

Law and History Review

Law and History Review

Law and History Review (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6975. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

Back issues of *Law and History Review* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209-1987. Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at (800) 828-7571, via fax at (716) 883-8100, or email to order@wshein.com. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Authors should submit their manuscripts on-line at <http://lhr.law.unlv.edu>. Step-by-step instructions on the website explain the submission process. Address all general editorial correspondence to David S. Tanenhaus, Editor, *Law and History Review*, Department of History, University of Nevada, Las Vegas, 4505 Maryland Parkway, Las Vegas, NV 89154-5020 (tel 702 895 3549; fax 702 895 1782; e-mail david.tanenhaus@unlv.edu). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to Alfred L. Brophy, Associate Editor, *Law and History Review*, University of Alabama, 101 Bryant Drive East, Box 870382, Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0382 (205-348-0841; fax 205-348-5829; e-mail: abrophy@law.ua.edu). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 15th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page at <http://lhr.law.unlv.edu>. Please use word processing. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

© 2007 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

Law and History Review

Volume 25, Number 1

Spring 2007

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editor

David S. Tanenhaus
*University of Nevada,
Las Vegas*
Department of History
4505 Maryland Parkway
Las Vegas, NV 89154-5020
702.895.3549
FAX: 702.895.1782
E-Mail: david.tanenhaus@
unlv.edu

**Associate Editor
(Book Reviews)**

Alfred L. Brophy
University of Alabama
101 Bryant Drive East,
Box 870382
Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0382
205.348.0841
FAX: 205.348.5829
E-Mail: abrophy@law.ua.edu

Editorial Board

Edward J. Balleisen
Duke University
David A. Bell
Johns Hopkins University
Girish Bhat
SUNY, Cortland
Mary Sarah Bilder
Boston College
Bettina Bradbury
York University, Toronto
Peter C. Caldwell
Rice University
Andrew Wender Cohen
Syracuse University
Jane Dailey
Johns Hopkins University
Elizabeth R. Dale
University of Florida
Adrienne Dale Davis
University of North Carolina
Thomas J. Davis
Arizona State University
Christine A. Desan
Harvard University
Charles R. Donahue
Harvard University
Markus Dirk Dubber
SUNY, Buffalo
Mary L. Dudziak
*University of Southern
California*
Laura F. Edwards
Duke University
Daniel R. Ernst
Georgetown University
William E. Forbath
University of Texas, Austin

Thomas P. Gallanis
*Washington and Lee
University*
Sarah Barringer Gordon
University of Pennsylvania
Ariela J. Gross
*University of Southern
California*
Sally E. Hadden
Florida State University
Daniel J. Hulsebosch
New York University
Nancy Isenberg
University of Tulsa
Bruce Kercher
Macquarie University
Diane Kirkby
La Trobe University
Daniel M. Klerman
*University of Southern
California*
Mindie Lazarus-Black
*University of Illinois,
Chicago*
Kenneth F. Ledford
*Case Western Reserve
University*
Sanford V. Levinson
University of Texas, Austin
Thomas B. McAfee
*University of Nevada,
Las Vegas*
M. C. Mirow
*Florida International
University*
Mae M. Ngai
University of Chicago
William J. Novak
University of Chicago

James C. Oldham
Georgetown University
Ruth Paley
*History of Parliament,
Wedgwood House, London*
Pablo Piccato
Columbia University
W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
Columbia*
Gerry R. Rubin
*University of Kent,
Canterbury*
Lucy E. Salyer
University of New Hampshire
Reva B. Siegel
Yale University
Robin Chapman Stacey
University of Washington
Robert J. Steinfeld
SUNY, Buffalo
Emily Z. Tabuteau
Michigan State University
Eric M. Tucker
York University, Toronto
Michael Vorenberg
Brown University
Barbara Y. Welke
University of Minnesota
James Q. Whitman
Yale University
Martin J. Wiener
Rice University
Michael Willrich
Brandeis University
John Fabian Witt
Columbia University

Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 25, No. 1, Spring 2007

Full text available at www.historycooperative.org/home/html
LHR home page at www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html

In This Issue vii

Articles

- “A Civil Inconvenience”? The Vexed Question of Slave Marriage in the British West Indies
Cecilia A. Green 1
- Sir John Fielding and Public Justice: The Bow Street Magistrates’ Court, 1754–1780
J. M. Beattie 61
- Imposing the Royal Pardon: Execution, Transportation, and Convict Resistance in London, 1789
Simon Devereaux 101

Forum: Rethinking the Second Amendment

- Gun Regulation, the Police Power, and the Right to Keep Arms in Early America: The Legal Context of the Second Amendment
Robert H. Churchill 139

Comment

- Arms and the Man: What Did the Right to “Keep” Arms Mean in the Early Republic
David Thomas Konig 177
- Mandatory Gun Ownership, the Militia Census of 1806, and Background Assumptions concerning the Early American Right to Arms: A Cautious Response to Robert Churchill
William G. Merkel 187
- Early American Gun Regulation and the Second Amendment: A Closer Look at the Evidence
Saul Cornell 197

Response

Once More unto the Breach, Dear Friends

Robert H. Churchill

205

Book Reviews

The Canon Law and Ecclesiastical Jurisdiction from 597 to the 1640s—R. H. Helmholz

reviewed by Charles J. Donahue, Jr.

217

On The Rule of Law: History, Politics, Theory—Brian Z. Tamanaha

reviewed by Mortimer Sellers

219

The Culture of Property: The Crisis of Liberalism in Modern Britain
—Jordanna Bailkin

reviewed by Susan Scafidi

221

Chocolate on Trial: Slavery, Politics, and the Ethics of Business

—Lowell J. Satre

reviewed by Bernie D. Jones

222

*A Windfall for the Magnates: The Development of Woodland
Ownership in Denmark c. 1150–1830*—Bo Fritzboøger

reviewed by Eric Kades

223

*The Family and the Nation: Gender and Citizenship in Revolutionary
France, 1789–1830*—Jennifer Ngaire Heuer

reviewed by Alyssa Goldstein Sepinwall

225

*Western Law, Russian Justice: Dostoevsky, The Jury Trial, and
the Law*—Gary Rosenshield

reviewed by Girish Bhat

227

A History of Public Law in Germany 1914–1945—Michael Stolleis

reviewed by Peter L. Lindseth

229

The Times and Trials of Anne Hutchinson: Puritans Divided

—Michael P. Winship

reviewed by Yasuhide Kawashima

230

*Children and the Criminal Law in Connecticut, 1635–1855: Changing
Perceptions of Childhood*—Nancy Hathaway Steenburg

reviewed by Norma Basch

232

*Righteous Anger at the Wicked States: The Meaning of the Founders'
Constitution*—Calvin H. Johnson

reviewed by John P. Kaminski

234

<i>The Olmsted Case: Privateers, Property, and Politics in Pennsylvania, 1778–1810</i> —M. Ruth Kelly reviewed by Emily Blanck	235
<i>At America's Gates: Chinese Immigration during the Exclusion Era, 1882–1943</i> —Erika Lee reviewed by John S. W. Park	237
<i>From Welfare to Workfare: The Unintended Consequences of Liberal Reform, 1945–1965</i> —Jennifer Mittelstadt reviewed by Michael S. Green	239

