

VOLUME 19
NUMBER 4
DECEMBER 1996

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Resolving the contradictions of addiction Gene M. Heyman

Innateness, autonomy, universality? Neurobiological approaches to language Ralph-Axel Müller

Second language acquisition: Theoretical and experimental issues in contemporary research Samuel David Epstein, Suzanne Flynn and Gita Martohardjono

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"The representing brain: Neural correlates of motor intention and imagery"
(Jeannerod)

"Two functional components of the hippocampal memory system" (Eichenbaum,
Otto & Cohen)

"Reintroducing group selection to the human behavioral sciences" (Wilson & Sober)

"Brain evolution and neurolinguistic preconditions" (Wilkins & Wakefield)

CAMBRIDGE

ISSN 0140-525X

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Department of Psychology
University of Southampton
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

Managing Editor

Henriette Korthals Altes

Production Coordinator

Lydia Stein

Chief Copy Editor

Anna Clune

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London

Computational Neuroscience

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primateology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. ISI Genuine Article Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 19 (1996) is US \$230.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £156.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$92.00 net (£60.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$51.00 net (£38.00). Subscription price includes surface postage.

Single parts cost US \$60.00 net (£40.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Periodicals postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 110 Midland Ave., Port Chester, NY 10573.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 19:4 December 1996

Heyman, G. M. Resolving the contradictions of addiction 561

Open Peer Commentary

Ainslie, G. How do people choose between local and global bookkeeping?	574	MacCoun, R. J. Is melioration the addiction theory of choice?	586
Bergman, J. & Miczek, K. A. The ameliorating addict: An illusion reviewed	575	McFarland, D. Who is at risk for addiction?	587
Berridge, K. C. & Robinson, T. E. Control versus causation of addiction	576	McKim, W. A. Positive reinforcement, the matching law and morality	587
Branch, M. N. Matching and melioration as accounts of reinforcement and drug addiction	577	Meisch, R. A. & Spiga, R. Relationship between melioration and the controlling variables	588
Fantino, E. The behavioral economics of addiction: A comprehensive alternative	578	Mitchell, S. H. & Baum, W. M. Maximization should sometimes lead to abstinence	589
Foss, J. A scientific fix for the classical account of addiction	579	Nevin, J. A. Stimulus factors in addiction	590
Higgins, S. T. Behavioral choice theory can enhance our understanding of drug dependence and other behavioral disorders	579	Orford, J. Addiction is not as puzzling as it seems	591
Hinson, R. E. Who determines the value of drug-taking behavior? Cultural considerations for a theory of behavioral choice	580	Perrig, C. Addiction requires philosophical explanation, not mere redescription	592
Houston, A. I. Melioration and addiction	581	Plaud, J. J. In search of the relevant behavioral variables	593
Hyman, S. E. Addiction: Taking the brain seriously	582	Robinson, T. E. & Berridge, K. C. The pursuit of value: Sensitization or tolerance?	594
Kirby, K. N. Future directions for the melioration model of addiction	583	Schelling, T. C. The contradiction unresolved	595
Laibson, D. I. An economic perspective on addiction and matching	583	Shizgal, P. The Janus faces of addiction	595
Logue, A. W. Self-control and impulsiveness: Resolution of apparent contradictions in choice behavior	584	Swift, R. M. Matching observation to addiction theory	596
McCauley, C. Understanding addiction: Conventional rewards and lack of control	585	Vuchinich, R. E. Addiction as choice? Yes. As melioration? Maybe, maybe not	597
		Vyse, S. A. Heyman's steady-state theory of addiction	598

Author's Response

Heyman, G. M. Which behavioral consequences matter? The importance of frame of reference in explaining addiction	599
---	-----

Müller, R.-A. Innateness, autonomy, universality? Neurobiological approaches to language 611

