

# THE CLASH OF CULTURES

*John Frederick Schwaller*

*Florida Atlantic University*

- EMIGRANTS AND SOCIETY: EXTREMADURA AND SPANISH AMERICA IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY.* By Ida Altman. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1989. Pp. 372. \$39.95.)
- COLONIAL IDENTITY IN THE ATLANTIC WORLD, 1500–1800.* Edited by Nicholas Canny and Anthony Pagden. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1987. Pp. 290. \$35.00.)
- CONQUEST OF NEW SPAIN, 1585 REVISION.* By Bernardino de Sahagún, translated by Howard F. Cline, edited with an introduction and notes by S. L. Cline. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1989. Pp. 672. \$50.00.)
- SEXUALITY AND MARRIAGE IN COLONIAL LATIN AMERICA.* Edited by Asunción Lavrin. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989. Pp. 349. \$29.95.)
- SPANISH IMPERIALISM AND THE POLITICAL IMAGINATION.* By Anthony Pagden. (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1990. Pp. 184. \$22.50.)
- INDIAN-RELIGIOUS RELATIONS IN COLONIAL SPANISH AMERICA.* Edited by Susan Ramírez. (Syracuse, N.Y.: Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University, 1989. Pp. 102. \$13.00 paper.)
- REAL HACIENDA Y ECONOMIA EN HISPANOAMERICA, 1541–1820.* By B. H. Slicher van Bath. (Amsterdam: Centrum voor Studie en Documentatie van Latijns Amerika, 1989. Pp. 182. \$17.50 paper.)
- FOOD, CONQUEST, AND COLONIZATION IN SIXTEENTH-CENTURY SPANISH AMERICA.* By John C. Super. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. Pp. 133. \$24.95 cloth, \$11.95 paper.)
- TWO WORLDS: THE INDIAN ENCOUNTER WITH THE EUROPEAN, 1492–1509.* By S. Lyman Tyler. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1988. Pp. 258. \$25.00.)
- ALONSO DE ZORITA, ROYAL JUDGE AND CHRISTIAN HUMANIST, 1512–1585.* By Ralph H. Vigil. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1987. Pp. 382. \$28.00.)
- INDIGENOUS MIGRATION AND SOCIAL CHANGE: THE “FORASTEROS” OF CUZCO, 1570–1720.* By Ann M. Wightman. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1990. Pp. 351. \$47.50.)

With the arrival of 1992, scholarship increasingly tends toward commemorating and investigating the series of events touched off by Christopher Columbus's fateful voyage. The range of books listed here is impressive. They cover everything from eyewitness accounts of the events of the contact of two worlds to the working out of the political theory that the Spanish would develop to regulate their dealings with the newly found lands. The theme common to all the works is the need for individuals and societies to adapt themselves to new situations, challenges, and adversities. Some authors have decried the celebrations of the Quincentenary as finding joy in genocide. To be sure, the arrival of Europeans on American shores carried with it diseases that would nearly annihilate the native Americans, and many of the Europeans viewed the natives as more of a hindrance than an asset. Yet the vitality of the ensuing hybrids and the true enlightenment that resulted from thoughtful persons evaluating the situation tend to redeem the sordid.

### *Exploration and Conquest*

To review this large group of titles, categories must be established to foster meaningful evaluations of the works. A chronological approach seems called for, allowing the themes to develop out of the material itself. Thus Lyman Tyler's *Two Worlds: The Indian Encounter with the European, 1492-1509* seems the best place to begin. This work is itself a hybrid in many ways. Tyler seeks to present not only the European perceptions of the natives but also a reader with selections from the texts of the period, translated into English. The original translations were made by Charles Wonder of the American West Center of the University of Utah. Most of *Two Worlds* consists of selections from Bartolomé de Las Casas, the Columbus journals, and Diego Columbus's biography of his father. Thus directly and indirectly, the materials presented heavily favor the perspective of Father Las Casas.

In *Two Worlds*, Tyler traces several themes through the writings of the period. The European perception of American natives is the principal one. He also focuses on the important role of Queen Isabella in legislating on behalf of the natives. Last, Tyler is concerned about the increasing contrast between the policies and principles developed in Spain and the manner in which they were subsequently implemented and adapted in the New World.

Tyler's attempt to recreate the development of the European view of the natives is to be lauded. The period he covers, 1492 to 1509, is absolutely critical to understanding later events in the New World. *Two Worlds* thus could serve as an important introduction to the themes of the early colony for the nonspecialist, or for those who for one reason or another do not have access to the writings of Las Casas or might seek a "guided tour"

through them. This study will find a ready niche in the classroom, perhaps in conjunction with Lewis Hanke's *Struggle for Justice*.

