

American
Bar
Foundation

research journal

Volume 1985 • Fall • Number 4

ARTICLES

Robert J. Levy

Custody Investigations in Divorce Cases

Michael Grossberg

**Crossing Boundaries: Nineteenth-Century Domestic Relations Law
and the Merger of Family and Legal History**

James W. Ely, Jr.

**"There are few subjects in political economy of greater difficulty":
The Poor Laws of the Antebellum South**

REVIEW ESSAYS

Papke on *Neo-Marxists, Nietzscheans, and New Critics*

Levinson on *Writing About Realism*

Tushnet on *Newmyer's Supreme Court Justice Joseph Story*

Dresser on *Metaphysics and Morals*

Simon on *Newman on Corporal Punishment*

REPLY/REJOINDER

Schneyer, *Reply to Chemerinsky on Professional Responsibility Casebooks*

Chemerinsky, *Rejoinder to Schneyer*

BOOK NOTES

CUMULATIVE INDEX, 1976-1985



(ISSN 0361-9486)

Editors

Terence C. Halliday
Rayman L. Solomon
Project Directors
American Bar Foundation

Review Section

Editor
Howard S. Erlanger
Professor of Law and Sociology
University of Wisconsin

Managing Editor: Bette H. Sikes, Director of Publications, American Bar Foundation

Editorial Assistant: Forrest Martin; *Production Editor:* Sandy Mathai

Manuscript Editors: Jessie Buhmann, Susan Messer, Kenner Swain-Harmon

Typesetter: Joanne P. Watson

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

1985

Alfred F. Conard, Henry M. Butzel Professor Emeritus, University of Michigan Law School
John E. Coons, Professor of Law, University of California School of Law, Berkeley
Herman Goldstein, Evjue-Bascom Professor in Law, University of Wisconsin Law School
Herbert Jacob, Professor of Political Science, Northwestern University
Peter Martin, Dean, Cornell Law School, Cornell University
Charles J. Meyers, Partner, Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, Denver, Colorado
Murray L. Schwartz, Professor of Law, University of California School of Law, Los Angeles

1986

Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California School of Law, Los Angeles
Carl A. Auerbach, Professor of Law, University of Minnesota Law School
Milton Heumann, Professor of Political Science, Rutgers University
Robert L. Rabin, Professor of Law, Stanford Law School, Stanford University
Maurice Rosenberg, Harold R. Medina Professor of Procedural Jurisprudence, Columbia University School of Law
Richard D. Schwartz, Ernest I. White Professor, Syracuse University College of Law
Jerome H. Skolnick, Professor of Law, Jurisprudence, and Social Policy, University of California School of Law, Berkeley
Robert B. Stevens, President, Haverford College

1987

David F. Cavers, Fessenden Professor of Law, Emeritus, Harvard University Law School
Malcolm M. Feeley, Visiting Professor, University of California School of Law, Berkeley
James Willard Hurst, Vilas Professor, Emeritus, University of Wisconsin Law School
Norval Morris, Julius Kreeger Professor of Law and Criminology, University of Chicago Law School
Nelson W. Polsby, Professor of Political Science, University of California, Berkeley
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Professor of Sociology, Brown University
Rita J. Simon, Dean, School of Justice, American University

ex officio

John P. Heinz, Executive Director, American Bar Foundation, and Professor of Law and Urban Affairs, Northwestern University School of Law
Barbara A. Curran, Associate Executive Director, American Bar Foundation
Spencer L. Kimball, Seymour Logan Professor of Law, University of Chicago Law School, and Project Director, American Bar Foundation

ARTICLES

- Robert J. Levy
Custody Investigations in Divorce Cases 713
- Michael Grossberg
Crossing Boundaries: Nineteenth-Century Domestic Relations Law and the Merger of Family and Legal History 799
- James W. Ely, Jr.
"There are few subjects in political economy of greater difficulty": The Poor Laws of the Antebellum South 849

