

NOTE ON POINTWISE CONVERGENCE ON THE  
CHOQUET BOUNDARY

Marvin W. Grossman<sup>1</sup>

(received September 8, 1966)

In [6] J. Rainwater obtained the following theorem.

**THEOREM.** Let  $N$  be a normed linear space,  $\{x_n\}$  a bounded sequence of elements in  $N$  and  $x \in N$ . If  $\lim_n f(x_n) = f(x)$  for each extreme point  $f$  of the unit ball of  $N^*$ , then  $\{x_n\}$  converges weakly to  $x$ .

Now let  $X$  be a compact Hausdorff space and  $H$  a linear subspace of  $C(X)$  (all real-valued continuous functions on  $X$ ) which separates the points of  $X$  and contains the constant functions. If  $x \in X$ , then  $M_x(H)$  denotes the set of positive linear functionals  $\mu$  on  $C(X)$  such that  $\mu(h) = h(x)$  for all  $h$  in  $H$ .  $\nabla_H X$ , the Choquet boundary of  $X$  relative to  $H$ , is the set of  $x$  in  $X$  for which  $M_x(H)$  contains only the evaluation functional on  $C(X)$  at  $x$  (i.e., the Dirac measure at  $x$ ). Note that  $\nabla_H X = \nabla_{\bar{H}} X$  where  $\bar{H}$  is the sup norm closure of  $H$ . The closure of  $\nabla_H X$  coincides with the Šilov boundary  $\partial_H X$  of  $X$  relative to  $H$ , that is, the smallest closed subset  $E$  of  $X$  such that  $\sup h(E) = \sup h(X)$  for all  $h$  in  $H$  (see [1] for details).  $\hat{H}$  is the set of  $f$  in  $C(X)$  such that  $\mu(f) = f(x)$  for all  $x \in X$  and  $\mu \in M_x(H)$ .

An application of the Choquet-Bishop-de Leeuw theorem and the Lebesgue bounded convergence theorem gives:

---

<sup>1</sup> This research was supported in part by NSF Grant GP 4413.

**THEOREM 1.** Let  $X$  be a compact Hausdorff space and  $H$  a separating linear subspace of  $C(X)$  which contains the constant functions. If  $\{h_n\} \subset H$  is a uniformly bounded sequence which converges pointwise to  $h_0 \in H$  on  $\nabla_H X$ , then  $\{h_n\}$  converges pointwise to  $h_0$  on  $X$ . Equivalently,  $\{h_n\}$  converges weakly to  $h_0$ .

Proof. Let  $x \in X$  and  $\mu_x$  be a measure on the  $\sigma$ -ring generated by  $\nabla_H X$  and the Baire sets such that  $\mu_x(\nabla_H X) = 1$  and  $\int h d\mu_x = h(x)$  for all  $h \in H$  (see [2, Theorem 5.5] or [4]). Since  $\{h_n\}$  converges to  $h_0$  almost everywhere  $\mu_x$ , by the Lebesgue bounded convergence theorem,

$$\int h_n d\mu_x \text{ converges to } \int h_0 d\mu_x, \text{ i.e.,}$$

$$h_n(x) \text{ converges to } h_0(x).$$

The purpose of this note is to show that the above theorem is equivalent to Rainwater's theorem.

$U_H$  will denote the positive face of the unit sphere of  $H^*$  (the conjugate space of  $H$  where  $H$  has the sup norm). Equip  $H^*$  with the  $w^*$ -topology and let  $L: X \rightarrow H^*$  be defined by  $L(x) = \phi_x^H$  where  $\phi_x^H(h) = h(x)$  for all  $h$  in  $H$ . Then  $L$  maps  $X$  homeomorphically onto  $L(X)$  and  $L(\nabla_H X) = \mathcal{E}(U_H)$  where  $\mathcal{E}$  denotes the set of extreme points (see [1, Hilfssatz 8] or [2, Lemma 4.3]).

