

SLAVIC REVIEW

FALL 2008

Interdisciplinary Quarterly of Russian, Eurasian, and East European Studies



EDITOR

MARK D. STEINBERG

MANAGING EDITOR, JANE T. HEDGES

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

DIANA GEORGESCU STEVEN G. JUG JESSE D. MURRAY

EDITORIAL BOARD

History

John Connelly, *University of California, Berkeley* • Yaroslav Hrytsak, *Lviv National University and Central European University, Budapest* • Adeeb Khalid, *Carleton College* • William Rosenberg, *University of Michigan* • Maria Todorova, *University of Illinois* • Stefan Troebst, *University of Leipzig* • Lynne Viola, *University of Toronto* • Mark von Hagen, *Arizona State University* • Sergei Zhuravlev, *Institute of Russian History of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow*

Literature and the Arts

Clare Cavanagh, *Northwestern University* • Gregory Freidin, *Stanford University* • Catriona Kelly, *Oxford University* • Christina Kiaer, *Northwestern University* • Judith Kornblatt, *University of Wisconsin, Madison* • Michał Paweł Markowski, *Jagellonian University, Kraków* • Eric Naiman, *University of California, Berkeley* • Catharine Nepomnyashchy, *Columbia University* • Andrei Zorin, *Oxford University*

Social Sciences

Judit Bodnár, *Central European University, Budapest* • M. Steven Fish, *University of California, Berkeley* • Susan Gal, *University of Chicago* • Elena Gapova, *European Humanities University, Vilnius-Minsk* • Grigorii Golosov, *European University, St. Petersburg* • Bruce Grant, *New York University* • Jan Kubik, *Rutgers University* • Pauline Luong, *Brown University* • Blair Ruble, *Kennan Institute*

Cover image: Elisabeth Netzkowa (Mnatsakanjan), *Osen' v lazarete nevinnykh sester: Rekviev v semi chastiakh*, album with translation by Gerald Janecek, produced by Gerald Janecek under the direction of the poet, 2004, unpaginated. Courtesy Elizaveta Mnatsakanova.

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

Slavic Review (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all association members. Members also receive *NewsNet*, the AAASS newsletter. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and the study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138; (617) 495-0677.

Membership Dues: students or those with salaries under \$20,000—\$35.00; those with salaries \$20,000–\$29,999—\$50.00; \$30,000–\$39,999—\$65.00; \$40,000–\$49,999—\$80.00; \$50,000–\$59,999—\$100.00; \$60,000–\$69,999—\$115.00; \$70,000–\$99,999—\$135.00; \$100,000–\$124,999—\$160.00; \$125,000 and over—\$180.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$35.00 to dues of higher paid member. Subscriptions without membership are \$150.00 within the United States, \$170.00 in Canada and Mexico, and \$190.00 overseas. For members or subscribers living in Canada or Mexico, please add \$20.00 for shipping; for members or subscribers living overseas, please add \$35.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$25.00; for members, \$20.00 each. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for *NewsNet* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Cambridge.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Cover design by B. Williams & Associates, Durham, North Carolina; the typeface Mason is from Emigre Fonts. Text set in Baskerville by Newgen-Austin, Austin, Texas. Printed by Cadmus Professional Communications, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Periodicals postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138.

Copyright © 2008 *Slavic Review* ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Permission to reprint must generally be obtained from *Slavic Review*.

(continued on inside back cover)

SLAVIC REVIEW

INTERDISCIPLINARY QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN, AND EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

VOLUME 67 NUMBER 3 • FALL 2008

CONTRIBUTORS	vii
ABSTRACTS	x
ON THE BORDERS OF THE SILVER AGE	
Robert Bird and Lina Steiner, Special Section Guest Editors	
Introduction LINA STEINER	547
Heroic Aesthetics and Modernist Critique: Extrapolations from Bakhtin's <i>Author and Hero in Aesthetic Activity</i> ILYA KLIGER	551
Masks of the Poet, Myths of the People: The Performance of Individuality and Nationhood in Georgian and Russian Modernism HARSHA RAM	567
Lyricism and Philosophy in Brodsky's Elegiac Verse AARON BEAVER	591
Visual Poetry after Modernism: Elizaveta Mnatsakanova STEPHANIE SANDLER	610
ARTICLES	
Violating the Canon: Reading Der Nister with Vasilii Grossman HARRIET MURAV	642

Russian Hybrids: Identity in the Translingual Writings of Andrei Makine, Wladimir Kaminer, and Gary Shteyngart ADRIAN WANNER	662
--	-----

DISCUSSION

Revisionism in Retrospect: A Personal View SHEILA FITZPATRICK	682
Comment: Revisionism Avant la Lettre ROBERT V. DANIELS	705
Comment: Codes and Confessions J. ARCH GETTY	711
Comment: Life and Fate of Western Revisionism ELENA A. OSOKINA	716
Comment: Of Archives and Frogs: Iconoclasm in Historical Perspective JOCHEN HELLBECK	720