Open Peer Commentary

Bickerton, D. An innate language faculty needs neither modularity nor localization	631	Lieberman, P. Neuroanatomical structures and segregated circuits	641
Bullinaria, J. A. & Chater, N. Double dissociation, modularity, and distributed organization	632	Newmeyer, F. J. Müller's conclusions and linguistic research	641
Corballis, M. C. How to grow a human	632	Poeppel, D. Neurobiology and linguistics are not yet unifiable	642
Corina, D. Sign language and the brain: Apes, apraxia, and aphasia	633	Pulvermüller, F., Mohr, B. & Preissl, H. Biology of language: Principle, predictions, and evidence	643
Friederici, A. D. Autonomy of syntactic processing and the role of Broca's area	634	Rivera-Gaxiola, M. & Karmiloff-Smith, A. It's a far cry from speech to language	645
Copnik, M. Familial language impairment: The evidence	635	Schoenemann, P. T. & Wang, W. S.-Y. Evolutionary principles and the emergence of syntax	646
Graham, S. & Poulin-Dubois, D. Speaking of language: Thoughts on associations	636	Sinha, C. Autonomy and its discontents	647
Grodzinsky, Y. Neurobiological approaches to language: Falsehoods and fallacies	637	Smith, N. A polyglot perspective on dissociation	648
Hauser, M. D. & Sakata, J. A worthy enterprise injured by overinterpretation and misrepresentation	638	Stromswold, K. Genes, specificity, and the lexical/functional distinction in language acquisition	648
Jacobs, B. & Larsen, L. Pluripotentiality, epigenesis, and language acquisition	639	Walker, S. F. Is human language just another neurobiological specialization?	649
Kemmerer, D. Innateness, autonomy, universality, and the neurobiology of regular and irregular inflectional morphology	639		

Author's Response

Müller, R.-A. The epigenesis of regional specificity	650
---	-----

Epstein, S. D., Flynn, S. & Martohardjono, G. Second language acquisition: Theoretical and experimental issues in contemporary research 677

Open Peer Commentary

Archibald, J. Guilfoyle, E. & Ritter, E. Functional categories in L2 acquisition: Evidence of presence is not necessarily presence of evidence	714	Kanno, K. In support of the early presence of functional categories in second language acquisition	732
Bhatt, R. M. & Hancin-Bhatt, B. Transfer in L2 grammars	715	Li, P. Why don't L2 learners end up with uniform and perfect linguistic competence?	733
Bickerton, D. A dim monocular view of Universal-Grammar access	716	Liceras, J. M. To "grow" and what "to grow," that is one question	734
Birdsong, D. Full access to the evidence for falsification	717	Lieberman, P. Universal Grammar and critical periods: A most amusing paradox	735
Bley-Vroman, R. What we have to explain in foreign language learning	718	MacWhinney, B. Language is learned	735
Borer, H. Access to Universal Grammar: The real issues	718	Newmeyer, F. J. Some incorrect implications of the full-access hypothesis	736
Carroll, S. E. Parameter-setting in second language acquisition – explanans and explanandum	720	O'Grady, W. Syntactic representations and the L2 acquisition device	737
Clahsen, H. & Muysken, P. How adult second language learning differs from child first language development	721	Otero, C. P. Language growth after puberty?	738
DeGraff, M. UG and acquisition in pidginization and creolization	723	Schwartz, B. D. Now for some facts, with a focus on development and an explicit role for the L1	739
Eubank, L. Methodological problems with Epstein, Flynn, and Martohardjono's research	724	Sharwood Smith, M. A. Metalinguistic ability and primary linguistic data	740
Freidin, R. Adult language acquisition and Universal Grammar	725	Sorace, A. On gradience and optionality in non-native grammars	741
Gregg, K. R. UG and SLA: The access question, and how to beg it	726	Sprouse, R. A. Appreciating the poverty of the stimulus in second language acquisition	742
Grewendorf, G. Does second language grow?	727	Thomas, M. "Full access" and the history of linguistics	743
Hale, K. Can UG and L1 be distinguished in L2 acquisition?	728	Torrego, E. Towards characterizing what the L2 learner knows	744
Hale, M. Competence and performance in language acquisition	730	Vainikka, A. & Young-Scholten, M. Partial transfer, not partial access	744
Harrington, M. L2 access to UG: Now you see it, now you don't	731	White, L. UG, the L1, and questions of evidence	745
		Authors' Response	
		Epstein, S. D., Flynn, S. & Martohardjono, G. Universal Grammar and second language acquisition: The null hypothesis	746

