterances?	367
<b>Mylopoulos, M. I. &amp; Pereplyotchik, D.</b> Is there any evidence for forward modeling in language production?	368
<b>Oppenheim, G. M.</b> Inner speech as a forward model?	369
<b>Pazzaglia, M.</b> Does what you hear predict what you will do and say?	370
<b>Pezzulo, G. &amp; Dindo, H.</b> Intentional strategies that make co-actors more predictable: The case of signaling	371
<b>Rabagliati, H. &amp; Bemis, D. K.</b> Prediction is no panacea: The key to language is in the unexpected	372
<b>Slevc, L. R. &amp; Novick, J. M.</b> Memory and cognitive control in an integrated theory of language processing	373
<b>Strijkers, K., Runnqvist, E., Costa, A. &amp; Holcomb, P.</b> The poor helping the rich: How can incomplete representations monitor complete ones?	374
<b>Trude, A. M.</b> When to simulate and when to associate? Accounting for inter-talker variability in the speech signal	375
<b>Yoon, S. O. &amp; Brown-Schmidt, S.</b> What is the context of prediction?	376
<b>Authors' Response:</b>	
<b>Pickering, M. J. &amp; Garrod, S.</b> Forward models and their implications for production, comprehension, and dialogue	377

**Schilbach, L., Timmermans, B., Reddy, V., Costall, A., Bente, G., Schlicht, T. & Vogeley, K.** Toward a second-person neuroscience

393

**Open Peer Commentary:**

<b>Chakrabarti, B.</b> Parameterising ecological validity and integrating individual differences within second-person neuroscience	414	<b>Ltongo, M. R. &amp; Tsakiris, M.</b> Merging second-person and first-person neuroscience	429
<b>Cummins, F.</b> Social cognition is not a special case, and the dark matter is more extensive than recognized	415	<b>Moore, C. &amp; Paulus, M.</b> A second-person approach cannot explain intentionality in social understanding	430
<b>Cleret de Langavant, L., Jacquemot, C., Bachoud-Lévi, A.-C. &amp; Dupoux, E.</b> The second person in “I”-“you”-“it” triadic interactions	416	<b>Moore, K.</b> Second-person neuroscience: Implications for Wittgensteinian and Vygotskian approaches to psychology	431
<b>Dezecache, G., Conty, L. &amp; Grèzes, J.</b> Social affordances: Is the mirror neuron system involved?	417	<b>Moore, L. &amp; Iacoboni, M.</b> The use of non-interactive scenarios in social neuroscience	432
<b>Dominey, P. F.</b> Reciprocity between second-person neuroscience and cognitive robotics	418	<b>Nephew, B. C.</b> What we can learn from second animal neuroscience	433
<b>Evans, N.</b> On projecting grammatical persons into social neurocognition: A view from linguistics	419	<b>Overgaard, S. &amp; Krueger, J.</b> Social perception and “Spectator Theories” of other minds	434
<b>Froese, T., Iizuka, H. &amp; Ikegami, T.</b> From synthetic modeling of social interaction to dynamic theories of brain-body-environment-body-brain systems	420	<b>Redcay, E., Rice, K. &amp; Saxe, R.</b> Interaction versus observation: A finer look at this distinction and its importance to autism	435
<b>Gallagher, S., Hutto, D. D., Slaby, J. &amp; Cole, J.</b> The brain as part of an enactive system	421	<b>Rietveld, E., de Haan, S. &amp; Denys, D.</b> Social affordances in context: What is it that we are bodily responsive to?	436
<b>Gallotti, M.</b> Why not the first-person plural in social cognition?	422	<b>Sameen, N., Thompson, J. &amp; Carpendale, J. I. M.</b> Further steps toward a second-person neuroscience	437
<b>Gambi, C. &amp; Pickering, M. J.</b> Talking to each other and talking together: Joint language tasks and degrees of interactivity	423	<b>Simpson, E. A. &amp; Ferrari, P. F.</b> Mirror neurons are central for a second-person neuroscience: Insights from developmental studies	438
<b>Gariépy, J.-F., Chang, S. W. C. &amp; Platt, M. L.</b> Brain games: Toward a neuroecology of social behavior	424	<b>Swain, J. E., Konrath, S., Dayton, C. J., Finegood, E. D. &amp; Ho, S. S.</b> Toward a neuroscience of interactive parent–infant dyad empathy	438
<b>Hamilton, A. F. de C.</b> Second person neuroscience needs theories as well as methods	425	<b>Syal, S. &amp; Anderson, A. K.</b> It takes two to talk: A second-person neuroscience approach to language learning	439
<b>Hamon-Hill, C. &amp; Gadbois, S.</b> From the bottom up: The roots of social neuroscience at risk of running dry?	426	<b>Vermeulen, N., Pleyers, G. &amp; Mermillod, M.</b> Second-person social neuroscience: Connections to past and future theories, methods, and findings	440
<b>Krach, S., Müller-Pinzler, L., Westermann, S. &amp; Paulus, F. M.</b> Advancing the neuroscience of social emotions with social immersion	427		
<b>Lewis, C. &amp; Stack, J.</b> A mature second-person neuroscience needs a first-person (plural) developmental foundation	428	<b>Authors’ Response:</b>	
		<b>Schilbach, L., Timmermans, B., Reddy, V., Costall, A., Bente, G., Schlicht, T. &amp; Vogeley, K.</b> A second-person neuroscience in interaction	441

**Errata**

<b>Marewski, J. N. &amp; Hoffrage, U.</b> Processes models, environmental analyses, and cognitive architectures: Quo vadis quantum probability theory? – ERRATUM	463
<b>Fowler, C. A.</b> An ecological alternative to a “sad response”: Public language use transcends the boundaries of the skin – ERRATUM	464