

# European Constitutional Law Review

2015 VOLUME 11 ISSUE 3

*Contributions by*

Jacques Ziller, Henri de Waele, Jan Podkowik, Ingolf Pernice,  
Dimitry Kochenov & Laurent Pech, Alicia Hinarejos, Aleksandra Gliszczyńska-Grabias  
& Wojciech Sadurski, Bruno De Witte, Eoin Daly, Stephen Brittain

*Subjects*

FRANCE: the evolving meaning of indivisibility of the Republic; EUROPEAN UNION:  
upholding the rule of law in member states; and whether institutional change in face of  
the euro crisis amounts to constitutional mutation; EUROPE: multilevel constitutionalism  
and the crisis of democracy; EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE: an originalist view on the role  
of the Charter and of the Convention; and the preliminary ruling on Outright Monetary  
Transactions; the POLISH CONSTITUTIONAL TRIBUNAL upholding privacy rights; and handing  
down a judgment on religious slaughter of animals; BOOK REVIEWS



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

*EuConst*  
2015/3

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*Leonard F.M. Besselink, co-editor-in-chief*  
Professor of European Constitutional Law,  
University of Amsterdam

*Monica Claes, co-editor-in-chief*  
Professor of European and  
Comparative Constitutional Law,  
Maastricht University

*Jan-Herman Reestman, co-editor-in-chief*  
Associate Professor of Public Law, University of  
Amsterdam

*W.T. Eijsbouts*  
Emeritus Professor of European Constitutional  
Law and its History, University of Amsterdam and  
Emeritus Professor of European Law, Leiden  
University

*John W. Sap*  
Professor of European Union Law, Open  
University in the Netherlands and Associate  
Professor of European Union Law,  
VU University Amsterdam

*Thomas Beukers*  
European University Institute, Florence

*Jan Komárek*  
London School of Economics

*Gerhard van der Schyff*  
University of Tilburg

Junior editors

*Geerten Boogaard*  
Leiden University

*Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme*  
University of Amsterdam

*Jeremy B. Bierbach, production editor*  
Attorney at law, Franssen Advocaten, Amsterdam

*Bastian Michel, managing editor*  
Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Special language adviser

*Russell E.M. Lawson*  
Oxford

## BOARD OF ADVISORS

*Andreas Auer*  
Professor emeritus of public law, Universities of  
Zurich and Geneva

*Paul Craig*  
Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

*Gráinne de Búrca*  
Professor of law, New York University  
School of Law

*Bruno De Witte*  
Professor of European Union law, European  
University Institute, Florence; Professor of  
European Union law, Maastricht University

*Olivier Duhamel*  
University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

*Spyridon Flogaitis*  
Professor of administrative law, University of  
Athens

*Jörg Gerkrath*  
Professor of European law, University of  
Luxembourg

*P.J.G. Kapteyn*  
Former judge in the ECJ

*Tim Koopmans*  
Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General  
at the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the  
Netherlands), The Hague

*Rick Lawson*  
Professor of European Law, Leiden University

*Koen Lenaerts*  
Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law,  
University of Leuven

*Ingolf Pernice*  
Professor of public law and of international and  
European law, Humboldt University, Berlin

*Jit Peters*  
Professor emeritus of public law, University  
of Amsterdam

*Lucas Prakke*  
Professor emeritus of comparative  
constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

*Sacha Prechal*  
Judge at the ECJ and Professor of  
international and European institutional law,  
University of Utrecht

*W.H. Roobol*  
Professor emeritus of European history,  
University of Amsterdam

*Dominique Rousseau*  
Professor of public law, Université Paris 1  
Panthéon-Sorbonne

*András Sajó*  
Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

*Miroslaw Wyrzykowski*  
Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw  
University

*Peter G. Xuereb*  
Professor of European and comparative law,  
University of Malta

*Jiří Zemánek*  
Professor of European Union Law, Charles  
University, Prague, Judge in the Czech  
Constitutional Court

# EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

## 2015 VOLUME 11 ISSUE 3

### CONTENTS

#### *Editorial*

In Search of the Union Method 425

#### *Articles*

Bruno DE WITTE – Euro Crisis Responses and the EU Legal Order: Increased Institutional Variation or Constitutional Mutation? 434

Eoin DALY – The indivisibility of the French republic as political theory and constitutional doctrine 458

Stephen BRITAIN – The Relationship Between the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and the European Convention on Human Rights: an Originalist Analysis 482

Dimitry KOCHENOV & Laurent PECH – Monitoring and Enforcement of the Rule of Law in the EU: Rhetoric and Reality 512

Ingolf PERNICE – Multilevel Constitutionalism and the Crisis of Democracy in Europe 541

#### *Case Notes*

Alicia HINAREJOS – *Gauweiler* and the Outright Monetary Transactions Programme: The Mandate of the European Central Bank and the Changing Nature of Economic and Monetary Union – European Court of Justice, Judgment of 16 June 2015, Case C-62/14 *Gauweiler and others v Deutscher Bundestag* 563

Jan PODKOWIK – Privacy in the digital era – Polish electronic surveillance law declared partially unconstitutional – Judgment of the Constitutional Tribunal of Poland of 30 July 2014, K 23/11 577

Aleksandra GLISZCZYŃSKA-GRABIAS & Wojciech SADURSKI – Freedom of Religion versus Humane Treatment of Animals: Polish Constitutional Tribunal's Judgment on Permissibility of Religious Slaughter – Judgment of the Constitutional Tribunal of Poland of 10 December 2014, K 52/13 596

#### *Book Review Essay*

Henri DE WAELE – The Secession Conundrum – Through the Looking Glass 609

#### *Book Review*

Maartje de VISSER – Constitutional Review in Europe – A Comparative Analysis (Jacques ZILLER) 617

*Erratum* 620

## EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The journal is edited in the Hogendorpcentre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is based in the University of Amsterdam. Published three times a year. In the tradition of the Hogendorpcentre, the *European Constitutional Law Review* (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of the member states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

### *Submitting an article, case note or book review*

The editors of the *European Constitutional Law Review* are happy to receive contributions on relevant subjects at any time. Before submitting, authors should ensure that their contribution falls within the scope of EuConst as stated above.

Articles, case notes and book reviews can be sent by email to [euconst@uva.nl](mailto:euconst@uva.nl). Manuscripts should be attached in Microsoft Word format (and not, specifically, in PDF format) to enable editing, anonymisation and comments. EuConst has an exclusive submission policy. Authors are required to state clearly, when submitting, that their contribution is not under consideration elsewhere.

Authors of article contributions are asked to aim for a length of no more than 10,000 words (including footnotes). Case notes and book reviews should not exceed 5,000 words. Upon request, the editors will consider whether relaxation of these limits is justified.

All submissions must be written in good English. Authors who are uncertain whether their English is of sufficient quality, should have their manuscript reviewed and edited by a native speaker with a background in law.

### *Copyright, licence to publish and open access policy*

Contributors retain copyright. By submitting to EuConst, authors agree that upon acceptance of their contribution they will grant an exclusive licence to publish by signing and returning the appropriate Licence Form. Authors can make their contributions available through academic repositories. For more information, including terms and conditions of publication and authors' rights of reuse, see [journals.cambridge.org/EuConst\\_CTF](http://journals.cambridge.org/EuConst_CTF).

### *Revisions and house style*

Accepted contributions will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to authors' approval. Authors should ensure that their submissions conform to the house style. A style sheet is available on the journal website, [journals.cambridge.org/euconst](http://journals.cambridge.org/euconst).



The G.K. VAN HOGENDORPCENTRE FOR EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL STUDIES, short: HOGENDORPCENTRE, is a Jean Monnet centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam. Founded in 1996, it promotes research and course development in the field of European Constitutional Studies, bringing together the disciplines of constitutional (including comparative) law, history, political theory. Gijsbert Karel van Hogendorp, 1762-1834, is the *author intellectualis* of the Dutch Kingdom's first constitution, of 1814.