

PMLA

PUBLICATIONS OF
THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION
OF AMERICA

Edited by
JOHN HURT FISHER
Secretary of the Association

December • 1965

VOLUME LXXX • NUMBER 5

The Modern Language Association of America

ORGANIZED 1883

INCORPORATED 1900

OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1965

President: HOWARD MUMFORD JONES, *Emeritus, Harvard University*
First Vice President: OSKAR SEIDLIN, *Ohio State University*
Second Vice President: GERMAINE BRÉE, *University of Wisconsin*
Executive Secretary: JOHN HURT FISHER, *New York University*
Treasurer and Associate Secretary: GEORGE L. ANDERSON, *New York University*

EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

For the term ending 31 December 1965
WILLIAM B. EDGERTON, *Indiana Univ.*
MARK SCHORER, *Univ. of California*
(*Berkeley*)
BARTLETT JERE WHITING, *Harvard Univ.*

For the term ending 31 December 1966
FREDSON T. BOWERS, *Univ. of Virginia*
HAROLD JANTZ, *Johns Hopkins Univ.*
BRUCE A. MORRISSETTE, *Univ. of Chicago*

For the term ending 31 December 1967
MADELEINE DORAN, *Univ. of Wisconsin*
VICTOR ERLICH, *Yale Univ.*
GEORGE J. METCALF, *Univ. of Chicago*

For the term ending 31 December 1968
CHANDLER B. BEALL, *Univ. of Oregon*
CLAUDE M. SIMPSON, JR., *Stanford Univ.*
CARL WOODRING, *Columbia Univ.*

TRUSTEES OF INVESTED FUNDS

F. B. ADAMS, JR., *Pierpont Morgan Library, Managing Trustee*
CLARENCE FAUST, *Ford Foundation*
ARTHUR HOUGHTON, JR., *Steuben Glass, Inc.*

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

Director of Programs: KENNETH W. MILDENBERGER
Foreign Language Program, MLA Tests: F. ANDRÉ PAQUETTE
English Program, ADE Coordinator: MICHAEL F. SHUGRUE
Research: GLEN WILLBERN
Association Bibliographer: PAUL A. BROWN (*Emeritus, Temple Univ.*)
Associate Bibliographer: HARRISON T. MESEROLE (*Pennsylvania State Univ.*)
Center for Applied Linguistics: CHARLES A. FERGUSON
Center for Editions of American Authors: WILLIAM M. GIBSON (*New York Univ.*)
Assistant Editor for PMLA: DONNA WALSH
Conventions, Advertising: ANNABELLE QUICK
Materials Center, Administrative Services: JOHN T. HARMON
Controller: HARRY ALONSO

Annual dues for membership in the Association, which includes subscription to *PMLA*, are \$15 except for the following special categories: a) student membership at \$7, open for a maximum of four years to those who are engaged primarily in a course of study leading to a degree and who do not hold full-time teaching appointments; b) joint husband-and-wife membership at \$22 with only one subscription to *PMLA*; c) foreign membership at \$10, open to resident citizens of countries other than the United States and Canada.

The subscription price of *PMLA* for libraries and other institutions is \$20 in the United States and Canada and \$18 in other countries. Agents deduct \$2 of these sums as their fee; institutions which subscribe directly may retain the same amount and remit \$18 or \$16. Single copies of the March, June, September (Part I), and December issues may be obtained for \$3 each; the May Bibliography and September (Part II) issues for \$4. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within one year of the publication date; thereafter the single issue price will be charged.

For information about the availability of back issues, inquire of the MLA Treasurer, 4 Washington Place, New York, N. Y. 10003. Early and current volumes may be obtained on microfilm from University Microfilms, 313 N 1st St., Ann Arbor, Mich. Purchase of current volumes on film is restricted to subscribers of the journal.

OFFICE OF PUBLICATION

Curtis Reed Plaza, Menasha, Wisconsin

EDITORIAL OFFICES

4 Washington Place, New York, N. Y. 10003

All communications including notice of changes of address should be sent NOT TO MENASHA but to the Treasurer of the Association at 4 Washington Place, New York, N. Y. 10003. If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation, the Treasurer should be informed of this fact at the same time.

Entered as second class matter at the post office at Menasha, Wis., under act of March 3, 1879. Subject to the provisions of §§7 and 8, Sec. 10, P. L. and R.

Acceptance for mailing at the special rate of postage provided for in the Act of February 28, 1925, embodied in paragraph 4, section 538, P. L. and R., authorized October 2, 1935.

© 1965 by The Modern Language Association of America.

