
The

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

VOLUME 7
NUMBER 4
DECEMBER 1984

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Canonical papers of B. F. Skinner

Selection by consequences

Methods and theories in the experimental analysis of behavior

The operational analysis of psychological terms

An operant analysis of problem solving

Behaviorism at fifty

The phylogeny and ontogeny of behavior

Co-editor for this issue: A. C. Catania

Also, Continuing Commentary on . . .

"Laterality inheritance" (Corballis & Morgan); "Demonstrating irrationality" (Cohen); "Genes, mind & culture" (Lumsden & Wilson); "Neuropsychology of anxiety" (Gray); "Schizophrenic language" (Schwartz); "Defense motivation system" (Masterson & Crawford); "Psychotherapy versus placebo" (Prioleau, Murdock & Brody)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Cognitive Neuroscience

Lynn Nadel/U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology

Charles J. Brainerd/University of Alberta

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/U. London

Neurobiology

Graham Hoyle/U. Oregon

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/U. Chicago

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 7 (1984) is US \$120.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£66.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$55.00 net (£33.00) for individuals; US \$32.00 net (£20.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$32.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$33.00 net (£19.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *The Brain and Behavioral Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 7:4 December 1984

CANONICAL PAPERS OF B. F. SKINNER

A. C. Catania, S. Harnad, editors

Introduction

- Catania, A. C. The operant behaviorism of B. F. Skinner 473

Skinner, B. F. Selection by consequences 477

Open Peer Commentary

- Barlow, G. W. Skinner on selection – A case study of intellectual isolation 481
Bolles, R. C. On the status of causal modes 482
Boulding, K. E. B. F. Skinner: A dissident view 483
Campbell, C. B. G. Behaviorism and natural selection 484
Dahlbom, B. Skinner, selection, and self-control 484
Dawkins, R. Replicators, consequences, and displacement activities 486
Donahoe, J. W. Skinner – The Darwin of ontogeny? 487
Gamble, T. J. The wider context of selection by consequences 488
Ghiselin, M. T. The emancipation of thought and culture from their original material substrates 489
Hallpike, C. R. Fitting culture into a Skinner box 489
Harris, M. Group and individual effects in selection 490
Honig, W. K. On the stabilization of behavioral selection 491
Katz, M. J. Cause and effect in evolution 492
- Maynard Smith, J. A one-sided view of evolution 493
Plotkin, H. C. & Odling-Smee, F. J. Linear and circular causal sequences 493
Provine, R. R. Contingency-governed science 494
Rosenberg, A. Fitness, reinforcement, underlying mechanisms 495
Rumbaugh, D. M. Perspectives by consequences 496
Schull, J. Selectionism, mentalisms, and behaviorism 497
Solomon, P. R. Bridges from behaviorism to biopsychology 498
Stearns, S. C. Selection misconstrued 499
Timberlake, W. Selection by consequences: A universal causal mode? 499
Vaughan, W. Jr. Giving up the ghost 501
Wyrwicka, W. Natural selection and operant behavior 501
- #### Author's Response
- Skinner, B. F. Some consequences of selection 502

Skinner, B. F. Methods and theories in the experimental analysis of behavior 511

Open Peer Commentary

- Deitz, S. M. Real people, ordinary language, and natural measurement 524
Luce, R. D. Behavior theory: A contradiction in terms? 525
Mackenzie, B. The challenge to Skinner's theory of behavior 526
Marriott, F. H. C. The role of the statistician in psychology 527
Millward, R. Cognitive science: A different approach to scientific psychology 527
Moravcsik, J. M. E. Should we return to the laboratory to find out about learning? 529
Nelson, R. J. Skinner's philosophy of method 529
Nicholas, J. M. Lessons from the history of science? 530
Richelle, M. N. Are Skinner's warnings still relevant to current psychology? 531
- Roberts, S. What then should we do? 532
Rozeboom, W. W. The dark side of Skinnerian epistemology 533
Sayre, K. M. Current questions for the science of behavior 535
Schagrin, M. L. Theories and human behavior 536
Shimp, C. P. The question: Not *shall* it be, but *which* shall it be? 536
Sosa, E. Behavior, theories, and the inner 537
Townsend, J. T. Psychology: Toward the mathematical inner man 539
Wolins, L. Behavioral and statistical theorists and their disciples 540
- #### Author's Response
- Skinner, B. F. Theoretical contingencies 541

