

SPRING 1991

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF SOVIET AND EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

ARTICLES

Mark Bassin : *Russia between Europe and Asia*

J. Arch Getty : *State and Society under Stalin*

Daniel Rancour-Laferriere : *From Incompetence to Satire*

Ronald Grigor Suny : *Beyond Psychohistory*

Margaret Ziolkowski : *A Modern Demonology*

Mark B. Tauger : *The 1932 Harvest and the Famine of 1933*

Sigrid McLaughlin : *Rybakov's Deti Arbata*

Robert A. McCutcheon : *The 1936–1937 Purge of Soviet Astronomers*

Svetlana Boym : *Dialogue as “Lyrical Hermaphroditism”*

Michael S. Fox : *Ante Ciliga, Trotskii, and State Capitalism*

Matt F. Oja : *Bulgakov's Ironic Parallel between Margarita and Afranius*

Jesse J. Dossick : *Doctoral Dissertations on Russia, the Soviet Union, and Eastern Europe*

**EDITOR**  
SIDNEY MONAS

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR	DANIEL T. ORLOVSKY
ASSOCIATE EDITOR	MARY JO POWELL
ASSISTANT EDITORS	JOHN CHRISTIE
	PATRICIA S. BROWN
EDITORIAL ASSISTANT	RICHARD H. LYNCH

**EDITORIAL BOARD:** William Brumfield, *Tulane University* • George W. Breslauer, *University of California, Berkeley* • Edward Brown, *Stanford University* • Istvan Deak, *Columbia University* • Caryl Emerson, *Princeton University* • Maurice Friedberg, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • Keith Hitchins, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • James Michael Holquist, *Yale University* • D. Barton Johnson, *University of California, Santa Barbara* • Aileen Kelly, *Cambridge University* • Hans Rogger, *University of California, Los Angeles* • William G. Rosenberg, *University of Michigan* • H. Gordon Skilling, *University of Toronto* • Richard Stites, *Georgetown University* • Victor Terras, *Brown University* • Alexander Vucinich, *University of Pennsylvania* • Piotr S. Wandycz, *Yale University*

**CONSULTANTS ON SOVIET AND EAST EUROPEAN BOOKS:** George Barany, *University of Denver* • Alexandra L. Batalden, *Arizona State University* • John D. Bell, *University of Maryland, Baltimore County* • Imre Boba, *University of Washington* • Marianna Tax Choldin, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • F. W. Galan, *Georgia Institute of Technology* • Charles Jelavich, *Indiana University* • Owen V. Johnson, *Indiana University* • Andrejs Plakans, *Iowa State University* • Gale Stokes, *Rice University* • Orest Subtelny, *York University, Ontario* • Ronald Grigor Suny, *University of Michigan*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

The *Slavic Review* (ISSN 0037-6779) (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all Association members. Members also receive the *AAASS Newsletter*. Membership is open to individuals interested in the advancement of Slavic studies (including study of the non-Slavic peoples of Eastern Europe and the USSR), and applications for membership are accepted by the national headquarters of the AAASS, 128 Encina Commons, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305; (415) 723-9668.

Membership dues: salary \$10,000 to \$19,999—\$25.00; \$20,000 to \$29,999—\$35.00; \$30,000 to \$39,999—\$45.00; \$40,000 to \$49,999—\$50.00; \$50,000 to \$59,000—\$55.00; more than \$60,000—\$60.00. Joint members with one subscription to the *Slavic Review*, add \$15.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$20.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$45.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$15.00; back issues for members are \$10.00 each. For overseas postage, please add \$6.00; for postage to Canada, add \$5.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for the *Newsletter* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters in Stanford. Advertising inquiries should also be directed to the AAASS office.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters should be sent to the *Slavic Review*, P.O. Box 8180, University of Texas, Austin, Texas 78713; (512) 471-5898. Building address is Geography 106B. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions are given on the inside back cover.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Composition by G&S Typesetters, Austin, Texas. Printed by Heffernan Press, Inc., Worcester, Massachusetts. Second-class postage paid at Palo Alto, CA and additional mailing office. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Slavic Review*, c/o AAASS, 128 Encina Commons, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305.

Copyright © 1991 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc.