Sarah Cline undertook the publication of Bernardino de Sahagún's history of the conquest of New Spain in a completely different manner. The story of how this book came to be deserves to be known. Sahagún, a Franciscan friar of sixteenth-century New Spain, devoted most of his adult life to collecting information about the ancient past of the Aztecs. His magnum opus, the *General History or Florentine Codex*, is a twelve-volume encyclopedia (written in Nahuatl with Spanish paraphrases and glosses) of Aztec history, lore, and mythology. The last volume provides an account of the conquest of Mexico that Sahagún wrote based on accounts of the Indian participants, mostly natives of Tlatelolco. The *Florentine Codex* was finished by about 1579. Six years later, he revised the section dealing with the conquest. Although the original Nahuatl manuscript of the *General History* eventually came to reside in Florence (hence the name *Florentine Codex*), the 1585 revision written in Spanish disappeared. An edition of it was published in 1840 by Carlos María Bustamante. As things would turn out, a nineteenth-century copy of the original manuscript ended up in the collection of the Boston Public Library, where it was eventually discovered in 1970 by John Glass.

Howard Cline, historian of Mexico and director of the Hispanic Division of the Library of Congress, had been interested for some time in the writings of Sahagún and in accounts of the conquest. When the manuscript in the Boston Public Library was discovered, he envisioned a monumental publication of all the versions of the Sahagún conquest account, in their originals and also translated into English. By 1971 Cline had completed an initial translation of the 1585 revision, translated the Spanish text of the *Florentine Codex*, and drafted an introduction for his monumental edition. The project was, however, cut short by his death later that year. His wife, Mary Cline, also worked on the draft translation and provided notes to the work. A decade later, the Clines' daughter, Sarah Cline, took over the project and brought the present edition to completion.

*Conquest of New Spain, 1585 Revision* will be a significant aid to scholars interested in the conquest. Although the Nahuatl-English version of the *Florentine Codex* has been available for some time, the 1585 revision of the section on the conquest is unique in providing a slightly different emphasis on the material. As Cline points out, Sahagún's revision was not intended to provide an improved text to aid students in learning Nahuatl while reading an impersonal account of the conquest. Rather, it reflected several major political issues raging within the Franciscan Order and the colony as a whole. During Sahagún's lifetime, the Franciscans manifested a change in direction from the early decades of evangelical purity, when friars had spread out across the countryside learning native languages and imitating the early apostles. By the end of the century, the

friars had withdrawn to their monasteries, become embroiled in confrontations with the secular authorities, and split among themselves over issues relating to their mission. Sahagún vocally advocated returning to the earlier era of apostolic purity. His revised account of the conquest underscores the important roles played by Cortés in the conquest and by the Franciscans in the spiritual conquest. This rationale was intended to provide a foundation for his view that the Franciscans should continue their earlier missionary practices.

The Cline edition of the 1585 revision is well done. It contains in sequence an English translation, a transcript of the Boston Public Library manuscript, a reproduction of the Boston manuscript, and a reproduction of the printed edition of 1840 edited by Carlos María de Bustamante. The English translation has notes, compiled by Sarah Cline, which contrast the contents of the 1585 edition with the *Florentine Codex*. The transcription of the Boston manuscript has notes comparing that text with the 1840 printed edition. While minor variants in orthography are not noted, more serious differences in the texts are discussed. Unfortunately, the reproduction of the Boston manuscript is not altogether clear, whether due to the condition of the original manuscript or the reproduction process. An apparently high-contrast process has blurred or obliterated some detail. On other pages, the text seems to spread and is difficult to read. Thus a thorough study of the manuscript reproduction would have to rely on the transcript. The final section fully reproduces the Bustamante work of 1840. It contains not only the Sahagún conquest narrative but also a refutation of arguments presented by Juan Bautista Muñoz disputing the validity of the legend of the Virgin of Guadalupe. Bustamante also comments extensively on the Sahagún text itself, mainly comparing it with Francisco Javier Clavigero's *Historia antigua de México*.

In summary, Sarah Cline is to be praised for having brought to fruition this project begun by her parents. It contributes a great deal to knowledge of the conquest and the life and work of Sahagún. *Conquest of New Spain, 1585 Revision* has important implications for the political history of early New Spain and the role of the Franciscans in the colony.

### *Social History*

Closely related to the topic raised by Cline in her work on Sahagún is the collection of essays edited by Susan Ramírez, *Indian-Religious Relations in Colonial Spanish America*. These essays explore the various manifestations of the interface between the natives and members of the religious orders during the Spanish settlement and occupation of the New World. The contributors include Murdo MacLeod, Stafford Poole, James Saeger, Susan Schroeder, and Eric Van Young. Three of the essays deal with issues relating to colonial Mexico and Chiapas, while the fourth

takes a look at eighteenth-century missions in Paraguay. Ramírez provides a worthy introduction to the volume, while Van Young wraps up the collection with his conclusion.

Poole's "The Declining Image of the Indian among Churchmen in Sixteenth-Century New Spain" provides a wonderful contrast to Schroeder's "Chimalpahin's View of Spanish Ecclesiastics in Colonial Mexico." Both focus on the late sixteenth century in demonstrating the mutual perspectives of the natives and Spaniards. By the end of the sixteenth century, the Spaniards had almost universally adopted a less idealistic view of the natives than the one that had prevailed during the first flush of missionary activity. While some Franciscans and others maintained images not unlike that of the noble savage, most observers saw Indians as subject to a host of evils and as having attained only a thin veneer of Christianity. Poole does not hesitate to point out that these same clerics also held less than complimentary views of their fellow Spaniards.

