

---

# INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION



SPRING 2025 VOLUME 79 NUMBER 2 ISSN 0020 8183

---

## ARTICLES

Conflicts that Leave Something to Chance  
Peter Schram

## RESEARCH NOTES

### SYMPOSIUM ON CLIMATE CHANGE

The Global Politics of Scientific Consensus: Evidence from the  
Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change  
Zuhad Hai

From Gridlock to Ratchet: Conditional Cooperation on Climate  
Change  
Sam S. Rowan

Shaming Paris: A Political Economy of Climate Commitments  
Justin Melnick and Alastair Smith

Apology Diplomacy: The International Image Effects of Interstate  
Apologies  
Michaela Mattes and Jessica L.P. Weeks

Civilian Harm and Military Legitimacy: Evidence from the Battle of  
Mosul  
Benjamin C. Krick, Jonathan B. Petkun, and Mara R. Revkin

Trade and the Politics of Electoral Reform  
Michael Becher and Irene Menéndez González

## ERRATUM

The Damocles Delusion: The Sense of Power Inflates Threat  
Perception in World Politics – ERRATUM  
Caleb Pomeroy

# IO International Organization

Edited at the Department of Political Science, Rice University;  
and the School of Public and International Affairs  
and Department of Politics, Princeton University  
Published quarterly by Cambridge University Press  
Founded in 1947 by the World Peace Foundation

---

|                           |                        |                              |
|---------------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|
|                           | Brett Ashley Leeds     | <i>Editors</i>               |
|                           | Layna Mosley           |                              |
|                           | B. Peter Rosendorff    | <i>Associate Editors</i>     |
|                           | Ayşe Zarakol           |                              |
|                           | Elana Matthews         | <i>Managing Editor</i>       |
|                           | Stephanie Rickard      | <i>Editorial Board Chair</i> |
|                           |                        |                              |
| Rebecca Adler-Nissen      | Edward D. Mansfield    | <i>Editorial Board</i>       |
| Michael Barnett           | Michaela Mattes        |                              |
| Allison Carnegie          | Megumi Naoi            |                              |
| David B. Carter           | Abraham Newman         |                              |
| Alexandre Debs            | Kai Quek               |                              |
| Songying Fang             | Dennis P. Quinn        |                              |
| Tanisha Fazal             | Stephanie Rickard      |                              |
| James Fearon              | Nita Rudra             |                              |
| Martha Finnemore          | Kenneth Scheve         |                              |
| Virginia Page Fortna      | Kenneth Schultz        |                              |
| Jeffrey Frieden           | Joel W. Simmons        |                              |
| Kristian Skrede Gleditsch | Randall W. Stone       |                              |
| Stacie Goddard            | Jonas Tallberg         |                              |
| Judith Goldstein          | Dustin Tingley         |                              |
| Susan Hyde                | Erik Voeten            |                              |
| Judith Kelley             | James Raymond Vreeland |                              |
| Joshua Kertzer            | Stefanie Walter        |                              |
| In Song Kim               | Jessica L.P. Weeks     |                              |
| Sung Eun Kim              | Jessica Chen Weiss     |                              |
| Sarah E. Kreps            |                        |                              |
| David Lake                |                        |                              |
|                           |                        |                              |
| Emanuel Adler             | Lisa L. Martin         | <i>Senior Advisors</i>       |
| Benjamin J. Cohen         | John Odell             |                              |
| Peter Gourevitch          | Louis Pauly            |                              |
| Stephan Haggard           | Thomas Risse           |                              |
| Miles Kahler              | Ronald Rogowski        |                              |
| Peter Katzenstein         | Kathryn Sikkink        |                              |
| Robert O. Keohane         | Janice Gross Stein     |                              |
| Stephen D. Krasner        |                        |                              |

*INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION* invites the submission of original manuscripts on all aspects of international affairs. Authors should follow the guidelines found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Address for submissions:* <http://io.edmgr.com>

*For all other inquiries:*

International Organization

School of Public and International Affairs, Robertson 448, Princeton University, Princeton NJ 08544.

Statements and opinions expressed in *International Organization* are the responsibility of the authors alone and do not imply the endorsement of the Board of Editors, the Board of Trustees of the World Peace Foundation, Cambridge University Press, the Department of Political Science at Rice University, or the School of Public and International Affairs and Department of Politics at Princeton University.

For abstracting listing and price information, please refer to the back of this issue.