Continuing commentary

On Jeannerod, M. (1994) The representing brain: Neural correlates of motor intention and imagery. BBS 17:187–245. 759

Grant, S. C. & Schmuckler, M. A. Alternative origins of motor images	759	Rossetti, Y. & Rode, G. In search of nonvisual motor images	762
Kohl, R. M. & Fisiaro, S. A. Response intention and imagery processes: Locus, interaction, and contribution to motor learning	760	Author's Response	
		Jeannerod, M. Motor representations: One or many?	763

On Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T. & Cohen, N. J. (1994) Two functional components of the hippocampal memory system. BBS 17:449–517. 766

Colombo, M. & Gross, C. G. Hippocampus, delay neurons, and sensory heterogeneity	766	Toates, F. The hippocampus seen in the context of declarative and procedural control	771
Crusio, W. E. The hunting of the hippocampal function	767	Authors' Response	
Moscovitch, M. Recovered consciousness: A proposal for making consciousness integral to neuropsychological theories of memory in humans and nonhumans	768	Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T., & Cohen, N. J. The hippocampal system: Dissociating its functional components and recombining them in the service of declarative memory	772
Mumby, D. G. Sequential processing of "items" and "relations"	770		

On Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. (1994) Reintroducing group selection to the human behavioral sciences. BBS 17:585–654.		777
Barresi, J. Group selection and “the pious gene”	777	Waller, M. Genier than thou 781
Jones, D. Varieties of group selection	778	
Lamb, M. E. What is selected in group selection?	779	Authors’ Response
Palmer, C. T., Fredrickson, B. E., & Tilley, C. F. Group selection or categorical perception?	780	Wilson, D. S. & Sober, E. More on group selection and human behavior 782
van de Wetering, S. Authoritarianism as a group-level adaptation in humans	780	
 On Wilkins, W. K. & Wakefield, J. (1995) Brain evolution and neurolinguistic preconditions. BBS 18:161–226.		788
Lynch, M. P. And what of human musicality?	788	Authors’ Response
Tobias, P. V. The dating of linguistic beginnings	789	Wilkins, W. K. & Wakefield, J. Further issues in neurolinguistic preconditions 793
Westergaard, G. C. The lithic technology of <i>Cebus apella</i> and its implications for brain evolution and the preconditions of language in <i>Homo habilis</i>	792	

Erratum

In BBS 17:3 (1994), p. 500, the title of the response by H. Eichenbaum, T. Otto, and N. J. Cohen, should have been “The hippocampal memory system and its functional components: Further explication and clarification,” as it appeared in the Contents of that issue.

THE CEREBRAL CODE

Thinking a Thought in the Mosaics of the Mind
William H. Calvin

"In an age when brain science is becoming increasingly fragmented and specialised, Calvin is a *rara avis*... he provides a broad overview on the functions of the brain and a bold and novel conjecture about the most highly evolved yet enigmatic of all biological organs—the human cerebral cortex." — V.S. Ramachandran, UCSD
A Bradford Book • 248 pp. \$22.50

BEING THERE

Putting Brain, Body, and World Together Again
Andy Clark

"...moves ahead of the current state of the field to anticipate the next stages of cognitive science, a science of the embodied mind, and mind embedded in the world. An excellent and unique book."
— Dan Lloyd, Trinity College

