

Social Philosophy & Policy

What Should Constitutions Do?

CONTENTS

LARRY ALEXANDER	What Are Constitutions, and What Should (and Can) They Do?	1
JOHN DAVID LEWIS	Constitution and Fundamental Law: The Lesson of Classical Athens	25
LOREN E. LOMASKY	Contract, Covenant, Constitution	50
MICHAEL ZUCKERT and FELIX VALENZUELA	Constitutionalism in the Age of Terror	72
FERNANDO R. TESÓN	The Liberal Constitution and Foreign Affairs	115
SANFORD LEVINSON	Do Constitutions Have a Point? Reflections on "Parchment Barriers" and Preambles	150
SCOTT D. GERBER	The Origins of an Independent Judiciary in New York, 1621-1777	179
ILYA SOMIN	Foot Voting, Political Ignorance, and Constitutional Design	202
WILLIAM A. GALSTON	Pluralist Constitutionalism	228
JAMES S. FISHKIN	Deliberative Democracy and Constitutions	242
GUIDO PINCIONE	The Constitution of Nondomination	261
RICHARD A. EPSTEIN	Can We Design an Optimal Constitution? Of Structural Ambiguity and Rights Clarity	290

Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor: Ellen Frankel Paul

Associate Editors: Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

Managing Editor: Harry Dolan

Administrative Editor: Tamara Sharp

Social Philosophy and Policy Center

Editorial Board

David Braybrooke
University of Texas, Austin

Baruch Brody
Rice University

Allen Buchanan
Duke University

James M. Buchanan
*Center for Study of Public Choice,
George Mason University*

Jules Coleman
Yale Law School

Jack Douglas
University of California, San Diego

Richard A. Epstein
University of Chicago Law School

James Fishkin
Stanford University

Martin Golding
Duke University

John Gray
*London School of Economics and
Political Science*

Gilbert Harman
Princeton University

Eric Mack
Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.
Harvard University

Wallace I. Matson
University of California, Berkeley

Jan Narveson
University of Waterloo

Nicholas Rescher
University of Pittsburgh

David Sidorsky
Columbia University

Hillel Steiner
University of Manchester

James Q. Wilson
*Pepperdine University,
Malibu*

Leland B. Yeager
Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Editorial Office: Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403-0188, USA.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information: See inside back cover.

Copyright © 2011 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. *Photocopying information for users in the USA:* The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/11 \$15.00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

CONTRIBUTORS

Larry Alexander is Warren Distinguished Professor at the University of San Diego School of Law. He is the author, coauthor, or editor of eleven books and more than 170 published essays on various topics in jurisprudence, constitutional law, criminal law, and moral/social philosophy. His most recent books are *Crime and Culpability: A Theory of Criminal Law* (with K. K. Ferzan, 2009), *Demystifying Legal Reasoning* (with E. Sherwin, 2008), and *Is There a Right of Freedom of Expression?* (2005).

John David Lewis is Visiting Associate Professor in the Philosophy, Politics, and Economics Program at Duke University. He received his Ph.D. in Classics from the University of Cambridge and is the author of *Solon the Thinker: Political Thought in Archaic Athens* (2006), *Early Greek Lawgivers* (2007), and *Nothing Less Than Victory: Decisive Wars and the Lessons of History* (2010). He is Senior Research Scholar in History and Classics at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, and has published in journals that include *Polis*, *Dikē*, and *Bryn Mawr Classical Review*.

Loren E. Lomasky is Cory Professor of Political Philosophy, Policy, and Law at the University of Virginia, where he directs the Political Philosophy, Policy, and Law Program. He previously taught at Bowling Green State University and the University of Minnesota, Duluth, and has held visiting positions at Virginia Polytechnic Institute, Australian National University, the Australian Defence Force Academy, and the National University of Singapore. He is the author of *Persons, Rights, and the Moral Community* (1987), for which he was awarded the 1990 Matchette Prize. His other books include *Democracy and Decision: The Pure Theory of Electoral Preference* (coauthored with Geoffrey Brennan, 1993), and *Politics and Process: New Essays in Democratic Theory* (coedited with Geoffrey Brennan, 1989).

Michael Zuckert is Nancy R. Dreux Professor of Political Science at the University of Notre Dame. He has written extensively on the liberal tradition in political philosophy and American constitutionalism. He is currently completing a book entitled *Natural Rights and American Constitutionalism*.

Felix Valenzuela is a doctoral candidate in Political Science at the University of Notre Dame. He holds a J.D. degree from Yale Law School and is currently at work on a critical study of the recent literature on constitutional failure.

CONTRIBUTORS

Fernando R. Tesón is Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar at Florida State University College of Law. A native of Buenos Aires, Argentina, he is known for his scholarship relating political philosophy to international law and for his work on political rhetoric. He is the author of *A Philosophy of International Law* (1998), *Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality* (3d ed., 2005), and *Rational Choice and Democratic Deliberation* (with Guido Pincione, 2006). Before joining Florida State University in 2003, he taught for seventeen years at Arizona State University. He has served as a visiting professor at Cornell Law School, Indiana University School of Law, and the University of California Hastings College of Law, and is Permanent Visiting Professor at Torcuato Di Tella University, Buenos Aires.

