

# European Constitutional Law Review

2011 VOLUME 7 ISSUE 2

*Contributions by*

Peter Van Elsuwege, Wim Roobol, Patricia Popelier and Werner Vandendriessche, Steve Peers, Anja Lansbergen and Nina Miller, Kriszta Kovács and Gábor Attila Tóth, Jean-Paul Costa

*Subjects*

THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS and the legitimacy of its judgments; HUNGARY'S new constitution; BELGIUM: the subsidiarity mechanism as a tool for inter-level dialogue; The constitutional implications of the EUROPEAN UNION patent; THE STATE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION'S MONARCHIES: the twilight of the European monarchy; EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE: Two judgments on citizenship rights in 'purely internal' situations; BOOK REVIEWS

*EuConst*

2011/2



T • M • C • ASSER PRESS



T · M · C · A S S E R P R E S S

## Freedom, Security and Justice after Lisbon and Stockholm

*Edited by*

Sarah Wolff, Flora Goudappel and Jaap de Zwaan

This book introduces the main changes induced by the Lisbon Treaty and the Stockholm Programme in the field of Justice and Home Affairs (JHA). The Lisbon Treaty has brought important changes to decision making at EU level, while the Stockholm Programme has set policy objectives for the next five years.

The contributions to this book assess briefly the *acquis* so far and elaborate on the future challenges that remain, in order to turn the *area of freedom, security and justice* into a reality, both for citizens and practitioners. Written by experts with different backgrounds – academics, policy makers and practitioners – they make this book a very useful tool for a broad audience, including EU officials, judges, lawyers, academics, students and police officers.

Dr. **Sarah Wolff** is research fellow at the Clingendael European Studies Programme, The Hague, The Netherlands. Dr. **Flora A.N.J. Goudappel** is associate professor of the Law of the European Union at the Erasmus School of law, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands. Prof. dr. **Jaap W. de Zwaan** is professor of the Law of the European Union at the Erasmus School of Law, Erasmus University Rotterdam.

2011, ISBN 9789067043175

280 pages, paperback

Price € 29.00

[www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)

Distributie: Boom Distributiecentrum, Postbus 400, 7940 AK Meppel,  
Tel. 0522-237555, Fax 0522-253864, [bdc@bdc.boom.nl](mailto:bdc@bdc.boom.nl)

# EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

[www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm](http://www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm)

[journals.cambridge.org/ECL](http://journals.cambridge.org/ECL)

Recommended citation: **EUCONST**

The journal is edited in the HOGENDORPcentre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is affiliated with the Europa Instituut and the Amsterdam Center of International Law (ACIL), University of Amsterdam and with the Faculties of Humanities and Political Sciences. Published three times a year.

Indexed in the following Thomson Reuters products and services: *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Social Scisearch*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Journal Citation Reports/Social Sciences Edition*.

## *Editorial Office*

European Constitutional Law Review c/o HOGENDORPcentre, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam. Tel. +31 20 5252957/2951. Fax +31 20 5252900. E-mail: [EuConst@uva.nl](mailto:EuConst@uva.nl).

## *Distribution*

The *European Constitutional Law Review* is distributed for T-M-C-ASSER PRESS by Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK. The journal is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service. This service can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/ECL>.

## *Subscription rates and specimen copies*

Subscription to the *European Constitutional Law Review*, Volume 7 (2011): Print + online: GBP 129.00 / USD 233.00 / EUR 185.00. Print only: GBP 117.00 / USD 211.00 / EUR 167.00; Online only: GBP 112.00 / USD 201.00 / EUR 153.00; Subscription orders, changes of address and requests for specimen copies should be sent to Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

## *Advertising*

To advertise in the journal please contact the relevant Advertising Promoter for your area: in the USA, Canada or Mexico: [journals\\_advertising@cup.org](mailto:journals_advertising@cup.org) or telephone +1 (212) 337 5053; in the UK, Europe or rest of the world: [ad\\_sales@cambridge.org](mailto:ad_sales@cambridge.org) or telephone +44 (1223) 325083.

## *Photocopying and permissions*

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Permission inquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; permission inquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission inquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm). Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com). For republication specific written permission should be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to [press@asser.nl](mailto:press@asser.nl).

ISSN 1574-0196

© 2011 T-M-C-ASSER PRESS, The Hague, and contributors.