FEATURED REVIEWS

Catriona Kelly, <i>Children's World: Growing up in Russia, 1890–1991</i> (Jeffrey Brooks)	724
Evgeny Dobrenko, <i>The Political Economy of Socialist Realism</i> , trans. Jesse M. Savage (Catharine Theimer Nepomnyashchy)	726
Archie Brown, <i>Seven Years That Changed the World: Perestroika in Perspective</i> (Richard Sakwa)	728

FILM REVIEW

Alexandru Solomon, dir. <i>The Great Communist Bank Robbery</i> (Constantin Iordachi)	732
--	-----

BOOK REVIEWS

Claude Lefort, <i>Complications: Communism and the Dilemmas of Democracy</i> , trans. and introduction, Julian Bourg (Harald Wydra)	734
David Lane and Martin Myant, eds., <i>Varieties of Capitalism in Post-Communist Countries</i> (John Marangos)	735

Anders Åslund and Marek Dąbrowski, eds., <i>Europe after Enlargement</i> (Larry Neal)	736
Anders Åslund, <i>How Capitalism Was Built: The Transformation of Central and Eastern Europe, Russia, and Central Asia</i> (Richard Pomfret)	738
Josette Baer, <i>Slavic Thinkers or The Creation of Polities: Intellectual History and Political Thought in Central Europe and the Balkans in the Nineteenth Century</i> (Jelena Milojković-Djurić)	739
Thorsten Botz-Bornstein, <i>Vasily Sesemann: Experience, Formalism, and the Question of Being</i> (James West)	740
Chad Bryant, <i>Prague in Black: Nazi Rule and Czech Nationalism</i> (Gary B. Cohen)	741
John V. A. Fine Jr., <i>When Ethnicity Did Not Matter in the Balkans: A Study of Identity in Pre-Nationalist Croatia, Dalmatia, and Slavonia in the Medieval and Early-Modern Periods</i> (Adrian Mandzy)	742
Ulf Brunnbauer, <i>Die sozialistische Lebensweise: Ideologie, Gesellschaft, Familie und Politik in Bulgarien (1944–1989)</i> (Maria Todorova)	743
George W. Gawrych, <i>The Crescent and the Eagle: Ottoman Rule, Islam and the Albanians, 1874–1913</i> (Nathalie Clayer)	744
John Tyrrell, <i>Janáček: Years of a Life. Vol. 1, (1854–1914): The Lonely Blackbird</i> (Brian Locke)	745
Alfred Thomas, <i>The Bohemian Body: Gender and Sexuality in Modern Czech Culture</i> (Melissa Feinberg)	746
Ingrid Merchiers, <i>Cultural Nationalism in the South Slav Habsburg Lands in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Scholarly Network of Jernej Kopitar (1780–1844)</i> (Elinor Murray Despalatović)	747
Sabrina P. Ramet, <i>The Liberal Project and the Transformation of Democracy: The Case of East Central Europe</i> (Minton F. Goldman)	748
Jasmina Lukić, Joanna Regulska, and Darja Zaviršek, eds., <i>Women and Citizenship in Central and Eastern Europe</i> (Janet Elise Johnson)	749
Seán Hanley, <i>The New Right in the New Europe: Czech Transformation and Right Wing Politics, 1989–2006</i> (Martin Dangerfield)	751
Zsuzsa Gille, <i>From the Cult of Waste to the Trash Heap of History: The Politics of Waste in Socialist and Postsocialist Hungary</i> (Katrina Z. S. Schwartz)	752
Maria Csanádi, <i>Self-Consuming Evolutions: A Model on the Structure, Self-Reproduction, Self-Destruction and Transformation of Party-State Systems Tested in Romania, Hungary and China</i> (Patrick H. O’Neil)	753

- Zsuzsa Csergo, *Talk of the Nation: Language and Conflict in Romania and Slovakia* (Nadya Nedelsky) 754
- Erin K. Jenne, *Ethnic Bargaining: The Paradox of Minority Empowerment* (Jóhanna K. Birnir) 756
- Maria Spirova, *Political Parties in Post-Communist Societies: Formation, Persistence, and Change* (Anna Grzymala-Busse) 757
- Balázs Balogh and Zoltán Illyés, eds., *Perspectives of Diaspora Existence: Hungarian Diasporas in the Carpathian Basin—Historical and Current Contexts of a Specific Diaspora Interpretation and Its Aspects of Ethnic Minority Protection*, trans. Gábor Komáromy (Éva V. Huseby-Darvas) 759
- Keith Doubt, *Understanding Evil: Lessons from Bosnia* (Stevan Weine) 760
- Alexander Bitis, *Russia and the Eastern Question: Army, Government and Society, 1815–1833* (Ronald P. Bobroff) 761
- Elena Andreeva, *Russia and Iran in the Great Game: Travelogues and Orientalism* (Firuz Kazemzadeh) 762
- Michael Share, *Where Empires Collided: Russian and Soviet Relations with Hong Kong, Taiwan, and Macao* (Elizabeth Wishnick) 763
- Darius Staliunas, *Making Russians: Meaning and Practice of Russification in Lithuania and Belarus after 1863* (Alfred Erich Senn) 764
- Melvyn P. Leffler, *For the Soul of Mankind: The United States, the Soviet Union, and the Cold War*; Vladislav M. Zubok, *A Failed Empire: The Soviet Union in the Cold War from Stalin to Gorbachev* (Hugh Ragsdale) 765
- Mary W. Cavender, *Nests of the Gentry: Family, Estate, and Local Loyalties in Provincial Russia* (David L. Ransel) 767
- Mikhail Luk'ianov, *Rossiiskii konservatizm i reforma, 1907–1914*, foreword, Mark D. Steinberg (Wayne Dowler) 768
- Wendy Slater, *The Many Deaths of Nicholas II: Relics, Remains and the Romanovs* (Jamie H. Cockfield) 769
- Lars T. Lih, *Lenin Rediscovered: What Is to Be Done? in Context* (Anna Krylova) 770
- Scott W. Palmer, *Dictatorship of the Air: Aviation Culture and the Fate of Modern Russia* (Reina Pennington) 772
- David Priestland, *Stalinism and the Politics of Mobilization: Ideas, Power, and Terror in Inter-War Russia* (Elena A. Osokina) 773
- R. W. Davies and Stephen G. Wheatcroft, *The Years of Hunger: Soviet Agriculture, 1931–1933* (Andrea Graziosi) 774