In writing about Chimalpahin, Schroeder outlines her subject's general worldview and his localocentric opinion that Amaquemeca (Amecameca) was simply a paradise. She then presents in ample detail all the important references in his work to the church, clerics, other church officers, the sacraments, and anything related to the ecclesiastical establishment. Chimalpahin was a fascinating character. In him one sees an upper-class Indian modifying both worldview and narrative impact following the conquest. His early accounts deal with native rulers, but the later narratives look to Spanish and Indian civil and religious figures. Schroeder concludes that although Chimalpahin cherished his Nahua heritage, he also reveled in his postconquest status, when he was loosely affiliated with the hermitage of San Antonio Abad.

The role of the Dominican Order in colonial Chiapas is the theme of Murdo MacLeod's essay, "Dominican Explanations for Revolts and Their Suppression in Colonial Chiapas, 1545–1715." MacLeod masterfully describes the emergence of four rival sectors of the elite class. He then analyzes the interplay of these four sectors over the course of events in the 170-year period studied. MacLeod posits that the elite groups in Chiapas consisted of the *conquistadores* and *primeros pobladores* of the region, the Dominicans and from time to time a few Franciscans, the Bishop of Chiapas and the secular clergy, and the *alcalde mayor* and his retinue. Initially, the religious were hostile to the bishop, while the old settlers were antagonistic to the magistrate. By the late seventeenth century, however, the magistrates had emerged as the victors. The regulars and secular clergy continued to squabble well into the eighteenth century. The Dominicans generally took credit for the successes among the Indians and blamed their rivals for all the failures. MacLeod's essay greatly clarifies the rivalries among the elite that had a dramatic impact on the natives. Especially intriguing is his view of the Dominicans, who were en-

gaged in a power struggle with the other elite sectors while conducting their ministry among the natives. The Dominicans were the group of Spaniards closest to the daily lives of the natives.

James Saeger's essay deals with Paraguay in the eighteenth century, specifically with the Jesuit missions among the Guaycuruan Indians. His study focuses on the Indians of the Paraguayan Chaco and how efforts to Christianize them, pacify them, and otherwise reduce them figured in the policies of colonial officials, both secular and ecclesiastical. The history of contact with this people paralleled experiences elsewhere in the Americas: European diseases and land-use patterns eventually either killed the Indians or destroyed the ecology on which they depended. Like many other native groups of the Paraguayan region, the Guaycuruan Indians came to live in missions organized by the Jesuits. As is well known, these missions used the technique first employed by Las Casas then by the viceroys of New Spain: gifts and persuasion rather than fire and sword. It proved successful. But when the Jesuits were expelled from Latin America, the missions began to fail. Quite simply, as long as someone was willing to support the natives, they would remain in the settlements. But without the gifts of food and trade goods, they eventually drifted back into the hinterland.

The concluding essay by Eric Van Young offers an excellent overview of the collection. He draws incisive comparisons among the essays and stimulates the reader to consider even broader implications. He also points the reader toward the larger world of culture contact and Indian-European conflict throughout the region. Van Young ends the volume by suggesting that the initial contact between Indians and representatives of the church were the beginnings of liberation theology.

Certainly, the clash of cultures inherent in the conquest and settlement brought with it many changes. Ramírez's edited volume, *Indian-Religious Relations in Colonial Spanish America*, attempts to view those changes in the context of the "spiritual conquest." John Super has taken a somewhat different approach. Food is so central to the daily lives of every human that all too often it has been overlooked as a topic of investigation. Super has written a slim but fascinating study of the role of food in the conquest and colonization of the New World entitled *Food, Conquest, and Colonization in Sixteenth-Century Spanish America*.

In the first chapter, Super develops three methodological approaches to the subject, noting that too little general attention has been paid to the topic. The first approach deals with the issue of diet. Clearly, some assumptions made regarding historical events have been based on diet. For instance, the *tumultos* in Mexico of 1624 and 1692 have often been attributed to shortages of corn, an essential element in the Mexican diet. Yet diet is a complex issue involving calories, nutrients, and costs, and when diet is analyzed closely, it exceeds the reach of historians, except

regarding a few well-documented groups. The second approach relies on studying agricultural production, allowing scholars to rely on broad indications of overall production for each commodity within the food sector. Yet weights, measures, and the caloric and nutritional values of goods vary greatly depending on which measure is used and whether goods are dried, salted, or fresh, thus complicating the equation. Third, one can use series data on wages and prices to evaluate the buying potential of a wage earner. Yet rarely in colonial Latin America does one find continuous or even fragmentary data on wages and prices. After analyzing these methods, Super resolves to look at what constituted an adequate diet, based on an adequate food distribution system. While acknowledging that the data are often spotty, Super argues that broad conclusions based on general data are better than none at all.

