

makes the identity of *Antonium* unmistakable: *auulsum Catilinae* in Cestius; in Pliny, the immediately preceding clause *tuum Catilina fugit ingenium*. The ‘Antonius’ linked with Catiline at *Suas.* 7.2 and *HN* 7.117 can be none other than C. Antonius (cos. 63).

University of Illinois at Chicago

JOHN T. RAMSEY

jtramsey@uic.edu

doi:10.1017/S0009838821000586

NOTES ON SEVEN PASSAGES OF PLUTARCH’S *LIVES**

ABSTRACT

This article discusses the text and interpretation of passages in Plutarch’s Lives of Romulus, Agis and Cleomenes, Pericles, Brutus, Marcellus, Alexander and Marius.

Keywords: Plutarch; emendation; interpretation; religion; cult; cavalry

(I) *ROMULUS* 29.10

αἱ δὲ θεραπαινίδες ἀγείρουσι περιουῶσαι καὶ παίζουσιν, εἴτα πληγαῖς καὶ βολαῖς λίθων χρῶνται πρὸς ἀλλήλας.¹

The slave-girls, going around, ἀγείρουσι and engage in play, then they come to blows and throw stones at one another.

This passage describes the ritual behaviour of slave-girls at the Roman festival of Nonae Capratinae. The verb ἀγείρουσι is commonly mistranslated: ‘gather together’,² or (with περιουῶσαι) ‘run about in companies’,³ ‘a gruppi, vanno in giro’.⁴ The active verb does not have such an intransitive sense. The correct meaning is given in the Budé edition: ‘font une quête’ (‘make a collection’).⁵ The girls are engaged in ritual begging (or soliciting of presents).⁶

* I am grateful to Nicholas Lane for helpful comments.

¹ Cl. Lindskog and K. Ziegler, *Plutarchi Vitae Parallelae*, I.1 (Leipzig, 1969⁴), 76.

² J. Tatum, in I. Scott-Kilvert, J. Tatum, C. Pelling, *The Rise of Rome: Twelve Lives by Plutarch* (London, 2013), 47.

³ B. Perrin, *Plutarch’s Lives* (Cambridge, Mass., 1914–26), 1.187.

⁴ C. Ampolo and M. Manfredini, *Le Vite de Teseo e di Romolo* (Rome, 1988), 171.

⁵ R. Flacelière, É. Chambry, M. Juneaux (edd.), *Plutarque, Vies*, tome 1 (Paris, 1957), 100. The correct meaning was also recognized by W. Bühler, ‘Die doppelte Erzählung des Aitions der Nonae Caprotinae bei Plutarch’, *Maia* 14 (1962), 271–82, at 275 (a passing allusion to ‘das Detail des Bettelns’).

⁶ For an explanation of the custom, see J.N. Bremmer, ‘The Nonae Capratinae’, in J.N. Bremmer and N.M. Horsfall, *Roman Myth and Mythography (BICS Supplement 52)* (London, 1987), 76–88, especially 82–3. Bremmer nowhere specifies in which of the sources (listed at 77 n. 3) begging is found. I find it only here and (in a very oblique allusion) at Ov. *Ars am.* 2.257–8. (Two references on his list need to be corrected: Aus. *Fer.* 24.16 to Auson. 14.16 Green and Macrobian *Sat.* 11.11 to 1.11.)

Plutarch has transferred to a Roman context a verb which has a specific association with Greek religion and cult. It is used (absolutely, as here) to describe the activity of collecting gifts or alms for deities or the like: Aesch. fr. 168.16 νύμφαι ναμερτεῖς, [κυδραῖ θεα]ί, αἷσιν ἀγείρω, Hdt. 4.35.3 (twice), Pl. *Resp.* 381d, W. Dittenberger, *Sylloge Inscriptionum Graecarum* 3 (Leipzig, 1920³), 1015.27 (ἡ ἱέρεια) ἀγειρέτω; see LSJ ἀγείρω II.2. In two passages of Lucian the collection is made for Cybele, by celebrants of her rites: *Alex.* 13 σεῖων ἅμα τὴν κόμην ἄνετον ὥσπερ οἱ τῇ μητρὶ ἀγείροντές τε καὶ ἐνθειάζοντες, *Sat.* 12 ὡς ἀγείροιεν τῇ μητρὶ σὺν αὐλοῖς καὶ τυμπάνοις βάκηλοι γενόμενοι.

