

Nineteenth-Century Music Review



Volume 21 • Issue 3 • December 2024



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editors

MARTIN CLARKE & ROSEMARY GOLDING, *The Open University, UK*

Associate Editor

ERIN JOHNSON-WILLIAMS, *University of Southampton, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER

Louisiana State University, USA

JAMES SOBASKIE (CD/DVD Review Editor)

Mississippi State University, USA

NANCY NOVEMBER (Score Review Editor)

University of Auckland, New Zealand

HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)

Ball State University, USA

SANNA PEDERSON

University of Oklahoma, USA

KATHERINE PRESTON (Book Review Editor)

William & Mary, USA

BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT

Clark University, USA

Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

University of Chicago, USA

ANDREW BOWIE

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

SUZANNAH CLARK

Harvard University, USA

NICHOLAS COOK

University of Cambridge, UK

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

King's College, University of London, UK

JAMES DEAVILLE

Carleton University, Canada

JEREMY DIBBLE

Durham University, UK

STEPHEN DOWNES

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

KATHARINE ELLIS

University of Cambridge, UK

ANNEGRET FAUSER

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

PETER FRANKLIN

University of Oxford, UK

SOPHIE FULLER

Trinity College of Music, UK

LYDIA GOEHR

Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY

Stanford University, USA

SARAH HIBBERD

University of Bristol, UK

JULIAN HORTON

Durham University, UK

LINDA HUTCHEON

University of Toronto, Canada

HERVÉ LACOMBE

Université Rennes 2, Haute Bretagne, France

ALICIA LEVIN

University of Kansas, USA

RALPH LOCKE

Eastman School of Music, USA

ROBERTA MONTEMORRA MARVIN

University of Iowa, USA

SIMON McVEIGH

Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

JULIAN RUSHTON

University of Leeds, UK

DOUGLASS SEATON

Florida State University, USA

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

University of Oxford, UK

SUSAN YOUENS

University of Notre Dame, USA

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.*

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at cambridge.org/core.

© Cambridge University Press 2025

Contents

VOLUME 21, ISSUE 3

Notes on Article Contributors	459
-------------------------------	-----

ARTICLES

Richard Sherr	
The Memory Man: Jacques Offenbach, <i>Le Bonhomme Jadis</i> and the Origin of an <i>air connu</i>	460
Anirban Bhattacharyya	
From Musical Writings To Writing Music: Book-Writing Leading to Music School in Nineteenth-Century Calcutta	492
Amanda Lalonde	
Delphine von Schauroth, Corinna-Sister	518
Ryan Ross	
Letting the Lark Ascend: Vaughan Williams's 'Most Popular Work' and the Limits of Revisionism	550

BOOK REVIEWS

Hervé Audéon, Jana Franková and Herbert Schneider	
<i>Antoine Reicha: Actes des rencontres organisées à l'occasion du 250^e anniversaire de sa naissance / Proceedings of the Meetings Organised on the Occasion of his 250th birthday</i>	574
by Michael Bulley	
Laura Watson	
<i>Paul Dukas: Composer and Critic</i>	578
by Keith E. Clifton	

CD REVIEWS

Noël Wan	
<i>Impromptu</i> Sarah O'Brien, harp Audite, 97.807, 2022 (1 CD: 80 minutes) €19.99	583
Joe Davies	
Clara & Robert Schumann: Piano Concertos Beatrice Rana, piano Chamber Orchestra of Europe Yannick Nézet-Séguin, conductor Warner Classics, 5419729625, 2023 (1 CD: 57 minutes) £12.75	588

REVIEW ESSAY

Anne Swartz

- Moniuszko and the Revival of the Noble Traditions: *The Countess and The Haunted Manor*** Stanisław Moniuszko, *Hrabina (The Countess)* Karen Gardezabal, *sop*, Nicola Proksch, *sop*, Natalia Rubiś, *sop*, Rafał Bartmiński, *ten*, Mariusz Godlewski, *bar*, Jan Martiník, *bass* Podlasie Opera and Philharmonic Choir, Europa Galante, Fabio Biondi, *cond* Fryderyk Chopin Institute, NIFCCD 089-090 2021 (2 CDs: 120 minutes), €18 **Stanisław Moniuszko, *Straszny dwór (The Haunted Manor)*** Edyta Piasecka, *sop*, Monika Ledzion-Porczyńska, *mezzo sop*, Małgorzata Walewska, *mezzo sop*, Karol Kozłowski, *ten*, Arnold Rutkowski, *ten*, Marcin Bronikowski, *bar*, Mariusz Godlewski, *bar*, Tomasz Konieczny, *bar*, Rafał Siwek, *bass*. Podlasie Opera and Philharmonic Choir Orchestra of the Eighteenth Century, Grzegorz Nowak, *cond* Fryderyk Chopin Institute, NIFCCD 084-085 2019 (2 CDs: 146 minutes), €18

SCORE REVIEWS

- Allan W. Atlas
A Wilkie Collins Songbook 601
Delia da Sousa Correa and Rosemary Golding
- Sam Girling
Pierre Rode: Selected String Quartets 604
Simone Laghi
- Lars Helgert
Herrman S. Saroni, Complete Songs 1844–1889 607
Petra Meyer-Frazier
- Beethoven, Ludwig van. Jonathan Del Mar
Septet for Clarinet, Bassoon, Horn, Violin, Viola, Violoncello and Double Bass in E-flat major op. 20 610
Marie Ross

DIGITAL RESOURCE REVIEW ARTICLE

- David Larkin
Richard Strauss Online 614