

# ASIAN JOURNAL OF COMPARATIVE LAW

VOLUME 16 • SUPPLEMENT 1 • DECEMBER 2021 • ISSN 2194-6078



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*

The *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* (AsJCL) is the leading forum for research and discussion of the law and legal systems of Asia. It embraces work that is theoretical, empirical, socio-legal, doctrinal, or comparative that relates to one or more Asian legal systems, as well as work that compares one or more Asian legal systems with non-Asian systems. The Journal seeks articles which display an intimate knowledge of Asian legal systems, and thus provide a window into the way they work in practice. The AsJCL is an initiative of the Asian Law Institute (ALI), an association established by 13 leading law schools in Asia and with a rapidly expanding membership base across Asia and in other regions around the world.

**Subscriptions:** The *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* is published twice a year in July and December. The 2021 price for an online and print subscription for institutions (excluding VAT or sales tax) is \$460.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico and £287.00 in the UK and elsewhere. The 2021 price for an online-only subscription is \$381.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico and £240.00 in the UK and elsewhere. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Prices include delivery by air when appropriate. Japanese prices for institutions are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent, or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK, email: [journals@cambridge.org](mailto:journals@cambridge.org); or in the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA, email: [subscriptions\\_newyork@cambridge.org](mailto:subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org). Prices include delivery by air. Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and at additional mailing offices.

**Permissions information:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://journals.cambridge.org/action/rightsAndPermissions>. Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center <http://www.copyright.com>, email [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Advertising:** Enquiries should be sent to the publisher at [ad\\_sales@cambridge.org](mailto:ad_sales@cambridge.org).

**Open Access:** Please visit Open Access Publishing at Cambridge ([cambridge.org/openaccess](http://cambridge.org/openaccess)) for information on our Open Access policies, compliance with major funding bodies, and guidelines on depositing your manuscript in an institutional repository.

*Asian Journal of Comparative Law* and all other Cambridge Journals can be found at [journals.cambridge.org](http://journals.cambridge.org).

# *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*

## **Editors-in-Chief**

Arif A. JAMAL  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Kevin Y.L. TAN  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

## **Book Review Editor**

Samuli SEPPÄNEN  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

## **Managing Editor**

Shazny RAMLAN  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

## **Editors**

Rehan Aindri ABEYRATNE  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong,  
Hong Kong

Ngoc Son BUI  
University of Oxford, UK

Simon BUTT  
University of Sydney, Australia

Cora CHAN  
University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

Aparna CHANDRA  
National Law School, Bangalore, India

Wen-Chen CHANG  
National Taiwan University, Taiwan

CHEN Weitseng  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Melissa CROUCH  
University of New South Wales, Australia

Mario GOMEZ  
International Centre for Ethnic Studies,  
Sri Lanka

Gen GOTO  
University of Tokyo, Japan

GUO Li  
Peking University, China  
Hisashi HARATA  
University of Tokyo, Japan  
Nadirsyah HOSEN  
Monash University, Australia

Robin Hui HUANG  
The Chinese University of Hong Kong,  
Hong Kong

Tomoko ISHIKAWA  
Nagoya University, Japan

Joongi KIM  
Yonsei Law School, South Korea

Key Joung LEE (Jason LEE)  
Seoul National University, South Korea

Ernest LIM  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

LIN Lin  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Jaclyn NEO  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Mumin PONGSAPAN  
Thammasat University, Thailand  
Panthip PRUKSACHOLAVIT  
Chulalongkorn University,  
Thailand

Dan W. PUCHNIAK  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

SAW Tiong Guan  
University of Malaya, Malaysia

Dian A.H. SHAH  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Narongdech SRUKHOSIT  
Chulalongkorn University, Thailand

Linda Yanti SULISTIAWATI  
Gajah Mada University, Indonesia

Arun THIRUVENGADAM  
National Law School, Bangalore, India

Umakanth VAROTTIL  
National University of Singapore, Singapore

WANG Jiangyu  
City University of Hong Kong,  
Hong Kong

## **Associate Editors**

Leon Vincent CHAN  
National University of  
Singapore, Singapore

Benjamin LAWRENCE  
National University of  
Singapore, Singapore

## **Advisory Board**

CHAN Sek Keong  
former Chief Justice of Singapore, Singapore

Albert H.Y. CHEN  
The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong

Jacques DELISLE  
University of Pennsylvania, USA

Yasuo HASEBE  
Waseda University, Japan

Vikramaditya KHANNA  
University of Michigan, USA

Kon Sik KIM  
Seoul National University, South Korea

H.P. LEE  
Monash University, Australia

Curtis J. MILHAUPT  
Stanford University, USA

Raul PANGALANGAN  
University of the Philippines, former Judge  
of the International Criminal Court, The  
Philippines

