

# Social Philosophy & Policy

## Ownership and Justice

### CONTENTS

JOHN KEKES	The Right to Private Property: A Justification	1
EDWARD FESER	Classical Natural Law Theory, Property Rights, and Taxation	21
ERIC MACK	The Natural Right of Property	53
DAVID SCHMIDTZ	Property and Justice	79
JAN NARVESON	Property and Rights	101
DANIEL C. RUSSELL	Embodiment and Self-Ownership	135
RICHARD J. ARNESON	Self-Ownership and World Ownership: Against Left-Libertarianism	168
THOMAS CHRISTIANO	The Uneasy Relationship between Democracy and Capital	195
GEORGE SHER	Real-World Luck Egalitarianism	218
GERALD GAUS	Coercion, Ownership, and the Redistributive State: Justificatory Liberalism's Classical Tilt	233
JAMES R. OTTESON	Adam Smith and the Great Mind Fallacy	276

# Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

**Editor:** Ellen Frankel Paul

**Associate Editors:** Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

**Managing Editor:** Harry Dolan

**Administrative Editor:** Tamara Sharp

*Social Philosophy and Policy Center*

## Editorial Board

David Braybrooke

*University of Texas, Austin*

Baruch Brody

*Rice University*

Allen Buchanan

*Duke University*

James M. Buchanan

*Center for Study of Public Choice,  
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman

*Yale Law School*

Jack Douglas

*University of California, San Diego*

Richard A. Epstein

*University of Chicago Law School*

James Fishkin

*Stanford University*

Antony G. N. Flew

*University of Reading (Emeritus)*

Martin Golding

*Duke University*

John Gray

*London School of Economics and  
Political Science*

Gilbert Harman

*Princeton University*

Eric Mack

*Tulane University*

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.

*Harvard University*

Wallace I. Matson

*University of California, Berkeley*

Jan Narveson

*University of Waterloo*

Nicholas Rescher

*University of Pittsburgh*

David Sidersky

*Columbia University*

Hillel Steiner

*University of Manchester*

James Q. Wilson

*Pepperdine University,  
Malibu*

Leland B. Yeager

*Auburn University*

*Social Philosophy & Policy* is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

**Editorial Office:** Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403-0188, USA.

**Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information:** See inside back cover.

Copyright © 2010 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/10 \$15.00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

## CONTRIBUTORS

**John Kekes**, Professor Emeritus of Philosophy and Research Professor, State University of New York at Albany, has retired in order to devote himself to writing full-time as an independent author. His books include *Against Liberalism* (1997), *A Case for Conservatism* (1998), *The Illusions of Egalitarianism* (2003), and most recently, *Enjoyment* (2008). He is currently at work on his next book, *The Human Condition: A Secular View*. He may be reached at jonkekes@nycap.rr.com.

**Edward Feser** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Pasadena City College in Pasadena, California. He has been a Visiting Assistant Professor at Loyola Marymount University and a Visiting Scholar at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University. He is the author of *On Nozick* (2003), *Philosophy of Mind* (2005), *Locke* (2007), *The Last Superstition: A Refutation of the New Atheism* (2008), and *Aquinas* (2009), and he is the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Hayek* (2006).

**Eric Mack** is Professor of Philosophy and a faculty member of the Murphy Institute of Political Economy at Tulane University. He specializes in moral, political, and legal philosophy. He has been a Visiting Fellow in Political Philosophy at Harvard University, a Visiting Scholar at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University, and a Resident Scholar at Liberty Fund, Inc. He has published many articles in scholarly journals and anthologies, primarily on such topics as the agent relativity of value, the nature and foundation of moral rights, property rights, Lockean provisos, rights and public goods, liberalism and pluralism, and economic justice. He is the author of *John Locke* (2009).

**David Schmidtz** is Kendrick Professor of Philosophy, joint Professor of Economics, and Director of the Center for Philosophy of Freedom at the University of Arizona. He is the author of *Person, Polis, Planet* (2008) and the coauthor with Jason Brennan of *A Brief History of Liberty* (2010).