---

Periodicals postage is paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

© 2025 by The IO Foundation. ISSN 0020-8183

---

# International Organization

Volume 79, Number 2, Spring 2025

---

## Article

Conflicts that Leave Something to Chance     *Peter Schram*     199

## Research Notes

### Symposium on Climate Change

The Global Politics of Scientific Consensus: Evidence from the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change     *Zuhad Hai*     233

From Gridlock to Ratchet: Conditional Cooperation on Climate Change     *Sam S. Rowan*     257

Shaming Paris: A Political Economy of Climate Commitments  
*Justin Melnick and Alastair Smith*     281

Apology Diplomacy: The International Image Effects of Interstate Apologies     *Michaela Mattes and Jessica L.P. Weeks*     306

Civilian Harm and Military Legitimacy: Evidence from the Battle of Mosul     *Benjamin C. Krick, Jonathan B. Petkun, and Mara R. Revkin*     332

Trade and the Politics of Electoral Reform  
*Michael Becher and Irene Menéndez González*     358

## Erratum

The Damocles Delusion: The Sense of Power Inflates Threat Perception in World Politics – ERRATUM     *Caleb Pomeroy*     380

---

# Reviewers

---

In addition to our board members' contributions, *International Organization* gratefully acknowledges the assistance of the following reviewers in 2024:

|                      |                       |                        |
|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|
| Kenneth Abbott       | Andy Baker            | Christopher Blair      |
| Lamis Abdelaaty      | Laia Balcells         | Robert Blanton         |
| Alexei Abrahams      | Lisa Baldez           | Cristina Bodea         |
| Yehonatan Abramson   | Cameron Ballard-Rosa  | Tanja Boerzel          |
| Scott Abramson       | Thierry Balzacq       | Derek Bolton           |
| Amitav Acharya       | Navin Bapat           | Jonathan Bonnitcha     |
| Fiona Adamson        | Corinne Bara          | Nils-Christian Bormann |
| Claire Adida         | Tarak Barkawi         | Sandra Botero          |
| Christine Agius      | Tiffany Barnes        | Aaron Brantly          |
| John Ahlquist        | Tim Bartley           | Deborah Brautigam      |
| Emma Aisbett         | Ida Bastiaens         | Samuel Brazys          |
| Michaël Aklin        | Genevieve Bates       | Ryan Briggs            |
| William Akoto        | Sarah Bauerle Danzman | Stephen Brooks         |
| Deniz Aksoy          | Matthew Baum          | Owen Brown             |
| Justin Alger         | Samuel Bazzi          | Chris Browning         |
| Bentley Allan        | David Bearce          | Jutta Brunnee          |
| Todd Allee           | Paul Beaumont         | Ryan Brutger           |
| Susan Allen          | Michael Bechtel       | Labeeb Bsoul           |
| Tim Allen            | Andreas Behnke        | Mark Buntaine          |
| Joshua Alley         | Duncan Bell           | Jonas Bunte            |
| Jamie Allinson       | Michelle Benson       | Sarah Bush             |
| Dan Altman           | Brett Benson          | Barry Buzan            |
| Maxim Alyukov        | Daniel Berliner       | Zoltan Buzas           |
| Benjamin Ansell      | Sarah Bermeo          | Susanna Campbell       |
| Amnon Aran           | Alexander Betts       | Justin Canfil          |
| Vincent Arel-Bundock | Timm Betz             | Xun Cao                |
| Lucian Ashworth      | Stephen Biddle        | Gulsah Capan           |
| Philip Ayoub         | Glen Biglaiser        | R. Charli Carpenter    |
| Sarah Babb           | Helga Malmin          | Robert Carroll         |
| Leonardo Baccini     | Binningsbo            | Austin Carson          |
| Benjamin Bagozzi     | James Bisbee          | Jeff Carter            |
| Stefanie Bailer      | Robert Blair          | Benjamin Cashore       |
| William Bain         | Graeme Blair          | Donald Casler          |

