

International Labor and Working-Class History

PATRONAGE, PATERNALISM,
AND COMPANY WELFARE

LABOR

&

CAPITAL



THE AMERICAN TWINS.
"United we stand, Divided we fall."



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

INTERNATIONAL LABOR AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY

Founded by
Robert F. Wheeler

EDITORS

Helmut Gruber
*Brooklyn Polytechnic
University*

Louise A. Tilly
*New School for
Social Research*

MANAGING EDITOR

Guy Baldwin
*New School for
Social Research*

ASSISTANT EDITOR FOR BOOK REVIEWS

Chad Alan Goldberg
*New School for
Social Research*

ISSUE COORDINATOR

David Montgomery

EDITORIAL BOARD

Dorothy Sue Cobble
Rutgers University

Geoffrey Field
*State University of
New York, Purchase*

Joshua Freeman
Queens College, CUNY

Michael Hanagan
*New School for
Social Research*

Victoria Hattam
*New School for
Social Research*

Ira Katznelson
Columbia University

Stephen Kotkin
Princeton University

David Montgomery
Yale University

Mary Nolan
New York University

Anson Rabinbach
Princeton University

Philip Scranton
*Georgia Institute
of Technology*

Judith Stein
*City College
of New York*

Barbara Weinstein
SUNY, Stony Brook

International Labor and Working-Class History (ISSN 0147-5479) is published twice yearly, in the spring and the fall, by Cambridge University Press for the editors of *ILWCH*. Additional support is provided by the New School for Social Research. Annual subscription rates for Numbers 53 and 54, 1998: Institutional US \$46.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £34.00 in the rest of the world; Individual US \$22.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £18.00 in the rest of the world; Single parts US \$24.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £17.00 in the rest of the world. Prices include surface postage. Add UK £8.00 for airmail.

International Labor and Working-Class History is indexed in ABC-CLIO; Alternative Press Index; American Bibliography of Slavic and East European Studies; America: History and Life; Arts and Humanities Citation Index; Current Contents: Arts and Humanities; Historical Abstracts; Left Index; Middle East: Abstracts and Index; and Sociological Abstracts.

Editorial Office: Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be addressed to Editor, *ILWCH*, Center for Studies of Social Change, New School for Social Research, 80 Fifth Avenue, Fifth Floor, New York, NY 10011. Tel. (212) 229-5921; Fax (212) 229-5929; INTERNET: ILWCH@NEWSCHOOL.EDU.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Offices: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England.

Copyright © 1998 International Labor and Working-Class History, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (ISSN 0147-5479/98 \$9.50) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law is authorized for duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$9.50 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. The Board of Consulting Editors may be found immediately following the contents. See the back of the journal for information concerning submissions to the journal.

Cover Photo: Thomas Nast, "The American Twins: Labor & Capital." Reproduced in M.B. Schnapper, *American Labor: A Pictorial Social History* (Washington, DC: Public Affairs Press, 1972), 571. Reproduced courtesy of The Tamiment Library, New York University.

PATRONAGE, PATERNALISM, AND COMPANY WELFARE

Introduction: Workers' Choices, Company Policies, and Loyalties
David Montgomery 1

Americanism and Paternalism: Managers and Workers in Twentieth-Century Italy
Elisabetta Benenati 5

Patronage, Paternalism, and Welfare: Masters, Workers, and Magistrates in Eighteenth-Century England
Douglas Hay 27

Divided Loyalties: Immigrant Padrones and the Evolution of Industrial Paternalism in North America
Gunther Peck 49

Paternalism in Indian Labor: The Tata Iron and Steel Company of Jamshedpur
Blair B. Kling 69

Designing Obedience: The Architecture and Landscape of Welfare Capitalism, 1880–1930
William Littmann 88

The Birth and Consequences of Industrial Paternalism in Monterrey, Mexico, 1890–1940
Michael David Snodgrass 115

Paternalism, Productivism, Collaborationism: Employers and Society in Interwar and Vichy France
Kathryn E. Amdur 137

REVIEW ESSAY

Fringe Benefits: A Review Essay on the American Workplace
Walter Licht 164

SCHOLARLY CONTROVERSY: REPLY

Women, Work, and Citizenship: Response to Comment
Louise A. Tilly 179

REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

- Racializing Class, Classifying Race: A Conference on Labour and Difference in Africa, the United States, and Britain
Colin J. Davis 182
- The State of Labour and Working-Class History in Europe
Talja Blokland 185
- Class in a Multicultural Age: Organization of American Historians Meeting
Charles Carlson 188
- A National Association for Working-Class History
James R. Barrett 191
- Society for French Historical Studies
Michelle Marshman, Lloyd Kramer, and Judith Coffin 195
- The Lost World of Italian-American Radicalism: Labor, Politics, and Culture
Paul C. Mishler and William Mello 198

BOOK REVIEWS

- The Sex of Things: Gender and Consumption in Historical Perspective*, ed. Victoria de Grazia, with Ellen Furlough
Reviewed by Joanna Bourke 201
- The Industrial Craftworker: Skill, Managerial Strategies and Workplace Relationships*, by Peter Cook
Reviewed by Jonathan Zeitlin 203
- Work and Welfare: The Social Costs of Labor in the History of Economic Thought*, by Donald R. Stabile
Reviewed by Fritz Efav 205
- Equivocal Feminists: The Social Democratic Federation and the Woman Question, 1882–1911*, by Karen Hunt
Reviewed by Pamela M. Graves 208
- Women's Talk? A Social History of Gossip in Working-Class Neighbourhoods*, by Melanie Tebbutt
Reviewed by Pamela J. Walker 211
- Farewell, Revolution: Disputed Legacies, France, 1789/1989, and Farewell, Revolution: The Historians' Feud, France, 1789/1989*, by Steven Laurence Kaplan
Reviewed by Lloyd Kramer 214
- Management, Labour and Industrial Politics in Modern Europe: The Quest for Productivity Growth during the Twentieth Century*, eds. Joseph Melling and Alan McKinlay
Reviewed by Irwin M. Wall 221