**Jan Narveson** is Distinguished Professor Emeritus of the University of Waterloo in Canada. He is the author of several books, including *The Libertarian Idea* (2001), *Respecting Persons in Theory and Practice* (2002), and more recently, *You and the State* (2008). His next book is tentatively titled *This Is Ethical Theory*. He is also active as the director of the Kitchener-Waterloo Chamber Music Society. In recognition of his achievements in both musical and academic respects, he was made an Officer of the Order of Canada in 2003.

## CONTRIBUTORS

**Daniel C. Russell** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Wichita State University. He received his Ph.D. from the University of Arizona, and his areas of specialization are ancient philosophy and contemporary virtue theory. He is the author of *Plato on Pleasure and the Good Life* (2005), *Practical Intelligence and the Virtues* (2009), and numerous papers on ancient and modern moral philosophy. His most recent book project, tentatively titled *Virtue, Happiness, and the Self*, focuses on the role of conceptions of the self in our understanding of the relation of virtuous activity to happiness.

**Richard J. Arneson** is Professor, Above Scale (Distinguished Professor) of Philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. In the fall of 2008, he was Adjunct Professor at the School of Law, University of San Diego, where he is also affiliated with the Institute for Law and Philosophy. His recent writings are in political philosophy (on theories of justice) and in moral philosophy (on act consequentialism versus deontology).

**Thomas Christiano** is Professor of Philosophy and Law at the University of Arizona and co-director of the Rogers Program in Law and Society. He has been a Visiting Fellow at All Souls College, a Visiting Fellow at the Research School of the Social Sciences of the Australian National University, and a Fellow of the National Humanities Center. He is the author of *The Rule of the Many* (1996) and *The Constitution of Equality: Democratic Authority and Its Limits* (2008), and the coeditor of the journal *Politics, Philosophy, and Economics*. He has edited *Modern Moral and Political Philosophy* (with Robert Cummins, 1998), *Philosophy and Democracy* (2003), and *Contemporary Debates in Political Philosophy* (with John Christman, 2009). He has written widely in the areas of democratic theory, distributive justice, and moral and political philosophy. His current projects are a book on the foundations of egalitarian distributive justice and research on issues in global justice.

**George Sher** is Herbert S. Autrey Professor of Philosophy at Rice University. His essays on topics in ethics and social and political philosophy have appeared in *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, *Ethics*, *Noûs*, *The Journal of Philosophy*, and numerous other journals. His books include *Desert* (1987), *Beyond Neutrality: Perfectionism and Politics* (1997), *Approximate Justice: Studies in Non-Ideal Theory* (1997), *In Praise of Blame* (2006), and most recently, *Who Knew? Responsibility without Awareness* (2009). His current project, of which the essay in this volume is a part, is a book tentatively titled *Egalitarianism for Inegalitarians*.

**Gerald Gaus** is James E. Rogers Professor of Philosophy at the University of Arizona. His essay "On Justifying the Moral Rights of the Moderns," published in *Social Philosophy and Policy*, won the 2009 Gregory Kavka

## CONTRIBUTORS

Prize. Among his books are *On Philosophy, Politics, and Economics* (2008), *Contemporary Theories of Liberalism* (2003), *Justificatory Liberalism* (1996), and *Value and Justification* (1990). With Christi Favor and Julian Lamont he edited *Essays on Philosophy, Politics, and Economics* (forthcoming from Stanford University Press); and with Chandran Kukathas he edited the *Handbook of Political Theory* (2004). Along with Jonathan Riley, he was a founding editor of the journal *Politics, Philosophy, and Economics*. He is currently at work on two books: *The Order of Public Reason*, and *Economic Justice* (with Julian Lamont).

**James R. Otteson** is Professor of Philosophy and Economics at Yeshiva University in New York. He earned a B.A. from the Program of Liberal Studies at the University of Notre Dame, an M.A. in philosophy from the University of Wisconsin–Milwaukee, and an A.M. and Ph.D. in philosophy from the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Adam Smith's Marketplace of Life* (2002) and *Actual Ethics* (2006), the latter of which won the 2007 Templeton Enterprise Award. He is also the editor of *The Levelers: Overton, Walwyn, and Lilburne* (5 vols., 2003) and *Adam Smith: Selected Philosophical Writings* (2004). He is currently working on a book titled *Adam Smith*, which will be part of Continuum Press's series *Major Conservative and Libertarian Thinkers*.