

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of
Science Association*



VOLUME 41, NUMBER 2

June, 1974

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

EDITORIAL BOARD:

- RICHARD S. RUDNER**, Department of Philosophy, *Washington University*, St. Louis, Missouri 63130, *Editor in Chief*
- PETER ACHINSTEIN**, Department of Philosophy, *The Johns Hopkins University*, Baltimore, Maryland 21218
- PETER D. ASQUITH**, Department of Philosophy, *Michigan State University*, East Lansing, Michigan 48823, *Managing Editor*
- GUSTAV BERGMANN**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Iowa*, Iowa City, Iowa 52240
- MAY BRODBECK**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Minnesota*, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455
- ARTHUR BURKS**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Michigan*, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104
- C. WEST CHURCHMAN**, Graduate School of Business Administration, *University of California*, Berkeley, California 94720
- THEODOSIUS DOBZHANSKY**, Department of Genetics, *University of California*, Davis, California 95616
- ADOLF GRÜNBAUM**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Pittsburgh*, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260
- EDWARD MADDEN**, Department of Philosophy, *State University of New York*, Buffalo, New York 14214
- HENRY MARGENAU**, Department of Physics, *Yale University*, New Haven, Connecticut 06520
- GERALD J. MASSEY**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Pittsburgh*, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260
- ALBERTO PASQUINELLI**, Facoltà di Lettere e Filosofia, Università degli Studi di Bologna, *University of Bologna*, Bologna, Italy
- WESLEY C. SALMON**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Arizona*, Tucson, Arizona 85721
- KENNETH F. SCHAFFNER**, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, *University of Pittsburgh*, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15260
- DUDLEY SHAPERE**, Department of Philosophy, *University of Illinois at Urbana*, Urbana, Illinois 61801
- J. J. C. SMART**, Department of Philosophy, *La Trobe University*, Bundoora, Australia
- MELFORD E. SPIRO**, Department of Anthropology, *The University of California at San Diego*, La Jolla, California 92037
- PATRICK C. SUPPES**, Department of Philosophy, *Stanford University*, Stanford, California 94305
- LEWIS K. ZERBY**, Department of Philosophy, *Michigan State University*, East Lansing, Michigan 48823

BOOK REVIEWS:

James Van Evra, Department of Philosophy, *University of Waterloo*, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

ASSISTANT EDITORS:

Patricia Ann Fleming and Paul C. L. Tang, Department of Philosophy, *Washington University*, St. Louis, Missouri 63130

GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION:

Israel Scheffler, *President (1975)*

Robert Cohen, *Vice-President (1975)*

Peter D. Asquith, *Secretary-Treasurer (1975)*

Mario A. Bunge (1974)

Richard S. Rudner

Brian Ellis (1975)

Wesley C. Salmon (*Past Pres.*)

Adolf Grünbaum (*Past Pres.*)

Michael J. Scriven (1975)

Ian Hacking (1974)

Wolfgang Stegmüller (1975)

Ernest Nagel (*Past Pres.*)

Patrick C. Suppes (1975)

MADE AND PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN BY

WILLIAM CLOWES & SONS, LIMITED, LONDON, BECCLES AND COLCHESTER

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 18 Morrill Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48823. Subscription price \$15.00 U.S.A. (\$16.00 non-U.S.A.) per Volume. Single numbers \$5.00. Membership dues, which include subscription, \$10.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the *Managing Editor*. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan and at additional mailing offices. © 1974 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

CONTENTS*

ANNOUNCEMENT.....	<i>overleaf</i>
THE RATIONALITY OF SCIENTIFIC DISCOVERY, PART I: THE TRADITIONAL RATIONALITY PROBLEM, NICHOLAS MAXWELL..	123
PROGRESS AS A DEMARCATION CRITERION FOR THE SCIENCES, PAUL M. QUAY, S.J.	154
MAXWELL'S DEMON AND COMPUTATION, RICHARD LAING	171
DISCUSSION: KUHN, SCHEFFLER, AND OBJECTIVITY IN SCIENCE, JACK W. MEILAND.....	179
DISCUSSION: THE QUARTERCENTENARY MODEL OF D-N EXPLANATION, DALE A. THORPE	188
DISCUSSION: INDUCTIVE IMMODESTY AND LAWLIKENESS, JUHANI PIETARINEN	196
DISCUSSION: VAN FRAASSEN'S MODAL MODEL OF QUANTUM MECHANICS, NANCY CARTWRIGHT	199
DISCUSSION: POLANYI ON THE MENO PARADOX, MICHAEL BRADIE	203
DISCUSSION: ON A PROBLEM IN CONDITIONAL PROBABILITY, A. I. DALE	204
BOOK REVIEWS	207
<i>Science and Religion in Seventeenth Century England</i> , Richard S. Westfall; E. J. Ashworth— <i>Paradigms and Paradoxes: the Philosophical Challenge of the Quantum Domain</i> , Robert G. Colodny (ed.); Nancy Cartwright.	

* The contents of *Philosophy of Science* are indexed in *Science Citation Index*, *ABC Pol Sci*, *Language and Language Behavior Abstracts*, and *The Philosopher's Index*.