<i>Wages, Manufacturers and Workers in the Nineteenth-Century Factory: The Voortman Cotton Mill in Ghent</i> , by Peter Scholliers	224
Reviewed by Louise A. Tilly	
<i>Creating German Communism, 1890–1990: From Popular Protests to Socialist State</i> , by Eric D. Weitz	227
Reviewed by Renate Bridenthal	
<i>Society, Culture, and the State in Germany, 1870–1930</i> , ed. Geoff Eley	230
Reviewed by Celia Applegate	
<i>Nazism and the Working Class in Austria: Industrial Unrest and Political Dissent in the “National Community”</i> , by Timothy Kirk	233
Reviewed by Martin Kitchen	
<i>La società unificata: Associazione, sindacato, partito sotto il fascismo</i> , by Maurizio Degl’Innocenti	235
Reviewed by Alexander De Grand	
<i>Politics and Ideology in the Italian Workers’ Movement: Union Development and the Changing Role of Catholic and Communist Subcultures in Postwar Italy</i> , by Gino Bedani	237
Reviewed by Stephen Hellman	
<i>Accounting for War: Soviet Production, Employment, and the Defence Burden, 1940–1945</i> , by Mark Harrison	240
Reviewed by Donald Filtzer	
<i>Native Americans and Wage Labor: Ethnohistorical Perspectives</i> , eds. Alice Littlefield and Martha C. Knack	244
Reviewed by Robert Campbell	
<i>More than Chattel: Black Women and Slavery in the Americas</i> , eds. David Barry Gaspar and Darlene Clark Hine, and <i>Discovering the Women in Slavery: Emancipating Perspectives on the American Past</i> , ed. Patricia Morton	247
Reviewed by Julie Saville	
<i>Commonwealth of Toil: Chapters in the History of Massachusetts Workers and Their Unions</i> by Tom Juravich, William F. Hartford, and James R. Green	251
Reviewed by Paul Buhle	
<i>Power, Culture and Conflict in the Coalfields: West Virginia and South Wales, 1900–22</i> by Roger Fagge	252
Reviewed by John H. M. Laslett	
<i>Una famiglia a stelle e strisce: grande guerra e cultura d’impresa in America</i> , by Ferdinando Fasce	255
Reviewed by David Montgomery	

<i>Organizing the Unemployed: Community and Union Activists in the Industrial Heartland</i> , by James J. Lorence Reviewed by Judith Stepan-Norris	258
<i>The Rational Factory: Architecture, Technology, and Work in America's Age of Mass Production</i> , by Lindy Biggs Reviewed by Daniel Nelson	261
<i>Organizing Dissent: Unions, the State, and the Democratic Teachers' Movement in Mexico</i> , by Maria Lorena Cook Reviewed by Susan Street	264
<i>Putting Class in Its Place: Worker Identities in East Asia</i> , ed. Elizabeth J. Perry Reviewed by Lane Earns	267
<i>Convict Maids: The Forced Migration of Women to Australia</i> , by Deborah Oxley Reviewed by Glenda Strachan	270
<i>Slaves into Workers: Emancipation and Labor in Colonial Sudan</i> , by Ahmad Alawad Sikainga, and <i>From Slaving to Neoslavery: The Bight of Biafra and Fernando Po in the Era of Abolition, 1827–1930</i> , by Ibrahim K. Sundiata Reviewed by Martin A. Klein	273
NEWS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS	276

BOARD OF CONSULTING EDITORS

Glenn Adler
University of the Witwatersrand

Kathryn Amdur
Emory University

Eric Arnesen
University of Illinois, Chicago

Gerd Callesen
*Arbejderbevaegelsens Bibliotek
og Arkiv, Copenhagen*

Lizabeth Cohen
Harvard University

Frederick Cooper
University of Michigan

Patrizia Dogliani
University of Bologna

Geoff Eley
University of Michigan

Elizabeth Faue
Wayne State University

Patrick Fridenson
*Ecole des Hautes Etudes
en Sciences Sociales*

Andrew Gordon
Harvard University

Michael Hall
Universidade Estadual de Campinas

Pat Hudson
University of Liverpool

Linda Kerber
University of Iowa

Alex Keyssar
Duke University

Bruce Levine
University of California, Santa Cruz

Nelson Lichtenstein
University of Virginia

Mary Jo Maynes
University of Minnesota

Louis Menashe
Polytechnic University

Ruth Milkman
University of California, Los Angeles

Lutz Niethammer
Kulturwissenschaftliches Institut, Essen

Elizabeth Perry
Harvard University

Pamela Radcliff
University of California, San Diego

Dilip Simeon
Association of Indian Labour Historians

Ronald G. Suny
University of Michigan

Marcel van der Linden
*International Review of Social History,
Amsterdam*

Adelheid von Saldern
Universität Hannover

Sean Wilentz
Princeton University

J. M. Winter
*Pembroke College, Cambridge
University*

Sergei Zhuravlev
Institut Rossiiskoi Istorii, Moscow