

January 2022
Volume 137 Number 1

PMLA

Publications of the Modern Language Association of America

Engage Every Student with



Achieve



bedford
st.martin's
Macmillan Learning

Commenting is easy

Draft with comments

interactive e-book

ACHIEVE INCLUDES

- Close Reading Modules (see below)
- Interactive E-book
- Instructor Feedback Tools
- Reporting and Insights
- Peer Review
- Revision Plan
- Source Check

The content you trust *plus* the writing tools you need

Achieve puts student reading, writing, and revision at the core of your course, with interactive close reading modules, reading comprehension quizzes for the selections in the book, videos of professional writers and students discussing literary works, and a dedicated composition space that guides students through draft, review, source check, reflection, and revision.

Close Reading Modules

Writing in Response

Each of the 23 modules is based on a piece of popular literature—classic as well as contemporary poetry or fiction, or a selected scene from a play—and features a sequence of five prompts to guide student activities.

1. Read for Overall Impression
2. Read for Understanding
3. Analyze with Guidance
4. Draw Connections
5. Write in Response

To review Achieve, contact your local Bedford/St. Martin's representative or visit: [macmillanlearning.com/PMLAJan2022](https://www.macmillanlearning.com/PMLAJan2022)

January 2022
Volume 137 Number 1

PMLA

Publications of the Modern Language Association of America

Published five times a year by the
Modern Language Association of America
and Cambridge University Press

THE MODERN LANGUAGE
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

[Organized 1883, Incorporated 1900]

Officers

FOR THE TERM ENDING 8 JANUARY 2023

President

CHRISTOPHER JOHN NEWFIELD
University of California, Santa Barbara

First Vice President

FRIEDA EKOTTO
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

Second Vice President

DANA A. WILLIAMS
Howard University

Executive Director

PAULA M. KREBS

Executive Council

FOR THE TERM ENDING 8 JANUARY 2023

ANN KALSCHUR SUAREZ
MiraCosta College, CA

ANJALI PRABHU
Wellesley College

JULIE SHOULTS
Muhlenberg College

FOR THE TERM ENDING 7 JANUARY 2024

LISA KARAKAYA
Graduate Center, City University of New York

JAHAN RAMAZANI
University of Virginia

IGNACIO SÁNCHEZ PRADO
Washington University in St. Louis

FOR THE TERM ENDING 5 JANUARY 2025

ESTHER ALLEN
Baruch College,

City University of New York

REBECCA COLESWORTHY
State University of New York Press

ERIN D. GRAFF ZIVIN
University of Southern California

FOR THE TERM ENDING 11 JANUARY 2026

SUSAN STANFORD FRIEDMAN
University of Wisconsin, Madison

LEAH S. MARCUS
Vanderbilt University

IFEOMA C. KIDDOE NWANKWO
Sarah Lawrence College

Trustees of Invested Funds

CHRISTOPHER JOHN NEWFIELD

IGNACIO SÁNCHEZ PRADO

WILLIAM H. JANEWAY
(Managing Trustee)

New York, New York

DOMNA C. STANTON
New York, New York

CATHARINE R. STIMPSON
New York, New York

PMLA

PUBLICATIONS OF
THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

[Published five times a year]

Available online at *JSTOR* and *Cambridge Core*;
indexed in the *MLA International Bibliography*.



Editor

BRENT HAYES EDWARDS

Columbia University

*Director of
Scholarly Communication*
ANGELA GIBSON

Head of Periodical Publications
SARA PASTEL

Senior Editor
BARNEY LATIMER

Associate Editors
JOHN D. GOLBACH
JOSEPH WALLACE

*Senior Advertising Manager and
Submissions Associate*
ANNABEL SCHNEIDER

Editorial Assistant
ISAIAH HOLBROOK

PMLA (ISSN 0030-8129) is published five times a year, in January, March, May, September, and October, by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, and the Modern Language Association of America. Membership in the association is open to persons who are professionally interested in the modern languages and literatures. Information about annual dues, which include subscription to *PMLA*, is available at www.mla.org/Membership/About-Membership. Membership applications are available on request and at www.mla.org/Membership/Join-the-MLA.