The second chapter of *Food, Conquest, and Colonization* focuses on land and soil types and the various crops found in Latin America. Super notes the variations caused by elevation and latitude and comments on rainfall and productivity. Crop yields are also discussed, largely on the basis of anecdotal evidence. Super goes on in the next chapter to examine the staples of the American diet, specifically meat and bread. One notable aspect is the comparative absence of domesticated animals in pre-Columbian America, followed by the explosive growth of flocks and herds of European livestock after the conquest. With regard to bread, the Spaniards demonstrated a marked preference for wheat over the native maize of the indigenous peoples. Super concludes that both livestock and grain yields in the New World were large enough to remove the New World from the traditional relationship between bread and meat found in Western Europe. In that relationship, as populations increased, pasture land was converted to crop land because the same acreage of grain could feed more people than if used for livestock. In contrast, as populations grew in the New World, the high productivity and relative abundance of land did not require the shift seen in Europe.

The fourth chapter covers the laws and institutions of food production and distribution. Spaniards brought with them a complex system that regulated food from the fields to the table. Super then focuses on the various countervailing forces that acted on food production and distribution, diet, and population. He looks at patterns of land use and labor as well as tribute regulations. The Spanish sector and its European foods accounted for only a small part of the whole picture in colonial Latin America. Native foods and natives as consumers were also key factors in the whole equation.

In the sixth chapter, Super considers native food and drink. By now, many realize that such delights as chocolate, vanilla, and tomatoes were “gifts” of the Aztecs, while potatoes came from the Inca. Maize was a food source easily understood by the Spanish, but Super argues that *pulque*

in Mexico and *chicha* in the Andean region also served as important food sources for the natives. They also played major roles in native ceremonial and ritual life. Super concludes that as in so many other aspects of life, Spanish control over food, especially native food, was yet another aspect of the overall Spanish domination of society. Super's point is that a "culinary conquest" occurred as inexorably as the military and spiritual conquests.

Considered as a whole, *Food, Conquest, and Colonization* is a fascinating work. Super admittedly took on a huge subject armed only with limited resources. Yet his presentation is lucid and compelling. It serves as a true beginning of what should prove to be an important area for future research. In this regard, the book is an important successor to Alfred Crosby's *The Columbian Exchange* (1972).

Another means of coming to grips with the reality of the Spanish conquest and domination of the New World is to follow the life of an individual active in the government. Ralph Vigil has done just this in his biography, *Alonso de Zorita, Royal Judge and Christian Humanist, 1512–1585*. A truly uncommon man, Zorita served as *oidor* on the island of Española, *juex de residencia* in New Granada, and *oidor* in Guatemala and New Spain. Beyond the purely bureaucratic aspect of his career, Zorita was dedicated to the notion of protecting the Indians, as free vassals of the crown, from the depredations of the Spanish colonists. At every turn, Zorita served his monarch well by providing reasoned and relatively passionless reports on local conditions. Known to posterity through his writings, he produced four major works in the last eighteen years of his life, including his justly famous *Breve y sumaria relación de los señores de la Nueva España*. Vigil also presents a detailed analysis of Zorita's writings.

Vigil's study captures the contentiousness of those participating in the suits that Zorita was called on to judge. Drawing heavily on published and manuscript sources, Vigil has in many ways recreated the arguments and perspectives of the major players of the period. If anything, he has erred on the side of inclusion in his portrayal of scenes and characters. Zorita played a crucial role in the development of Indian-Spanish relations in the middle of the sixteenth century. *Alonso de Zorita* is an important study in a genre that has recently been rediscovered. This work, along with others like Stafford Poole's biography of Pedro Moya de Contreras, goes a long way in personalizing our understanding of the clash of cultures.

While Vigil's study examines Spanish bureaucratic responses to the clash of cultures, Ann Wightman's study of colonial Cuzco focuses on a more purely native response. The conquest of the New World shattered native social structures. But to assume that the Indians were left with nothing is incorrect. Rather, much of the pre-Columbian social structure remained to provide a framework on which to develop a more or less

syncretistic society. In Mesoamerica, the quick dispersal of Spanish population across the terrain implied more opportunity for syncretism. Yet the relative isolation of much of Andean society and the nucleation of Spanish society in a dozen or more towns and cities allowed pre-Columbian modes to continue more readily.

Individual identity in the Andean world was closely tied to corporate identity. Each person existed as a member of a kin group known as an *ayllu*. Membership carried with it a nexus of mutual support and obligations, including reciprocal labor service. From this structure, the Inca removed some workers (known as *yana*) and created new royal *ayllus*, generally tinkering with the social structure. The arrival of the Spaniards destroyed or fractured many of the traditional *ayllus*. Enslavement and the uprooting of native populations in the program of *reducciones* also tended to break down the *ayllu*. Eventually, two groups of natives without *ayllu* identity came to exist in the society. One consisted of the *yanacona*, colonial descendants of the old *yana*, augmented by some Indians who chose to leave Indian society and attach themselves to a Spaniard. The other group was made up of *forasteros* or outsiders. These individuals were Indian migrants and their descendants who came to live in major cities like Cuzco but lacked an *ayllu* identity. Wightman traces this category over a century and a half in *Indigenous Migration and Social Change: The "Forasteros" of Cuzco, 1570–1720*.

