

ARCHITECTURAL
HISTORY

*Journal of the Society
of Architectural Historians
of Great Britain*

Volume 50: 2007

SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

The Alice Davis Hitchcock Medallion is presented annually to authors of outstanding contributions to the literature of architectural history. Recipients of the award have been:

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1959: H. M. COLVIN | 1984: WILLIAM CURTIS |
| 1960: JOHN SUMMERSON | 1985: JILL LEVER |
| 1961: KERRY DOWNES | 1986: DAVID BROWNLEE |
| 1962: JOHN FLEMING | 1987: JOHN HARVEY |
| 1963: DOROTHY STROUD | 1988: ROGER STALLEY |
| 1964: F. H. W. SHEPPARD | 1989: ANDREW SAINT |
| 1965: H. M. & JOAN TAYLOR | 1990: CHARLES SAUMAREZ SMITH |
| 1966: NIKOLAUS PEVSNER | 1991: CHRISTOPHER WILSON |
| 1967: MARK GIROUARD | 1992: EILEEN HARRIS & NICHOLAS SAVAGE |
| 1968: CHRISTOPHER HUSSEY | 1993: JOHN ALLAN |
| 1969: PETER COLLINS | 1994: COLIN CUNNINGHAM &
PRUDENCE WATERHOUSE |
| 1970: A. H. GOMME & D. M. WALKER | 1995: MILES GLENDINNING & STEFAN MUTHESIUS |
| 1971: JOHN HARRIS | 1996: ROBERT HILLENBRAND |
| 1972: HERMIONE HOBHOUSE | 1997: ROBIN EVANS |
| 1973: MARK GIROUARD | 1998: IAN BRISTOW |
| 1974: J. MORDAUNT CROOK &
M. H. PORT | 1999: DEREK LINSTRUM |
| 1975: DAVID WATKIN | 2000: LINDA FAIRBAIRN |
| 1976: ANTHONY BLUNT | 2001: NICHOLAS COOPER:
PETER FERGUSSON & STUART HARRISON |
| 1977: ANDREW SAINT | 2002: MARK WILSON JONES |
| 1978: PETER SMITH | 2003: NICOLA COLDSTREAM |
| 1979: TED RUDDOCK | 2004: KATHRYN MORRISON |
| 1980: ALLAN BRAHAM | 2005: GEORGIA CLARKE |
| 1981: HOWARD COLVIN | 2006: PETER GUILLERY |
| 1982: PETER THORNTON | |
| 1983: MAURICE CRAIG | |

The Society's Essay Medal is presented annually to the winner of the Society's essay medal competition. The regulations are available from the Honorary Secretary. Recipients of the medal have been:

- | | |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1982: GORDON HIGGOTT | 1995: JONATHAN HUGHES |
| 1983: NEIL JACKSON | 1996: ANDREW HOPKINS |
| 1984: JOSEPH SHARPLES | 1997: PETER MAYHEW |
| 1985: No award was made | 1998: ANDREW FOYLE |
| 1986: LAURA JACOBUS | 1999: HENRY DIETRICH FERNÁNDEZ |
| 1987: TIM MOWL | 2000: ELEANOR TOLLFREE |
| 1988: GILES WORSLEY | 2001: KATHRYN FERRY |
| 1989: No award was made | 2002: ALEX BREMNER |
| 1990: No award was made | 2003: JAMES WEEKS |
| 1991: MICHAEL HALL | 2004: TOM NICKSON |
| 1992: FRANK SALMON | 2005: No award was made |
| 1993: CATHERINE STEEVES | 2006: MATTHEW WHITFIELD |
| 1994: SEAN SAWYER | |

ARCHITECTURAL
HISTORY

*Journal of the Society
of Architectural Historians
of Great Britain*

Volume 50: 2007

SOCIETY OF ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIANS OF GREAT BRITAIN

Founded 1956: incorporated 1964

The Society exists to encourage an interest in the history of architecture, to provide opportunities for the exchange and discussion of ideas related to this subject and to publish, in its journal, Architectural History, significant source material and the results of original research.

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE 2006–07

President: Frank Kelsall

Past President: Peter Draper

Chairman: Andrew Ballantyne

Honorary Secretary: Simon Green

Honorary Treasurer: David Lermon

Honorary Editor: Judi Loach

Honorary Conference Secretaries: Elizabeth Green; Kathryn Ferry; Olivia Horsfall Turner

Honorary Events Secretary: Andrew Martindale

Honorary Web Officer: Robert Proctor

Honorary Membership Secretary: Alex Bremner

Honorary Publications Officer: Simon Oakes

Honorary Newsletter Editor: Grace McCombie

Honorary Reviews Editor: Sean O'Reilly

Honorary Education Officer: Linda Monckton

Executive Committee

Simon Bradley

Andrew Foyle

David Adshead

Julian Holder

Kathryn Morrison

James Campbell

All correspondence concerning the Society except applications for membership should be addressed to: Simon Green, RCAHMS, 16 Bernard Terrace, Edinburgh EH8 9NX, or secretary@sahgb.org.uk