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*W.T. Eijsbouts, editor-in-chief*

Professor of European constitutional law and history, University of Amsterdam and professor of European law, Leiden University

*Jan-Herman Reestman, associate editor-in-chief*

Associate professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

*Leonard F.M. Besselink*

Professor of European constitutional law, University of Utrecht

*Monica Claes*

Professor of European and comparative constitutional law, University of Maastricht

*John W. Sap*

Professor of European Union law, Open University in the Netherlands, Heerlen, and associate professor of European Union law, VU University Amsterdam

*Jeremy B. Bierbach, managing editor*

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

*David Nederlof, associate managing editor*

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Junior editors

*Thomas Beukers*

University of Utrecht

*Lars Hoffmann*

University of Maastricht

*Jan Komárek*

London School of Economics

*Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme*

University of Amsterdam

*Gerhard van der Schyff*

University of Tilburg

*Geerten Boogaard*

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

*Laurens Westendorp, student editor*

University of Amsterdam

Special language adviser

*Russell E.M. Lawson*

Oxford

## BOARD OF ADVISORS

*Andreas Auer*

Professor of public law, University of Zurich

*Paul Craig*

Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

*Gráinne de Búrca*

Professor of law, Harvard Law School

*Bruno de Witte*

Professor of European Union law, European University Institute, Florence

*Olivier Dubamel*

University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

*Spyridon Flogaitis*

Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

*Jörg Gerkrath*

Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

*P.J.G. Kapteyn*

Former judge in the ECJ

*Tim Koopmans*

Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General at the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands), The Hague

*Rick Lawson*

Kirchheiner Chair, Department of Public Law, Leiden University

*Koen Lenaerts*

Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law, University of Leuven

*Ingolf Pernice*

Professor of public law and of international and European law, Humboldt University, Berlin

*Jit Peters*

Professor emeritus of public law, University of Amsterdam

*Lucas Prakke*

Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

*Sacha Prechal*

Judge at the ECJ and Professor of international and European institutional law, University of Utrecht

*Hjalte Rasmussen*

Professor of European Union law, University of Copenhagen

*W.H. Roobol*

Professor emeritus of European history, University of Amsterdam

*Dominique Rousseau*

Professor of public law, University of Montpellier 1

*Andrés Sajó*

Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

*Miroslaw Wyrzykowski*

Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw University, Poland and judge in the Trybunał Konstytucyjny (Polish Constitutional Court)

*Peter G. Xuereb*

Professor of European and comparative law, University of Malta

*Jiří Zemánek*

Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law, Charles University, Prague

# EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2011 VOLUME 7 ISSUE 2

*This issue is dedicated to Joost de Reede  
for his contribution to the first five years of EuConst*

## CONTENTS

### *Editorial*

Rethinking Solidarity in the EU, from Fact to Social Contract 169

### *Articles*

Jean-Paul COSTA – On the Legitimacy of the European Court of Human Rights' Judgments 173

Kriszta KOVÁCS & Gábor Attila TÓTH – Hungary's Constitutional Transformation 183

Patricia POPELIER & Werner VANDENBRUWAENE – The Subsidiarity Mechanism as a Tool for Inter-Level Dialogue in Belgium: On 'Regional Blindness' and Co-operative Flaws 204

Steve PEERS – The Constitutional Implications of the EU Patent 229

The State of the European Union's Monarchies

Introduction 267

Wim ROOBOL – Twilight of the European Monarchy 272

### *Case Notes*

Anja LANSBERGEN & Nina MILLER – European Citizenship Rights in Internal Situations: An Ambiguous Revolution? European Court of Justice. Decision of 8 March 2011, *Gerardo Ruiz Zambrano v. Office national de l'emploi (ONEM)*, Case C-34/09 287

Peter VAN ELSUWEGE – European Union Citizenship and the Purely Internal Rule Revisited. European Court of Justice. Decision of 5 May 2011, *Shirley McCarthy v. Secretary of State for the Home Department*, Case C-434/09 308

### *Book Reviews*

*Robert Schütze*, *From Dual to Cooperative Federalism: The Changing Structure of European Law* (Nikos SKOUTARIS) 325

*András Jakab, Péter Takács & Allan F. Tatham (eds.)*, The Transformation of the Hungarian Legal Order 1985–2005. Transition to the Rule of Law and Accession to the European Union (Anneli ALBI) 332

*Jeffrey Goldsworthy*, Parliamentary Sovereignty: Contemporary Debates (Tina ORŠOLIĆ) 336

*Peter Gerangelos*, The Separation of Powers and Legislative Interference in Judicial Process. Constitutional Principles and Limitations (Anna JASIAK) 344

## ERRATUM

7 *EuConst* (2011) issue 1

In Mathias WENDEL's article 'Lisbon Before the Courts: Comparative Perspectives', on p. 106 and 107, the following sentences should read:

In Hungary and Poland the Lisbon treaty was reviewed within the framework of an objective *ex post* review. (106)

Instead, the Hungarian Constitutional Court decided on the constitutionality of the Act of promulgation of the Lisbon Treaty within the framework of an *ex post* review introduced by a person acting in private capacity (*actio popularis*). (106)

After the ratification had been completed, a group of deputies and a group of senators filed petitions for an *ex post* treaty review under Article 188 no 1 of the Polish constitution. (107)

*and*

Like its Hungarian counterpart, the Constitutional Tribunal had to cope with the procedural particularities of an *ex post* review and found an answer on its own with this line of argument. (107)

In these cases we made a rather serious editing error in changing the *ex post* to *ex ante*. We apologise to the author and to our readers. In the online version of this article, the necessary corrections have been made.