

# Law and History Review

## Law and History Review

---

**Editor**

Christopher Tomlins  
*American Bar Foundation*

**Associate Editor**

Laura Edwards  
*UCLA*

**Managing Editor**

Diane Clay  
*American Bar Foundation*

---

*Law and History Review* (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6975. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

---

© 1999 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

*This journal is printed on acid-free paper.*

# Law and History Review

---

Volume 17, Number 3

Fall 1999

---

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press  
for the American Society for Legal History*

## Editorial Board

David Abraham  
*University of Miami*

William P. Alford  
*Harvard University*

Mary Frances Berry  
*University of Pennsylvania*

Thomas Brennan  
*U.S. Naval Academy*

Martin Chanock  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Elaine Clark  
*University of Michigan,  
Dearborn*

Martha F. Davis  
*NOW Legal Defense,  
New York*

Thomas J. Davis  
*Arizona State University*

Cornelia Dayton  
*University of Connecticut*

Laura Engelstein  
*Princeton University*

Jean-Marie Fecteau  
*Université du Québec  
à Montréal*

Christian G. Fritz  
*University of New Mexico*

Judy Fudge  
*York University, Toronto*

Paul Hyams  
*Cornell University*

Nancy Isenberg  
*University of Northern Iowa*

Bruce Kercher  
*Macquarie University, NSW*

Diane Kirkby  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Michael Klarman  
*University of Virginia*

David Konig  
*Washington University,  
St. Louis*

Mindie Lazarus-Black  
*University of Illinois at  
Chicago*

Kenneth F. Ledford  
*Case Western Reserve  
University*

Brian P. Levack  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Jeanette Neeson  
*York University, Toronto*

Kent Newmyer  
*University of Connecticut*

James P. Oakes  
*Northwestern University*

John V. Orth  
*University of North Carolina*

Steven Pincus  
*University of Chicago*

W. Wesley Puc  
*University of British  
Columbia*

Nicole Hahn Rafter  
*Northeastern University*

Gerry R. Rubin  
*University of Kent,  
Canterbury*

Lucy E. Salyer  
*University of  
New Hampshire*

John Henry Schlegel  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Stephen A. Siegel  
*De Paul University*

Rayman L. Solomon  
*Rutgers University, Camden*

Robin Chapman Stacey  
*University of Washington*

Robert J. Steinfeld  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Emily Z. Tabuteau  
*Michigan State University*

Victor M. Uribe  
*Florida International  
University*

Barbara Y. Welke  
*University of Oregon*

James Q. Whitman  
*Yale University*

Stephen C. Yeazell  
*University of California,  
Los Angeles*

## Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscripts and all general editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611 (tel 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579; e-m <clt@abfn.org>). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to Laura Edwards, Department of History, UCLA, 6265 Bunche Hall, Los Angeles, California 90095-1473 (tel 310 825 3737; fax 310 206 9043; e-m <edwards@history.ucla.edu>). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page <[www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html](http://www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html)>. Please use word processing wherever possible. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

# Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 17, No. 3, Fall 1999

[www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html](http://www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html)

In This Issue v

## Articles

The “Science” of Legal Science: The Model of the Natural Sciences  
in Nineteenth-Century American Legal Education  
Howard Schweber 421

Judges v. Jurors: Courtroom Tensions in Murder Trials and the Law  
of Criminal Responsibility in Nineteenth-Century England  
Martin J. Wiener 467

Indictment for Fun and Profit: A Prosecutor’s Reward at  
Eighteenth-Century Quarter Sessions  
Norma Landau 507

## Forum: The Origins of the Jury

Vicinage and the Antecedents of the Jury  
Mike Macnair 537

### Comments

Biology and the Origins of the English Jury  
Charles Donahue, Jr. 591

Neighbors, Courts, and Kings: Reflections on Michael  
Macnair’s *Vicini*  
Patrick Wormald 597

### Response

Law, Politics, and the Jury  
Mike Macnair 603

## The *LHR* Electronic Resource Page

A New Approach to the Dynamic Organization of Knowledge  
Terence C. Halliday 609

## Book Reviews

*Law and Family in Late Antiquity: The Emperor Constantine’s Marriage  
Legislation*—Judith Evans Grubbs  
reviewed by William Turpin 617

- Clean Hands and Rough Justice: An Investigating Magistrate in Renaissance Italy*—David S. Chambers and Trevor Dean  
 reviewed by Julius Kirshner 619
- Law Reporting in Britain*—Chantal Stebbings, editor  
 reviewed by Louis A. Knafla 621
- Discourse in History, Law and Governance in the Public Career of John Selden, 1610–1635*—Paul Christianson  
 reviewed by John Morrill 623
- Islamic Legal Interpretation: Muftis and Their Fatwas*—Muhammad Khalid Masud, Brinkley Messick, and David S. Powers, editors  
 reviewed by Morris Rossabi 625
- A History of Islamic Legal Theories: An Introduction to Sunni Usul al-Fiqh*—Wael B. Hallaq  
 reviewed by Colin Imber 626
- Sex, Power and Justice: Historical Perspectives on Law in Australia*—Diane Kirkby, editor  
 reviewed by Stephen Robertson 628
- Penitentiaries, Reformatories, and Chain Gangs: Social Theory and the History of Punishment in Nineteenth-Century America*—Mark Colvin  
 reviewed by Michael Meranze 630
- The Hidden Holmes: His Theory of Torts in History*—David Rosenberg, and *Holmes and Frankfurter: Their Correspondence, 1912–1934*—Robert M. Mennel and Christine L. Compston, editors  
 reviewed by Catharine Wells 632
- Gender and the Politics of Welfare Reform: Mothers' Pensions in Chicago, 1911–1929*—Joanne L. Goodwin  
 reviewed by Gwendolyn Mink 635
- Maternal Justice: Miriam Van Waters and the Female Reform Tradition, 1887–1974*—Estelle B. Freedman  
 reviewed by David S. Tanenhaus 636
- Enforcing Civil Rights: Race Discrimination and the Department of Justice*—Brian K. Landsberg  
 reviewed by Paul D. Moreno 638
- A Critique of Adjudication: Fin de Siècle*—Duncan Kennedy  
 reviewed by John Henry Schlegel 640