Applications for membership should be sent to: Dr Alex Bremner, Department of Architecture, University of Edinburgh, 20 Chambers Street, Edinburgh EH1 1JZ, or alternatively membership can be obtained online, through the SAHGB website, at www.sahgb.org.uk/index.cfm/display_page/membership

Correspondence concerning Architectural History should be addressed to:

Professor Judi Loach, 30 Africa Gardens, Cardiff CF14 3BU, or preferably architectural.history@sahgb.org.uk

Correspondence concerning the Society's Newsletter should be addressed to:

Dr Zeynep Kezer, School of Architecture, Planning, and Landscape, The Quadrangle, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU, or zeynep.kezer@ncl.ac.uk

Books for review in the Society's Newsletter should be sent to:

Kathryn Morrison, English Heritage, Brooklands House, 24 Brooklands Avenue, Cambridge CB2 2BU

Correspondence concerning purchase of the Society's publications, including Architectural History, should be addressed to: Dr Simon Oakes, St John's College, Oxford OX1 3JP, or simon.oakes@sjc.ox.ac.uk

copyright © 2007

Society of Architectural Historians of Great Britain and Authors

ISSN: 0066-622X

*Produced by Outset Services Limited
Clifford, West Yorkshire*

CONTENTS

OF CRYSTALS, CELLS, AND STRATA: NATURAL HISTORY AND DEBATES ON THE FORM OF A NEW ARCHITECTURE IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY by Barry Bergdoll	1
A WINCHESTER MASON AND THE EARLY RENAISSANCE STYLE IN THE 1520S: THE CHAPEL AND TOMB OF SIR JOHN AND MARY LISLE AT THRUXTON CHURCH, HAMPSHIRE by Nicholas Riall	31
APETHORPE HALL AND THE WORKSHOP OF THOMAS THORPE, MASON OF KING'S CLIFFE: A STUDY IN MASONS' MARKS by Jennifer S. Alexander and Kathryn A. Morrison	59
ARCHITECTURE AND IDENTITY ON THE EDGE OF EMPIRE: THE EARLY DOMESTIC ARCHITECTURE OF SCOTTISH SETTLERS IN NOVA SCOTIA, CANADA, 1800–1850 by Daniel Maudlin	95
GILBERT SCOTT AND THE CHAPEL OF EXETER COLLEGE, OXFORD by Geoffrey Tyack	125
EXPRESSING LOCAL SPECIFICITY: THE FLEMISH RENAISSANCE REVIVAL IN BELGIUM AND THE ANTWERP CITY ARCHITECT PIETER JAN AUGUSTE DENS by Inge Bertels	149
THE CITY OF THE GREAT SINGER: C. R. ASHBEE'S JERUSALEM by Raquel Rapaport	171
C. H. B. QUENNELL (1872–1935): ARCHITECTURE, HISTORY AND THE QUEST FOR THE MODERN by Elizabeth McKellar	211
CONSTRUCTIVISM AND CONTEXTUALISM IN A MODERN COUNTRY HOUSE: THE DESIGN OF BRACKENFELL (LESLIE MARTIN AND SADIE SPEIGHT, 1937–38) by Louise Campbell	247
PICTURESQUE AND INTRANSIGENT: 'CREATIVE TENSION' AND COLLABORATION IN THE EARLY HOUSE PROJECTS OF STIRLING AND GOWAN by Mark Crinson	267

NOTES TO CONTRIBUTORS

The Editor welcomes contributions on all aspects and periods of the history of architecture. Proposals should in the first instance be e-mailed to her at loachj@cf.ac.uk. Since the journal is a double blind refereed one, when the article is submitted in full two anonymous copies should be sent to Dr Judi Loach, Cardiff University, 49b Park Place, Cardiff, Wales, CF10 3AT. It is recommended that illustrations should be sent in the first instance as photocopies. Notes for contributors are available on the SAHGB website (www.sahgb.org.uk/index.cfm/display_page/AHContributors), or from the Editor on request.

Those sending papers which they wish to be returned are requested to enclose a self-addressed envelope with sufficient stamps to cover return postage or, in the case of overseas contributors, international postage coupons.

ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY ON-LINE

The Society is very pleased to announce that back issues of *Architectural History* are available for consultation on-line to subscribers to JSTOR, a not-for-profit American company. Our journal has joined JSTOR's electronic, digital archive, which already includes many periodicals of relevance to the study of the history of architecture. Ease of access to back issues of specific journals and the ability to word search across different journals that have published work in architectural history greatly facilitates scholarship in our field and has also increased the visibility of the journal and Society alike.

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

PROFESSOR BARRY BERGDOLL trained in art history at Cambridge University and gained his PhD at Columbia University, where he has been a member of the faculty, teaching nineteenth- and twentieth-century architectural history, theory and criticism, since 1986. His research concerns modern architectural history, with a particular emphasis on France and Germany between 1800 and 1945. His books include *Le Vaudoyer: Historicism in the Age of Industry* (Cambridge, Mass., 1994), *Karl Friedrich Schinkel: An Architecture for Prussia* (New York, 1994), *European Architecture 1750–1890* (Oxford, 2000), and *Mies in Berlin* (Berlin, 2001; New York, 2002). In January 2007 he became Philip Johnson Chief Curator of Architecture and Design at the Museum of Modern Art, New York City.

