

# JOURNAL of Law and Religion

Volume XXI

Number 1

2005-2006

---

## Articles

Asking the Right Questions: Harnessing the Insights  
of Bernard Lonergan for the Rule of Law *Patrick McKinley Brennan*

Legal Theology: The Turn to Conceptualism in  
Nineteenth-Century Jewish Law *Chaim Saiman*

Christian Scripture and American Scripture:  
An Instructive Analogy? *Gregory A. Kalscheur, S.J.*

The Use of Natural Law in Early Calvinist  
Resistance Theory *David VanDrunen*

## Review Essays

Religion in the World *Carolyn Evans*

Religion and Politics in the United States *Marci A. Hamilton*

## Book Reviews

*Taking Faith Seriously*,  
edited by Mary Jo Bane, Brent Coffin and Richard Higgins *Kenneth R. Himes*

*Homicide in the Biblical World*,  
by Pamela Barmash *Beth Berkowitz*

*Roger Williams (Lives and Legacies)*,  
by Edwin S. Gaustad *Timothy L. Hall*

*How Can a Christian be in Politics? A Guide Toward  
Faithful Politics*,  
by Roy Herron *Robert F. Drinan*

*Gandhi's Way: A Handbook of Conflict Resolution*,  
by Mark Juergensmeyer *Darrell Cole*

*(continued on outside back cover)*

---

Sponsored by: Hamline University School of Law

Published by: Hamline University School of Law  
ISSN: 0748-0814

# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXI

2005-2006

NUMBER 1

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### *Editor*

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

### *Associate Editors*

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary  
HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

### *Book Review Editor*

LESLIE GRIFFIN, University of Houston Law Center

### *Technical Editors*

MARY L. DUNNEWOLD, Hamline University School of Law  
STEPHEN LIEBO, Hamline University School of Law

### *Production/Subscription Manager*

LINDA BERGLIN, Hamline University School of Law

### EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

JENNIFER CHO

CHRISTOPHER GANGL

TANEEZA ISLAM

PETER NAVIS

MARIT PETERSON

REBECCA PINERO

LINDSAY SHAW

KAREN WESTWOOD

## EDITORIAL BOARD

*JOSÉ ROBERTO JUÁREZ, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law, Chair*

*STEPHEN L. CARTER, Yale Law School*

*PAULA COOEY, Macalester College*

*ANTHONY E. COOK, Georgetown University Law Center*

*ANVER M. EMON, University of Toronto*

*MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law*

*Ex Officio*

*JON M. GARON, Hamline University School of Law*

*LESLIE C. GRIFFIN, University of Houston Law Center*

*Ex Officio*

*EMILY ALBRINK HARTIGAN, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law*

*AFRA JALABI, Islamic Scholar, Ile Perrot, Quebec*

*PATRICK R. KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary*

*HOWARD LESNICK, University of Pennsylvania Law School*  
*ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University*  
*ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Law*  
*NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee, Secretary*  
*RUSSELL PEARCE, Fordham University School of Law*  
*MICHAEL PERRY, Emory University School of Law*  
*THOMAS PORTER, JUSTPEACE Center for Mediation & Conflict Transformation*  
*RICHARD QUINNEY, Professor Emeritus, Northern Illinois University*  
*ASIFA QURAIISHI, University of Wisconsin Law School*  
*EARL SCHWARTZ, Hamline University*  
*DARRYL TRIMIEW, Colgate Rochester Crozer Divinity School*  
*AMELIA UELMEN, Fordham University School of Law*  
*HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law, Treasurer*

The *Journal of Law and Religion* is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a interdisciplinary, interfaith academic and professional publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to the *Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$25 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$35 for institutions, and \$12 for students. Add an additional \$10 for foreign postage. Subscription requests, manuscripts, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

*Journal of Law and Religion*  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104  
[lberglin@hamline.edu](mailto:lberglin@hamline.edu)

Book reviews and books to be reviewed should be addressed to:  
[lgriffin@uh.edu](mailto:lgriffin@uh.edu)

Citations generally conform to the Association of Legal Writing Directors' *ALWD Citation Manual*. Citations to Jewish/Christian Biblical sources conform to the SBL Handbook of Style and the Jewish Law Annual. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of the *Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in the *Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of the *Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by the H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on-line on a variety of computer database services.

This periodical is also indexed in the *ATLA Religion Database*®, published by the American Theological Library Association, 300 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 2100, Chicago, IL 60606, E-mail: [atla@atla.com](mailto:atla@atla.com), WWW: <http://www.atla.com/>.

Internet access to information about the *Journal of Law and Religion*, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 21 J. L. & RELIG. (2005-06)

## **ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

- TAHA JABER AL-ALWANI, Graduate School of Social and Islamic Sciences*  
*AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond*  
*ABDULLAHI AN-NA'IM, Emory University School of Law*  
*ZAFAR ISHAQ ANSARI, Islamic Research Institute, International Islamic University, Pakistan*  
*RICHARD BAEPLER, Professor Emeritus, Valparaiso University School of Law*  
*MILNER BALL, University of Georgia School of Law*  
*HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law*  
*GERARD BRADLEY, Notre Dame University Law School*  
*MICHAEL J. BROYDE, Emory University School of Law*  
*LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law*  
*FRED CARNEY, Professor Emeritus, Perkins School of Theology,*  
*Southern Methodist University*  
*ROBERT F. COCHRAN, JR., Pepperdine University School of Law*  
*MOHAMED S. EL-AWA, Islamic Scholar, Egypt*  
*CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law*  
*EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law*  
*RICHARD HIERS, University of Florida*  
*CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School*  
*DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths*  
*SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law*  
*DAVID LITTLE, Harvard University Divinity School*  
*SEYYED HOSSEIN NASR, George Washington University*  
*LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College*  
*KAY PRANIS, Saint Paul, Minnesota*  
*ELISABETH SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School*  
*THOMAS L. SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School*  
*STEVEN D. SMITH, University of San Diego School of Law*  
*DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University*  
*PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law*  
*CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, South Africa*  
*MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany*  
*JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law*  
*WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities*  
*STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota*

