

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary

VOLUME 5 / NUMBER 2 / JUNE 1982

Special Symposium issue

Peer Commentary on Peer Review 185
Stevan Harnad (Ed.)

**Peer-review practices of psychological journals:
The fate of published articles, submitted again** 187
D. P. Peters and S. J. Ceci

With Commentary by R. K. Adair; J. S. Armstrong; J. J. Bartko; D. deB. Beaver; C. Belshaw; H. R. Bernard; J. M. Beyer; M. Blissett; D. E. Chubin; D. V. Cicchetti; A. M. Colman; J. D. Cone; R. Crandall; L. DeBakey; D. L. Eckberg; J. L. Fleiss; R. G. Geen; N. D. Glenn; L. D. Goodstein; M. D. Gordon; R. A. Gordon; B. C. Griffith; J. Hartley; R. Hogan; W. M. Honig; D. F. Horrobin; M. J. A. Howe; D. Lazarus; R. T. Louttit; M. J. Mahoney; C. Manwell & C. M. A. Baker; J. Millman; B. Mindick; I. I. Mitroff; M. J. Moravcsik; K. Nelson; R. Over; D. S. Palermo; D. Perlman; R. M. Perloff & R. Perloff; A. L. Porter; S. Presser; R. Rosenthal; C. Ross; D. B. Rubin; S. Scarr; W. A. Scott; S. Tax & R. A. Rubinstein; G. J. Thomas; M. J. White; G. J. Whitehurst; W. A. Wilson, Jr.; J. C. Witt & M. J. Hannafin; R. S. Yalow; D. Zeaman; J. Ziman, *and Authors' Response*

**Continuing Commentary on selected target
articles from past issues of BBS, with authors'
responses** 257



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY
PRESS

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08540

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith Nijmegen and U. Sussex

Cognitive Neuroscience

Lynn Nadel U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology

Charles J. Brainerd U. Western Ontario

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin U. Utah

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes Princeton

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart U. London

Neurobiology

Graham Hoyle U. Oregon

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen U. Cambridge

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray U. Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould Harvard

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett Tufts

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg U. Connecticut

David S. Olton Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin U. Wisconsin

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 325 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 5 (1982) is US \$95.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£54.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions, US \$47.50 net (£27.00) for individuals; US \$29.00 net (£18.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$29.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$27.00 net (£15.50) plus postage. Orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada, direct to Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster, send address changes to Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York office of Cambridge University Press.