

Law and History Review

Law and History Review

Editor

Michael Grossberg
Case Western Reserve University

Book Review Editor

Christopher Tomlins
American Bar Foundation

Law and History Review (ISSN 0738-2480) is published twice a year, in spring and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions.

The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 S. Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

Address manuscript submissions to Michael Grossberg, Case Western Reserve University Law School, 11075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106. Instructions for preparation of manuscripts are printed on page ii. Address books for review to Christopher Tomlins, American Bar Foundation, 750 N. Lakeshore Drive, Chicago, Illinois 60611.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC code for *Law and History Review* is 0738-2480. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

Postmaster: Send change-of-address notices to University of Illinois Press, 1325 S. Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820.

© 1994 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

Law and History Review

Volume 12, Number 1

Spring 1994

*Published twice a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editorial Board

Constance Backhouse
*University of Western
Ontario*

Michael Les Benedict
Ohio State University

Eliane Clark
*University of Michigan-
Dearborn*

Cornelia Dayton
*University of California,
Irvine*

Tony Freyer
University of Alabama

Christain Fritz
University of New Mexico

Cynthia Herrup
Duke University

Herbert Hovenkamp
University of Iowa

Paul R. Hyams
Cornell University

William Jones
Washington University

Laura Kalman
*University of
California, Santa
Barbara*

Linda Kerber
University of Iowa

Michael Klarman
University of Virginia

David Konig
Washington University

Brian Levack
University of Texas

Bruce Mann
*University of
Pennsylvania*

Charles McCurdy
University of Virginia

John P. S. McLaren
University of Victoria

Kent Newmyer
*University of
Connecticut*

John Orth
*University of North
Carolina*

Lawrence Poos
*Catholic University of
America*

W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
Columbia*

Stephen Seigel
DePaul University

A. W. Brian Simpson
University of Michigan

Susan Staves
Brandeis University

Robert Steinfeld
*State University of
New York, Buffalo*

Emily Z. Tabuteau
*Michigan State
University*

Brian Young
McGill University

Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts, books for review, and suggestions concerning *Law and History Review*. Manuscripts should be submitted to Michael Grossberg, Case Western Reserve University Law School, 11075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106. The text should be typed, double-spaced, on 8½" x 11" paper with ample margins on all sides. Type on one side of the paper only. Footnotes should be typed double-spaced and separate from the text, and should conform to either the style found in the *Chicago Manual of Style* (13th ed.) or to *A Uniform System of Citation* (14th ed.); the *Chicago Manual* is preferred. Authors of accepted manuscripts should contact the editorial office regarding computer compatibility. Because of the commitment we ask of our outside referees, *Law and History Review* cannot consider for publication manuscripts that have been submitted to other journals. A submission to the *Review* carries with it the implicit promise that the author will not submit the manuscript elsewhere while it is under consideration by *Law and History Review*.

Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 12, No. 1, Spring 1994

Articles

Moving Beyond the Canon of Traditional Constitutional History: Anti-Federalists, the Bill of Rights, and the Promise of Post-Modern Historiography 1
Saul Cornell

The Concept of Property in the Early Common Law 29
David J. Seipp

Symposium: English Legal History in the Age of Mansfield

Introduction 93
Michael Grossberg

Truth-Telling in the Eighteenth-Century English Courtroom 95
James Oldham

Chattel Property Rules and the Construction of Englishness 123
Susan Staves

Punishment and Brutalization in the English Enlightenment 155
J. S. Cockburn

Book Reviews

Fundamental Authority in Late Medieval English Law—
Norman Doe 181
reviewed by David Millon

Law, Family and Women: Toward a Legal Anthropology of Renaissance Italy—Thomas Kuehn 185
reviewed by James Q. Whitman

Interpretation and Meaning in the Renaissance: The Case of Law—Ian Maclean 189
reviewed by Peter Goodrich

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>A Short History of Western Legal Theory</i> —John M. Kelly reviewed by Albert J. Schmidt | 191 |
| <i>The Mansfield Manuscripts and the Growth of English Law in the Eighteenth Century</i> —James Oldham reviewed by Henry J. Bourguignon | 193 |
| <i>Law and People in Colonial America</i> —Peter Charles Hoffer reviewed by Bernard J. Hibbitts | 197 |
| <i>The Rise of the Penitentiary: Prisons and Punishment in Early America</i> —Adam J. Hirsch reviewed by Lawrence M. Friedman | 200 |
| <i>Cold War Casualty: The Court Martial of Major General Robert W. Grow</i> —George F. Hoffman reviewed by Jonathan O. Lurie | 203 |
| <i>The Wheeling Bridge Case: Its Significance in American Law and Technology</i> —Elizabeth Brand Monroe reviewed by Peter Karsten | 205 |
| <i>From Punishment to Doing Good: Family Courts and Socialized Justice in Ontario, 1880–1940</i> —Dorothy E. Chunn reviewed by Mary Stokes | 207 |
| <i>John Marshall Harlan: The Last Whig Justice</i> —Loren P. Beth reviewed by Tony Freyer | 210 |
| <i>The Transformation of American Law, 1870–1960: The Crisis of Legal Orthodoxy</i> —Morton J. Horwitz reviewed by Allan M. Winkler | 213 |
| <i>Arming Military Justice: Volume 1, The Origins of the United States Court of Military Appeals, 1775–1950</i> — Jonathan O. Lurie reviewed by Jerry Cooper | 215 |