

# History of Education Quarterly



February 2009

Volume 49, Number 1

**THE CLAUDE A. EGGERTSEN DISSERTATION PRIZE:** The History of Education Society is accepting submissions for the Claude A. Eggertsen Prize for the dissertation judged to be the most outstanding in the field of History of Education. The prize carries an award of \$1,000 for the winner. 2009 Committee members: Sevan Terzian (Chair), Maggie Nash.

2008 winner: Zoe Burkholder, "'With Science as His Shield': Teaching Race and Culture in American Public Schools, 1900–1954." New York University.

Eggertsen Dissertation Award Committee for 2009:

Chair: Sevan Terzian, (2006–2009) University of Florida

Maggie Nash, (2007–2010) University of California, Riverside

**THE HISTORY OF EDUCATION BEST ARTICLE AWARD:** The History of Education Society awards a prize of \$500 biennially (in alternating years with the Henry Barnard Prize) for the best article in the history of education, broadly defined to cover a wide range of educational and cultural institutions inside and outside of the United States. This includes work on schools and universities, teachers, students, and families. The next award will be presented at the fall 2010 meeting of the History of Education Society. Articles published in journals during 2008 and 2009 (no book chapters) will be eligible. Self-nominations are also welcome. **The postmark date for entries is April 1, 2010.**

Best Article Winner for 2008: Kim Tolley, Notre Dame de Namur University, and Nancy Beadie, University of Washington. "Socioeconomic Incentives to Teach in New York and North Carolina: Toward a More Complex Model of Teacher Labor Markets, 1800–1850."

Honorable Mention: Jennifer de Forest, University of Virginia. "Conservatism Goes to College: The Role of Philanthropic Foundations in the Rise of Conservative Student Networks."

Honorable Mention: Ronald E. Butchart, University of Georgia. "Remapping Racial Boundaries: Teachers as Border Police and Boundary Transgressors in Post-Emancipation Black Education, USA, 1861–1876."

**THE HENRY BARNARD PRIZE:** The History of Education Society awards the Henry Barnard Prize of \$500 biennially (in alternating years with the Best Article Prize) for the best graduate student essay in the history of education. Nominations by faculty, graduate advisers, department chairs, and deans, as well as self-nominations by students, are welcome. HES also extends a \$250 travel supplement to the Barnard Prize winner for his/her attendance at the annual meeting, and covers the costs of registration and the banquet. 2009 Committee Members: Peter Wallenstein (Chair), Michael Fultz, Chris Ogren, Adah Ward Randolph, Christine Woyshner.

2007 Winner: Paul J. Ramsey, Indiana University. "In the Region of Babel: Public Bilingual Schooling in the Midwest, 1840s–1880s."

2007 Honorable Mention: Katherine Sedgwick, University of Pennsylvania. "From Hazing to Socialization: A History of Social Conformity and Freshman Orientation."

Barnard Prize Committee for 2009 (alternating years with Best Article Award):

Chair, Christine Ogren, (2006–2009) University of Iowa

Adah Ward Randolph, (2006–2009) Ohio University

Christine Woyshner, (2006–2009) Temple University

Benita Blessing, (2007–2010) Ohio University

**OUTSTANDING BOOK AWARD:** The History of Education Society sponsors an Outstanding Book Award. This award of \$1,000 is made annually to the author of the best book published in the preceding year. 2008 Committee members: Richard Angelo (Chair), Bethany Rogers, and Amy McCandless

**2008 Award Winners**

Outstanding Book Award Winner for 2008: Adam Fairclough, Leiden University, *A Class of Their Own: Black Teachers in the Segregated South* (Harvard University Press, 2007).

Outstanding Book Award Committee for 2009:

Chair, Bethany Rogers, (2006–2009) College of Staten Island

Amy McCandless, (2007–2010) College of Charleston

**History of Education Quarterly**  
 University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
 360 Education Building, MC-708  
 1310 South Sixth Street, Champaign, IL 61820  
 Phone: 217 333-2446 (Office), Fax: 217 244-7064  
<http://www.ed.uiuc.edu/hes/INDEX.htm>

**Senior Editor**

James D. Anderson, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*

**Co-Editors**

Yoon K. Pak, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*      Christopher M. Span, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*

**Book Review Editor**

Katrina M. Sanders, *University of Iowa*

**Associate Editors**

David Adams, *Cleveland State University*      Kate Rousmaniere, *Miami University*  
 Nancy Beadie, *University of Washington, Seattle*      Eileen Tamura, *University of Hawaii*  
 Timothy Cain, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*      Wayne Urban, *University of Alabama*