The *forastero* issue was a complex matter. Various crown policies tended to stimulate migration to the city. The program of concentrating dispersed native populations into artificial towns, known as *congregación* or *reducción*, uprooted the natives yet often did not provide them with the structures necessary for recreating their society. Native populations were also being uprooted by the *mita*, a system of forced labor that required natives to work in the Potosí mines according to a rotational scheme. Moreover, the city, then as now, had attractions of its own. It offered new opportunities to natives interested in partially integrating into the new Spanish economic system. Likewise, migration provided a degree of social flexibility not found in Incan society. Leaving the ancestral homeland for the city, one could take on a new identity and escape from the pattern of reciprocal obligations. Yet this new population had to be dealt with administratively. Local native groups did not recognize the outsiders. Eventually, the crown approved the creation of "*ayllus de forasteros*," thereby adapting the pre-Columbian institution of social identity to the new colonial reality.

Ann Wightman's *Indigenous Migration and Social Change* is a fascinating study of the clash of cultures. Neither the Spaniards nor the natives clearly understood each other. Both tended to borrow and adapt from the other. Native responses to Spanish policies followed by the adaptation of native institutions for Spanish ends form a classic scenario in

colonial Latin America. Wightman details this sequence admirably and also provides ample statistical documentation.

The life of the natives and Spaniards in the New World provides only part of the picture of the Hispanic world. The process of migration across the Atlantic was a vital part of the reality of the early colonies. Just as the conquest brought with it upheaval for the native communities, so it brought about change back in Spain. Ida Altman's *Emigrants and Society: Extremadura and Spanish America in the Sixteenth Century* details the migration and social change in Spain and the New World brought about by the conquest. This award-winning study focuses on the region of Extremadura in Spain. Long praised as the "cradle of conquerors," Extremadura supplied a significant percentage of all Spanish migrants to the New World, in addition to its two famous native sons, Hernán Cortés and Francisco Pizarro. Altman chose the areas of Cáceres and Trujillo for closer study. Cáceres boasts many impressive homes built by petty nobles in the sixteenth century, before and after the conquest. Trujillo gained fame as the hometown of Pizarro and his brothers. The members of the clan who came home lavished attention on the town and graced the plaza with their palaces.

Most of the emigrants from Extremadura were not Pizarros, however. Altman does a wonderful job of depicting Spanish society of the late fifteenth and early sixteenth century. She presents examples from each major social group and describes the interaction of regional society. *Emigrants and Society* thus serves as a model of a micro-history of regional Spanish society. But Altman also traces the Extremadurans in their travels and adventures in the New World, assessing their contributions and following those who returned to their homeland. Her study draws heavily on archival materials in Seville and in New World libraries.

*Emigrants and Society* is divided between chapters focusing primarily on Spain and those focusing on the New World. The first four chapters provide an overview of Extremeño society, followed by closer examination of the main social groups of nobles and commoners, including clergy and professionals. Altman then analyzes the patterns of family, kinship, and society, thus constructing a concise image of local society in Extremadura during the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. The next two chapters deal with the emigrants' move to the New World and the role they played once there. Another chapter considers the Extremeños who returned home, followed by the conclusion.

Altman has done a fine job of tracing the movement and impact of this group of conquerors and settlers in the Americas. It is less easy to assess the impact of their morality and habits on the New World society. In *Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America*, a collection of essays edited by Asunción Lavrin, the contributors attempt to examine the specific topic of issues relating to sexuality and marriage. This collection of nine

essays is admirably previewed in Lavrin's exceptionally well-written introduction, which extracts essentials from each essay.

Of the nine essays, three were originally presented at the annual meeting of the American Historical Association (those by Ann Twinam, Kathy Waldron, and Susan Socolow). Yet all the pieces in this collection mesh well. Lavrin's essay on sexuality in colonial Mexico is a well-reasoned study of the structural limits placed on sexuality by the Catholic Church and royal government. She also draws heavily on specific cases found in the Mexican archives, thus giving the legalistic norms reality in the lives of the individuals studied. Serge Gruzinski, in contrast, looks at native practices and their acculturation to Spanish norms. He relies on the many *confessionarios* written in Nahuatl by the early friars as the means of opening up the acculturation process. In doing so, Gruzinski's study breaks new ground and offers many important insights. Continuing the theme of normative behavior and the social and legal structure surrounding it, Ann Twinam deals with notions of honor and the role of illegitimacy in the colonial period. While Gruzinski and Lavrin deal mostly with Mexico, Twinam's vision encompasses the whole of Spanish America. Her research also deals mainly with the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Her principal source of information were the scores of requests for *gracias al sacar* sought by colonials to regularize irregular conditions (usually for the purpose of legitimizing a child born out of wedlock).