For libraries and other institutions, a subscription in 2022 to the print or electronic format of *PMLA* can be purchased through a Cambridge University Press library sales representative. Subscriptions include online access to the 2002–21 volumes. Single copies of issues for the current year and the previous one are also available for purchase. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within six months of the publication date; thereafter the single-issue price will be charged. In the Americas, write to subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org. In all other parts of the world, write to journals@cambridge.org.

The MLA publication and editorial offices are located at 85 Broad Street, Suite 500, New York, NY 10004-2434 (646 576-5000; pmlasubmissions@mla.org).

All communications concerning membership should be sent to Member and Administrative Services, MLA, 85 Broad Street, Suite 500, New York, NY 10004-2434 (646 576-5151; membership@mla.org).

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

© 2022 Published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the Modern Language Association of America. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. MLA and the MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION are trademarks owned by the Modern Language Association of America.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040.

United States Postal Service Number 449-660.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *PMLA*, Member and Administrative Services, MLA, 85 Broad Street, Suite 500, New York, NY 10004-2434.

Contents

JANUARY 2022

- 5 Submitting Manuscripts to *PMLA*
 6 Forthcoming in *PMLA*
 6 Features in *PMLA*
 9 **Editor's Column—Rethinking Exceptionalism in an Age of Plague: An Introduction**



- 19 ***Waiting for Godot* and the Racial Theater of the Absurd**
SHANE VOGEL
 36 **Fossil Fuel Fiction and the Geologies of Race**
SHOUHEI TANAKA
 52 **Imagining the Bob and Wheel**
EMMA MAGGIE SOLBERG
 70 **Ibn al-Khaṭīb: Character Assassin**
SHERIF ABDELKARIM
 88 **Resentment: Shakespeare and Nietzsche on Anger without Privilege**
BENEDICT S. ROBINSON



LITTLE-KNOWN DOCUMENTS

- 107 **A Laboratory Fancy**
JOHN M. OSKISON
INTRODUCTION BY ALEX BENSON



THEORIES AND METHODOLOGIES

Rethinking Exceptionalism

- 112 **Resentful Humanitarianism**
MARÍA DEL PILAR BLANCO
 119 **Unexceptional States**
ANNE ANLIN CHENG
 125 **“Is God Still French?”: Racecraft, States of Exception, and the Creation of *l'Exception Française***
CHRISTY PICHICHERO

Editorial Board

- HEATHER BLURTON, 2022
University of California, Santa Barbara
 GAURAV G. DESAI, 2023
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor
 CHRISTINA GERHARDT, 2023
Princeton University
 ANNE MONROE LAMBRIGHT, 2023
Carnegie Mellon University
 MARY MCALPIN, 2022
University of Tennessee, Knoxville
 JOSEPHINE PARK, 2022
University of Pennsylvania

Advisory Committee

- AKINWUMI ADESOKAN, 2024
Indiana University, Bloomington
 PATRICIA AKHIMIE, 2024
Rutgers University, Newark
 ERIC GARY ANDERSON, 2022
George Mason University
 ARTURO ARIAS, 2023
University of California, Merced
 C. D. BLANTON, 2022
University of California, Berkeley
 TOBIAS BOES, 2022
University of Notre Dame
 JIM BROWN, 2023
Rutgers University, Camden
 KATHARINE CAPSHAW, 2022
University of Connecticut, Storrs
 NATALIA CECIRE, 2023
University of Sussex
 MICHAEL C. COHEN, 2022
University of California, Los Angeles
 JOHN ALBA CUTLER, 2024
University of California, Berkeley
 MARTHA CUTTER, 2024
University of Connecticut, Storrs
 JENNY DAVIDSON, 2022
Columbia University
 CESAR DOMINGUEZ, 2023
Universidade de Santiago de Compostela
 PATRICK E. DOVE, 2024
Indiana University, Bloomington
 NATALIE EDWARDS, 2023
University of Adelaide, Adelaide
 MARTIN G. EISNER, 2022
Duke University
 NICOLÁS FERNÁNDEZ-MEDINA, 2024
Penn State University, University Park
 MELISSA J. GANZ, 2024
Marquette University
 PETER C. HERMAN, 2024
San Diego State University
 JONATHAN HSY, 2024
George Washington University

(continued)

Advisory Committee (continued)