**HAMLIN**  
**UNIVERSITY**  
**SCHOOL OF LAW**

A subscription to the  
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND  
RELIGION**

**Cost per volume (two issues):**

\$25.00 individual (U.S.)  
\$35.00 individual (foreign)  
\$35.00 institution (U.S.)  
\$45.00 institution (foreign)  
\$12.00 student

**Print and send to:**

Circulation Manager  
Journal of Law and Religion  
Hamline University School of Law  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
St. Paul, MN 55104  
U.S.

**Please Enclose Payment made out to:**  
Journal of Law and Religion

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

City: \_\_\_\_\_ State: \_\_\_\_\_ Zip: \_\_\_\_\_

Country: \_\_\_\_\_

Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Fax: \_\_\_\_\_ E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

## JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

### STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

*The Journal of Law and Religion* was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

*The Journal of Law and Religion* is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

- Historical** The *Journal* intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.
- Theoretical** The *Journal* intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.
- Ethical** The *Journal* intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.
- Global** The *Journal* intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.
- Professional** The *Journal* intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.
- Spiritual** The *Journal* recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The *Journal* is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the *Journal* intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

# ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire  
back stock, reprint and  
microform rights to the

## **JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION**

Complete sets to date  
are now available.  
We can also furnish  
single volumes and issues.

**WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.**  
1285 Main Street  
Buffalo, New York 14209-1987

Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at 800.828.7571;  
via fax 716.883.8100; or found in electronic format for all your research  
needs on HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>

*Check out our website!*

# Journal of Law & Religion

<http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>



Books of Interest

Contemporary Conversations



Index of Issues



How to become a Subscriber



Lifetime Achievement Awards

Table of U.S. Supreme Court Decisions  
Relating to Religious Liberty



Soon to be added:  
Announcements of Coming Events

# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXI

2005-2006

NUMBER 1

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface ..... xiii

### ARTICLES

- Patrick McKinley  
Brennan *Asking the Right Questions: Harnessing the  
Insights of Bernard Lonergan for the Rule  
of Law* ..... 1
- Chaim Saiman *Legal Theology: The Turn to Conceptualism in  
Nineteenth-Century Jewish Law* ..... 39
- Gregory A. Kalscheur,  
S.J. *Christian Scripture and American Scripture:  
An Instructive Analogy?* ..... 101
- David VanDrunen *The Use of Natural Law in Early Calvinist  
Resistance Theory* ..... 143

### REVIEW ESSAYS

- Carolyn Evans *Religion in the World* ..... 169
- Marci A. Hamilton *Religion and Politics in the United States* ..... 173

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

BOOK REVIEWS

Kenneth R. Himes	<i>Taking Faith Seriously</i> , edited by Mary Jo Bane, Brent Coffin and Richard Higgins.....	181
Beth Berkowitz	<i>Homicide in the Biblical World</i> , by Pamela Barmash .....	185
Timothy L. Hall	<i>Roger Williams (Lives and Legacies)</i> , by Edwin S. Gaustad.....	189
Robert F. Drinan	<i>How Can a Christian be in Politics?</i> <i>A Guide Toward Faithful Politics</i> , by Roy Herron .....	193
Darrell Cole	<i>Gandhi's Way: A Handbook of Conflict Resolution</i> , by Mark Juergensmeyer.....	197
Peter Clark	<i>Contemporary Catholic Health Care Ethics</i> , by David F. Kelly.....	201
Stacey A. Tovino	<i>Introduction to Jewish and Catholic Bioethics: A Comparative Analysis</i> , by Aaron L. Mackler.....	205
Mark P. Strasser	<i>The Philosophy of Positive Law: Foundations of Jurisprudence</i> , by James Bernard Murphy.....	209
David R. Dow	<i>Religion and the Death Penalty: A Call for Reckoning</i> , edited by Erik C. Owens, John D. Carlson and Eric P. Elshtain.....	213
Stephen Parker	<i>In Good Faith: Schools, Religion and Public Funding</i> , by Marie Parker-Jenkins, Dimitra Hartas and Barrie A. Irving.....	217

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

Betty Mensch	Jonathan Edwards, <i>Gilead</i> , and the Problem of “Tradition”: <i>Gilead</i> , by Marilynne Robinson; <i>Jonathan Edwards: A Life</i> , by George M. Marsden ..... 221
James A.R. Nafziger	<i>Religion &amp; Security: The New Nexus in International Relations</i> , edited by Robert A. Seiple and Dennis R. Hoover ..... 243
Stacey A. Tovino	<i>Jewish Biomedical Law: Legal and Extra-legal Dimensions</i> , by Daniel B. Sinclair..... 247
Dian Murray	<i>Tibetan Buddhists in the Making of Modern China</i> , by Gary Tuttle..... 251
Stacey A. Tovino	<i>The Birth of Surrogacy in Israel</i> , by D. Kelly Weisberg ..... 255
Anver M. Emon	<i>Islamic Law and the Challenges of Modernity</i> , edited by Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad and Barbara Freyer Stowasser..... 259