**Editorial Assistants**

Paul W. Mathewson      Mario Rios Perez      Kevin Zayed

**Editorial Board**

<p><b>TERM EXPIRES IN 2010</b></p> <p>Carlos Blanton, <i>Texas A&amp;M University</i>              Benita Blessing, <i>Ohio University</i>              James W. Fraser, <i>New York University</i>              Marybeth Gasman, <i>University of Pennsylvania</i>              Karen Graves, <i>Denison University</i>              K. Tsianina Lomawaima, <i>University of Arizona</i>              Jeffrey Mirel, <i>University of Michigan</i>              Kathleen Weiler, <i>Tufts University</i>              Joy Williamson-Lott, <i>University of Washington, Seattle</i>              Robert S. Wolff, <i>Central Connecticut State University</i>              Roberta Wollons, <i>University of Massachusetts, Boston</i></p>	<p><b>TERM EXPIRES IN 2008</b></p> <p>Ian Grosvenor, <i>University of Birmingham</i>              Jon Reyhner, <i>Northern Arizona University</i>              Kim Tolley, <i>Notre Dame de Namur University</i>              Clive Whitehead, <i>University of Western Australia</i>              William Wraga, <i>University of Georgia</i></p> <p><b>TERM EXPIRES IN 2009</b></p> <p>Mona Gleason, <i>University of British Columbia</i>              Joyce Goodman, <i>University of Winchester</i>              Philo Hutcheson, <i>Georgia State University</i>              W. Bruce Leslie, <i>State University of New York, Brockport</i>              Gary McCulloch, <i>University of London</i>              Adah Ward Randolph, <i>Ohio University</i>              Alan Sadovnik, <i>Rutgers University</i>              Joseph Watras, <i>University of Dayton</i></p>
---	--

The History of Education Society is an international scholarly society. Its purposes are to encourage and facilitate research in the history of education; to promote and improve the teaching of history of education; to encourage cooperation among specialists in history of education; and to promote an appreciation of the value of historical perspective in the making of educational policy. The Society is affiliated with the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, and members of the Society are automatically members of the Standing Conference.

**President**

Eileen Tamura, *University of Hawaii (2009)*

**Vice-President**

Jonathan Zimmerman, *New York University (2009)*

**Secretary-Treasurer**

Robert Hampel, *University of Delaware (2009)*

**Directors**

Harold Wechsler, *New York University (2009)*      Kim Tolley, *Notre Dame de Namur University (2008–2010)*  
 Andrea Walton, *Indiana University (2007–2009)*

**INDIVIDUAL MEMBERSHIP:** Membership is open to all persons interested in the study of the history of education. Membership provides for subscription to the *History of Education Quarterly*; subscription to *The Network*, a newsletter published jointly with Division F of the American Educational Research Association; and receipt of the program of the annual meeting of the Society. Members of the Society are automatically members of the International Standing Conference for the History of Education. Membership offers subscription to publications on a calendar-year basis only. Dues are \$25 for students, \$50 for others. Non-U.S. members should add \$7 to cover additional postage for surface mail; \$20 for airmail. To become a member, send a check for the appropriate amount in U.S. dollars only to Journal Customer Services, John Wiley & Sons, 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148, USA, or to pay by credit card visit [www.blackwellpublishing.com/journals/hoeq/members.htm](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/journals/hoeq/members.htm)

Make checks payable to John Wiley & Sons. Indicate preferred mailing address and the calendar year in which your subscription should begin.

**Article Submissions:** Manuscripts must be submitted electronically to the *History of Education Quarterly* manuscript submission site, <http://ojs.ed.uiuc.edu/index.php/heq/index>. Questions regarding submissions can be directed to the editorial staff at [heq@ed.uiuc.edu](mailto:heq@ed.uiuc.edu). See last page of this issue or our website [www.blackwellpublishing.com/HOEQ](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/HOEQ) for guidelines on submission. The editor will only consider articles that have been submitted exclusively to the *History of Education Quarterly*.

**Book Reviews:** Assignments of reviews are made from a file of potential reviewers. To have your name added to that file, send curriculum vitae to the book review editor. Requests to review particular books cannot be honored.

HISTORY OF EDUCATION QUARTERLY, (Print ISSN: 0018-2680 Online ISSN: 1748-5959), is published quarterly on behalf of the History of Education Society in conjunction with the College of Education, the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 360 Education Building, MC-708, 1310 South Sixth St., Champaign, IL 61820 by Wiley Subscription Services, Inc., a Wiley Company, 111 River St., Hoboken, NJ 07030-5774.

**Mailing:** Periodical Postage Paid at Hoboken, NJ and additional offices.

**Postmaster:** Send all address changes to HISTORY OF EDUCATION QUARTERLY, Journal Customer Services, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 350 Main St., Malden, MA 02148-5020.

