

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBER 1 1989

ARTICLES

BABY DOE, CONGRESS AND
THE STATES: CHALLENGING
THE FEDERAL TREATMENT
STANDARDS FOR IMPAIRED
INFANTS

Stephen A. Newman

PHYSICIAN SELF REFERRAL
ARRANGEMENTS:
LEGITIMATE BUSINESS OR
UNETHICAL
“ENTREPRENEURIALISM”

Theodore N. McDowell, Jr.

NOTES AND COMMENTS

MOST-FAVORED-NATION CLAUSES AND
MONOPSONISTIC POWER: AN UNHEALTHY MIX?

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$45.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$25.00 for air mail postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10 (plus \$3 for postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$95.00 for 1989). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President*,

University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

COLIN S. DIVER, B.A., LL.B., *Dean and Professor of Law*

LARRY W. YACKLE, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean*

BARBARA LAUREN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Dean*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *President*

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President-Elect*

BERNARD M. DICKENS, Ph.D., LL.D., *Secretary*

WILLIAM J. CURRAN, LL.M., S.M. Hyg., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

RONALD E. CRANFORD, M.D., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

American Society of Law & Medicine
Merrill Kaitz

CIRCULATION MANAGER

Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.
Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel
Massachusetts Hospital Association

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Powers & Hall
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Department of Preventive Medicine
Medical College of Wisconsin

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D. *25 years*
General Counsel
American Medical Association

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Honorable Max Rosenn
United States Court of Appeals for the
Third Circuit

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine
Harvard Medical School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.
Former Director, Medical Genetics
Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Dean, Tufts University School of
Dental Medicine

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael J. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeals
Supreme Court
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBER 1 1989

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS

1988-1989

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Sara Lou Lander

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Shep A. Rosenman

MANAGING EDITOR

Maureen A. MacFarlane

PROJECTS EDITOR

Donna M. Praiss

ARTICLES EDITORS

Aileen C. Denne Bolton
Joseph P. Kelly
Robert D. Webb
Michelle S. Wolf

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Elizabeth A. Reingold

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Diane M. Crawford
Jeffrey A. Dollinger
Stephen G. Hamel
Karen Laufer

Kathleen M. Norton
Joseph C. Stanko, Jr.
David Van Speybroeck
Jonathan Wilk

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

David Babner
Tracy Daugherty
Michael DeVito
James R. Eddy
Mary L. Gallant
Steven N. Jacobs
Todd Kirsch
Frances Lynch
Steven H. Meyer

Todd L. Safon
Richard I. Shaker
Stacey H. Snyder
Constance N. Stratton
Edward Tumavicus
Ann M. VanDeventer
Eric E. Wolf
Ellen Wright

STAFF MEMBERS

Joan Andres
Robert Bannish
David Baum
David J. Breen
Astrid W. Calderon
Mark Cheffo
Liane Cohen
Andrea de Gorgey
Karyn Finamore
Rachel Fishman
Wayne S. Flick

Michael C. Fondo
Stephen Freeland
Daniel Gindes
Allen Glass
Pamela D. Harvey
Anne Marie Jennings
Miriam Kelliher
Stephen Kelly
William A. Kraiss
Marie Lavalleye
Joan A. Lieberman
Allison Linneman

Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.
Barbara A. Masterson
Linda Mesler
Laurie E. Meyers
Stephen B. Monick
James Nealon
Deborah Savarese
Meredith Skinner
Pamela L. Taylor
James W. Tegtmeier
Susan Tribble

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBER 1 1989

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1989-1990

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Mark Cheffo

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Robert J. Bannish

MANAGING EDITOR
Pamela D. Harvey

PROJECTS EDITOR
James W. Tegtmeier

ARTICLES EDITORS
Andrea de Gorgey
Stephen Freeland
Daniel Gindes
Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR
Liane Cohen

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Astrid W. Calderon
Rachel Fishman
Wayne S. Flick
Michael C. Fondo

Meriam Kelliher
William Kraiss
Joan Lieberman
Allison Linneman

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Joan Andres
David Baum
David J. Breen
Karyn Finamore
Allan Glass
Anne Marie Jennings

Stephen Kelly
Marie Lavalleye
Barbara Masterson
Linda Mesler
Laurie E. Meyers

Stephen B. Monick
James Nealon
Deborah Savarese
Meredith Skinner
Pamela L. Taylor
Susan Tribble

Special thanks to Linda Mesler for all her help.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBER 1 1989

ARTICLES

BABY DOE, CONGRESS AND THE STATES: CHALLENGING THE FEDERAL TREATMENT STANDARDS FOR IMPAIRED INFANTS 1
Stephen A. Newman

PHYSICIAN SELF REFERRAL ARRANGEMENTS: LEGITIMATE BUSINESS OR UNETHICAL "ENTREPRENEURIALISM" 61
Theodore N. McDowell, Jr.

NOTES AND COMMENTS

MOST-FAVORED-NATION CLAUSES AND MONOPSONISTIC POWER: AN UNHEALTHY MIX? 111

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 129

SELECTED BOOK RELEASES 151

Copyright 1989 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.