- AHMED IDRISI ALAMI, 2024
Purdue University, West Lafayette
- ESSAKA JOSHUA, 2024
University of Notre Dame
- BONNIE LENORE KYBURZ, 2023
Northern Illinois University
- KATHRYN LACHMAN, 2021
University of Massachusetts, Amherst
- Ji-EUN LEE, 2024
Washington University in St. Louis
- LEILA MARIA LEHNEN, 2022
Brown University
- MATTHEW LEVAY, 2024
Idaho State University
- PETER MALLIOS, 2023
University of Maryland, College Park
- SHARON LOIS MAZER, 2024
Auckland University of Technology
- NICK NESBITT, 2024
Princeton University
- JANE OGDEN NEWMAN, 2022
University of California, Irvine
- ALAN RAUCH, 2022
University of North Carolina, Charlotte
- THANGAM RAVINDRANATHAN, 2024
Brown University
- CHARLOTTE ROGERS, 2023
University of Virginia
- MATTHEW ROWLINSON, 2023
Western University
- IGNACIO SÁNCHEZ PRADO, 2022
Washington University in St. Louis
- FRANCESCA CANADÉ SAUTMAN, 2023
*Hunter College,
City University of New York*
- SUBRAMANIAN SHANKAR, 2023
University of Hawai'i, Mānoa
- DANIEL SHORE, 2023
Georgetown University
- VICTOR SIERRA MATUTE, 2022
New York University
- JONATHAN STONE, 2022
Franklin and Marshall College
- NATHAN SUHR-SYTSMA, 2023
Emory University
- EDWIGE TAMALET TALBAYEV, 2024
Tulane University
- ELISA TAMARKIN, 2022
University of California, Berkeley
- ROBERT TRAIN, 2023
Sonoma State University
- VICKI TROMANHAUSER, 2024
State University of New York, New Paltz
- JEFFREY TUCKER, 2024
University of Rochester
- CHANTAL ZABUS, 2024
Université Sorbonne Paris Nord

JANUARY 2022

- 136 Ceremonies Lost and Found: Global South Critical Philosophy against Cognitive Exceptionalism
DEBORAH JENSON
- 144 Boethian Abolition
SEETA CHAGANTI
- 155 Exceptionalism and Anticolonial Writing: The Afro-Asian Movement and Its Forerunners
PETER KALLINEY
- 163 Homo Alphabeticus, Glottographic Exceptionalism, and the Ethnocentric Definition of Writing
GALEN BROKAW
- 171 Rethinking Asian American Exceptionalism
JOSEPHINE PARK
- 177 The Land of Gods: The Myth of Shambhala as a Dream of American Exceptionalism
ILYA VINITSKY
-
- FORUM
- 188 Publisher 2.0
LUCAS POWER, AARTHI VADDE
- 191 In Memoriam
- Index of Advertisers

Submitting Manuscripts to *PMLA*

Editorial Policy for Essays

PMLA welcomes essays of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature. As the publication of a large and heterogeneous association, the journal is receptive to a variety of topics, whether general or specific, and to all scholarly methods and theoretical perspectives. The ideal *PMLA* essay exemplifies the best of its kind, whatever the kind; addresses a significant problem; draws out clearly the implications of its findings; and engages the attention of its audience through a concise, readable presentation.

Eligibility

To be eligible for review, manuscripts must meet the following requirements:

MLA membership. Authors must be members of the MLA. (For a collaboratively written essay to be eligible for review, all coauthors must be members of the MLA.)

Author anonymity. Authors should not refer to themselves in the first person in the submitted text or notes if such references would identify them; any necessary references to the author's previous work, for example, should be in the third person.

Word length. Articles must be between 6,000 and 9,000 words. The word count includes discursive notes but excludes works-cited lists and translations.

Originality. Articles cannot have been previously published in any language. An article is considered previously published if it appears in print or in an online outlet with the traits of publication, such as editorial selection of content, a formal presentation, and ongoing availability. Online contexts that typically lack these traits include personal web pages, discussion groups, and repositories.

Exclusive submission. Articles cannot be under consideration by other journals or publishers. An article found to have been simultaneously submitted elsewhere will not be published in *PMLA* even if it has already been accepted for publication by the Editorial Board.

Language. Manuscripts in languages other than English must be accompanied by a detailed summary in English (generally of 1,000 to 1,500 words) and must be translated into English if they are recommended to the Editorial Board. Translations should accompany all foreign language quotations.

