ADDENDUM TO "ON A THEOREM OF NIVEN"

Kenneth S. Williams

Can. Math. Bull., Vol. 10, no.4, pp. 573-578

Gordon Pall has kindly pointed out that the result of this paper was obtained by him in

Sums of two squares in a quadratic field, Duke Math. Jour., 18 (1951), 399-409.

He gives the result in a slightly different form on page 405. We note that the two formulae are indeed the same. In my paper write (3) as

$$z = \epsilon (1 + i)^{\alpha} \pi_{1}^{\alpha_{1}} \dots \pi_{s}^{\alpha_{s}} \bar{\pi}_{1}^{\alpha_{1}'} \dots \bar{\pi}_{s}^{\alpha_{s}'} q_{1}^{\beta_{1}} \dots q_{\ell}^{\beta_{\ell}}$$

so that

$$z\overline{z} = 2^{\alpha}p_1^{\alpha_1 + \alpha_1'} \cdots p_s^{\alpha_s + \alpha_s'} q_1^{2\beta_1} \cdots q_\ell^{2\beta_\ell}$$
.

If $p_i^{\gamma_i} | (x, y)$, then in Pall's notation $\gamma_i = \min(\alpha_i, \alpha_i')$

and
$$\alpha_i + \alpha_i' = 2\gamma_i + \delta_i$$
,

giving
$$\gamma_i + \delta_i = \alpha_i + \alpha_i' - \min(\alpha_i, \alpha_i') = \max(\alpha_i, \alpha_i')$$
.

Hence
$$(1 + \gamma_{i})(1 + \gamma_{i} + \delta_{i})$$

= $(1 + \min(\alpha_{i}, \alpha_{i}'))(1 + \max(\alpha_{i}, \alpha_{i}'))$
= $(1 + \alpha_{i})(1 + \alpha_{i}')$,

showing that Pall's formula (22) is the same as my formula (19).