These passages of Lucian explain another passage of Plutarch, where ἀγείρειν is again used absolutely and again is sometimes misunderstood: *Agis et Cleom.* 54.2 (= *Cleom.* 33.2) ὁ μὲν γὰρ βασιλεὺς αὐτὸς οὕτω διέφθαρτο τὴν ψυχὴν ὑπὸ γυναικῶν καὶ πότων ὥσθ', ὁπότε νήφοι μάλιστα καὶ σπουδαιότατος αὐτοῦ γένοιτο, τελετὰς τελεῖν καὶ τύμπανον ἔχων ἐν τοῖς βασιλείοις ἀγείρειν⁷ ('For the king himself was so corrupted in spirit by wine and women that, when he was at his most sober and serious, he would celebrate religious rites and, holding a hand-drum, ἀγείρειν in his palace'). The meaning is not 'rassembler les gens',⁸ 'assemble the people',⁹ or 'act the mountebank'.¹⁰ Others have recognized the correct meaning.¹¹ The passage is to be linked with *Cleom.* 36.7, where the king is described as μητραγύρτης and as 'ready to kill as soon as he lays aside his hand-drum and ends his revelry'. The word μητραγύρτης refers, sometimes pejoratively, to a devotee who collects money for Cybele (LSJ s.v.). The king is acting like one of these.

(II) PERICLES 1.3

ὡς γὰρ ὀφθαλμῶι χροὰ πρόσφορος, ἥς τὸ ἀνθηρὸν ἅμα καὶ τερπνὸν ἀναζωπυρεῖ καὶ τρέφει τὴν ὄψιν, οὕτω τὴν διάνοιαν ἐπάγειν δεῖ θεάμασιν ἃ τῷ χαίρειν πρὸς τὸ οἰκεῖον αὐτὴν ἀγαθὸν ἐκκαλεῖ. ταῦτα δὲ κτλ.¹²

A colour is suited to the eye if its freshness, and its pleasantness as well, stimulates and nourishes the vision; and so our intellectual vision must be applied to such objects as, by their very charm, invite it onward to its own proper good. Such objects ...¹³

The verb ἐκκαλεῖν, in the active, is used only in a literal sense, of calling or summoning a person from a place. In more extended senses, such as 'provoke, rouse, prompt' (an activity or emotion, or, as here, to an activity or emotion), it is always middle: for

⁷ Lindskog and Ziegler, III.1 (1996³), 407.

⁸ R. Flacelière and E. Chambry (edd.), *Plutarque, Vies*, tome 11 (Paris, 1976), 76.

⁹ R.J.A. Talbert, *Plutarch on Sparta* (London, 1988), 99.

¹⁰ Perrin (n. 3), 10.125.

¹¹ 'stipem colligere, quod faciebant sacerdotes', G.F. Schoemann, *Plutarchi Agis et Cleomenes* (Greifswald, 1839), 266; 'betteln', C. Sintenis, *Plutarchs Agis und Cleomenes* (Leipzig, 1850), 91; 'questuare', G. Marasco, *Commento alle biografie Plutarchee di Agide e di Cleomene* (Rome, 1981), 622, also D. Magnino, *Plutarco, Agide e Cleomene, Tiberio e Caio Gracco* (Milan, 1991), 246.

¹² Lindskog and Ziegler, I.2 (1994³), 1.