Scope. *PMLA* does not publish book reviews or new works of fiction. Submissions should be broadly of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature.

Quality. *PMLA* publishes the best of its kind. Works that demonstrate egregious signs of poor quality (e.g., lack of scholarly apparatus when relevant, evidence of extreme carelessness in preparation) cannot be sent for review.

Forthcoming in *PMLA*

IN THE MARCH ISSUE

Editor's Column

VANESSA SMITH. "Possible Persons: Dickensian Character, Violent Play"

IAN AFFLERBACH. "On the Literary History of Selling Out: Craft, Identity, and Commercial Recognition"

PRASHANT KESHAVMURTHY. "Two Interpretive Postures and Two Kinds of Friendship in Mughal Commentaries on Sa'di's *Gulistān*"

BERYL PONG. "Reading Late Modern Wartime in the Anthropocene: Elizabeth Bowen's *The Little Girls*"

BIRGIT BRANDER RASMUSSEN. "Native American Literature, 901 AD? A New Reading of the Battiste Good Wintercount"

Little-Known Documents

ABDELKÉBIR KHATIBI. "Tattoos: Writing in Dots." Introduction and translation by Matthew Reeck

Theories and Methodologies

Abdelkébir Khatibi: *Literature and Theory*

Coordinated by Yasser Elhariry and Matthew Reeck. Essays by Matthew Brauer, Brian T. Edwards, Brahim El Guabli, Hoda El Shakry, David Fieni, Charles Forsdick, Jane Hiddleston, Khalid Lyamlahy, and Teresa Villa-Ignacio

Submission Procedures

MLA style. Manuscripts should follow MLA style as set out in the most recent edition of the *MLA Handbook*. The MLA urges its contributors to be sensitive to the social implications of language and to seek wording free of discriminatory overtones.

Cover sheet. Authors' names should not appear on manuscripts; instead, a cover sheet, with the author's name and address and the title of the article, should accompany each manuscript.

Permissions. If the contribution includes any materials (e.g., quotations that exceed fair use, illustrations, charts, other graphics) that have been taken from another source, the author must obtain written permission to reproduce them in print and electronic formats.

Please submit manuscripts (as *Word* files) through *PMLA*'s ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla).

Review Process

Each article submitted and eligible for peer review is sent to at least two reviewers. Articles recommended by these readers are then sent to the members of the Editorial Board, who meet periodically with the editor to make final decisions. Until a final decision is reached, the author's name is not made known to readers, to members of the Editorial Board, or to the editor. For detailed information on the review process for submitted essays, please send an inquiry to pmlasubmissions@mmla.org.

Features in *PMLA*

Criticism in Translation

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals for translations. Articles, as well as chapters or sections of books that can function as independent units, will be considered. The originals may be in any language. Two types of proposals are welcome: (1) significant scholarship from earlier periods that has not lost its forcefulness and whose retrieval in English in *PMLA* would be a noteworthy event for a broad body of readers and (2) contemporary work of sufficient weight and potential influence to merit the attention of the field as a whole.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should first ascertain that no previous English translation exists. The proposer should then submit the following materials through *PMLA*'s ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla): (1) a photocopy of the original essay, (2) an extended summary of the entire essay in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 1,000 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style and submitted as a *Word* file, that will be

published with the essay if the essay is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the translation is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, a 1,000-word sample of the translation should be submitted (as a *Word* file). The proposer may either serve as translator of the essay or designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member).

The translated essays should normally not exceed *PMLA*'s 9,000-word limit. The Editorial Board will approve or decline the proposals and evaluate the quality of the translations.

Little-Known Documents

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals regarding little-known documentary material that merits the attention of a broad range of readers. Consideration will be given to archival data from any period and in any language that do not exceed *PMLA*'s 9,000-word limit.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should send submit the following material through *PMLA*'s ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla): (1) a photocopy of the document, (2) an extended summary of the document in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 1,000 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style and submitted as a *Word* file, that will be published with the document if it is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the document is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, if the document is not in English, the proposal should include a 1,000-word sample of the translation. The proposer may either serve as translator of the document or designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member). The Editorial Board will approve or decline the proposals and evaluate the quality of the translations, if applicable.

