

An International Journal of Legal Thought

Editors: Richard Bronaugh & Peter Barton

Erika Chamberlain A Classical Perspective on the Modern

Workplace: The Aristotelian Conflict in

Sexual Harassment Litigation

Are There Necessary Truths About Rights? Sean Covle

William A. Edmundson Social Meaning, Compliance Conditions,

and Law's Claim to Authority

Michael Giudice Unconstitutionality, Invalidity, and

Charter Challenges

Maricarmen Jenkins Can Pragmatism Overcome the Impasse in

Contemporary Legal Theory?

Emran Mian The Curious Case of Exclusionary Reasons

Critical Notice

Wil Waluchow In Pursuit of Pragmatic Legal Theory

The Practice of Principle by Jules Coleman

Volume XV, Number 1

January 2002

THE CANADIAN JOURNAL OF LAW AND JURISPRUDENCE is published biannually. Manuscripts should be addressed to The Editors, Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence, Faculty of Law, UWO, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 3K7. For e-mail: rbronaug@uwo.ca or rbronaug@rogers.com. Manuscripts should be written in English or French and double spaced. Authors are requested to include their e-mail address. Footnotes should conform to the Canadian Guide To Uniform Legal Citation/Manuel de la référence juridique, 4th ed. Two copies of manuscripts are required; these will not be returned, unless this is requested by the author. 25 offprints are provided without cost, as well as a two year free subscription to the Journal.

Web Page: http://www.law.uwo.ca/cjlj/

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION (two issues), including postage and handling:

Individuals \$40.00 Cdn. + 7% G.S.T. (\$2.80) if applicable

\$35.00 U.S.

Institutions \$70.00 Cdn. + 7% G.S.T. (\$4.90) if applicable

\$61.00 U.S.

BACK ISSUES (single copies), including postage and handling:

Individuals \$10.00 Cdn. + 7% G.S.T. (\$0.70) if applicable

\$ 9.00 U.S.

Institutions \$16.00 Cdn. + 7% G.S.T. (\$1.12) if applicable

\$14.00 U.S.

Institutions starting \$10.00 Cdn. + 7% G.S.T. (\$0.70) if applicable

a new subscription \$ 9.00 U.S.

Bills are mailed annually with issues. Information concerning back issues and subscriptions, as well as new orders, may be secured from Amy Jacob, Business Manager, CJLJ, Faculty of Law, UWO, London, Ontario, Canada N6A 3K7. Phone: (519) 661-2111, ext. 88422, e-mail: ajacob@uwo.ca.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

A Classical Perspective on the Modern	
Workplace: The Aristotelian Conflict in	
Sexual Harassment Litigation	3
Are There Necessary Truths About	
Rights?	21
Social Meaning, Compliance Conditions,	
and Law's Claim to Authority	51
Unconstitutionality, Invalidity, and	
Charter Challenges	69
Can Pragmatism Overcome the Impasse	
in Contemporary Legal Theory?	85
The Curious Case of Exclusionary	
Reasons	99
In Pursuit of Pragmatic Legal Theory	
The Practice of Principle	
by Jules Coleman	125
Announcements	153
	Workplace: The Aristotelian Conflict in Sexual Harassment Litigation

Faculty of Law
University of Western Ontario
London, Ontario
Canada

Volume XV, Number 1

alis volat propriis

January 2002

Editors

P.G. Barton R.N. Bronaugh Erika Chamberlain (LL.B., Western Ontario, 2001) is currently serving as a clerk to Mr. Justice Major of the Supreme Court of Canada. Her main interests are torts and the jurisprudence of private law.

E-mail: eachamberlain@sympatico.ca.

Consulting Editors

Anne Bayefsky
Jerome Bickenbach
Alan Brudner
Bruce Chapman
David Dyzenhaus
Leslie Green
Barry Hoffmaster
Michael Milde
Dennis M. Patterson
Stephen Perry
Denise Réaume
Arthur Ripstein
Mark Thornton
Wil Waluchow

Sean Coyle (LL.B. (Hons.), Dundee; Ph.D., Glasgow, 1998) is Lecturer in law at the University of Durham. His interests have particular reference to legal reasoning, property theory and theories of rights. With K. Morrow, he is working on a book entitled *Philosophical Foundations of Environmental Law*.

E-mail: Sean.Coyle@durham.ac.uk

William A. Edmundson (B.A., Antioch; Ph.D., UC, Berkeley; J.D., Duke, 1985) is Professor of Law and of Philosophy at Georgia State University. He has published *Three Anarchical Fallacies: An Essay on Political Authority* (Cambridge, 1998) and *The Duty to Obey the Law: Selected Readings* (Rowman & Littlefield, 1999)

E-mail: wedmundson@gsu.edu

Michael Giudice (B.A., New Brunswick, 2000) is an M.A. candidate in philosophy at McMaster University. His interests are in legal, moral, and political philosophy.

Student Editors

Mysty Clapton Ruth Rosen Ryan Steiner Randall Stephenson E-mail: giudicgm@mcmaster.ca

Maricarmen Marshall Jenkins (B.A., Regina; M.A. and Ph.D., McMaster, 1999) is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at St. Thomas More College, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon. Her interests are in ethics, politics and philosophy of law.

E-mail: maricarmen.jenkins@usask.ca

French Language Editor

Michael Hartney

Emran Mian (LL.B. (Hons.) and M.Phil., Glasgow, 1999) is a Doctoral Student in Law, Corpus Christi College, Cambridge, writing on the place of community in legal theory and in law.

E-mail: em244@cam.ac.uk

Business Manager

Amy Jacob

Wil Waluchow (B.A. and M.A., Western Ontario; D.Phil., Oxford, 1980) is Professor of Philosophy at McMaster University. He is the author of *Inclusive Legal Positivism* and editor of *Free Expression: Essays on Law and Philosophy*.

E-mail: walucho@mcmail.CIS.McMaster.Ca