The following statements are equivalent:

I. Theorem 1

II. Let  $K$  be a compact convex subset of a locally convex Hausdorff space  $E$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  the family of continuous affine functions on  $K$ . If  $\{A_n\} \subset \mathcal{A}$  is a uniformly bounded sequence which converges pointwise to  $A \in \mathcal{A}$  on  $\mathcal{E}(K)$ , then  $\{A_n\}$  converges pointwise to  $A$  on  $K$ .

III. Let  $X$  and  $H$  be as in Theorem 1. If  $\{h_n\} \subset H$  is

uniformly bounded and converges pointwise to 0 on  $\nabla_H X$ , then there is a sequence of convex combinations of the  $h_n$  which converges uniformly to 0 on  $\nabla_H X$ .

IV. Let  $K$  and  $\mathcal{A}$  be as in II. If  $\{A_n\} \subset \mathcal{A}$  is uniformly bounded and converges pointwise to 0 on  $\mathcal{E}(K)$ , then there is a sequence of convex combinations of the  $A_n$  which converges uniformly to 0 on  $\mathcal{E}(K)$ .

V. Rainwater's theorem.

Proof. Let  $\mathcal{L}$  be the class of continuous affine functions on  $E$  (i. e., functions of the form  $l + \alpha$  where  $l$  is a continuous linear functional on  $E$  and  $\alpha$  is a real scalar) restricted to  $K$ . By a result of Bauer [1, Korollar, p.119],  $\mathcal{L}$  is a separating linear subspace of  $C(K)$  which contains the constant functions and  $\nabla_{\mathcal{L}} K = \mathcal{E}(K)$ . Bauer has also shown [1, Korollar, p.117] that  $\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{A}$ . Consequently,  $\nabla_{\mathcal{A}} K = \nabla_{\mathcal{L}} K = \nabla_{\mathcal{L}} K = \mathcal{E}(K)$ .

(Alternatively,  $\nabla_{\mathcal{A}} K = \nabla_{\mathcal{L}} K$  since  $\mathcal{L}$  is uniformly dense in  $\mathcal{A}$  [4, p.31].) It follows that Theorem 1 implies II and III implies IV.

We note that under our general setting if we set  $H \circ L^{-1} = \{h \circ L^{-1} : h \in H\}$ , then  $H \circ L^{-1}$  is exactly the restriction of the continuous affine functions on  $H^*$  to  $L(X)$ . (cf. [3, Theorem 3, p.18]). Since  $L(\nabla_H X) = \mathcal{E}(U_H)$ , II implies I and IV implies III.

If  $\{h_n\} \subset H$  is uniformly bounded and converges pointwise to 0 on  $\nabla_H X$ , then by I,  $\{h_n\}$  converges pointwise to 0 on  $X$ . It is well-known that then the zero function on  $X$  can be uniformly approximated on  $X$  by convex combinations of the  $h_n$  (see [5, 2.1] for a non-measure-theoretic proof). Thus, I implies III.

If III holds, then by a result of Pták [5, Theorem 5.3]  $h_n|_{\partial_H X}$  converges weakly to  $h|_{\partial_H X}$  where  $\partial_H X$  is the Šilov boundary of  $X$  relative to  $H$ . Since  $H$  is isometrically isomorphic to  $H|_{\partial_H X}$ ,  $h_n$  converges weakly to  $h$ .

Statement II provides exactly the crucial step in Rainwater's proof (see [6]) so that II implies V.

