

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXI NUMBERS 2&3 1995

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST  
IN HEALTH CARE

SYMPOSIUM ARTICLES

Sidney D. Watson  
Marc A. Rodwin

Judith F. Daar  
Bernard M. Dickens

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Jody Weisberg Menon

J. Mark Appleberry

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS AND THE  
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer & Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint ASLME/Boston University School of Law editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or the law school.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: (617) 353-2912.

Subscription or membership correspondence should be addressed to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Business telephone: (617) 262-4990. Requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material should be addressed to the Director of Publications, at the preceding address.

Subscription rates are \$170.00 per year for institutions; and \$90.00 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. Foreign subscribers should remit an additional \$30.00 per year for foreign postage. Members of ASLME receive the JOURNAL as part of their annual dues (please see details in the back matter).

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of ASLME provided that notice of such a claim is received at ASLME's subscription office *within one month of receipt of the next issue published*. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$25.00 (members) and \$35.00 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$40.00 (members) and \$50.00 (nonmembers).

Articles published in the JOURNAL are indexed in *LEXIS*, *WESTLAW*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (non-profit organization).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *President, University*

*Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

JACK BEERMANN, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

DAÑIEL J. FREEHLING, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS**

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President*

SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., *President-Elect*

STEVEN H. MILES, M.D., *Secretary*

ELLEN WRIGHT CLAYTON, M.D., J.D., *Treasurer*

KAREN H. ROTHENBERG, J.D., M.P.A., *Immediate Past President*

BENJAMIN MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Director*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD OF EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER

**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**

### DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

**Michael Vasko, M.A.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

### CIRCULATION MANAGER

**T. Patrick Rewalt**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

### EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

**Benjamin Moulton, J.D., M.P.H.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

## EDITORS

**Michael Baram, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**  
Boston College Law School

**Henry Beyer, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M.Hyg.**  
Harvard University School of Public Health

**Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M.**  
Dunn & Auton  
Boston, Massachusetts

**Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**  
Harvard Medical School

**Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

**Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**  
Duke University School of Law

**Nathan Hershey, J.D.**  
University of Pittsburgh Grad. School of Public Health

**Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**  
Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

**Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Cornell University Prog. on Science Technology & Society

**Timothy S. Jost, J.D.**  
Ohio State University College of Law

**Jay Katz, M.D.**  
Yale University Law School

**Renée M. Landers, J.D.**  
Boston College Law School

**Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**  
New York University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**  
Boston University School of Medicine

**Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**  
University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

**Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

**Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Indiana University

**Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**  
Founder, American Society of Law & Medicine

**E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**  
New York Law School

**Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.**  
Medical College of Wisconsin

**Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**  
Tufts University

**Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.**  
University of Michigan Grad. School of Business Admin.

**Paul R. Tremblay**  
Boston College Law School

**David G. Warren, J.D.**  
Duke University Medical Center

**Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**  
St. Francis Central Hospital  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

**James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
Monumental Life Insurance Co. of AGON

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

**Professor Koichi Bai**  
Director, Institute of Medical Humanities  
Kitasato University School of Medicine  
Japan

**Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Göttingen  
Germany

**Professor Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Faculties of Law and Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Dr. S.S. Fluss**  
Chief, Health Legislation  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Prof. Dr. Dieter Giesen**  
Inst. for International, Foreign and Comparative Law  
Freie Universität Berlin  
Germany

**Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeal  
Supreme Court of New South Wales  
Australia

**Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen**  
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**Professor Amos Shapira**  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

**Professor P.D.G. Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
New Zealand

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director, Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS  
1994–1995

## EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

David T. Morris

## EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Felecia R. Wein

## MANAGING EDITOR

Daniel McCarthy

## PROJECTS EDITOR

Ellen M. Crowley

## SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Andrew E. Seewald

## ARTICLES EDITORS

Nicole E. Dale  
Brian F. Freyermuth  
Jeffrey M. Holoubek  
Stephanie M. Pitcher

