

Social Philosophy & Policy

Problems of Market Liberalism

CONTENTS

GERALD F. GAUS	Why All Welfare States (Including Laissez-Faire Ones) Are Unreasonable	1
ROBERT SUGDEN	Measuring Opportunity: Toward a Contractarian Measure of Individual Interest	34
ERIC MACK	Deontic Restrictions Are Not Agent-Relative Restrictions	61
DANIEL SHAPIRO	Why Even Egalitarians Should Favor Market Health Insurance	84
N. SCOTT ARNOLD	Affirmative Action and the Demands of Justice	133
THOMAS W. HAZLETT	The Dual Role of Property Rights in Protecting Broadcast Speech	176
DANIEL D. POLSBY	Regulation of Foods and Drugs and Libertarian Ideals: Perspectives of a Fellow-Traveler	209
JAMES W. CHILD	Profit: The Concept and Its Moral Features	243
ROBERT EHMAN	Natural Property Rights: Where They Fail	283
RODERICK T. LONG	Toward a Libertarian Theory of Class	303
LOREN E. LOMASKY	Libertarianism as if (the Other 99 Percent of) People Mattered	350
JONATHAN R. MACEY	On the Failure of Libertarianism to Capture the Popular Imagination	372
RICHARD A. EPSTEIN	Imitations of Libertarian Thought	412

Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor: Ellen Frankel Paul

Associate Editors: Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

Managing Editor: Harry Dolan

Social Philosophy and Policy Center

Editorial Board

David Braybrooke

University of Texas, Austin

Baruch Brody

Rice University

Allen Buchanan

University of Wisconsin, Madison

James Buchanan

Center for Study of Public Choice,

George Mason University

Jules Coleman

Yale University

Jack Douglas

University of California, San Diego

Richard A. Epstein

University of Chicago Law School

James Fishkin

University of Texas, Austin

Antony G.N. Flew

University of Reading (Emeritus)

Martin Golding

Duke University

John Gray

Jesus College, Oxford University

Gilbert Harman

Princeton University

Seymour Martin Lipset

George Mason University and

Hoover Institution, Stanford University

Eric Mack

Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.

Harvard University

Wallace I. Matson

University of California, Berkeley

Jan Narveson

University of Waterloo

Robert Nozick

Harvard University

Nicholas Rescher

University of Pittsburgh

David Sidorsky

Columbia University

Hillel Steiner

University of Manchester

James Q. Wilson

University of California,

Los Angeles

Leland B. Yeager

Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Editorial Office: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information: See inside back cover.

Copyright © 1998 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/98 \$9.50+ .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

CONTRIBUTORS

Gerald F. Gaus is Professor of Philosophy and Political Science at the University of Minnesota, Duluth. In 1996–98, he was Professor of Ethics and Public Philosophy at the Queensland University of Technology at Brisbane. He is the author of *The Modern Liberal Theory of Man* (1983), *Value and Justification* (1990), and *Justificatory Liberalism* (1996). He is the coeditor of *Public and Private in Social Life* (with Stanley Benn, 1983) and, most recently, of a collection entitled *Public Reason* (with Fred D'Agostino, forthcoming). He is also an editor of the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* and is currently completing two books, *Social Philosophy* and *Political Concepts and Political Theories*.

Robert Sugden is Leverhulme Research Professor of Economics at the University of East Anglia in Norwich. He has held positions at the University of York and at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, and is the author of *The Economics of Rights, Cooperation, and Welfare* (1986). His research interests include liberal and contractarian approaches to social choice, the evolution of social norms, the scope and limitations of the theory of rational choice, and experimental economics.

Eric Mack is Professor of Philosophy at Tulane University. He has published numerous articles in moral, political, and legal philosophy, on such topics as moral individualism, natural rights and deontic restraints, property rights, Lockean provisos, distributive justice, contractual rights, liberal neutrality, bad samaritanism, and anarchism and the justification of the state. During the spring of 1997, he was a Visiting Scholar at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center, where he worked on a book tentatively entitled *Moral Individualism and Libertarian Theory*.

Daniel Shapiro is Associate Professor of Philosophy at West Virginia University. He received his Ph.D. from the University of Minnesota in 1984, and has held visiting appointments at Rice University, the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and Bowling Green State University. He has published a variety of articles in social and political philosophy in such journals as *Philosophical Studies*, *Social Theory and Practice*, *Public Affairs Quarterly*, *Journal of Political Philosophy*, and *Law and Philosophy*. He is currently at work on a book in which he compares welfare-state institutions to more free-market alternatives, as judged by central values or principles in contemporary political philosophy.