The first three essays all tend to deal with general principles operating in Hispanic America. The remaining six focus more closely on limited time periods or regions. Kathy Waldron evaluates the morality of late-colonial Caracas, as viewed through the *visita* records of Bishop Mariano Martí. She studies the role of the bishop in regulating the morality of his diocese. Ruth Behar reviews cases brought before the Mexican Inquisition to analyze witchcraft and women's powers in a colonial setting. Her innovative work focuses mainly on the eighteenth century in attempting to characterize female identity through documents that evaluate what was perceived as antisocial behavior.

Susan Socolow and Richard Boyer both deal with issues relating to marriage and marriage choice. Socolow focuses on colonial Argentina on the eve of the independence movements, while Boyer takes a somewhat larger view that draws on cases from the Mexican Inquisition. Socolow analyses marriage choice, especially the conflict inherent in the canonical principle that marriage as a sacrament had to be entered into by means of free will and could not be coerced, in contrast with the political reality that parents indeed forced marriage choices, a practice finally embodied in the *Pragmática* of 1776. Boyer sketches patriarchy as it developed in the West, especially in Spanish Christianity, and then examines specific cases from the Mexican Inquisition to evaluate its impact.

Tomás Calvo analyzes the theme of family cohesion in seventeenth-

century Guadalajara. Clearly, unless the integrity of the family is considered, studies focusing on the forces of disintegration, adultery, illegitimacy, and coercion cannot be evaluated for lack of norms. Calvo concludes that cohesion was an important factor in the families he studied, although not always in a guise recognizable in other times and places. Last of all, María Beatriz Nizza da Silva takes on the issue of divorce in colonial São Paulo. The universe evaluated by her study includes 88 out of 225 divorce suits heard by the ecclesiastical tribunal between 1700 and 1822. Her findings reveal that deep incompatibility was accepted by colonial authorities as a justification for separating a couple. On the whole, *Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America* is an illuminating collection of essays.

### *Political and Economic History*

The studies reviewed thus far have all dealt with various aspects of social history. But political and economic historians have not been idle either. Anthony Pagden has produced two important contributions to colonial historiography. *Spanish Imperialism and the Political Imagination* is an intriguing work that deals with international politics and the heirs of Francisco de Vitoria, the father of international law. In this work, Pagden brings together many different themes dealing with Spanish imperial identity. This unique work studies the Spanish imperial system not just from the point of view of the New World, or Flanders, or Naples but attempts to view the system as a whole, although focusing mainly on the New World and Italy.

The first chapter considers the important concept of rights to property. One of the notable features of the Spanish colonial world was that the Spanish crown recognized the pre-existing right of the colonized peoples to their land. A central part of the process of acquiring a land title was obtaining proof that the land was not already occupied by natives. The Spaniards used the writings of Francisco de Vitoria to justify their peaceable possession of the New World.

The Spaniards clearly had achieved occupation of the new lands. The question that ensued was whether they exercised legal dominion over the lands and their inhabitants. This issue was debated heatedly from 1504 until about 1512. The concluding opinion was that prior to the conquest, the Indians had had dominion over their own lands and possessions, and except for very special cases when natives might lose the right to dominion, they continued to exercise it. Vitoria, not finding a precedent for dominion by conquest and occupation in natural law or civil law, postulated that the law of nations, *ius gentium*, provided such a right.

Citing the law of nations, Vitoria held that the right of free travel and the right to spread the Gospel were the main roots of Spanish domin-

ion. Others quickly rejected the concept of a right to free travel, given that Spain did not in fact keep the Indies open to all traders. But Spain certainly did spread the Gospel. From this premise, two camps emerged. One declared that the right to spread the Gospel could not carry with it dominion, which was antithetical to the notion of free will. Thus short of just war or free alliance, there were no bases for Spanish dominion. Others, notably Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda, argued that because the natives were merely pre-social men who had not yet even entered into natural law, they could be justly subdued and even enslaved. The countervailing argument, voiced most loudly by Bartolomé de Las Casas, claimed that the natives had entered fully into natural law and therefore could not be dominated by the Spanish, except through free alliance. This latter argument was identified with the Salamanca school of Thomistic theologians.

Pagden's second chapter covers the thought of Tommaso Campanella, a Neapolitan political thinker of the early seventeenth century who had participated in an ill-fated attempt in 1599 to defeat Spanish dominion over Naples. Campanella's greatest fear was that Christendom would disintegrate due to pressures from heretics and the Turks. He envisioned a universal monarch, governing with science, who would be capable of purifying Europe from within and strengthening the continent against attack and subversion. No republican, Campanella perceived the only solution as being a theocratic monarchy. He identified Spain as the only candidate for this role because its power was at its zenith, a phase that no declining empire had ever recovered. Yet for reasons of legitimacy and continuity with the past, this empire must also be subject to the papacy. Thus for Campanella, dominion over the New World resulted from papal plenitude of power.