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BY THE GEORGE BANTA COMPANY, INC., MENASHA, WISCONSIN

CONTENTS • DECEMBER

L. The Aesthetics of Textual Criticism. By JAMES THORPE.....	465
LI. Hook and Ahab: Barrie's Strange Satire on Melville. By DAVID PARK WILLIAMS.....	483
LII. The Problem of <i>Billy Budd</i> . By EDWARD H. ROSENBERRY.....	489
LIII. A Reading of Robert de Boron. By MARY E. GIFFIN.....	499
LIV. The Late Medieval Cult of Jesus and the Mystery Plays. By J. W. ROBINSON.....	508
LV. Theme and Irony in the Wakefield <i>Mactacio Abel</i> . By JOHN GARDNER	515
LVI. Theme and Structure in The Merchant's Tale: The Function of the Pluto Episode. By KARL P. WENTERSDORF.....	522
LVII. The History and Rhetoric of the Triplet. By CONRAD A. BALLIET.	528
LVIII. Satires on Man and "The Dignity of Human Nature." By BER- TRAND A. GOLDFAR.....	535
LIX. The Evidence that Hugh Brackenridge Wrote "The Cornwalliad." By J. F. S. SMEALL.....	542
LX. New Light on Sterne: An Old Man's Recollections of the Young Vicar. By JAMES M. KUIST.....	549
LXI. Browning's <i>Sordello</i> : The Art of the Makers-See. By DANIEL STEMPEL.	554
LXII. Walt Whitman and the <i>Nibelungenlied</i> . By WM. A. LITTLE.....	562
LXIII. The <i>Ebauche</i> of <i>Germinal</i> . By PHILIP WALKER.....	571
LXIV. Auden's Marxism. By JUSTIN REPLOGLE.....	584
LXV. Sutpen and the South: A Study of <i>Absalom, Absalom!</i> By MELVIN BACKMAN.....	596
<i>Notes, Documents, and Critical Comment</i> : 1. A Glance at "Whiteness" in Melville and Camus (by HARRY TUCKER, JR.).....	605
"For Members Only": News and Comment.....	610

PMLA

Issued five times a year during the months of March, May,
June, September, and December by the Modern
Language Association of America

(Indices: Vols. I-L, 1935, LI-LX, 1945)

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

JEROME H. BUCKLEY, 1968 <i>Harvard University</i>	FREDERICK J. HOFFMAN, 1969 <i>University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee</i>
J MILTON COWAN, 1970 <i>Cornell University</i>	MAURICE KELLEY, 1966 <i>Princeton University</i>
RUTH J. DEAN, 1967 <i>Mount Holyoke College</i>	JOHN G. KUNSTMANN, 1967 <i>University of North Carolina</i>
LEON EDEL, 1968 <i>New York University</i>	LOUIS A. LANDA, 1968 <i>Princeton University</i>
G. BLAKEMORE EVANS, 1969 <i>University of Illinois</i>	ROBERT A. PRATT, 1966 <i>University of Pennsylvania</i>
ZBIGNIEW FOLEJEWSKI, 1969 <i>University of Illinois</i>	WALTER SILZ, 1966 <i>Columbia University</i>
DONALD FRAME, 1968 <i>Columbia University</i>	WILLARD THORP, 1970 <i>Princeton University</i>
GORDON S. HAIGHT, 1969 <i>Yale University</i>	BRUCE W. WARDROPPER, 1969 <i>Duke University</i>

Editor: JOHN HURT FISHER

Assistant Editor: DONNA R. WALSH

Advertising Manager: ANNABELLE M. QUICK

A STATEMENT OF EDITORIAL POLICY

PMLA endeavors to represent the most distinguished contemporary scholarship and criticism in the modern languages and literatures. It welcomes both new and traditional approaches by either young or established scholars, providing only that whatever it publishes is excellent and likely to be of permanent value. The distribution of papers in *PMLA* should reflect work of distinction actually being done from year to year, regardless of periods or languages. Members who feel their interests neglected by this policy can always alter the situation by writing, or by encouraging others to write, articles good enough to be published.

The audience for *PMLA* is the total membership of the Association. Hence, it is reluctant to publish minor articles or highly technical studies addressed to specialists in limited fields. Nor does it encourage brief notes or unduly long papers. *PMLA* does not review books. Articles should be written in a clear, concise, and attractive style. Documentation should be held to a necessary minimum.

Every member of the Association has the privilege of submitting papers for publication in *PMLA*. Each paper submitted will be read by at least one consultant with special competence in the field concerned. Papers in any way recommended will also be read by at least one member of the Editorial Committee. Attempt is made to publish papers within nine months of acceptance. If a decision to accept or reject a paper seems unduly delayed, contributors are reminded that the services of consultant readers and the Editorial Committee are the unpaid labors of distinguished men and women who generously contribute their scant leisure to the advancement of scholarship in humane letters.

Manuscripts must be prepared in conformity with the *MLA Style Sheet*, published in the April 1951 *PMLA* and on sale as a pamphlet in the MLA offices. Authors are urged to read also the advice of R. B. McKerrow and H. M. Silver on scholarly publication, published in the April 1950 *PMLA*, and also on sale as a pamphlet. Manuscripts should be addressed to the Editor of *PMLA*, 4 Washington Place, New York, N. Y. 10003. Carbon copies are not needed, but should be made and retained by the author.