

AMERICAN LAW & MEDICINE



VOLUME 5 NUMBER 2 SUMMER 1979

- Foreword: More on Appropriate Decision Making for the Terminally Ill Incompetent Patient John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
- Medical Paternalism or Legal Imperialism: Not the Only Alternatives for Handling *Saikewicz*-type Cases Allen Buchanan, Ph.D.
- A Response to Allen Buchanan's Views on Decision Making for Terminally Ill Incompetents Arnold S. Relman, M.D.
- Report on the Center for Law and Health Sciences Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B.
- Selected Recent Court Decisions John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D.
- Book Review: *Encyclopedia of Bioethics*, Warren T. Reich, Editor in Chief Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.
- Short Reviews of Selected Books and Articles Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.
- Selected Book Releases, Annotated Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
- Patient Compensation Funds: Legislative Responses to the Medical Malpractice Crisis Elizabeth D. Schrero

Published by the American Society of Law & Medicine

Editorial support provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE was founded in response to the need for a scholarly yet pragmatic publication encompassing all aspects of medicolegal relations. The JOURNAL seeks to provide a broad perspective on our complex health care system, to encourage interdisciplinary communication, and to stimulate creative solutions to the pressing medicolegal problems of our time.

In addition to serving as a forum for analyses and proposals in such areas as health law and policy, legal and insurance medicine, and bioethics, the JOURNAL offers a wide variety of pertinent reference materials in these and related areas.

The JOURNAL serves persons from a variety of fields who seek to understand and influence medicolegal developments: physicians, other health care providers, and health administrators; lawyers; health analysts and planners; researchers and educators in health specialties; judges, legislators, and government administrators; insurance officials; consumer advocates; and concerned members of the general public.

The JOURNAL is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine. Editorial support is provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the Editor-in-Chief on behalf of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law schools.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 969-0100, ext. 4301.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, and claims for missing copies, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4992.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$60.00 for 1979). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4992.

Copyright © 1979 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. All or any part of materials appearing in the JOURNAL may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Contents of Current Legal Periodicals*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts in accordance with Permit No. 55855 (Nonprofit Org.).

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 2 SUMMER 1979

BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.
Boston College Law School

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Harvard Medical School
Boston College Law School

MANAGING EDITOR

Jim McMahon, J.D.

ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR

Judith Lesser, J.D.

BOOK & PERIODICAL REVIEW EDITOR

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Mark D. Altschule, M.D.

Harvard University

Donald B. Barkan, M.D., F.A.C.P.

Health Director, Lynn Hospital School
of Nursing

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.

Boston College Law School

Patrick Carroll, J.D.

Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,
Massachusetts Hospital Ass'n

Roger C. Cramton, J.D.

Dean, Cornell Law School

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.

Harvard University

Douglas Danner, J.D.

Trial Attorney

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.

General Counsel, Northwestern
Memorial Hospital

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Harvard Medical School

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

Duke University School of Law

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.

General Counsel, Am. Med. Ass'n

Richard G. Huber, J.D.

Dean, Boston College Law School

Alan K. Kaplan, LL.B., M. Sci.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Georgetown Univ. Medical School

Jay Katz, M.D.

Yale University

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.

New York University School of Law

Frances H. Miller, J.D.

Boston University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch.,

M.R.C.P., D.C.H.

Harvard Medical School; Director,
Genetics Division, Shriver Center

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.

Rutgers Medical School, College of
Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law

Honorable Max Rosenn

United States Court of Appeals

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.

Dean, New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.

Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.

Dean, Tufts Univ. School of
Dental Med.; Past Pres., ADA

Richard E. Speidel, J.D., LL.M.

Dean, Boston University School of Law

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.

Director, Pittsburgh Inst. of Legal
Med.; Coroner, Allegheny County

RESEARCH ASSOCIATES

Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.

Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D.

ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT

Cecily Anne Wells

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

PRESIDENT

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Boston College Law School
Harvard Medical School

FIRST VICE-PRESIDENT

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney and Consultant in Health Law, Boston, Massachusetts
Editor-in-Chief, *American Journal of Law & Medicine*

VICE-PRESIDENT

Sidney Scherlis, M.D.
University of Maryland Medical School

SECRETARY

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch., M.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Harvard Medical School
Director, Genetics Division, Shriver Center

TREASURER

Barry C. Reed, LL.B.
Trial Attorney

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.
Managing Editor, *Medicolegal News*

GENERAL COUNSEL

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 2 SUMMER 1979

FOREWORD

- More on Appropriate Decision Making for the Terminally Ill Incompetent Patient John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A. i

ARTICLE

- Medical Paternalism or Legal Imperialism: Not the Only Alternatives for Handling *Saikewicz*-type Cases Allen Buchanan, Ph.D. 97

CORRESPONDENCE

- A Response to Allen Buchanan's Views on Decision Making for Terminally Ill Incompetents Arnold S. Relman, M.D. 119

GUEST ORGANIZATION

- Report on the Center for Law and Health Sciences Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B. 125

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- Selected Recent Court Decisions John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D. 133
- Book Review: *Encyclopedia of Bioethics*, Warren T. Reich, Editor in Chief Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H. 145
- Short Reviews of Selected Books and Articles Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H. 157
- Selected Book Releases, Annotated Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. 163

NOTES

- Patient Compensation Funds: Legislative Responses to the Medical Malpractice Crisis Elizabeth D. Schrero 175