Special Topics

From time to time the *PMLA* Editorial Board invites essays on special topics designed to attract a wide readership. These groupings allow dialogue among essays and encourage in-depth investigation of the selected subjects. Special topics appear about once every three years and are composed primarily of full-length essays that go through the regular *PMLA* review process; in addition, coordinators write an introduction to the topic and can commission up to two full-length essays and material for Theories and Methodologies and The Changing Profession (among other sections of the journal), to round out the submissions received through peer review.

Forthcoming in *PMLA*

IN OTHER ISSUES

- IAN ALMOND. "Disappearing in the Ecstasy of History: Armenians and the Monocultural Sublime in Modern Turkish Literature"
- HADJI BAKARA. "Time, Sovereignty, and Refugee Writing"
- EDMUND BIRCH. "Alexandre Dumas's *Odyssey*: Race, Slavery, Narrative"
- EMMA BRUSH. "Rude Railing Rhymers: Reading Close Rhyme in Skeltonic Verse and Hip-Hop"
- JORDAN BURKE. "Lawino in the Library: Anthropology, Modernity, and the Profession of African Literature"
- ANTHONY CORDINGLEY. "Puritan Genealogies: Robert Lowell, Perry Miller, and the Postwar Jonathan Edwards"
- MARY DOCKRAY-MILLER. "*Afrisc Meowle*: Exploring the Other in the Old English Exodus"
- JED ESTY. "After the West: Conrad and Nabokov in Long-Wave Literary History"
- GABRIELLA FRIEDMAN. "Illegible Histories, Invisible Movements: Indigenous Refusal in Blake Hausman's *Riding the Trail of Tears*"
- MARIUS HENTEA. "Pound's *Four Pages*: 'Literary Camouflage' and Postwar Anonymous Propaganda"
- ALLAN HEPBURN. "Sound, Interrogation, Torture: John le Carré and the Audible State"
- GEOFFREY KIRSCH. "Loss without Remedy: *Moby-Dick* and the Laws of Compensation"
- SELINA LAI-HENDERSON. "'You Are No Darker Than I Am': *The Souls of Black Folk* in Maoist China"
- JESSICA RESVICK. "Picturesque Mediations: Adalbert Stifter, Washington Irving, and the Transfiguration of the Mundane"
- REENA USHA RUNGGOO. "Creolization Otherwise: Centering the Local (Inter)Textualities of Ananda Devi's *Pagli*"
- SUSANNA SACKS. "From Plinth to Stage: Protest Theatre as Historiographic Activism in *The Fall*"

(continued)

Forthcoming in *PMLA*
(continued)

MÉDAR SERRATA. "The True and Only Bones of Columbus: Relics, Archives, and Reversed Scenarios of Discovery"

ANNE MARIE THOMPSON. "Intimate Editing: The Textual Poetics of Susan Howe's Collage Poems"

JOSE LUIS VENEGAS. "Minor Orientalism: Spain in James Joyce's *Ulysses*"

Criticism in Translation

GIORGIO AGAMBEN. "The 'Dark Night' of John of the Cross (1974)." Introduction and translation by Alberto Parisi

MARIA JANION. "Uncanny Slavdom." Introduction and translation by Marta Figlerowicz

NAZIK AL-MALA'IKA. "The Social Roots of the Arabic Free Verse Movement." Introduction and translation by Qussay Al-Attabi

AHMET HAMDI TANPINAR. "Letter to a Young Girl from Antalya." Introduction and translation by Shaj Mathew and Selin Ünlüönen

Little-Known Documents

W. E. B. DU BOIS. "New Negro Creed" and "A Negro on Etiquet of Caste." Introduction by Martha Patterson

JOHANN WOLFGANG GOETHE. "Archive of the Poet and Writer." Introduction and translation by Kai Sina and Carlos Spoerhase

DORIS LESSING. "Lesser Lessing: On Stage and Off." Introduction by James Arnett

Special Features

Each fall, the *PMLA* Editorial Board welcomes proposals for clusters of essays on a topic of wide interest, to appear in the following special features: Theories and Methodologies, which addresses a timely issue or recent work of scholarship, and The Changing Profession, which takes up new and emerging fields in the humanities. Please visit the MLA website for more details about proposing special features for the journal (www.mla.org/PMLA-Submissions).