Geoffrey Roberts, <i>Stalin's Wars: From World War to Cold War, 1939–1953</i> (Steven Merritt Miner)	775
Lisa A. Kirschenbaum, <i>The Legacy of the Siege of Leningrad, 1941–1995: Myth, Memories, and Monuments</i> (Frederick Corney)	777
Dmitrii Shepilov, <i>The Kremlin's Scholar: A Memoir of Soviet Politics under Stalin and Khrushchev</i> , ed. Stephen V. Bittner, trans. Anthony Austin (Martin McCauley)	778
Gerhard Wettig, <i>Chruschtschows Berlin-Krise 1958 bis 1963: Drohpolitik und Mauerbau</i> (Rolf Steininger)	779
Stephen F. Cohen, "Vopros voprosov": <i>Pochemu ne stalo Sovetskogo Soiuza?</i> trans. Irina Davidian (Grigorii V. Golosov)	780
Andrew Kahn, ed., <i>The Cambridge Companion to Pushkin</i> (Gary Rosenshield)	781
Melissa Frazier, <i>Romantic Encounters: Writers, Readers, and the Library for Reading</i> (Justyna Beinek)	783
Abderhaman Messaoudi, <i>La Transversalité du thème religieux dans Les Démons</i> (Gary Cox)	784
Andrew Baruch Wachtel, <i>Plays of Expectations: Intertextual Relations in Russian Twentieth-Century Drama</i> (J. Douglas Clayton)	785
V[sevolod] E[vgen'evich] Bagno, A[ndrei] B[orisovich] Shishkin, et al., eds., <i>Bashnia Viacheslava Ivanova i kul'tura Serebrianogo Veka</i> (Anna Frajlich)	786
Tanja Zimmermann, <i>Abstraktion und Realismus im Literatur- und Kunstdiskurs der russischen Avantgarde</i> (Isabel Wünsche)	787
Birgit Beumers, ed., <i>The Cinema of Russia and the Former Soviet Union</i> (Denise J. Youngblood)	788
Andreas Schönle, ed., <i>Lotman and Cultural Studies: Encounters and Extensions</i> (Edna Andrews)	789
Elina Kahla, <i>Life as Exploit: Representations of Twentieth-Century Saintly Women in Russia</i> (Adele Barker)	791
Markku Kangaspuro and Jeremy Smith, eds., <i>Modernisation in Russia since 1900</i> (Anthony D'Agostino)	792
Jeff Sahadeo and Russell Zanca, eds., <i>Everyday Life in Central Asia: Past and Present</i> (Martha Brill Olcott)	793
Lilia Shevtsova, <i>Russia—Lost in Transition: The Yeltsin and Putin Legacies</i> , trans. Arch Tait (Thomas F. Remington)	794
Ellen Carnaghan, <i>Out of Order: Russian Political Values in an Imperfect World</i> (Neil Robinson)	795

Regina Smyth, <i>Candidate Strategies and Electoral Competition in the Russian Federation: Democracy without Foundation</i> (Peter Rutland)	796
Julie Hemment, <i>Empowering Women in Russia: Activism, Aid, and NGOs</i> (Lisa McIntosh Sundstrom)	797
Michael Ellman, ed., <i>Russia's Oil and Natural Gas: Bonanza or Curse?</i> (David Lane)	798
Adam Swain, ed., <i>Re-Constructing the Post-Soviet Industrial Region: The Donbas in Transition</i> (King Banaian)	799
Larisa Fialkova and Maria N. Yelenevskaya, <i>Ex-Soviets in Israel: From Personal Narratives to a Group Portrait</i> (Larissa Remennick)	800
REFERENCE BOOKS OF 2006 –2007: A SELECTION	802
COLLECTED ESSAYS	806
BOOKS RECEIVED	809
IN MEMORIAM	814
ERRATA	820