|                        |                         |                      |
|------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Lars-Erik Cederman     | Cassy Dorff             | Amélie Godefroidt    |
| Raphael Ch             | Daniel Drezner          | Kerry Goettlich      |
| Terrence Chapman       | Thad Dunning            | Michael Goldfien     |
| Suparna Chaudhry       | Andreas Dür             | Benjamin Goldsmith   |
| Stephen Chaudoin       | Allard Duursma          | Kristi Govella       |
| Jeffrey Checkel        | Christoph Dworschak     | Erin Graham          |
| Frederick Chen         | Sean Ehrlich            | Julia Gray           |
| Muyang Chen            | Mette Eilstrup-         | Elliott Green        |
| Wilfred Chow           | Sangiovanni             | Kelly Greenhill      |
| Olga Chyzh             | Manfred Elsig           | Michael Greig        |
| Deniz Cil              | Andrew Enterline        | Sheena Greitens      |
| Menevis Cilizoglu      | Chelsea Estancona       | Sharan Grewal        |
| Richard Clark          | Theo Farrell            | Ryan Griffiths       |
| Ronen A. Cohen         | Henry Farrell           | Tyrone Groh          |
| Italo Colantone        | Benjamin Faude          | Guy Grossman         |
| Jeff Colgan            | Lauren Ferry            | Janis Grzybowski     |
| Luke Condra            | Michael Findley         | Anna Grzymala-Busse  |
| Justin Conrad          | K. Orfeo Fioretos       | Andrew Guess         |
| Ben Cormier            | Hanne Fjelde            | Alexandra Guisinger  |
| Julia Costa Lopez      | Trine Flockhart         | Robert Gulotty       |
| Christina Cottiero     | Michael Flynn           | Stefano Guzzini      |
| Neta Crawford          | Benjamin Fordham        | Yoram Haftel         |
| Christophe Crombez     | Vasiliki Fouka          | Jillienne Haglund    |
| Audrey Cronin          | Matthew Fuhrmann        | Jens Hainmueller     |
| Raphael Cunha          | Nikhil Gaikwad          | Henry Hale           |
| David Cunningham       | Max Gallop              | Thomas Hale          |
| Kathleen Cunningham    | Jennifer Gandhi         | Todd Hall            |
| Xinyuan Dai            | Sumit Ganguly           | Mark Hallerberg      |
| Roman David            | Omar Garcia-Ponce       | Robin Harding        |
| Christina Davis        | Francisco Garfias       | Heidi Hardt          |
| Lucas De Oliveira Paes | Kishore Gawande         | Caroline Hartzell    |
| Indra de Soysa         | Federica Genovese       | Ron Hassner          |
| Nicole Deitelhoff      | Stephen Gent            | Jonathan Havercroft  |
| Lisa Dellmuth          | Adom Getachew           | Darren Hawkins       |
| Richard Devetak        | Anna Getmansky          | Jarrod Hayes         |
| Daniel Devine          | Eugene Gholz            | Jude Hays            |
| Jessica Di Salvatore   | Michael Gibilisco       | Chad Hazlett         |
| Jonathan DiCicco       | Douglas Gibler          | Tobias Heinrich      |
| Greg Distelhorst       | Matthew Gibney          | Mirko Heinzl         |
| Austin Doctor          | Mark Gibney             | Jaakko Heiskanen     |
| Lindsay Dolan          | Michael Gilligan        | Eric Helleiner       |
| Jack Donnelly          | Desh Girod              | C. Randall Henning   |
| Daniela Donno          | Theodora-Ismene Gizelis | Paul Hensel          |
| Vito D'Orazio          | Charles Glaser          | Courtney Hillebrecht |

