



The Experience of Listening to Music in the  
Nineteenth Century

Volume 17 • Issue 3 • December 2020

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review

*Nineteenth-Century Music Review* locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

## General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

## Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER

*Louisiana State University, USA*

JAMES SOBASKIE (CD/DVD Review Editor)

*Mississippi State University, USA*

NANCY NOVEMBER (Score Review Editor)

*University of Auckland, New Zealand*

HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)

*Ball State University, USA*

SANNA PEDERSON (Book Review Editor)

*University of Oklahoma, USA*

KATHERINE PRESTON

*William & Mary, USA*

WILLIAM WEBER

*California State University, Long Beach, USA*

BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT

*Clark University, USA*

## Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

*University of Chicago, USA*

ANDREW BOWIE

*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*

SUZANNAH CLARK

*Harvard University, USA*

NICHOLAS COOK

*University of Cambridge, UK*

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

*King's College, University of London, UK*

JAMES DEAVILLE

*Carleton University, Canada*

JEREMY DIBBLE

*Durham University, UK*

STEPHEN DOWNES

*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*

KATHARINE ELLIS

*University of Cambridge, UK*

ANNEGRET FAUSER

*University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA*

PETER FRANKLIN

*University of Oxford, UK*

SOPHIE FULLER

*Trinity College of Music, UK*

LYDIA GOEHR

*Columbia University, USA*

THOMAS GREY

*Stanford University, USA*

SARAH HIBBERD

*University of Bristol, UK*

JULIAN HORTON

*Durham University, UK*

LINDA HUTCHEON

*University of Toronto, Canada*

HERVÉ LACOMBE

*Université Rennes 2, Haute Bretagne, France*

ALICIA LEVIN

*University of Kansas, USA*

RALPH LOCKE

*Eastman School of Music, USA*

ROBERTA MARVIN

*University of Massachusetts, USA*

SIMON McVEIGH

*Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK*

JULIAN RUSHTON

*University of Leeds, UK*

DOUGLASS SEATON

*Florida State University, USA*

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

*University of Oxford, UK*

SUSAN YOUENS

*University of Notre Dame, USA*

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published three times a year in April, August and December. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 17 (2020), which includes print and electronic access, is £249 net (US\$394 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £51 net (US\$81 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £95 (US\$151 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at [cambridge.org/core](http://cambridge.org/core).

© Cambridge University Press 2020

# Contents

VOLUME 17, ISSUE 3

Notes on Article Contributors 341

## ARTICLES

- Helen Barlow and Trevor Herbert  
Introduction: Listeners in Music History: Studying the Evidence 343
- David Rowland  
British Listeners c. 1780–1830 359
- Martin V. Clarke  
Hearing and Believing: Listening Experiences as Religious Experiences in  
Nineteenth-Century British Methodism 381
- Rosemary Golding  
'Appeasing the Unstrung Mental Faculties': Listening to Music in  
Nineteenth-Century Lunatic Asylums 403
- Trevor Herbert  
Public Military Music and the Promotion of Patriotism in the British  
Provinces, c. 1780-c. 1850 427
- Helen Barlow  
'Praise the Lord! We are a Musical Nation': The Welsh Working Classes and  
Religious Singing 445

## BOOK REVIEWS

- Paul Watt  
*The Regulation and Reform of Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century England* by  
Eric Saylor 473
- Rebecca Cypess and Nancy Sinkoff, eds.  
*Sara Levy's World: Gender, Judaism, and the Bach Tradition in Enlightenment  
Berlin* by R. Larry Todd 477
- Jacquelyn Sholes  
*Allusion as Narrative Premise in Brahms's Instrumental Music* by Diego Cubero 482
- Michela Niccolai  
*Debussy's Pelléas et Mélisande: The Staging of Albert Carré* by Michael Oravitz 490

## CD REVIEWS

- Benjamin Binder  
**Decades: A Century of Song Ludwig van Beethoven, et al, *Decades: A Century of Song. Vol. 1, 1810–1820*** Michael Schade *ten*, Lorna Anderson *sop*, Sylvia Schwartz *sop*, Ann Murray *mezzo*, Florian Boesch *bar*, Malcolm Martineau *pf* Vivat 112, 2016 (1 CD: 78 minutes) **Vincenzo Bellini, et al, *Decades: A Century of Song. Vol. 2, 1820–1830*** Anush Hovhannisyan *sop*, Sarah Connolly *mezzo*, John Mark Ainsley *ten*, Robin Tritschler *ten*, Luis Gomes *ten*, Christopher Maltman *bar*, Malcolm Martineau *pf* Vivat 114, 2017 (1 CD: 79 minutes) **Alexander Alyabyev, et al, *Decades: A Century of Song. Vol. 3, 1830–1840*** Soraya Mafi *sop*, Lorna Anderson *sop*, Angelika Kirchschrager *mezzo*, John Mark Ainsley *ten*, Alexey Gusev *bass*, Malcolm Martineau *pf* Vivat 116, 2018 (1 CD: 69 minutes) 495
- Maiko Kawabata  
**Violin Music of Pauline and Paul Viardot** Viardot, Paul, and Pauline Viardot, Violin Sonatas; Violin Sonata Reto Kuppel *vln*, Wolfgang Manz *pf* Naxos 8.573607, 2017 (1 CD: 68 minutes), £7.99 Viardot, Paul, and Pauline Viardot, Six pièces; Six morceaux; Six pièces faciles Reto Kuppel *vln*, Wolfgang Manz *pf* Naxos 8.573749, 2018 (1 CD: 84 minutes), £7.99 500
- Helena Kopchick Spencer  
**Fromental Halévy, *La Reine de Chypre*** Véronique Gens *sop*, Cyrille Dubois *ten*, Étienne Dupuis *bar*, Éric Huchet *ten*, Christophoros Stamboglis *bass*, Artavazd Sargsyan *ten*, Tomislav Lavoie *bass* Flemish Radio Choir and Orchestre de chambre de Paris, Hervé Niquet *cond* Includes book of essays in French and English edited by Alexandre Dratwicke Livres-Disques du Palazzetto Bru Zane, Opéra français, vol. 17 Ediciones Singulares 1032, 2018 (2 CDs: 154 minutes) 504

## SCORE REVIEW

- Anton Reicha  
*Die Harmonie der Sphären* by Sam Girling 507

## DIGITAL RESOURCE REVIEW

- Scott Warfield  
 Oxford Music Online 511