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF SOVIET AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

---

## CONTENTS

VOLUME 50 NUMBER 1 • SPRING 1991

### ARTICLES

- Russia between Europe and Asia: The Ideological Construction of Geography 1  
MARK BASSIN
- State and Society under Stalin: Constitutions and Elections in the 1930s 18  
J. ARCH GETTY
- From Incompetence to Satire: Voinovich's Image of Stalin as Castrated Leader of  
the Soviet Union in 1941 36  
DANIEL RANCOUR-LAFERRIERE
- Beyond Psychohistory: The Young Stalin in Georgia 48  
RONALD GRIGOR SUNY
- A Modern Demonology: Some Literary Stalins 59  
MARGARET ZIOLKOWSKI
- The 1932 Harvest and the Famine of 1933 70  
MARK B. TAUGER
- Rybakov's *Deti Arbata*: Reintegrating Stalin into Soviet History 90  
SIGRID MCLAUGHLIN
- The 1936–1937 Purge of Soviet Astronomers 100  
ROBERT A. MCCUTCHEON
- Dialogue as “Lyrical Hermaphroditism”: Mandel'shtam's Challenge to Bakhtin 118  
SVETLANA BOYM
- Ante Ciliga, Trotskii, and State Capitalism: Theory, Tactics, and Re-evaluation  
during the Purge Era, 1935–1939 127  
MICHAEL S. FOX
- Bulgakov's Ironic Parallel between Margarita and Afranius 144  
MATT F. OJA

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

- Recent Developments on the Historical Front: Excerpts from an Interview with  
Viktor Petrovich Danilov 150  
TERENCE EMMONS
- Stalinist Terror in the Donbas: A Note 157  
HIROAKI KUROMIYA
- Tenguz Abuladze's *Repentance* and the Georgian Nationalist Cause 163  
JULIE CHRISTENSEN

## REVIEW ARTICLE

- Russian Economic History: The Legacy of Arcadius Kahan 176  
PETER GATRELL

## BOOK REVIEWS

- Erich Donnert, *Peter der Grosse* (Marc Raeff) 179
- Judith E. Zimmerman, *Mid-Passage: Alexander Herzen and European  
Revolution, 1847–1852* (Philip Pomper) 179
- Olga Crisp and Linda Edmonson, eds., *Civil Rights in Imperial Russia*;  
Michael John, *Politics and the Law in Late Nineteenth-Century Germany*  
(Albert J. Schmidt) 180
- Thomas S. Pearson, *Russian Officialdom in Crisis: Autocracy and Local  
Self-Government, 1861–1900* (Gary Hamburg) 181
- Francis Conte, *Christian Rakovski (1873–1941): A Political Biography*  
(Samuel A. Oppenheim) 182
- Lewis H. Siegelbaum, *Stakhanovism and the Politics of Productivity in the  
USSR, 1935–1941* (David R. Shearer) 183
- Maurice Hindus, *Red Bread: Collectivization in a Russian Village*  
(Stephen K. Wegren) 185
- Richard D. Little, *Governing the Soviet Union* (Jeffrey Hahn) 185
- Padma Desai, *Perestroika in Perspective: The Design and Dilemmas of Soviet  
Reform* (Michael Hemesath) 186
- Stephen White and Alex Pravda, eds., *Ideology and Soviet Politics*  
(Mark Beissinger) 188
- David Lane, ed., *Elites and Political Power in the USSR* (Donald K. Rowney) 189
- Meghnad Desai, *Lenin's Economic Writings* (Alfred Evans, Jr.) 190
- Hubert Gannrich, *Economic Reforms in Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union*;  
Peter Wiles, ed., *The Soviet Economy on the Brink of Reform: Essays in  
Honor of Alec Nove* (Martin C. Spechler) 190
- Peter J. Potichnyj, ed., *The Soviet Union: Party and Society* (Eugene Huskey) 192
- Jim Riordan, ed., *Soviet Youth Culture* (John Bushnell) 193
- Viktor Kozlov, *The Peoples of the Soviet Union* (Ronald Wixman) 193

