

VOLUME 16 REPRINT EDITION
NUMBER 3
SEPTEMBER 1993

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary. . .

From simple associations to systematic reasoning: A connectionist representation of rules, variables and dynamic bindings using temporal synchrony Lokendra Shastri & Venkat Ajjanagadde

Cultural learning Michael Tomasello, Ann Cale Kruger & Hilary Horn Ratner

Express saccades and visual attention B. Fischer & H. Weber

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Multiple book review of *The emperor's new mind: Concerning computers, minds, and the laws of physics*" (Penrose)

"The quest for optimality: A positive heuristic of science?" (Schoemaker)

CAMBRIDGE

ISSN 0140-525X

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: harnad@clarity.princeton.edu or

harnad@pucc.bitnet

20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor

Nancy Simon

Chief Copy Editor

Avis Kniffin

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primatology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 16 (1993) is US \$196.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada; £133.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$80.00 net (£54.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$46.00 net (£34.00); for APA, APS, and ASA members US \$64.00 net (£34.00) with proof of eligibility with order. Subscription price includes postage.

Single parts cost US \$50.00 net (£34.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 16:3 September 1993

Shastri, L. & Ajjanagadde, V. From simple associations to systematic reasoning: A connectionist representation of rules, variables and dynamic bindings using temporal synchrony		417	
Open Peer Commentary			
Barnden, J. A. Time phases, pointers, rules and embedding	451	Hölldobler, S. On the artificial intelligence paradox	463
Bauer, M. I. Plausible inference and implicit representation	452	Hummel, J. E. & Holyoak, K. J. Distributing structure over time	464
Cooper, P. R. Could static binding suffice?	453	Koerner, E. Synchronization and cognitive carpentry: From systematic structuring to simple reasoning	465
Cottrell, G. W. From symbols to neurons: Are we there yet?	454	Martin, D. L. Reflections on reflexive reasoning	466
Dawson, M. R. W. & Berkeley, I. Making a middling mousetrap	454	Munsat, S. What we know and the LTKB	466
Diederich, J. Reasoning, learning and neuropsychological plausibility	455	Oaksford, M. & Malloch, M. Computational and biological constraints in the psychology of reasoning	468
Dorffner, G. Connectionism and syntactic binding of concepts	456	Ohlsson, S. Psychological implications of the synchronicity hypothesis	469
Eckhorn, R. Dynamic bindings by real neurons: Arguments from physiology, neural network models and information theory	457	Palm, G. Making reasoning more reasonable: Event-coherence and assemblies	470
Feldman, J. A. Toward a unified behavioral and brain science	458	Rohwer, R. Useful ideas for exploiting time to engineer representations	471
Freeman, W. J. Deconstruction of neural data yields biologically implausible periodic oscillations	458	Sloman, S. Do simple associations lead to systematic reasoning?	471
Garson, J. W. Must we solve the binding problem in neural hardware?	459	Strong, G. W. Phase logic is biologically relevant logic	472
Grossberg, S. Self-organizing neural models of categorization, inference and synchrony	460	Thorpe, S. J. Temporal synchrony and the speed of visual processing	473
Halford, G. S. Competing, or perhaps complementary, approaches to the dynamic-binding problem, with similar capacity limitations	461	Touretzky, D. S. & Fahlman, S. E. Should first-order logic be neurally plausible?	474
Hampson, P. J. Rule acquisition and variable binding: Two sides of the same coin	462	Tsuda, I. Dynamic-binding theory is not plausible without chaotic oscillation	475
Hirst, G. & Wu, D. Not all reflexive reasoning is deductive	462	Young, M. P. Ethereal oscillations	476
Authors' Response			
Shastri, L. & Ajjanagadde, V. A step toward modeling reflexive reasoning		477	
Tomasello, M., Kruger, A. C. & Ratner, H. H. Cultural learning		495	
Open Peer Commentary			
Bard, K. A. A developmental theory requires developmental data	511	Harwood, R. L. Child development and theories of culture: A historical perspective	523
Baron-Cohen, S. Are children with autism acultural?	512	Hauser, M. D. Cultural learning: Are there functional consequences?	524
Barresi, J. & Moore, C. Sharing a perspective precedes the understanding of that perspective	513	Heyes, C. M. Imitation without perspective-taking	524
Boesch, C. Towards a new image of culture in wild chimpanzees?	514	Hobson, R. P. On acquiring the concept of "persons"	525
Braten, S. Social-emotional and auto-operational roots of cultural (peer) learning	515	Ingold, T. A social anthropological view	526
Bruner, J. Do we "acquire" culture or vice versa?	515	King, B. J. The primate behavioral continuum: What are its limits?	527
Byrne, R. W. Hierarchical levels of imitation	516	Lillard, A. S. Moving forward on cultural learning	528
Collier, J. Whence the motive for collaboration?	517	Midford, P. Cultural transmission is more than cultural learning	529
Forman, E. A. What is the difference between cognitive and sociocultural psychology?	518	Mitchell, R. W. Kinesthetic-visual matching, perspective-taking and reflective self-awareness in cultural learning	530
Gabora, L. M. Cultural learning as the transmission mechanism in an evolutionary process	519	Olson, D. R. & Astington, J. W. Cultural learning and educational process	531
Goldman, A. I. Learning stages and person conceptions	520	Renshaw, P. Cultural learning and teaching: Toward a nonreductionist theory of development	532
Gómez, J. C. Agents, intentions and enculturated apes	520	Rogoff, B., Chavajay, P. & Matusov, E. Questioning assumptions about culture and individuals	533
Gopnik, A. & Meltzoff, A. Imitation, cultural learning and the origins of "theory of mind"	521	Schnewly, B. Cultural learning is cultural	534