REVIEW ESSAYS

- David Ray Papke
Review Essay: Neo-Marxists, Nietzscheans, and New Critics: The Voices of the Contemporary Law and Literature Discourse 883
- Sanford Levinson
Review Essay: Writing About Realism 899
- Mark Tushnet
Review Essay: The Republican Synthesis and Judicial Biography: Newmyer's Supreme Court Justice Joseph Story 909
- Rebecca Dresser
Review Essay: Metaphysics and Morals: Moore's Medicine for a Misunderstood Marriage 917
- Jonathan Simon
Review Essay: Back to the Future: Newman on Corporal Punishment 927

REPLY/REJOINDER

- Ted Schneyer
Professional Responsibility Casebooks and the New Positivism: A Reply to Professor Chemerinsky 943
- Erwin Chemerinsky
Training the Ethical Lawyer: A Rejoinder to Schneyer 959

BOOK NOTES 971

CUMULATIVE INDEX, 1976–1985 987

Publication Policy

The role of the American Bar Foundation is to create and disseminate knowledge about law and the workings of the legal profession and legal institutions. With that purpose in mind, the *American Bar Foundation Research Journal* invites the submission of unsolicited articles and research notes by lawyers, legal academics, social scientists, and other scholars. The *Journal* publishes articles on the legal profession, the provision of legal services, the operation of legal institutions, trends and policy developments in the law, and related topics. Recognizing that a variety of disciplines and approaches can contribute to knowledge of the legal system, the *Journal* strives to be multidisciplinary and publishes empirical, doctrinal, and theoretical analyses. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions expressed are those of the authors and not those of the American Bar Foundation, its officers and directors, research staff, or others associated with the Foundation's work.

Manuscript Evaluation: To ensure informed publication decisions, the *Journal* employs a refereed publication process. Articles and research notes that the Editors deem potentially appropriate for the *Journal* are normally evaluated by two or more reviewers chosen on the basis of their familiarity with the subject matter and the research methods. Manuscripts produced by scholars affiliated with the Foundation are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

Submission of Manuscripts: Manuscripts submitted to the *Journal* should be typed double spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. Because it is preferred that an author's identity not be disclosed when a manuscript is sent to reviewers, the author's name, credentials, institutional affiliation, and any acknowledgments should appear only on the cover sheet or other separate pages.

To avoid placing unnecessary burdens on reviewers, the Editors request that manuscripts be submitted only if the author is committed to publication in the *Journal* if the manuscript is accepted. If a manuscript is submitted that is under consideration by another journal, that fact should be disclosed to the Editors at the time of submission. The Editors will make publication decisions promptly, usually about two months after submission.

Editing of Accepted Manuscripts: All manuscripts accepted for publication will be edited for style by the *Journal's* professional editorial staff in consultation with the author. The editorial staff does not check citations. Authors of articles see both edited manuscript and galleys.

Reprints to Authors: Without charge, the *Journal* provides to authors of articles 50 reprints of each published article or research note and 5 copies of the issue in which it appears; to authors of review essays and book reviews, 25 reprints and 1 copy of the issue.

Republication Rights: The Foundation will normally permit authors to republish or use their manuscripts after publication in the *Journal*, but the *Journal* will have the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The *Journal* will retain the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

Comments and Responses: comments on or responses to articles or reviews in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

Send article or research note
manuscripts to:
Terence C. Halliday, Rayman L. Solomon
Editors
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding
review essays to:
Howard S. Erlanger
ABF Research Journal
University of Wisconsin Law School
Madison, WI 53706
(608) 262-2240

The *American Bar Foundation Research Journal* is published quarterly. SUBSCRIPTION RATES: one year \$20.00; two years \$38.00; three years \$53.00. Overseas subscribers add \$6.00 per year. Single copies, \$5.50. Reprints of articles are available (with quantity discounts available for orders of 10 or more): articles of 1-49 pages, \$2.00; articles of 50-99 pages, \$2.50; articles over 99 pages, \$3.25.

Notification of change of address should include old and new address and be sent to: Foundation Publications, American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611.