|                      |                     |                    |
|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| Simon Hix            | Andreas Kern        | Melissa Lee        |
| Sara Hobolt          | Andrew Kerner       | Halvard Leira      |
| Anke Hoeffler        | Hassan Khalilieh    | Douglas Lemke      |
| Stephanie Hofmann    | Christopher Kilby   | Tobias Lenz        |
| Alisha Holland       | Soo Yeon Kim        | Quan Li            |
| Florian Hollenbach   | James Dongjin Kim   | Xiaojun Li         |
| James Hollyer        | Tongfi Kim          | Steven Liao        |
| Mirya Holman         | Minju Kim           | Keir Lieber        |
| Yusaku Horiuchi      | Amy King            | Jennifer Lind      |
| Lise Howard          | Brandon Kinne       | Jon Lindsay        |
| Reyko Huang          | Helen Kinsella      | Erik Lin-Greenberg |
| Connor Huff          | Risa Kitagawa       | Lizhi Liu          |
| Llewelyn Hughes      | Katja Kleinberg     | David Logan        |
| Melanie Hughes       | Mareike Kleine      | Dylan Loh          |
| Victoria Tin-bor Hui | Daniel Klinenberg   | Meredith Loken     |
| Lisa Hultman         | Audie Klotz         | Erica Lonergan     |
| Andrew Hurrell       | Jiyoung Ko          | Cyanne Loyle       |
| Iza Hussin           | Yoshiharu Kobayashi | Christopher Lucas  |
| Matias Iaryczower    | Natalia Koga        | Danielle Lupton    |
| Patrick Jackson      | Shoko Kohama        | Yonatan Lupu       |
| Nathan Jensen        | Ore Koren           | Jason Lyall        |
| Eun A Jo             | Markus Kornprobst   | Paul MacDonald     |
| Leslie Johns         | Daniel Krcmaric     | Julia MacDonald    |
| Jesse Johnson        | Anne-Kathrin Kreft  | Matthias Mader     |
| Tana Johnson         | Matthew Kroenig     | Gabriele Magni     |
| Jacint Jordana       | Mona Krook          | Cameron Mailhot    |
| Tyler Jost           | Brenden Kuerbis     | Edmund Malesky     |
| Michelle Jurkovich   | Raymond Kuo         | Zachariah Mampilly |
| David Kang           | Charles Kupchan     | Mark Manger        |
| Stephen Kaplan       | Jorg Kustermans     | Giovanni Mantilla  |
| Stefanie Kappler     | Andrew Kydd         | Silvia Marchesi    |
| Devesh Kapur         | Dillon Laaker       | Isabela Mares      |
| Sabrina Karim        | David Laitin        | Yotam Margalit     |
| John Karlsrud        | Milli Lake          | Nikolay Marinov    |
| Scott Kastner        | Marika Landau-Wells | Lisa Martin        |
| Azusa Katagiri       | Valentin Lang       | Lennart Maschmeyer |
| Aycan Katitas        | Anthony Lang        | Aila Matanock      |
| Stuart Kaufman       | Alexander Lanoszka  | Xavier Mathieu     |
| Emilian Kavalski     | Deborah Larson      | Matthias Matthijs  |
| Mark Kayser          | Kyle Lascurettes    | Kelly Matush       |
| Lucas Kello          | Andrew Leber        | Sarah Maxey        |
| Brenton Kenkel       | David Leblang       | Anna Maria Mayda   |
| Amanda Kennard       | Matthew Lebo        | Rose McDermott     |
| Michael Kenwick      | James H. Lebovic    | Matt McDonald      |

|                      |                       |                      |
|----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| Carrie McDougall     | Nathan Nunn           | Kristopher Ramsay    |
| Daniel McDowell      | Brendan Nyhan         | Brian Rathbun        |
| Elena McLean         | Thomas Oatley         | Tanika Raychaudhuri  |
| Roseanne McManus     | Diana O'Brien         | Mark Raymond         |
| Kathleen McNamara    | Jared Oestman         | Lindsay Reid         |
| Marius Mehrl         | Marie Olson Lounsbury | Bernhard Reinsberg   |
| Rupal Mehta          | Michal Onderco        | Dan Reiter           |
| Anne Meng            | Harry Oppenheimer     | Jonathan Renshon     |
| Elizabeth Menninga   | Iain Osgood           | Anatoly Reshetnikov  |
| Jane Darby Menton    | Erica Owen            | Christian Reus-Smit  |
| Jennifer Merolla     | Patricia Owens        | Mara Revkin          |
| Sophie Meunier       | Lucas Paes            | Arman Rezaee         |
| Anna Meyerrose       | Jack Paine            | Sungmin Rho          |
| Matto Mildenerberger | Tabea Palmtag         | Philip Roessler      |
| Karolina Milewicz    | Costas Panagopoulos   | Adrian Rogstad       |
| Charles Miller       | Manjeet Pardesi       | Ben Rosher           |
| Aidan Milliff        | Bradley Parks         | Joshua Rovner        |
| Eric Min             | Tommaso Pavone        | Aviad Rubin          |
| Ronald Mitchell      | Pamela Paxton         | Michael Rubin        |
| Tamar Mitts          | Clint Peinhardt       | Kamal Sadiq          |
| Jennifer Mitzen      | Krzysztof Pelc        | Scott Sagan          |
| Sayumi Miyano        | Thomas Pepinsky       | Atef Said            |
| Courtenay Monroe     | Anibal Perez-Linan    | Idean Salehyan       |
| Julia Morse          | Rebecca Perlman       | Colette Salemi       |
| Lisa Mueller         | Margaret Peters       | Ilai Saltzman        |
| Rohan Mukherjee      | Andrew Phillips       | Cyrus Samii          |
| Bumba Mukherjee      | Pablo Pinto           | Wayne Sandholtz      |
| Amanda Murdie        | Paul Poast            | Mehwish Sarwari      |
| Matt Murphy          | Mark Pollack          | Brent Sasley         |
| Harris Mylonas       | Sara Polo             | Thomas Sattler       |
| Rachel Myrick        | Ethan Porter          | Burcu Savun          |
| Robert Nagel         | Daniel Posner         | William Schabas      |
| Deepak Nair          | Abigail Post          | Frank Schimmelfennig |
| Monika Nalepa        | Philip Potter         | Averell Schmidt      |
| Neil Narang          | Lauge Poulsen         | Olivier Schmitt      |
| Daniel Naurin        | Emilia Powell         | Rachel Schoner       |
| Eric Neumayer        | Kathleen Powers       | Andrew Schrank       |
| Daniel Nexon         | Aseem Prakash         | Robert Schub         |
| Daniel Nielson       | Lauren Prather        | Joshua Schwartz      |
| Olena Nikolayenko    | Tyler Pratt           | Randall Schweller    |
| Desirée Nilsson      | Keith Preble          | Todd Sechser         |
| Yui Nishimura        | Alyssa Prorok         | Emily Sellars        |
| Ragnhild Nordås      | Xiaoyu Pu             | Ole Jacob Sending    |
| Fernando Nuñez-Mietz | Didac Queralt         | Renard Sexton        |