Trevarthen, C. Predispositions to cultural learning in young infants	534	Whiten, A. Human enculturation, chimpanzee enculturation(?) and the nature of imitation	538
Užgiris, I. Č. Interpersonal interaction as foundation for cultural learning	535	Wynn, T. Instructed and cooperative learning in human evolution	539
van Oers, B. Developing semiotic activity in cultural contexts	536		
Velichkovsky, B. M. From intra- to interpsychological analysis of cognition: Cognitive science at a developmental crossroad	537	Authors' Response	
		Tomasello, M., Kruger, A. C. & Ratner, H. H. Culture, biology and human ontogeny	540

Fischer, B. & Weber, H. Express saccades and visual attention 553

Open Peer Commentary

Albano, J. E. Express saccade programming produces visually triggered saccades	568	Jüttner, M. & Wolf, W. Express saccade—really a specific type of saccade?	582
Atkinson, J. & Hood, B. Gap effects on saccadic latency in infants and children	568	Klein, R. M. & Kingstone, A. F. Why do visual offsets reduce saccadic latencies?	583
Bachmann, T. Visual attention is <i>visual</i> , too	569	Nakayama, K. & Mackeben, M. Express attentional shifts	584
Belopolsky, V. I. The spatial dimension in visual attention and saccades	570	Reuter-Lorenz, P. A. & Hughes, H. C. Warning signals, response specificity and the gap effect: Implications for a nonattentional account	585
Bracewell, R. M. The express saccade: Autobahn or short circuit of the brain?	571	Robinson, D. L. & Cowie, R. J. Attentional engagement and the pulvinar	586
Breitmeyer, B. G. Express saccades: Attention, fixation or both?	572	Ruhnau, E. & Haase, V. G. Parallel distributed processing and integration by oscillations	587
Cameron, E. L. & Lennie, P. A speed/accuracy tradeoff in saccadic latency	572	Schall, J. D. & Hanes, D. P. Saccade latency in context: Regulation of gaze behavior by supplementary eye field	588
Cavegn, D. Is attention engaged or disengaged in saccade programming?	573	Sommer, M. A., Schiller, P. H. & McPeck, R. M. What neural pathways mediate express saccades?	589
Crawford, T. J. Attentional engagement, disengagement and preparatory intervals	574	Tam, W. J. Where do the three central issues stand?	590
Deubel, H. & Schneider, W. X. There is no expressway to a comprehensive theory of the coordination of vision, eye movements and visual attention	575	Van Gisbergen, J. A. M. & Minken, A. W. H. Toward an alternative scheme for the generation of express saccades	591
Findlay, J. M. Does the attention need to be visual?	576	Vitu, F. Prediction as an explanation for the occurrence of express saccades	592
Fischer, M. H. & Rayner, K. On the functional significance of express saccades	577	Wenban-Smith, M. G. Express saccades: A separable population?	593
Forman, S. D., Cohen, J. D. & Johnson, M. H. Frontal eye fields: Inhibition through competition	578	West, P. & Harris, C. M. Are express saccades anticipatory?	593
Hallett, P. E. Complexity and modes as factors underlying saccadic latencies	578	Wright, R. D. & Ward, L. M. Indexing and the control of express saccades	594
Henderson, J. M. Visual attention and saccadic eye movements in complex visual tasks	579	Authors' Response	
Inhoff, A. W. Visual attention may not control the occurrence of express saccades	580	Fischer, B. & Weber, H. Modes of saccade generation and their attentional control	595
Jackson, S. & Lees, M. The significance of the basal ganglia in suppressing hyper-reflexive orienting	581		

Continuing Commentary

On Penrose, R. (1990) <i>Précis of The emperor's new mind: Concerning computers, minds, and the laws of physics</i> . BBS 13:643–705.			611
Davis, M. How subtle is Gödel's theorem?	611	Wilson, D. L. Quantum theory and consciousness	615
Guccione, S. Mind the truth: Penrose's new step in the Gödelian argument	612		
Squires, E. J. The incompleteness of quantum physics	613	Author's Response	
Wallace, R. Cognitive mapping and algorithmic complexity: Is there a role for quantum processes in the evolution of human consciousness?	614	Penrose, R. An emperor still without mind	616
On Schoemaker, P. J. H. (1991) <i>The quest for optimality: A positive heuristic of science?</i> BBS 14:205–245.			622
Keren, G. Optimality as an epistemological organizing principle	622	Rachlin, H. Optimality and Aristotle's concept of final cause	623