

THE
HISTORICAL
JOURNAL



VOLUME 37, 1 MARCH 1994

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORS

J. S. MORRILL, PH.D.
J. STEINBERG, PH.D.

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

Cambridge members

C. M. ANDREW, PH.D.
PROFESSOR D. E. D. BEALES, LITT.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR T. C. W. BLANNING, PH.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR W. O. CHADWICK, O.M., K.B.E., D.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR P. F. CLARKE, LITT.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR PATRICK COLLINSON, M.A., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR SIR GEOFFREY ELTON, LITT.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR D. K. FIELDHOUSE, LITT.D.
V. A. C. GATRELL, PH.D.
PROFESSOR SIR HARRY HINSLEY, M.A., F.B.A.
H. M. PELLING, LITT.D., F.B.A.
PROFESSOR Q. R. D. SKINNER, M.A., F.B.A.

American members

PROFESSOR H. JAMES (Princeton University), M.A., PH.D.
PROFESSOR GEOFFREY PARKER (University of Illinois), M.A., LITT.D., F.B.A.

The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 37, 1994 (which includes postage) is £89.00 (US\$174.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions, £50.00 (US\$75.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals ordering direct from the Press and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts cost £24.00 net (US\$45.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller or to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU or, in the USA, Canada and Mexico, Cambridge University Press, The Journals Department, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211. EC subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo. THE HISTORICAL JOURNAL (ISSN 0018-246x) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. Copies of the journal for subscribers in the USA, Canada and Mexico are sent by air to New York to arrive with minimum delay. Second class postage paid at New York, NY and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: send address changes in USA, Canada and Mexico to *The Historical Journal*, Cambridge University Press, 110 Midland Avenue, Port Chester, New York, NY 10573-9864.

Articles appearing in this journal are covered in major abstracting and indexing services including *America: History and Life*, *British Humanities Index*, *Current Contents*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Humanities Abstracts*, *Humanities Index*.

COPYING

This journal is registered with the Copying Clearance Center, 27 Congress St., Salem, Mass. 01970. Organizations in the USA who are also registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per-copy fee of \$5.00. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 0018-246X 94 \$5.00 + .00. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use*, permission should be sought from Cambridge or the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

THE HISTORICAL JOURNAL

VOLUME 37, 1 MARCH 1994

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Diarmaid MacCulloch* Two dons in politics: Thomas Cranmer and Stephen Gardiner, 1503–1533 1
- Susan Holland* Archbishop Abbot and the problem of ‘puritanism’ 23
- John D. Ford* The lawful bonds of Scottish society: the Five Articles of Perth, the Negative Confession and the National Covenant 45
- Jerzy Lukowski* Recasting Utopia: Montesquieu, Rousseau and the Polish constitution of 3 May 1791 65
- Michael Durey* The Dublin Society of United Irishmen and the politics of the Carey–Drennan dispute, 1792–1794 89
- Ian D. Thatcher* Trotsky and *Bor’ba* 113
- Martin Pettey* ‘Temporary Gentlemen’ in the aftermath of the Great War: rank, status and the ex-officer problem 127
- Kevin Ruane* Anthony Eden, British diplomacy and the origins of the Geneva Conference of 1954 153
- Ina Zweiniger-Bargielowska* Rationing, austerity and the Conservative party recovery after 1945 173

HISTORIOGRAPHICAL REVIEWS

- R. W. Scribner* Communalism: universal category or ideological construct? a debate in the historiography of early modern Germany and Switzerland 199
- Antoine Prost* The impact of war on French and German political cultures 209

REVIEW ARTICLES

- R. W. Scribner* Magic, witchcraft and superstition 219
- Conal Condren* The paradoxes of recontextualization in early modern intellectual history 225
- Francis J. Brooks* Text and truth: reading Latin American history 233

OTHER REVIEWS

- Ann Hughes*
Tessa Watt, *Cheap print and popular piety, 1550–1640* 245
- Richard H. Mitchell*
Donald Calman, *The nature and origins of Japanese imperialism: a reinterpretation of the great crisis of 1873* 248
- John Hiden*
Anatol Lieven, *The Baltic revolution. Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania and the path to independence* 250

Published by
The Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press, 1994