¹³ Perrin (n. 3), 3.3–5.

example (for the former) Aesch. *Ag.* 270 χαρὰ ... δάκρυον ἐκκαλουμένη, Aeschin. 2.3 τὴν ὑμετέραν ὀργὴν ἐκκαλέσασθαι, (for the latter) Polyb. 2.56.7 εἰς ἔλεον ἐκκαλεῖσθαι τοὺς ἀναγινώσκοντας, 4.57.4 ἐξεκέκλητο πρὸς τὴν πρᾶξιν αὐτοῦς, Diod. Sic. 10.5.2 τὰς τῆς φύσεως ἐπιθυμίας πρὸς τὴν ἀπόλαυσιν ἐκκαλεσάμενοι, Plut. *Flam.* 21.9 ἐκκαλεῖσθαι ... πρὸς τὰς ἐπιθέσεις τοὺς ἀεὶ τῷ μισεῖν πολεμοῦντας, *Brut.* 9.5 Βρούτον ... ἐξεκαλοῦντο καὶ παρώρων ἐπὶ τὴν πρᾶξιν. We should therefore probably write ἐκκαλεῖ<ται>, a simple error of lipography before ταῦτα.¹⁴

(III) *BRUTUS* 51.1

Βρούτος δὲ διαβάς τι ρεῖθρον ὑλώδες καὶ παράκρημον ἦδη σκότου ὄντος οὐ πολὺ προῆλθεν.¹⁵

But Brutus, after crossing a brook which ran among trees and had precipitous banks, would go no further, since it was already dark.¹⁶

ὕλωδης, ‘wooded’, usually describes terrain covered by trees or undergrowth, and is less naturally applied to a river. Even if it is allowable to give it the sense ‘among trees’,¹⁷ it lacks point, and is a weak partner for παράκρημον. This second adjective makes a clear and telling point—a river with precipitous banks presents an obstacle to those wishing to cross it. A river among trees is nothing very remarkable.

LSJ (ὕλωδης II, invoking ὕλη IV.1) translates the adjective as ‘turbid, muddy’, in this and two other passages of Plutarch: (i) *Sull.* 20.7 λίμνας τυφλὰς καὶ ὑλώδεις, where the change to ἐλώδεις (Bryan)¹⁸ restores a phrase found in Diod. Sic. 3.23.3 and Paus. 1.32.7; (ii) *Pyrrh.* 21.7 ποταμὸν ὑλώδη καὶ τραχύν, where the change to ἱλυώδη (Schaefer),¹⁹ ‘muddy’, restores a suitable partner for τραχύν, ‘with a powerful current’. And in our passage, too, ἱλυῶδες (Coray) is the right partner for παράκρημον.²⁰ Cf. also App. *Hisp.* 384 ποταμὸς ... ἱλυώδης.

(IV) *MARCELLUS* 6.9

ὁ δὲ Μάρκελλος, ὡς μὴ φθαῖεν αὐτὸν ἐγκυκλωσάμενοι καὶ περιχυθέντες ὀλιγοστὸν ὄντα, τὰς ἱλας ἦγε πόρρω τῶν ἱππέων καὶ παρήλαυνε (Ziegler: περιήλαυνε codd.), λεπτὸν ἐκτείνων (ἐπέιγων L¹) τὸ κέρας, ἄχρι οὐ μικρὸν ἀπέσχε τῶν πολεμίων.²¹

¹⁴ Additionally (as Mr Lane observes) the preceding actives ἀναζωπυρεῖ and τρέφει may have assisted the change to active ἐκκαλεῖ.

¹⁵ Lindsog and Ziegler, II.1 (1964²), 177.

¹⁶ Perrin (n. 3), 6.241.

¹⁷ Or ‘shaded by trees’, I. Scott-Kilvert, *Makers of Rome: Nine Lives by Plutarch* (London, 1965), 267.

¹⁸ Less good is ἱλυῶδεις (Latte), printed by Lindsog and Ziegler, III.2 (1973²).

¹⁹ Printed by Lindsog and Ziegler, III.1 (1971²), but revoked by H. Gärtner in the revised edition (1996³), Addenda page 475, in deference to the Budé text.

²⁰ It is reported, but not printed, by Lindsog and Ziegler (n. 15), alongside the unappealing δινώδες (F.W. Schmidt).

²¹ Lindsog and Ziegler, II.2 (1994³), 112.