The *American Bar Foundation Research Journal* (ISSN: 0361-9486) is published quarterly, for \$20.00 per year, by American Bar Foundation, 750 N. Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611. Second-class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: *American Bar Foundation Research Journal*, 750 N. Lake Shore Dr., Chicago, IL 60611.

Cite as 1985 A.B.F. Res. J. 000

From the Editors

Editorial Advisory Board

The Editors wish to express their gratitude to the following members of the Editorial Advisory Board of the *American Bar Foundation Research Journal* for their invaluable assistance during the past three years. We have relied on their advice and judgment both in formulating *Journal* policy and as reviewers of manuscripts.

Alfred F. Conard, University of Michigan Law School
John E. Coons, School of Law, University of California at Berkeley
Herman Goldstein, University of Wisconsin Law School
Herbert Jacob, Department of Political Science, Northwestern University
Peter Martin, Cornell Law School
Charles J. Meyers, the firm of Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher
Murray L. Schwartz, School of Law, University of California at Los Angeles

We are most pleased to announce that the following scholars have agreed to serve on the Editorial Advisory Board for the next three years.

Morris Arnold, U.S. District Court for the Western District of Arkansas
Erhard Blankenburg, Faculty of Law, Free University of Amsterdam
Lawrence M. Friedman, Stanford Law School
Eliot Friedson, Department of Sociology, New York University
Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard Law School
Robert J. Levy, University of Minnesota Law School
Doreen McBarnet, Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Wolfson College, Oxford
Carrie Menkel-Meadow, School of Law, University of California
at Los Angeles
Judith Resnik, University of Southern California Law Center
Barbara Yngvesson, Department of Anthropology, Hampshire College

Acknowledgments to Reviewers

The Editors wish to thank the following reviewers whose careful evaluations and helpful recommendations have greatly assisted us in selecting manuscripts for the 1985 volume of the *American Bar Foundation Research Journal*. We are grateful for their willingness to provide their expertise in furthering our efforts to ensure the publication of high-quality contributions to sociolegal scholarship.

Richard L. Abel
Carl A. Auerbach
Barbara Babcock
Lawrence Baum
Daniel Bell
Robert Bell
Michael Les Benedict
Maxwell Bloomfield
Charles Bosk
Judy Bourn
Wayne Brazil
William Bridges
John Brigham
Steven Brint
Charles L. Cappell
David F. Cavers
David L. Chambers
Erwin Chemerinsky
Thomas Church
Michael J. Churgin
Charlotte Crane
Barbara A. Curran
Jon Dalberg
Stephen Daniels
Stuart Deutsch
Stephen Diamond
Fred DuBow
Malcolm M. Feeley

William Felstiner
James Ferguson
Paul Finkelman
John Flood
Noah E. Friedkin
Bryant Garth
Jerry Goldman
Mark Granfors
Michael Grossberg
Joseph Gusfield
James Haddad
Kermit L. Hall
Hendrik A. Hartog
Robert Hayden
Albert Hunter
James Willard Hurst
Herbert Jacob
James B. Jacobs
Jack Katz
Karyl Kinsey
Herbert Kritzer
Jack Ladinsky
Mark Lazerson
David I. Levine
James Lindgren
Walter P. Loughlin
Robert Mason
Doreen McBarnet

Carrie Menkel-Meadow
Neal Milner
Martha Minow
Sheldon Nahmod
Robert Nelson
R. Kent Newmyer
Frank Parkin
Ronald Pipkin
Michael J. Powell
Mark Puccetti
Paul Rice
Robert Rosen
Victor Rosenblum
Douglas Rosenthal
Dietrich Rueschemeyer
Austin Sarat
Ted Schneyer
Murray L. Schwartz
Andy Shapiro
Jerome H. Skolnick
Jeffrey S. Slovak
Kent Smith
Eric Steele
Fred L. Strodbeck
Garth Taylor
Margaret A. Troha
Louise G. Trubek
Jamil Zainaldin