N. Scott Arnold is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Alabama at Birmingham. He is the author of *The Philosophy and Economics of Market*

CONTRIBUTORS

Socialism (1994) and *Marx's Radical Critique of Capitalist Society* (1990). He has been a Visiting Scholar at the Hoover Institution at Stanford University and at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University.

Thomas W. Hazlett is Professor of Agricultural and Resource Economics at the University of California, Davis, and Director of the Program on Telecommunications Policy at the Institute of Governmental Affairs. He earned his doctorate in economics from UCLA in 1984, and was a Visiting Scholar at the Columbia University Graduate School of Business in 1990–91, the Chief Economist of the Federal Communications Commission in 1991–92, and a Visiting Scholar at the American Enterprise Institute in 1995–96. He has provided expert testimony on telecommunications policy in federal and state courts, before the Department of Commerce and the Federal Communications Commission, and before congressional committees. His book *Public Policy toward Cable Television* (coauthored with Matthew Spitzer) is forthcoming from MIT Press.

Daniel D. Polsby is Kirkland & Ellis Professor of Law at Northwestern University, where he has taught since 1976. He received his J.D. from the University of Minnesota in 1971. He is the author of over seventy scholarly articles and has taught courses in criminal law, First Amendment jurisprudence, family law, torts, broadcasting regulation, constitutional law, legislation, labor law, administrative law, sex discrimination, secured transactions, and debtor-creditor law.

James W. Child is Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University and is also Chairman of the Aardvark Media Group, Inc., located in Findlay, Ohio. He is the author of *Nuclear War: The Moral Dimension* (1986), coauthor of *Two Paths toward Peace* (with Donald Scherer, 1992), and author of a number of articles appearing in such journals as *Analysis*, *Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence*, *Ethics*, *The Monist*, and *Public Affairs Quarterly*. Child has held a Fulbright Lectureship and has been a research fellow at Pittsburgh's Center for Philosophy of Science and at St. Andrews Centre for Public Policy. He is presently working on a book entitled *Buy Low, Sell High: The Moral Foundations of Commercial Transactions*.

Robert Ehman is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. He earned his Ph.D. in philosophy from Yale University, where he taught for six years. His main areas of research are contemporary contractarian theories of ethics and the economic analysis of rights. He is especially concerned with the problems of determining initial property rights and the just distribution of income. His essays have appeared in such journals as *Public Affairs Quarterly*, *Journal of Value Inquiry*, and *Constitutional Political Economy*.

CONTRIBUTORS

Roderick T. Long is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, as well as Research Director of the Free Nation Foundation. He has published in the areas of moral and political philosophy, ancient philosophy, and philosophy of action, and is the author of a book manuscript entitled *Aristotle on Fate and Freedom*.

Loren E. Lomasky is Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University. He was educated at Michigan State University, Harvard University, and the University of Connecticut, and has taught at the University of Minnesota, Duluth, and at the University of Connecticut at both the Hartford and Storrs branches. He is the author of *Persons, Rights, and the Moral Community* (1987), the coauthor, with Geoffrey Brennan, of *Democracy and Decision: The Pure Theory of Electoral Preference* (1993), and the coeditor with Brennan of a volume of essays entitled *Politics and Process: New Essays in Democratic Theory* (1989).

Jonathan R. Macey is J. DuPratt White Professor of Law and Director of the John M. Olin Program in Law and Economics at Cornell Law School. His research is in corporate finance, public choice, and the economics of regulation. In 1995, he was awarded the Paul M. Bator Prize for Excellence in Teaching, Scholarship, and Public Service by the Federalist Society of the University of Chicago; in 1996, he was awarded a Ph.D. *honoris causa* from the Stockholm School of Economics; and in 1997, he was elected to the Comitato Scientifico of the International Centre for Economic Research in Turin, Italy.

Richard A. Epstein is James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Takings: Private Property and the Power of Eminent Domain* (1985); *Forbidden Grounds: The Case against Employment Discrimination Laws* (1992); *Bargaining with the State* (1993); *Simple Rules for a Complex World* (1995); and *Mortal Peril: Our Inalienable Right to Health Care?* (1997). He is an editor of the *Journal of Law and Economics* and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.