Skinner, B. F. The operational analysis of psychological terms 547

Open Peer Commentary

- Bennett, J. Stimulus-response meaning theory 553
Brinker, R. P. & Jaynes, J. Waiting for the world to make me talk and tell me what I meant 554
Danto, A. C. Skinner on the verbal behavior of verbal behaviorists 555
Dennett, D. C. Wishful thinking 556
Garrett, K. R. Private reference 557
- Graham, G. Sensation and classification 558
Harzem, P. Operationism, smuggled connotations, and the nothing-else clause 559
Hineline, P. N. What, then, is Skinner's operationism? 560
Hocutt, M. Skinner on sensations 560
Kenrick, D. T. & Keefe, R. C. Social traits, self-observations, and other hypothetical constructs 561

Lowe, C. F. The flight from human behavior	562	Stalker, D. & Ziff, P. B. F. Skinner's theorizing	569
Meehl, P. E. Radical behaviorism and mental events: Four methodological queries	563	Terrace, H. S. A behavioral theory of mind?	569
Moore, J. On Skinner's radical operationism	564	Wright, C. On the operational definition of a toothache	571
Place, U. T. Logic, reference, and mentalism	565	Zuriff, G. E. Radical behaviorism and theoretical entities	572
Rachlin, H. Mental, yes. Private, no.	566		
Ringen, J. D. B. F. Skinner's operationism	567	Author's Response	
Robertson, L. C. There is more than one way to access an image	568	Skinner, B. F. Coming to terms with private events	572

Skinner, B. F. An operant analysis of problem solving 583

Open Peer Commentary

Cohen, L. J. On the depth and fit of behaviorist explanation	591	Kochen, M. Problem solving as a cognitive process	599
Dodwell, P. C. Can we analyze Skinner's problem- solving behavior in operant terms?	592	Raaheim, K. Is there such a thing as a problem situation?	600
Feldman, J. A. Learning from instruction	593	Rapoport, A. Questions raised by the reinforcement paradigm	601
Grossberg, S. The microscopic analysis of behavior: Toward a synthesis of instrumental, perceptual, and cognitive ideas	594	Rein, J. C. Response classes, operants, and rules in problem solving	602
Harré, R. Psychology as moral rhetoric	595	Scandura, J. M. New wine in old glasses?	602
Hogarth, R. M. On choosing the "right" stimulus and rule	596	Stabler, E. P., Jr. Rule-governed behavior in computational psychology	604
Hunt, E. A case study of how a paper containing good ideas, presented by a distinguished scientist, to an appropriate audience, had almost no influence at all	597	Sternberg, R. J. Operant analysis of problem solving: Answers to questions you probably don't want to ask	605
Julià, P. Contingencies, rules, and the "problem" of novel behavior	598	Verplanck, W. S. The egg revealed	605
Kaufmann, G. Can Skinner define a problem?	599	Wetherick, N. E. Negation in Skinner's system	606
		Author's Response	
		Skinner, B. F. Contingencies and rules	607