ANNOUNCEMENT

FOURTH BIENNIAL MEETING OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

TIME: Weekend of November 1–November 3, 1974

PLACE: *Center for Continuing Education*, Notre Dame, Indiana

HOST INSTITUTION: University of Notre Dame

Friday, November 1, 1974: 9.00–11.00

Symposium: The Unity of Science
Carl G. Hempel, Princeton University (Moderator)
Robert L. Causey, University of Texas
Lawrence Sklar, University of Michigan
Thomas Nickles, University of Illinois

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION I

Laurens Laudan, University of Pittsburgh (Moderator)
A. M. Pampusch, College of St. Catherine
*Experimental, Metaphysical, and Hypothetical
Philosophy in Newtonian Methodology*
R. D. Herrmann, University of Tennessee
*Newton and the Cogitations: Three Unexplored
MSS*
W. A. Wallace, Catholic University of America
*Aquinas and Galileo: The Origins of Modern
Science*
J. V. Strong, University of Pittsburgh
*The Phenomenalist's Dilemma: J. B. Stallo's
Attack on Atomism*

Friday, November 1, 1974: 10.00–12.00

Symposium: Genetics, I.Q. and Education
A. Edward Manier, University of Notre Dame
(Moderator)
Ned Block, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Norman Daniels, Tufts University
Kenneth Kaye, University of Chicago

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION II

Henry Kyburg, University of Rochester (Moderator)
H. Skolimowski, University of Michigan
Evolutionary Rationality
W. Berkson, Bridgewater State College
Rationality and Science
M. A. Finocchiaro, University of Nevada, Las Vegas
Toward a Philosophy of the History of Science

Friday, November 1, 1974: 2.00–4.00

Symposium: Systems and decision theory
Wesley C. Salmon, University of Arizona (Moderator)
C. West Churchman, University of California,
Berkeley
Patrick Suppes, Stanford University
Isaac Levi, Columbia University

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION III

Scott A. Kleiner, University of Georgia (Moderator)
L. Wessels, Indiana University
*Laws and Meaning Postulates in van Fraassen's
View of Theories*
P. Fitzgerald, Temple University
Meaning in Science and Mathematics
P. A. Ostien, University of Iowa
Observationality and the Comparability of Theories
M. Pastin, Indiana University
C. I. Lewis's Radical Foundationalism

Friday, November 1, 1974: 3.00–5.00

*Symposium: Science education and the philosophy of
science*
Israel Scheffler, Harvard University (Moderator)
Michael Martin, Boston University
Hugh Petrie, University of Illinois
Robert Palter, University of Texas

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION IV

S. Barker, Johns Hopkins University (Moderator)
R. Tuomela, University of Helsinki
Causes and Deductive Explanation
L. Addis, University of Iowa
On Defending the Covering-Law Model
N. Koertge, Indiana University
On Explaining Beliefs
J. H. Fetzer, University of Kentucky
The Likeness of Lawlikeness

Saturday, November 2, 1974: 9.00–11.00

Symposium: Marxist philosophy of science
John J. Compton, Vanderbilt University (Moderator)
Marx Wartofsky, Boston University
Robert Cohen, Boston University
Erwin N. Hiebert, Harvard University

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION V

Arthur Fine, University of Illinois at Chicago Circle
(Moderator)
G. M. Hardegrave, Indiana University
A Note on the Conditional in Quantum Logic
P. Kirschenmann, Wayne State University
Two Forms of Determinism
P. A. Bowman, University of Tennessee
The Conventionality of Slow-Transport Synchrony
G. Schlesinger, University of North Carolina
The Similarities Between Space and Time

Saturday, November 2, 1974: 10.00–12.00

Symposium: Technology assessment
Nicholas Rescher, University of Pittsburgh
(Moderator)
Håkan Törnebohm, University of Gothenburg
Michael Baram, Massachusetts Institute of
Technology
Kenneth Hammond, University of Colorado, Boulder
Tom Settle, University of Guelph

Saturday, November 2, 1974: 2.00–4.30

Symposium: Velikovsky and the politics of science
George Grinnell, McMaster University (Moderator)
Immanuel Velikovsky, Princeton, N.J.
Lynn Rose, State University of New York at Buffalo
M. W. Friedlander, Washington University
Antoinette M. Paterson, State University College,
Buffalo

Saturday, November 2, 1974: 3.30–5.30

Symposium: Quantum logics
Clifford A. Hooker, University of Western Ontario
(Moderator)
Peter Mittelstaedt, Köln University
John Stachel, Boston University
David Finkelstein, Yeshiva University
William Demopoulos, University of Western Ontario

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION VI

Richard S. Rudner, Washington University
(Moderator)
I. I. Mitroff, University of Pittsburgh
*On the Fundamental Importance of the Social
Psychology of Research as a Basic Paradigm for
the Philosophy of Science*
R. M. Anderson, Stanford University
The Illusions of Experience
A. Caplan, Columbia University
Must Adaptation be Advantageous?

Sunday, November 3, 1974: 9.00–11.00

Symposium: Development of the philosophy of science
Ernest Nagel, Columbia University (Moderator)
Grover Maxwell, University of Minnesota
Ernan McMullan, University of Notre Dame
Hilary Putnam, Harvard University

Sunday, November 3, 1974: 10.00–12.00

Symposium: History and philosophy of biology
Marjorie Grene, University of California, Davis
(Moderator)
Kenneth Schaffner, University of Pittsburgh
Michael Ruse, University of Guelph
David Hull, University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee
William C. Wimsatt, University of Chicago

CONTRIBUTED PAPERS SESSION VII

H. Lehman, University of Guelph (Moderator)
N. D. Cartwright, Stanford University
How do we Apply Science?
M. L. Marchi, Brooklyn College
*Theorems as Facts in Lakatos' Methodology of
Mathematics*
M. H. Salmon, University of Arizona
Consistency Proofs for Applied Mathematics