## ASLME DEVELOPMENTS EDITOR

Jeffrey S. Trey

## CASE & NOTES EDITORS

Derek A. Cohen  
David R. Feniger  
Natascha S. George

Patrick R. Jones  
Susan Lee

Erin B. Newman  
Ross D. Silverman  
Jody M. Weisberg

## THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

J. Mark Appleberry  
Klio A. Arvanitidis  
Claire E. Breaux  
Patricia Cashman  
Jessica L. Ferrell

Stacy J. Grossman  
Allison R. Handel  
Nicholas J. Maglio  
Michael A. Moore  
Moy N. Ogilvie

Andrea J. Platner  
Paul C. Smith  
Michael D. Sweet  
Ukwani O. Udo  
Aaron C. Wong

## STAFF MEMBERS

Jeannie M. Atwood  
Victoria T. Ayer  
Ira A. Azulay  
Jeffrey W. Barringer  
Mia S. Blackler  
Regina A. Bigay  
Brenda A. Buan  
William D. DeVaul  
Katherine E. Ellsworth  
Angelo Evangelou  
William O. Fabbri

Elizabeth A. Frohlich  
J. Vladimir Galiano  
Joel J. Garris  
Anthony W. Graziano  
Katherine W. Ho  
Lorraine E. Jones  
Daniel J. Levy  
Katy C. Li  
John J. Limb  
Michael M. Lin  
Jessica Miller  
Sharon Miller

Mark K. Molloy  
Christina L. Paradiso  
Urvashi R. Paul  
Thomas M. Rodrigues  
Nina M. Sas  
Joseph Salama  
David B. Summer  
Ashley C. Stanley  
Sandra D. Strassner  
J. Page Turney  
Guido S. Weber

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

The American Journal of Law & Medicine  
is pleased to introduce its  
Student Board of Editors for  
1995–1996

## EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Elizabeth A. Frohlich

## EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Nina M. Sas

## MANAGING EDITORS

Katy C. Li  
Guido S. Weber

## PROJECTS EDITOR

Victoria T. Ayer

## SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Lorraine E. Jones

## ARTICLES EDITORS

William O. Fabbri  
Jessica Miller  
Thomas M. Rodrigues  
J. Page Turney

## CASE & NOTES EDITORS

Joel J. Garris  
Katherine W. Ho  
Urvashi R. Paul  
Joseph Salama  
Ashley C. Stanley

## THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Jeannie M. Atwood  
Ira A. Azulay  
Jeffrey W. Barringer  
Mia S. Blackler  
Regina A. Bigay  
Brenda A. Buan

William D. DeVaul  
Katherine E. Ellsworth  
Angelo Evangelou  
Vladimir V. Galliano  
Anthony W. Graziano  
Daniel J. Levy  
John J. Limb

Michael M. Lin  
Sharon Miller  
Mark K. Malloy  
Christina L. Paradiso  
David B. Summer  
Sandra D. Strassner

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXI NUMBERS 2&3 1995

## Conflicts of Interest in Health Care

### ARTICLES

MEDICAID PHYSICIAN PARTICIPATION: 191 Sidney D. Watson  
PATIENTS, POVERTY, AND PHYSICIAN  
SELF-INTEREST

MEDICAL FUTILITY AND IMPLICATIONS 221 Judith F. Daar  
FOR PHYSICIAN AUTONOMY

STRAINS IN THE FIDUCIARY METAPHOR: 241 Marc A. Rodwin  
DIVIDED PHYSICIAN LOYALTIES AND  
OBLIGATIONS IN A CHANGING HEALTH  
CARE SYSTEM

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN 259 Bernard M. Dickens  
CANADIAN HEALTH CARE LAW

### NOTES AND COMMENTS

ADVERSARIAL MEDICAL AND 281 Jody Weisberg Menon  
SCIENTIFIC TESTIMONY AND LAY  
JURORS: A PROPOSAL FOR MEDICAL  
MALPRACTICE REFORM

NEGLIGENT INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL 301 J. Mark Appleberry  
DISTRESS: A FOCUS ON RELATIONSHIPS

ANNOUNCEMENTS 323

Copyright 1995 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notifies the Director of Publications of ASLME; (2) the author(s) and the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyrights is affixed to each copy.