|                        |                        |                      |
|------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|
| Alireza Shams Lahijani | Motoshi Suzuki         | Carolyn Warner       |
| Megan Shannon          | Jordan Tama            | Dov Waxman           |
| Gulnaz Sharafutdinova  | Nina Tannenwald        | Carly Wayne          |
| Jason Sharman          | Ahmer Tarar            | Catherine Weaver     |
| Christopher Shay       | Margit Tavits          | Florian Weiler       |
| Moses Shayo            | Michelle Taylor-       | Michael Weintraub    |
| Robbie Shilliam        | Robinson               | Alex Weisiger        |
| Adrian Shin            | Ruti Teitel            | Ryan Weldzius        |
| Susan Shirk            | Shibley Telhami        | Rachel Wellhausen    |
| Niloufer Siddiqui      | Jan Teorell            | Stephen Weymouth     |
| Branislav Slantchev    | Rochelle Terman        | Samuel Whitt         |
| Michael Slobodchikoff  | Cameron Thies          | Monica Widmann       |
| Max Smeets             | Jakana Thomas          | Krista Wiegand       |
| Michal Smetana         | Alexander Thompson     | Antje Wiener         |
| Hannah Smidt           | Calvin Thrall          | William Winecoff     |
| Brad Smith             | Michael Tierney        | Matthew Winters      |
| Alastair Smith         | Michelle Torres        | William Wohlforth    |
| Omer Solodoch          | Ann Towns              | Scott Wolford        |
| Konstantin Sonin       | Daniel Treisman        | Elisabeth Wood       |
| Mark Souva             | Jacqui True            | Reed Wood            |
| William Spaniel        | Gerasimos Tsourapas    | Joseph Wright        |
| Gabriele Spilker       | Zeynep Tufekci         | Austin Wright        |
| Sharath Srinivasan     | Matthew Tyler          | Julian Wucherpfennig |
| Swati Srivastava       | Akin Unver             | Carmen Wunderlich    |
| Jessica Stanton        | Felicity Vabulas       | Frank Wyer           |
| David Stasavage        | Milada Vachudova       | Xu Xu                |
| Jeffrey Staton         | Krishna Vadlamannati   | Tony Zirui Yang      |
| Brent Steele           | Benjamin Valentino     | Brandon Yoder        |
| David Steinberg        | Roos van der Haer      | Hye Young You        |
| Zachary Steinert-      | Jane Vaynman           | Joseph Young         |
| Threlkeld              | Kristopher Velasco     | Amy Yuen             |
| Megan Stewart          | Robert Vitalis         | Neda Zawahri         |
| Jonathan Strand        | Tristan Volpe          | Maja Zehfuss         |
| Austin Strange         | Inken von Borzyskowski | Alexandra Zeitz      |
| Jelena Subotic         | Stefanie von Hlatky    | Yuleng Zeng          |
| Kyungwon Suh           | Samantha Vortherns     | Boliang Zhu          |
| Lauren Sukin           | Elsa Voytas            | Yuri Zhukov          |
| Christopher Sullivan   | Ole Wæver              | Noah Zucker          |
| Meicen Sun             | Geoffrey Wallace       | Kelebogile Zvobgo    |
| Pavithra Suryanarayan  | Stephen Walt           |                      |
| Shogo Suzuki           | Steven Ward            |                      |