

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXIV NUMBER 1 1998

## ARTICLES

**THE CLASS ACTION SUIT AS A METHOD OF PATIENT EMPOWERMENT IN THE MANAGED CARE SETTING** Kathy L. Cerminara

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

**RISKY BUSINESS: PROPOSED REFORM OF THE ANTITRUST LAWS AS APPLIED TO HEALTH CARE PROVIDER NETWORKS** Natalie Marjancik

**ASHES TO ASHES: WHY FDA REGULATION OF TOBACCO ADVERTISING MAY MARK THE END OF THE ROAD FOR THE MARLBORO MAN** Kathleen M. Paralusz

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS  
AND THE BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

A JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer & Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint ASLME/Boston University School of Law editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or the law school.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: (617) 353-2912.

Address subscription or membership correspondence to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Business telephone: (617) 262-4990. Requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material should be addressed to the Director of Publications, at the preceding address.

Subscription rates are \$170.00 per year for institutions; and \$90.00 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. Foreign subscribers remit an additional \$30.00 per year for foreign postage. Members of ASLME receive the JOURNAL as part of their annual dues (please see details in the back matter).

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of ASLME provided that notice of such a claim is received at ASLME's subscription office *within one month of receipt of the next issue published*. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$25.00 (members) and \$35.00 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$40.00 (members) and \$50.00 (nonmembers).

The JOURNAL is indexed in *LEXIS, WESTLAW, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*, and EMBASE.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (non-profit organization).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JON WESTLING, B.A., LL.D. (hon.), *President and Professor of Humanities*

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *Chancellor, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

FREDERICK M. LAWRENCE, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

DANIEL J. FREEHLING, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS**

NANCY NEVELOFF DUBLER, LL.B., *President*

JOHN LANTOS, M.D., *President-Elect*

SARA ROSENBAUM, J.D., *Secretary*

ELLEN WRIGHT CLAYTON, M.D., J.D., *Immediate Past President*

BENJAMIN W. MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD OF EDITORS

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**  
**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF  
EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**  
**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**

**ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR/PUBL. DIRECTOR**  
**Michael Vasko, M.A.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

**CIRCULATION MANAGER**  
**Thomas Psipsikas**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

**EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT**  
**Benjamin W. Moulton, J.D., M.P.H.**  
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

## EDITORS

**Michael Baram, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

**Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**  
Boston College School of Law

**Henry A. Beyer, J.D.**  
Fernald School Corp.  
Waltham, Massachusetts

**Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M.**  
Dunn & Auton  
Boston, Massachusetts

**Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**  
Harvard Medical School

**Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

**Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**  
Duke University School of Law

**Nathan Hershey, J.D.**  
University of Pittsburgh Grad. School of Public Health

**Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**  
Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

**Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Harvard University Kennedy School of Government

**Timothy S. Jost, J.D.**  
Ohio State University College of Law

**Jay Katz, M.D.**  
Yale University Law School

**Renée M. Landers, J.D.**  
Boston College School of Law

**Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**  
New York University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**  
Boston University School of Medicine

**Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**  
University of Washington School of Medicine

**Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**  
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

**Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D.**  
Indiana University School of Public & Environmental  
Affairs

**Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**  
Founder, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

**E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**  
New York Law School

**Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.**  
Medical College of Wisconsin

**Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**  
Tufts University

**Paul R. Tremblay**  
Boston College School of Law

**David G. Warren, J.D.**  
Duke University Medical Center

**Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**  
St. Francis Central Hospital  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

**James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**  
Monumental Life Insurance Co. of AGON

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

**Professor Koichi Bai**  
Director, Institute of Medical Humanities  
Kitasato University School of Medicine  
Japan

**Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Göttingen  
Germany

**Professor Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Faculties of Law and Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Dr. S.S. Fluss**  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeal  
Supreme Court of New South Wales  
Australia

**Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen**  
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**Professor Amos Shapira**  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

**Professor P.D.G. Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
New Zealand

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director, Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS FOR  
1997–1998

## EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Michelle A. Zamarin

## EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Jerome B. Tichner Jr.

## MANAGING EDITORS

Kristine Dimitrova

Bradley G. Rausa

## SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Jennifer Homer

## PROJECTS EDITOR

Bethany Cooper

## ARTICLES EDITORS

Michelle M. Enfinger

Alissa Epstein

Kristen M. Green

Nicole Jerabek

## CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Grace Bacon

Craig P. Druehl

Shana Lewinger

Natalie Marjancik

Lou Ross

## THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Erica Abate  
Theonie Alicandro  
Kerri Catino  
Robert Earley  
Jonathan Eichman  
Catherine Kaczowka  
Rachelle A. Kagan

Jason M. Levy  
Richard Liner  
Ryan McDonald  
Judith Michelman  
Julia Nelson  
Mary Osterbauer  
K. Shiek Pal  
Kathleen Paralusz

Michael Portnoy  
Andrea Rathburn  
Randi Rivner  
David Rudin  
Sharon Schlesinger  
Betsi Silverman  
Stephen D. Wilson

## STAFF MEMBERS

Noel Bilitz  
Jennifer Blake  
Kendra Carlson  
Robert Chatham  
Alison Chen  
Caroline Chen  
Jeremy A. Colby  
Rachelle De Gregory  
Dylan Devito  
Danielle Dooley  
Andrew Eliseev  
Adam Falk  
Rebecca Galeota

John Gorzkowski  
Jennifer Greaney  
Brian Green  
Julia Jacobson  
Jeremy Johnson  
Jason Karavias  
Isidor Kim  
Colin Kisor  
Gabrielle Lipson  
Jessika Moon  
Laurie Moroff

Melissa Paddock  
Henry Park  
Geoff Repo  
Rebecca Risse  
Leigh Rubinstein  
Amy Schoeffel  
Susan Seitz  
Nathan Spatz  
Tamar Terzian  
Karen Volmar  
Leann Westerhold  
Angela Whitehead  
Jennifer Williamson

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XXIV NUMBER 1 1998

## ARTICLES

- THE CLASS ACTION SUIT AS A METHOD OF PATIENT EMPOWERMENT IN THE MANAGED CARE SETTING 7 Kathy L. Cerminara

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

- RISKY BUSINESS: PROPOSED REFORM OF THE ANTITRUST LAWS AS APPLIED TO HEALTH CARE PROVIDER NETWORKS 59 Natalie Marjancik
- ASHES TO ASHES: WHY FDA REGULATION OF TOBACCO ADVERTISING MAY MARK THE END OF THE ROAD FOR THE MARLBORO MAN 89 Kathleen M. Paralusz

## MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 123
- ANNOUNCEMENTS 139

Copyright 1998 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notifies the Director of Publications of ASLME; (2) the author(s) and the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyrights is affixed to each copy.