Sanford Levinson is W. St. John Garwood and W. St. John Garwood Jr. Centennial Chair in Law at the University of Texas Law School. He is also Professor of Government at the University of Texas at Austin. He holds a Ph.D. from Harvard University and a J.D. from Stanford University Law School. He has taught at Princeton University and has held visiting appointments at the Harvard, Yale, New York University, Georgetown, and Boston University law schools, as well as law schools in France, Hungary, Israel, New Zealand, and Australia. Among his books are *Constitutional Faith* (1988) and *Our Undemocratic Constitution: Where the Constitution Goes Wrong (and How We the People Can Correct It)* (2006). He is the author of more than 250 articles in professional and popular journals and was elected to membership in the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2001.

Scott D. Gerber is Ella and Ernest Fisher Chair in Law and Professor of Law at Ohio Northern University, and Senior Research Scholar in Law and Politics at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center. He received his Ph.D. and J.D. from the University of Virginia, and his B.A. from the College of William and Mary. His published works include six books and nearly one hundred articles, book reviews, and op-eds. He clerked for U.S. District Judge Ernest C. Torres of the District of Rhode Island and practiced with a major Boston-based law firm. He is a member of the Massachusetts, Colorado, and Virginia bars, as well as the U.S. Supreme Court bar. In both 2002 and 2009, he received the Fowler V. Harper Award for excellence in legal scholarship, and in 2008, he was appointed to a two-year term on the Ohio Advisory Committee of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. He teaches constitutional law and American legal history.

Ilya Somin is Associate Professor of Law at George Mason University School of Law. His research focuses on constitutional law, property law, and the study of popular political participation and its implications for

CONTRIBUTORS

constitutional democracy. His work has appeared in numerous scholarly journals, including the *Yale Law Journal*, *Stanford Law Review*, *Northwestern University Law Review*, *Georgetown Law Journal*, and *Critical Review*. He has served as a visiting professor at the University of Pennsylvania Law School; the University of Hamburg, Germany; and Torcuato Di Tella University in Buenos Aires, Argentina; and as an Olin Fellow at Northwestern University School of Law.

William A. Galston is Ezra Zilkha Chair of the Governance Studies Program at the Brookings Institution, where he serves as a Senior Fellow. He is also College Park Professor at the University of Maryland. Prior to January 2006, he was Saul Stern Professor at the School of Public Policy, University of Maryland, director of the Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy, and founding director of the Center for Information and Research on Civic Learning and Engagement (CIRCLE). From 1993 until 1995, he served as Deputy Assistant to President Clinton for Domestic Policy. He is the author of eight books, the most recent of which are *Liberal Pluralism* (2002), *The Practice of Liberal Pluralism* (2004), and *Public Matters* (2005). A winner of the American Political Science Association's Hubert H. Humphrey Award, he was elected a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2004.

James S. Fishkin is Janet M. Peck Chair in International Communication at Stanford University, where he is also Chair and Professor of Communication and Professor of Political Science (by courtesy). He is the director of Stanford's Center for Deliberative Democracy and is the author of a number of books, including *When the People Speak: Deliberative Democracy and Public Consultation* (2009), *The Voice of the People: Public Opinion and Democracy* (1995), *The Dialogue of Justice* (1992), and *Democracy and Deliberation* (1991). He is the coauthor, with Bruce Ackerman, of *Deliberation Day* (2004).

Guido Pincione is Professor of Philosophy and Law at Torcuato Di Tella University, Buenos Aires, and was Visiting Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University in 2009–2010. He has taught previously at Buenos Aires University Law School and was a visiting scholar at Arizona State University College of Law, Australian National University, the Center for Ethics and Public Affairs at Tulane University, Corpus Christi College at Oxford University, Florida State University College of Law, Mannheim University, Université de Montreal Faculté de Droit, and University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He is the coauthor, with Fernando R. Tesón, of *Rational Choice and Democratic Deliberation* (2006), and has published articles on moral, political, and legal philosophy in journals such as *Utilitas*, *The Journal of Philosophy*, and *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*.

CONTRIBUTORS

Richard A. Epstein is James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law and a director of the John M. Olin Program in Law and Economics at the University of Chicago. He has been the Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow at the Hoover Institution since 2000 and a visiting law professor at New York University Law School since 2007. He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and a Senior Fellow of the Center for Clinical Medical Ethics at the University of Chicago Medical School. He has served as editor of the *Journal of Legal Studies* and the *Journal of Law and Economics*, and is the author of numerous books, including *Cases and Materials on Torts* (9th ed., 2008), *Supreme Neglect: How to Revive Constitutional Protection for Private Property* (2008), *Overdose: How Excessive Government Regulation Stifles Pharmaceutical Innovation* (2006), and *Skepticism and Freedom: A Modern Case for Classical Liberalism* (2003).

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The editors gratefully acknowledge Liberty Fund, Inc., for holding the conference at which the original versions of many of these papers were presented and discussed.