But Marcellus, that they might not succeed in enclosing and surrounding him and his few followers, led his troops of cavalry forward and tried to outflank them, extending his wing into a thin line, until he was not far from the enemy.²²

Such a predicative use of λεπτόν ('extending his wing *into a thin line*') is acceptable. But one may wonder whether Plutarch wrote περιήλαυνε<ν, ἐπὶ λεπτόν, using the standard prepositional expression: Xen. *Cyr.* 5.4.46 ἐπὶ λεπτόν καὶ ἀσθενὲς τὸ μάχμιον τετάχθαι, Polyb. 1.27.7 ἐπὶ λεπτόν ἐκτεταμένους τοὺς Καρχηδονίους, 3.115.6 τῶν μὲν Κελτῶν ἐπὶ λεπτόν ἐκτετα{γ}μένων,²³ App. *Hann.* 94 τὴν τάξιν ἐκτείναντες ἐπὶ λεπτόν, App. *Tact.* 29.10 ἐπὶ λεπτόν ἐπεκτείναντα; similarly Xen. *Hell.* 4.8.38 ἐπὶ πολὺ τε καὶ στενὸν ἐκτεταμένον τὸ αὐτοῦ στράτευμα.²⁴

(V) ALEXANDER 32.5

ἔσχε γὰρ ὁ ἀγὼν ὑποτροπὴν καὶ σάλον ἐν τῷ εὐωνύμῳ κέρατι κατὰ Παρμενίωνα, τῆς Βακτριανῆς ἵππου ρόθῳ πολλῷ καὶ μετὰ βίας παρεμπεσούσης εἰς τοὺς Μακεδόνας.²⁵

For in the battle the left wing under Parmenio was thrown back and in distress, when the Bactrian cavalry fell upon the Macedonians with great impetuosity and violence.²⁶

Similarly (for ρόθῳ πολλῷ) 'avec beaucoup de fougue';²⁷ somewhat differently, 'with a terrific roar' (Waterfield).²⁸ The latter is closer to the meaning of the noun. But the noun is found only in verse (no more than seven occurrences, in Hesiod, Aeschylus, Pindar, Nicander, Oppian), except for a solitary passage in which Plutarch is said to have used it as the Boeotian term for 'mountain path'.²⁹

A more natural noun here would be ροθίῳ, which describes various kinds of tumultuous and noisy movement (LSJ ρόθιος II.1), commonly (several times in Plutarch) that of ships being rowed vigorously. It is applied to a cavalry charge in Dion. Hal. *Ant. Rom.* 6.10.3 Λατῖνοι μὲν τῷ πλήθει τῆς σφετέρας ἵππου πιστεύσαντες, ἥς οὐδὲ τὸ ρόθιον ὦιντο τοὺς Ῥωμαίους ἱππεῖς ἀνέξεσθαι. Plutarch's application of the word to a cavalry charge may have been prompted by his use of the word σάλος (a maritime metaphor) just before.³⁰

²² Perrin (n. 3), 5.449 (translating περιήλαυνε).

²³ ἐκτεταμένων is my emendation of ἐκτεταγμένων.

²⁴ It is conceivable (as Mr Lane suggests) that ἐπεύγων (L¹) preserves a vestige of an original ἐπὶ.

²⁵ Lindskog and Ziegler (n. 21), 196.

²⁶ Perrin (n. 3), 7.321.

²⁷ R. Flacelière and É. Chambry (edd.), *Plutarque, Vies*, tome 9 (Paris, 1975), 72.

²⁸ R. Waterfield, *Plutarch, Greek Lives: A Selection of Nine Greek Lives* (Oxford, 1998), 343. Others translate ρόθῳ πολλῷ καὶ μετὰ βίας together: 'with tumultuous fury', K.J. Maidment, *Plutarch, Life of Alexander* (Auckland, 1971), 41, 'by a violent charge', I. Scott-Kilvert, *The Age of Alexander: Nine Greek Lives by Plutarch* (London, 1973), 289.

²⁹ fr. 34 Sandbach (*Plutarchi Moralia* 7 [Leipzig, 1967], 28).