Auvo Kostiaainen, <i>Loikkaarit: Suuren lamakauden laitton siirtolaisuus neuvostoliittoon</i> (Kristiina Kalleinen)	195
Ira M. Lapidus, <i>A History of Islamic Societies</i> ; H��l��ne Carr��re d'Encausse, <i>Islam and the Russian Empire: Reform and Revolution in Central Asia</i> (Keith Hitchins)	195
Alexandre Bennigsen et al., <i>Soviet Strategy and Islam</i> (Muriel Atkin)	197
Benjamin Pinkus, <i>The Jews of the Soviet Union: The History of a National Minority</i> ; Robert O. Freedman, <i>Soviet Jewry in the 1980s: The Politics of Anti-Semitism and Emigration and the Dynamics of Resettlement</i> (Michael Rywkin)	198
Janice Broun, <i>Conscience and Captivity: Religion in Eastern Europe</i> (Dimitry Pospelovsky)	199
Geoffrey A. Hosking and George F. Cushing, eds., <i>Perspectives on Literature and Society in Eastern and Western Europe</i> (Hugh McLean)	200
Bogdan Suchodolski, <i>A History of Polish Culture</i> (Neal Pease)	201
David Childs, Thomas A. Baylis, and Marilyn Rueschemeyer, <i>East Germany in Comparative Perspective</i> (Robert Rickards)	202
Stanislav ��matk��k, <i>Dejiny slovenskej literat��ry: Od Stredoveku po s��časnost'</i> (Norma Leigh Rudinsky)	203
Ing. Vladim��r Vrtiak et al., <i>��lovek, pr��ca, ekonomika: S��časnost' a perspekt��vy</i> (Jiri Kolaja)	204
Xavier Richet, <i>The Hungarian Model: Markets and Planning in a Socialist Economy</i> (Bennett Kovrig)	204
Karel M��cha, <i>Glaube und Vernunft: Die b��hmische Philosophie in geschichtlicher ��bersicht</i> (Josef Kalvoda)	205
Linda J. Ivanits, <i>Russian Folk Belief</i> (Joanna Hubbs)	206
Thomas A. Eekman, ed., <i>Critical Essays on Anton Chekhov</i> (Milton Ehre)	207
Wolf Schmid, ed., <i>Mythos in der slawischen Moderne</i> (Maria Carlson)	208
Angela Livingstone, <i>Boris Pasternak: Doctor Zhivago</i> (Darra Goldstein)	209
Leona Toker, <i>Nabokov: The Mystery of Literary Structures</i> (Priscilla Meyer)	210
Pamela Davidson, <i>The Poetic Imagination of Vyacheslav Ivanov: A Russian Symbolist's Perception of Dante</i> (Clarence Brown)	211
Jaroslav ��ejka, Michal ��ern��k, and Karel S��ys, <i>The New Czech Poetry</i> (Zdenek Salzmann)	212
Gerald Stone and Dean Worth, eds., <i>The Formation of Slavonic Literary Languages: Proceedings of a Conference Held in Memory of Robert Auty and Anne Pennington at Oxford 6–11 July 1981</i> (Kenneth E. Naylor)	213
George Y. Shevelov, <i>The Ukrainian Language in the First Half of the Twentieth Century (1900–1941): Its State and Status</i> (George S. N. Luckyj)	214
Patricia Kennedy Grimsted, <i>Archives and Manuscript Repositories in the USSR: Ukraine and Moldavia, Book 1, General Bibliography and Institutional Directory</i> (Gregory Freeze)	215

## **BOOKS RECEIVED**

Doctoral Dissertations on Russia, the Soviet Union and Eastern Europe Accepted  
by Universities in the United States, Canada, and Great Britain,  
1989–1990

JESSE J. DOSSICK

224

**TO OUR READERS:** Technical problems resulted in the printing of only a portion of the index for volume 49 (1990). The complete index for that volume will appear in the summer issue of volume 50 (1991). We apologize for the inconvenience.

## **CONTRIBUTORS**

**MARK BASSIN** is assistant professor in the Department of Geography, University of Wisconsin, Madison.

**SVETLANA BOYM** is assistant professor of comparative literature at Harvard University.

**JULIE CHRISTENSEN** is assistant professor in the Department of Foreign Languages and Literatures, George Mason University.

**JESSE J. DOSSICK** is professor emeritus of social studies, New York University.

**TERENCE EMMONS** is professor in the Department of History, Stanford University.

**MICHAEL S. FOX** is a graduate student in the Department of History, Yale University.

**PETER GATRELL** teaches in the Department of History, University of Manchester.

**J. ARCH GETTY** is associate professor in the Department of History, University of California, Riverside.

**HIROAKI KUROMIYA** is assistant professor, Department of History, Indiana University, Bloomington.

**ROBERT A. MCCUTCHEON** is a section manager in the Control System Technology Group at Computer Sciences Corporation in Laurel, Maryland.

**SIGRID MCLAUGHLIN** is assistant professor, Stevenson College, University of California, Santa Cruz.

**MATT J. OJA** is a graduate student in the Department of History, Georgetown University.

**DANIEL RANOUR-LAFERRIERE** is professor of Russian, University of California, Davis.

**RONALD GRIGOR SUNY** is Alex Manoogian Professor of Modern Armenian History, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor.

**MARK B. TAUGER** is a graduate student in the Department of History, University of California, Los Angeles.

**MARGARET ZIOLKOWSKI** is assistant professor in the Department of German, Russian and East Asian Languages, Miami University, Ohio.