The third chapter introduces Paolo Mattia Doria, another Neapolitan, who wrote in the early eighteenth century. Doria recognized that the Spanish had maintained their hold over Naples by politics rather than by force (the Spanish had no army there). He believed that the Spanish had followed some of Campanella's recommendations in hispanizing the society and submerging the local culture. Central to the political society for Doria was public trust and private trust. Public trust depends on the security of expectation, while private trust is intimately tied to notions of honor. The two work together to bind the state. According to Doria, the Spanish, by eroding the private trust, had reduced the kingdom to subservient status. In his view, Naples had become the Indies.

Pagden's fourth chapter reviews the writings of such luminaries as Carlos de Sigüenza y Góngora and Francisco Javier Clavigero. Both provided important reassessments of the status of the pre-Columbian civilizations. Early theorists thought it important to recognize the barbaric nature of the native societies in justifying Spanish dominion. But by the mid-seventeenth century, a counterargument had emerged that ulti-

mately allowed the criollos to stake a claim to some of the ancient glory. Sigüenza y Góngora and Clavigero converted the view of the Aztecs from bloodthirsty barbarians to heirs of the likes of Greece and Rome. For Clavigero, at least, the retrospective look at the Aztecs was not intended to provide a prologue to independence but rather to enhance criollos' sense of pride in their homeland.

Pagden draws all these threads forward into the independence period in his last two chapters, in which he focuses on two leaders in Venezuela, Francisco de Miranda and Simón Bolívar. Juan Pablo Viscardo, a nineteenth-century Peruvian, wrote that the Hapsburg monarchs had broken Spanish constitutional traditions by denying their vassals, the conquerors and descendants, the right to interpret law and to hold executive office. He believed that this practice had led to Spain's decline. Viscardo, like Clavigero, felt that although the criollos' *patria* was American, Spain was their nation. Independence would therefore restore the constitutionalism of old Aragón and Castile, as well as the culture of the ancient Indian empires, within a multiracial society, as posited earlier by Garcilaso de la Vega. This vision became embodied in the constitutional project of Miranda. Bolívar, however, diverged from this line of thinking to espouse a different model. He viewed the ancient Hispanic constitutions as part of the problem. Monarchies too had fallen out of intellectual favor in Enlightenment thinking. For the republicans who sought independence, the image of the ancient native civilizations was the most frightening part of this political vision. Bolívar therefore proceeded down a very different path. Drawing on Enlightenment thinking, he and others developed their political structures outside the historic traditions of Spain, America, or the Hispanic empire.

Pagden raises many important questions about the development of political culture and political theory in the Hispanic empire. His parallel studies of Spanish America and Naples are indeed illuminating. The two regions had more in common in terms of the political structure of the empire than has been widely recognized. Overall, *Spanish Imperialism and the Political Imagination* is crucial to understanding the Hispanic political imagination in the colonial period.

In *Colonial Identity in the Atlantic World, 1500–1800*, Pagden and Nicholas Canny have brought together essays examining the colonial experience in the North Atlantic and South America. The studies deal with Brazil, Spanish America, Quebec, British America, Ireland, and Barbados (the last as an example from the British Caribbean). Originally commissioned for a seminar held at the Institute for Advanced Study at Princeton in 1982, the essays on the colonial identity in the Atlantic world, Brazil, and Hispanic America are most relevant to Latin Americanists.

John Elliot's introduction provides an admirable overview of colonial identity in the Atlantic region. He has extracted some of the key in-

sights from the subsequent essays to construct a mosaic of the Atlantic colonial world. Although the colonizers all set out from their European homelands and created societies in the new land, somehow those new societies took on independent identities. Elliot poses questions and develops a common ground for the other essayists to build on.

Stuart Schwartz's essay on colonial Brazil attempts to place the development of the colonial identity within the context of the social and political structure of the colony. Society in Brazil represented a continuation of norms imported from Portugal, although the Jesuits and New Christians were attempting to create a new society. Schwartz traces two important processes leading to colonial identity. First, the colonists gradually came to see themselves as somehow different from those living in the metropolis. Second, they eventually recognized that the difference transcended regionalism or localism and could be the basis for a new national identity. For Schwartz, the war with the Dutch provided ample opportunity for the beginnings of a real colonial identity. Yet these beginnings involved ambiguities as well in that the colonists were fighting to liberate themselves from the Dutch and yet remain a part of the Portuguese world. Well into the nineteenth century, social and political forces dictated the strongly contradictory nature of Brazilian colonial identity.

Pagden addresses the issue of colonial identity for Spanish America by focusing on the criollo elite of Mexico and Peru. He posits that by the middle of the seventeenth century, colonial Spanish Americans had acquired a clear sense of belonging to a culture that was already independent of the metropolis, despite its economic and political dependence. The conquerors and early settlers sought to create a new society in which they were lords, not unlike the images embodied in such peninsular examples as El Cid and Sancho Panza and his government. Yet the New World soon became filled with others who sought to make their mark. Understandably, the first settlers regarded the latecomers with great hostility, hoping to prohibit their emigration and fighting their incorporation into colonial society. The epitome of these latecomers were the administrators from Spain who were sent out to govern the colony. The first settlers had claimed a role in government as a reward for their service in arms, but by the seventeenth century, the criollos were making their claim by virtue of place of birth, and only by extension from the services of now distant forebears.