³⁰ Perrin's translation of σάλος as 'distress' does not bring this out; 'turbulence' might do so. For the metaphorical use, in military contexts, see *Aem.* 18.3 ὁ μὲν οὖν Αἰμίλιος ὥσπερ κυβερνήτης τῷ παρόντι σάλῳ καὶ κινήματι τῶν στρατοπέδων τεκμαιρόμενος τὸ μέγεθος τοῦ μέλλοντος ἀγῶνος, *Mar.* 20.9 ἐν περιτροπῇ καὶ σάλῳ τῶν σωμάτων ὄντων.

(VI) *ALEXANDER* 33.8

Δαρείος δέ, τῶν δεινῶν ἀπάντων ἐν ὀφθαλμοῖς ὄντων, καὶ τῶν προτεταγμένων δυνάμεων ἐρειπομένων εἰς αὐτόν, κτλ.³¹

But Darius, now that all the terrors of the struggle were before his eyes, and now that the forces drawn up to protect him were crowded back upon him, ...³²

Something like that ('were crowded back upon him') is the sense required—Alexander has just been described as τοὺς φεύγοντας ἐμβαλὼν εἰς τοὺς μένοντας, 'driving those who fled before him upon those who held their ground' (33.6). But ἐρειπομένων does not mean 'be crowded back', nor 'hurled back',³³ 'driven back',³⁴ 'pushed back',³⁵ 'break and surge back',³⁶ '(ses troupes) refluèrent sur lui'.³⁷

I suggest ἐπερειδομένων. The troops in front were 'pressing' (or passive 'being pressed') upon him. Cf. *Flam.* 8.4 ὅλην ἐπερείσας τὴν φάλαγγα τοῖς Ῥωμαίοις, 'bringing the whole weight of the phalanx to bear upon the Romans', *Pyrrh.* 21.11 ἐπερείσαντα τοῖς ἀντιτεταγμένοις, 'pressing hard upon his opponents'; LSJ ἐπερείδω I.2. The middle/passive has a similar sense in Eur. *Hec.* 111–12 σχεδίας | λαίφῃ προτόνοις ἐπερειδομένας, 'ships having their sails pressed against the forestays'. For εἰς after this verb (matching εἰς at 33.6, cited above), see Hom. *Il.* 5.856–7 ἐπέρεισε δὲ (*sc.* ἔγχος) Παλλὰς Ἀθήνη | νεῖατον ἐς κενεῶνα.³⁸

(VII) *MARIUS* 18.2

καὶ συσκευασάμενοι παρήμειβον τὸ στρατόπεδον τῶν Ῥωμαίων.³⁹

So they packed up their baggage and began to march past the camp of the Romans.⁴⁰

The active παρήμειβον is anomalous (LSJ παραμείβω A II). Read παρημείβον<το> τὸ στρατόπεδον, the usual middle, as (immediately below) τὸν χάρακα τοῦ Μαρίου παραμειψάσθαι, *Luc.* 17.3 παρημείβετο τὸ στρατόπεδον, *Pomp.* 32.9 παραμειψάμενος τὰς πηγάς, 73.2 παραμειψάμενος ... Λάρισσαν, *Ant.* 39.3 παρημείβετο τῶν βαρβάρων τὴν τάξιν.

Queens' College, Cambridge

JAMES DIGGLE

jd10000@cam.ac.uk

doi:10.1017/S0009838821000501

³¹ Lindskog and Ziegler (n. 21), 198.

³² Perrin (n. 3), 7.325.

³³ J.R. Hamilton, *Plutarch, Alexander. A Commentary* (Oxford, 1969), 88, calling it 'a strong expression'.

³⁴ Scott-Kilvert (n. 28), 291.

³⁵ Waterfield (n. 28), 344.

³⁶ Maidment (n. 28), 42.

³⁷ Flacelière and Chambry (n. 27), 75.

³⁸ As an alternative (suggested by Mr Lane), I would not exclude the simple verb ἐπειδομένων.

³⁹ Lindskog and Ziegler (n. 7), 64.

⁴⁰ Perrin (n. 3), 9.511.