Skinner, B. F. Behaviorism at fifty 615

Open Peer Commentary

Adler, J. E. A defense of ignorance	621	Perlis, D. Belief-level way stations	639
Belth, M. The fruitful metaphor, but a metaphor, nonetheless	622	Rey, G. Ontology and ideology of behaviorism and mentalism	640
Davis, L. H. Skinner as conceptual analyst	623	Robinson, D. N. Behaviorism at seventy	641
Farrell, B. A. Treading the primrose path of dalliance in psychology	624	Rosenthal, D. M. The behaviorist concept of mind	643
Furedy, J. J. & Riley, D. M. Undifferentiated and "mote-beam" percepts in Watsonian-Skinnerian behaviorism	625	Schnaitter, R. "Behaviorism at fifty" at twenty	644
Gallup, G. G. Jr. Consciousness, explanation, and the verbal community	626	Schustack, M. W. & Carbonell, J. G. Cognitive science at seven: A wolf at the door for behaviorism?	645
Gopnik, A. In search of a theory of learning	627	Simon, M. A. Explaining behavior Skinner's way	646
Gordon, R. M. A causal role for "conscious" seeing	628	Staddon, J. E. R. Skinner's behaviorism implies a subcutaneous homunculus	647
Gunderson, K. Leibnizian privacy and Skinnerian privacy	628	Stich, S. P. Is behaviorism vacuous?	647
Heil, J. I've got you under my skin	629	Terry, W. S. "Mental way stations" in contemporary theories of animal learning	649
Hitterdale, L. B. F. Skinner's confused philosophy of science	630	Thomas, R. K. Are radical and cognitive behaviorism incompatible?	650
Irwin, F. W. J. B. Watson's imagery and other mentalistic problems	632	Toates, F. M. Models, yes; homunculus, no	650
Johnson, C. N. What's on the minds of children?	632	Wellman, H. M. The development of concepts of the mental world	651
Lebowitz, M. Artificially intelligent mental models	633	Woodruff, M. L. Operant conditioning and behavioral neuroscience	652
Lycan, W. G. Skinner and the mind - body problem	634	Wyers, E. J. Is "Behaviorism at fifty" twenty years older?	653
Lyons, W. Behaviorism and "the problem of privacy"	635	Zentall, T. R. In support of cognitive theories	654
Marr, M. J. Philosophy and the future of behaviorism	636		
Marshall, J. C. Mechanism at two thousand	637	Author's Response	
Moore, R. C. A cognitivist reply to behaviorism	637	Skinner, B. F. Representations and misrepresentations	655
Mortensen, C. Introspection as the key to mental life	639		

Skinner, B. F. The phylogeny and ontogeny of behavior **669**

Open Peer Commentary

Altmann, S. A. Skinner's circus	678	Hogan, J. A. The structure versus the provenance of behavior	690
Baerends, G. P. Ontogenetic or phylogenetic—another afterpain of the fallacious Cartesian dichotomy	679	Hoyle, G. Behavior in the light of identified neurons	690
Barash, D. P. Contingencies of selection, reinforcement, and survival	680	Kacelnik, A. & Houston, A. The use of evolutionary analogies and the rejection of state variables by B. F. Skinner	691
Barkow, J. H. Of false dichotomies and larger frames	680	Kaplan, S. Molar concepts and mentalistic theories: A moral perspective	692
Blanchard, D. C., Blanchard, R. J. & Flannelly, K. J. A new experimental analysis of behavior—one for all behavior	681	Perzigian, A. J. B. F. Skinner and the flaws of sociobiology	693
Brown, J. L. Cost-benefit models and the evolution of behavior	682	Plomin, R. & Daniels, D. Hereditary ≠ innate	694
Burghardt, G. M. Ethology and operant psychology	683	Plotkin, H. C. Nature and nurture revisited	695
Colman, A. M. Operant conditioning and natural selection	684	Rapoport, A. Is evolution of behavior operant conditioning writ large?	696
Delius, J. D. Consequence contingencies and provenance partitions	685	Salthe, S. N. Skinner's practical metaphysics may be impractical	696
Eibl-Eibesfeldt, I. Difficulties with phylogenetic and ontogenetic concepts	685	Staddon, J. E. R. Reinforcement is the problem, not the solution: Variation and selection of behavior	697
Eysenck, H. J. Skinner's blind eye	686	Wahlsten, D. Each behavior is a product of heredity and experience	699
Ghiselin, M. T. B. F. Skinner versus Dr. Pangloss	687	Wassermann, G. D. Neuropsychology vis-à-vis Skinner's behaviouristic philosophy	700
Gottlieb, G. Lingering Haeckelian influences and certain other inadequacies of the operant viewpoint for phylogeny and ontogeny	688	Author's Response	
Hailman, J. P. Ethology ignored Skinner to its detriment	689	Skinner, B. F. Phylogenetic and ontogenic environments	701