Colonists lived in a complex society populated by Spaniards, Indians, slaves, and a host of mixed groups denominated by the catchall term *las castas*. By the late seventeenth century, colonists could claim with some justification that they had bested their peninsular cousins in letters, art, architecture, and piety. Yet not until economic and political structures achieved a similar level of independence could the colonies actually overthrow their motherland.

Pagden's *Spanish Imperialism and the Political Imagination* and the essays in *Colonial Identity in the Atlantic World* all point to the importance of the fiscal and economic ties between the colony and the motherland. Certainly, many scholars have attempted to analyze the commercial ties of the Hispanic empire, building on the groundwork laid by Pierre Chaunu's monumental study. More recently John TePaske and Herbert Klein have sought to make royal treasury accounts available to scholars in a useful form. Bernard Slicher van Bath has drawn upon the accounts published by TePaske and Klein in *Real Hacienda y economía en Hispanoamérica, 1541–1820*. He concludes from his analysis of the global treasury reports that the first fiscal boom resulted from native tribute entering the royal coffers. By the end of the sixteenth century, Potosí had replaced tribute as the single most important source. In the seventeenth century treasury, officials were still hoping that more Potosís would be found.

Between 1641 and 1680, silver production actually declined, but this trend did not imply a general crisis. Commerce increased slightly, as reflected earlier in the Lima and Callao treasury records. For Mexico, the growth of mining paralleled that of Peru, with Zacatecas being an important but not exclusive source of silver. It was no Potosí. By 1700 the Mexican treasury records indicate that the region had begun to show different patterns from the south. While neither area grew in the first two decades of the eighteenth century, Mexico was healthier than Peru. After 1720 a general economic zone emerged from Mexico to Chile, with a core zone extending from Lima-Callao to Potosí.

The core zone experienced slow growth in commerce and a decline in the dominance of mining. In the external peripheral zone, new growth took place in many sectors. Following 1760, government income showed a new spurt, but that increase was generally used to cover increased military costs. Slicher van Bath's general vision of the ebb and flow of the fiscal life of the colonies does not differ from what has been posited by others, but his *Real Hacienda y economía* is still an intriguing study that will doubtless spur more debate about the utility of royal treasury records for understanding economic changes. He has concentrated a tremendous amount of information into a slim volume. Specialists on each region will need to consult this work as well as the TePaske and Klein data to evaluate the relevance of this study to the local areas.

### *Conclusion*

These eleven books as a whole give an excellent indication of the depth and breadth of recent scholarship on colonial Latin American history. The group tends to focus on the earlier period of the Hapsburgs, rather than on the later Hapsburgs. These works thus tend to zero in more on the processes whereby Spanish political, economic, and political struc-

tures were imposed on the New World. The perspective of these works is almost uniformly Spanish. What little is glimpsed of the native component in colonial Latin America is seen through Spanish eyes, as in Cline's work on Sahagún. This orientation does not imply, however, that the native peoples did not have an important part to play in the development of the colonies. As shown in Wightman's work, many of the institutions that eventually appeared on the American scene were syncretistic as a result of either imperfect Spanish understanding of native customs or native misunderstanding of Spanish institutions.

These works also break new ground by focusing on new topics and themes. Super's work on food, Lavrin's collection of essays on sexuality and marriage, and Wightman's study of the *forasteros* all point to new methods being used and new questions being asked. Yet genre such as biography also have adherents in this cross-section of scholarship. Vigil's work demonstrates the wealth of information available about the colony, natives, and Spaniards through the life of one single, and singular, individual.

Clearly, the emphasis among these works still falls on social history. A few deal with political history in a fresh and interesting fashion, such as Pagden and Vigil. Yet the main concern is about how individuals reacted to the extraordinary forces that were unleashed in the conquest. Altman's book is a fine example of how events in the New World could profoundly change life in the Old. It thus provides a wonderful counterbalance to Wightman's study, which looks at how native institutions were modified by the Spaniards. The front lines of social change are also well studied. Tyler and Cline, by focusing on the primary sources that document the clash of cultures, have helped to illuminate the whole range of changes. The Catholic Church as an active participant in the acculturation process is likewise a major theme—in the primary sources, in Ramírez's collection of essays, in Vigil's biography, and in the essays on sexuality and marriage. Perhaps more than any other institution of Spanish society, the church is now being studied by more scholars than ever before.

In summary, these works demonstrate the vitality of colonial Latin American history as we approach the Quincentenary. The polemics of the White and Black legends have in general receded in favor of closer looks at the day-to-day reality of the conquest and European colonization of the New World. The debate will continue, but with strides such as these, all scholars will be better equipped to engage in truly meaningful discourse.