#### **Publisher**

*History of Education Quarterly* is published by Wiley Periodicals, Inc., Commerce Place, 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148; Telephone: 781 388 8200; Fax: 781 388 8210

**Journal Customer Services:** For ordering information, claims and any enquiry concerning your journal subscription please go to [interscience.wiley.com/support](http://interscience.wiley.com/support) or contact your nearest office:

**Americas:** Email [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +1 781 388 8598 or 1 800 835 6770 (Toll free in the USA & Canada).

**Europe, Middle East and Africa:** Email: [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +44 (0) 1865 778315

**Asia Pacific:** Email: [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com); Tel: +65 6511 8000

**Production Editor:** James Lui (email: [HOEQ@bos.blackwellpublishing.com](mailto:HOEQ@bos.blackwellpublishing.com))

#### **Information for Subscribers**

History of Education Quarterly is published in 4 issues per year. Subscription prices for 2009 are: Institutional Print & Online Rate: US\$132 (the Americas), US\$167 (Rest of World), €108 (Europe), £85 (UK). Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to [www.interscience.wiley.com/aboutus/journal\\_ordering\\_and\\_payment.html#Tax](http://www.interscience.wiley.com/aboutus/journal_ordering_and_payment.html#Tax). The Institutional Print & Online price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1, 1997, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit [www.interscience.wiley.com/journals](http://www.interscience.wiley.com/journals).

#### **Delivery Terms and Legal Title**

Prices include delivery of print journals to the recipient's address. Delivery terms are Delivered Duty Unpaid (DDU); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Legal title passes to the customer on despatch by our distributors.

**Back Issues:** Single issues from current and recent volumes are available at the current single issue price from [cs-journals@wiley.com](mailto:cs-journals@wiley.com). Earlier issues may be obtained from the Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526, USA. Tel: +1 518 537 4700, Fax: +1 518 537 5899, Email: [psc@periodicals.com](mailto:psc@periodicals.com).

#### **Copyright and Photocopying**

© 2009 History of Education Society. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to photocopy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organisation (RRO), e.g. Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA ([www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works or for resale. Special requests should be addressed to: [jrights@wiley.com](mailto:jrights@wiley.com).

**Advertising:** For advertising enquiries, please email Kristin McCarthy (email: [kmccarthy@wiley.com](mailto:kmccarthy@wiley.com))

#### **Disclaimer**

The Publisher, History of Education Society, and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, History of Education Society, and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, History of Education Society, and Editors of the products advertised.

This journal is available online at Wiley InterScience. Visit [www.interscience.wiley.com](http://www.interscience.wiley.com) to search the articles and register for table of contents email alerts.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: [www.blackwellpublishing.com/HOEQ](http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/HOEQ).

ISSN 0018-2680 (Print)  
ISSN 1748-5959 (Online)

Printed in the USA by The Sheridan Press.

# History of Education Quarterly

---

Volume 49 • Number 1 • February 2009

## Contents

---

### *Articles*

- 1      *Presidential Address*  
How Getting into College Led Me to Study the History of  
Getting into College  
*Harold S. Wechsler*
- 39     A Struggle for Control and a Moral Scandal: President  
Edmund J. James and the Powers of the President at the  
University of Illinois, 1911–14  
*Winton U. Solberg*
- 68     Tilting at Windmills? Judge Justine Wise Polier and a  
History of Justice and Education in New York City  
*Jennifer de Forest*
- 89     Reading, Writing and Radicalism: Right-Wing Women and  
Education in the Post-War Years  
*June Melby Benowitz*

---

### *Essay Review*

- 112    *Chicos, Chucos, and Chamacos: Perspectives in Chicana/o*  
*Educational History*  
By *Mario Rios Perez*

---

### *Book Reviews*

- 120    Benson, et al., *Dewey's Dream: Universities and Democracies in*  
*an Age of Education Reform*  
By *J. Wesley Null*

- 125 Klapper, *Small Strangers: The Experience of Immigrant Children in America, 1880–1920*  
By James R. Barrett
- 128 Levy, *To Export Progress: The Golden Age of University Assistance in the Americas*  
By Adam R. Nelson
- 133 O'Donoghue, *Come Follow Me and Forsake Temptation: Catholic Schooling and the Recruitment and Retention of Teachers for Religious Teaching Orders, 1922–1965*  
By Ann Marie Ryan
- 137 Recchiuti, *Civic Engagement: Social Science and Progressive-Era Reform in New York City*  
By Benjamin Justice
- 143 Setran, *The College “Y”: Student Religion in the Era of Secularization*  
By Katherine V. Sedgwick
- 148 Westhoff, *A Fatal Drifting Apart: Democratic Social Knowledge and Chicago Reform*  
By Kathryn L. Wegner
- 151 Williamson, *Radicalizing the Ebony Tower: Black Colleges and the Black Freedom Struggle in Mississippi*  
By Marybeth Gasman

**PHOTO CREDIT:** Judge Justine Wise Polier, Schlesinger Library, Radcliffe Institute, Harvard University.