Now suppose  $V$  holds and let  $\{h_n\}$  be a uniformly bounded sequence in  $H$  which converges pointwise to  $h \in H$  on  $\nabla_H X$ . By hypothesis,  $\phi_x^H(h_n) \rightarrow \phi_x^H(h)$  for all  $x \in \nabla_H X$ . Since  $L(\nabla_H X) = \mathcal{E}(U_H)$ ,  $\mu(h_n) \rightarrow \mu(h)$  for all  $\mu \in \mathcal{E}(U_H) \cup \mathcal{E}(-U_H)$ . If  $\mu \in H^*$  is such that  $\|\mu\| = 1$  and  $\mu$  is neither positive nor negative, then  $\mu$  is not an extreme point of the unit ball of  $H^*$ . For let  $\nu$  be a Hahn-Banach extension of  $\mu$  to  $C(X)$ . Since  $C(X)^*$  is an (AL)-space,  $\nu = \|\nu^+\| \left( \frac{\nu^+}{\|\nu^+\|} \right) + \|\nu^-\| \left( \frac{-\nu^-}{\|\nu^-\|} \right)$  where  $\nu^+$ ,  $\nu^-$  denote the positive and negative parts of  $\nu$ . Consequently,  $\nu|_H = \mu = \lambda\mu_1 + (1 - \lambda)\mu_2$  where  $0 < \lambda < 1$ ,  $\mu_1 \in U_H$  and  $\mu_2 \in -U_H$ . Thus, the set of extreme points of the unit ball of  $H^*$  is contained in  $\mathcal{E}(U_H) \cup \mathcal{E}(-U_H)$ . It follows from  $V$  that  $h_n \rightarrow h$  weakly in  $H$  so that  $V$  implies  $I$ .

Problem. Find an elementary non-measure-theoretic proof of Theorem 1 or of Rainwater's theorem.

A reason for hoping that a solution might exist is Pták's Theorem 2.1 which proves III, without using measure theory, when  $\nabla_H X$  is closed. Theorem 5.3 in Pták's paper may be useful here.

We state next two corollaries of Theorem 1 which follow immediately from known characterizations of  $\nabla_H X$ .

**COROLLARY 1.** Let  $\Omega$  be a bounded open set in  $E^n$  and  $\{h_n\}$  a uniformly bounded sequence of real-valued functions continuous on  $\bar{\Omega}$  and harmonic in  $\Omega$ . If  $\{h_n\}$  converges pointwise on the set of regular points of the boundary of  $\Omega$  to  $h$  continuous on  $\bar{\Omega}$  and harmonic in  $\Omega$ , then  $\{h_n\}$  converges pointwise to  $h$  on  $\bar{\Omega}$ .

Proof. If  $H$  is the set of functions in  $C(\bar{\Omega})$  which are harmonic in  $\Omega$ , then  $\nabla_H \bar{\Omega}$  coincides with the set of regular points of the boundary of  $\Omega$  (see [1, Satz 16]).

**COROLLARY 2.** Let  $A$  be a separating, uniformly closed

subalgebra of the algebra of all complex-valued continuous functions on the compact metric space  $X$  with  $1 \in A$ . If  $\{f_n\}$  is a uniformly bounded sequence of functions in  $A$  which converges pointwise to  $f \in A$  on the set of peak points for  $A$ , then  $\{f_n\}$  converges pointwise to  $f$  on  $X$ .

Proof. If  $H = \{\operatorname{Re} f : f \in A\}$ , then  $\nabla_H X$  coincides with the set of peak points for  $A$  (see [2, Theorem 6.5]).

#### REFERENCES

1. H. Bauer, Silovscher Rand und Dirichletsches Problem. Ann. Inst. Fourier (Grenoble) 11 (1961), pages 89-136.
2. E. Bishop and K. de Leeuw, The representation of linear functionals by measures on sets of extreme points. Ann. Inst. Fourier (Grenoble) 9 (1959), pages 305-331.
3. M.M. Day, Normed Linear Spaces. Springer-Verlag, Berlin (1958).
4. R.R. Phelps, Lectures on Choquet's Theorem. D. Van Nostrand, Princeton (1966).
5. V. Pták, A combinatorial lemma on the existence of convex means and its applications to weak compactness. Proc. of Symposia in Pure Mathematics, Vol. 7, Convexity, Amer. Math. Soc. (1963), pages 211-219.
6. J. Rainwater, Weak convergence of bounded sequences. Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 6 (1963), page 999.

Rutgers, The State University