Summing up

Catania, A. C. Problems of selection and phylogeny, terms and methods of behaviorism	713	Harnad, S. What are the scope and limits of radical behaviorist theory?	720
Skinner, B. F. Reply to Catania	718	Skinner, B. F. Reply to Harnad	721

Continuing Commentary **725**

On Corballis, M. C. and Morgan, M. J. (1978) On the biological basis of human laterality: I. Evidence for a maturational left-right gradient; II. The mechanisms of inheritance. BBS 1:261–336. **725**

Boklage, C. E. On the inheritance of directional asymmetry (sidedness) in the starry flounder, <i>Platichthys stellatus</i> : Additional analyses of Policansky's data	725	McManus, I. C. The inheritance of asymmetries in man and flatfish	731
Harris, L. J. Louis Pierre Gratiolet, Paul Broca, et al. on the question of a maturational left-right gradient: Some forerunners of current-day models	730	Policansky, D. Do genes know left from right?	733
		Author's Response	
		Corballis, M. C. Human laterality: Matters of pedigree	734

On Cohen, L. J. (1981) Can human irrationality be experimentally demonstrated? BBS 4:317–370. **735**

Author's Response

Cohen, L. J. Can irrationality be discussed accurately?	736
--	-----

On Multiple Book Review of Lumsden and Wilson's *Genes, mind, and culture*. BBS 5:1–37. **738**

Almeida, J.-M. G. Jr. Genetic and cultural evolution: The gap, the bridge, . . . and beyond	738	Alper, J. S. & Lange, R. V. Mathematical models for gene-culture coevolution	739
--	-----	---	-----

Rushton, J. P. & Russell, R. J. H. Gene–culture theory and inherited individual differences in personality	740	Author's Response	
Vetta, A. Natural selection and unnatural selection of data	741	Lumsden, C. J. & Wilson, E. O. On incest and mathematical modeling	742
<i>On Multiple Book Review of Gray's The neuropsychology of anxiety: An enquiry into the functions of the septo-hippocampal system.</i> BBS 5:469–534.			744
Pitman, R. K. The septo-hippocampal system and ego	744	Author's Response	
Schmajuk, N. A. Information processing in the hippocampal formation	745	Gray, J. A. From angst to information processing	747
Willner, P. The neuropsychology of depression	746		
<i>On Schwartz, S. (1982) Is there a schizophrenic language?</i> BBS 5:579–626.			749
Neufeld, R. W. J. Are semantic networks of schizophrenic samples intact?	749	Author's Response	
		Schwartz, S. Semantic networks, schizophrenia, and language	750
<i>On Masterson, F. A. and Crawford, M. (1982) The defense motivation system: A theory of avoidance behavior.</i> BBS 5:661–696.			752
Rakover, S. S. Avoidance theory: The nature of innate responses and their interaction with acquired responses	752	Author's Response	
		Masterson, F. A. A theory of defense behavior: Innate responses, consummatory goal stimuli, and cognitive expectancies	754
<i>On Prioleau, L., Murdock, M. & Brody, N. (1983) An analysis of psychotherapy versus placebo studies.</i> BBS 6:275–310.			756
Butler, S. F., Schacht, T. E., Henry, W. P. & Strupp, H. H. Psychotherapy versus placebo: Revisiting a pseudo issue	756	Author's Response	
Weinberger, J. Is the meta-analysis/placebo controversy a case of new wine in old bottles?	757	Brody, N. Is psychotherapy better than a placebo?	758