A Bradford Book • 280 pp. \$25

RETHINKING INNATENESS

A Connectionist Perspective on Development

*Jeffrey L. Elman, Elizabeth A. Bates,
Mark H. Johnson, Annette Karmiloff-Smith,
Domenico Parisi, Kim Plunkett*

"This is a landmark publication in developmental psychology, bringing together ideas from cognitive psychology, connectionist modelling, neurobiology and dynamical systems theory." — Dr. Dorothy Bishop, MRC Applied Psychology Unit

Neural Networks and Connectionist Modeling series.
A Bradford Book • 475 pp. \$45

MIND

Introduction to Cognitive Science

Paul Thagard

"...an engaging introduction to cognitive science. *Mind* highlights both the core ideas about mental representation that guide the field, and the intellectual challenges that fuel current debates." — Keith J. Holyoak, University of California, Los Angeles

A Bradford Book • 190 pp., 19 illus. \$22.50

ADVANCES IN GENETIC PROGRAMMING, VOLUME 2

*edited by Peter J. Angeline
and Kenneth E. Kinneer, Jr.*

"...shows off the exuberance of the new field [with] useful work on theory, representations, and applications." — BYTE

Complex Adaptive Systems series.
A Bradford Book • 538 pp. \$50

WORDS, THOUGHTS, AND THEORIES

Alison Gopnik and Andrew N. Meltzoff

Explains why theories are as fundamental to cognition as words and thoughts are—not only for adults, but also in child cognitive development.

Learning, Development, and Conceptual Change series.
A Bradford Book • 350 pp. \$30

Now in Paperback

IMAGE AND BRAIN

The Resolution of the Imagery Debate

Stephen M. Kosslyn

"An excellent and comprehensive volume that reviews the major findings in the study of visual mental imagery." — *Science Books & Films*

A Bradford Book • 528 pp., 46 illus. \$27.50 paper

The MIT Press

INDIRECT PERCEPTION

Irvin Rock

Argues that visual perception is mediated by psychological inference, so that the mapping between stimulation of the eye and conscious perceptual experience is indirect.

Cognitive Psychology series. A Bradford Book
350 pp., 101 illus. \$35

ELEMENTS OF ARTIFICIAL NEURAL NETWORKS

*Kishan Mehrotra, Chilukuri K. Mohan,
and Sanjay Ranka*

"This most readable book covers all the major network models and provides insightful information on their applications." — Duc Truong Pham, University of Wales Cardiff

Complex Adaptive Systems series.
A Bradford Book • 384 pp., 144 illus. \$55

FROM ANIMALS TO ANIMATS 4

Proceedings of the Fourth International Conference on Simulation of Adaptive Behavior

*edited by Pattie Maes, Maja J. Mataric,
Jean-Arcady Meyer, Jordan Pollack, and
Stewart W. Wilson*

Brings together the latest research at the frontier of an exciting new approach to understanding intelligence.

Complex Adaptive Systems series.
A Bradford Book • 600 pp. \$65 paper

Original in Paperback

GROWING ARTIFICIAL SOCIETIES

Social Science from the Bottom Up

Joshua M. Epstein and Robert L. Axtell

How do social structures and group behaviors arise from the interaction of individuals? This book approaches this question with cutting-edge computer simulation techniques.

Distributed for The Brookings Institution
160 pp. \$18.95 paper
Growing Artificial Societies is also available on CD-ROM, which includes animations that develop the scenarios described in the text. • CD-Rom \$59.95

Now in Paperback

THE ENGINE OF REASON, THE SEAT OF THE SOUL

A Philosophical Journey into the Brain

Paul M. Churchland

"Churchland has a knack for vivid exposition. He makes his case with clarity, wit, and certainly no shortage of verve." — *New York Times Book Review*

A Bradford Book • 344 pp., 89 illus. \$17.50 paper

To order call **800-356-0343** (US & Canada) or (617) 625-8569. Prices higher outside the U.S. and subject to change without notice.

<http://www.mitpress.mit.edu>