Arnelmo T. REYES  
International Commercial Court, Singapore

Cheryl SAUNDERS  
University of Melbourne, Australia

SHEN Weixing  
Tsinghua University, China

Frank K. UPHAM  
New York University, USA

Wen-Yeu WANG Wallace  
National Taiwan University, Taiwan

# *Asian Law Institute (ASLI)*

## **Board of Governors**

### **Co-Directors**

Kelry LOI  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore, Singapore

WEE Meng Seng  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore, Singapore

### **Members**

LI Weifang  
Dean, School of International Law, East China  
University of Political Science and Law, China

PAN Jian Feng  
Dean, Peking University Law School, China

FU Hualing  
Dean, Faculty of Law, The University of Hong Kong,  
Hong Kong

Sudhir KRISHNASWAMY  
Vice-Chancellor, National Law School of India  
University, Bangalore, India

Srikrishna Deva RAO  
Vice-Chancellor, National Law University, Delhi, India

Edmon MAKARIM  
Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Indonesia,  
Indonesia

Bintan Regen SARAGIH  
Dean, Law School, University Pelita Harapan, Indonesia

Yutaka OSAWA  
Dean, Graduate Schools for Law and Politics, University  
of Tokyo, Japan

Naoki KUMANO  
Dean, Faculty of Law, Kyushu University, Japan

Farid Sufian Bin SHUAIB  
Dean, Ahmad Ibrahim Kulliyah of Laws, International  
Islamic University Malaysia, Malaysia

Johan Shamsuddin Bin Hj SABARUDDIN  
Dean, Faculty of Law, University of Malaya, Malaysia

Fides CORDERO-TAN  
Dean, College of Law, University of the Philippines,  
Philippines

Simon CHESTERMAN  
Dean, Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore,  
Singapore

Ki-Jeong HAN  
Dean, School of Law, Seoul National University, South  
Korea

Tsung-Fu CHEN  
Dean, College of Law, National Taiwan University,  
Taiwan

Pareena SRIVANIT  
Dean, Faculty of Law, Chulalongkorn University,  
Thailand

# Contents

## ARTICLES

- S1–S9 Constitutional Democracy and Electoral Commissions: A Reflection from Asia  
*Rosalind Dixon and Mark Tushnet*
- S10–S22 Institutions for Protecting Constitutional Democracy: An Analytic Framework, with Special Reference to Electoral Management Bodies  
*Mark Tushnet*
- S23–S39 Constitutional Design of Electoral Governance in Federal States  
*Michael Pal*
- S40–S59 Guarantor Institutions  
*Tarunabh Khaitan*
- S60–S84 The Rise of Electoral Management Bodies: Diffusion and Effects  
*Malcolm Langford, Rebecca Schiel and Bruce M. Wilson*
- S85–S104 Governing Democracy Outside the Law: India's Election Commission and the Challenge of Accountability  
*M. Mohsin Alam Bhat*
- S105–S120 The Malaysian Election Commission: Navigating Electoral Authoritarianism and Political Change  
*Dian A H Shah*
- S121–S135 Multilayered Oversight: Electoral Administration in Indonesia  
*Simon Butt and Fritz Siregar*
- S136–S155 The Union Election Commission of Myanmar 2010–2020  
*Catherine Renshaw and Michael Lidauer*
- S156–S176 Sri Lanka's First Election Commission: Strengthening Electoral Management or Advancing Electoral Integrity?  
*Dinesha Samararatne*
- S177–S192 Democratic Constitutions, Electoral Commissions and Legitimacy – The Example of Australia  
*Paul Kildea and Sarah Murray*
- S193–S210 Constituting and Regulating Democracy: Kenya's Electoral Commission and the Courts in the 2010s  
*Richard Stacey and Victoria Miyandazi*