DR NICHOLAS RIALI, BA(Hons), Dip. Archaeol., PhD, was for thirty years an archaeologist working in southern England. A joint research project with Dr Angela Smith on the building works of the bishops of Winchester, including the Renaissance frieze in the chapel of the hospital of St Cross, was published in the *Antiquaries Journal* (2002). This led on to a single-author study of another Renaissance frieze, in Winchester Cathedral, published in *Proc. Hampshire Field Club Archaeol. Soc.* (2003). In 2002 a studentship awarded by Swansea University enabled him to pursue a PhD, with a thesis 'Bringing the Renaissance to Tudor England: The role of Richard Fox and his frieze at St Cross, Winchester', completed in 2005; this in turn has led to further articles on the introduction of the Renaissance into England, in *Renaissance Studies*, *Hampshire Studies*, and *Alton Papers*.

KATHRYN A MORRISON MA(Hons), MA, FSA, studied art history at the University of Edinburgh and at the Courtauld Institute of Art. She is a Senior Investigator with English Heritage, having previously worked with the Royal Commission on the Historical Monuments of England. Her publications include *The Workhouse: A Study of Poor Law Buildings In England* (RCHME, 1999), *English Shops and Shopping: An Architectural History* (Yale University Press/EH, 2003), which was awarded the 2004 Alice Davis Hitchcock medallion, and *Built to Last. The Buildings of the Northamptonshire Boot and Shoe Industry* (EH, 2004), as well as articles on a variety of different building types and periods.

DR JENNIFER S ALEXANDER, BA, PhD, FSA, studied art history at the University of East Anglia and archaeology at Nottingham University, and holds a teaching fellowship in art history at Warwick. She specializes in the study of medieval building construction and has pioneered new methods for computer analysis of the masons' marks in specific buildings to determine the sequence of their construction. Publications in the periodic literature have focused on building materials, and on medieval cathedrals and major churches, particularly those in the East Midlands. More recent work has been on the construction of country houses of the early-modern period.

DR DANIEL MAUDLIN, PhD, FSA Scot, is a Lecturer in Architectural History in the School of Architecture and Design, University of Plymouth. After a first degree in Art History from St Andrews he won a British Academy PhD Scholarship for his doctorate there, on 'Robert Mylne, Thomas Telford and the Architecture of Improvement: Highland Planned Villages of the British Fisheries Society, 1786–1820'. Following a period as Inspector of Historic Buildings, Historic Scotland, working mainly in the Scottish Highlands, he won a Leverhulme Trust Postdoctoral Research Fellowship, and worked in the Department of History, Dalhousie University, Nova Scotia, while also holding an Honorary Research Fellowship in the Art History Department, University of Glasgow.

DR GEOFFREY TYACK, MA, MLitt, PhD, FSA is the Director of the Stanford University Centre in Oxford, and a Fellow of Kellogg College, Oxford University. His publications include *Oxford: An Architectural Guide* (Oxford, 1998) and *Modern Architecture in an Oxford College: St John's College 1945–2005* (Oxford, 2005). He is co-editor, with Malcolm Airs, of *The Renaissance Villa in Britain* (Reading, 2007), and he is currently revising the Berkshire volume in the *Buildings of England* series.

DR INGE BERTELS took her first degree in Modern History at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven (Belgium) and then further pursued her interest in architectural history with Masters degrees in Conservation (R. Lemaire International Centre for Conservation) and in teaching Modern History, both at the same university. She then held an academic research post there while simultaneously undertaking doctoral research, completing a thesis on 'Building the City, Antwerp 1815–1880'. She has also undertaken architectural research for the Antwerp firm of architects R. Steenmeijer & H. Baksteen. She currently holds a post in the Department of History at the University of Antwerp.

DR RAQUEL RAPAPORT studied architecture in Santiago, Chile, and at the Technion, Haifa, Israel. She took her PhD at the Welsh School of Architecture, Cardiff University, with a thesis on architecture in Palestine during the British Mandate period. For the last twenty years she has taught Architectural Design and History of Art and of Modern Architecture, at the WIZO Academy of Design and Education, Haifa, Israel; she is also Associate Lecturer at the History and Theory Unit of Bezalel Academy of Arts and Design, Jerusalem, where she teaches nineteenth- and twentieth-century architecture, including a seminar on Modern Architecture in Palestine during the British Mandate. Her publications include articles on C.R. Ashbee's interior decoration of Government House, Jerusalem, Sir Patrick Geddes' 1926 Tel Aviv Plan, and Martin Buber's texts on architecture.

DR ELIZABETH MCKELLAR, BA, MSc, PhD is Staff Tutor and Lecturer in Art History at the Open University. She specializes in seventeenth and eighteenth-century British architecture. She is the author of *The Birth of Modern London: the development and design of the city 1660–1720* (Manchester, 1999) and, with Barbara Arciszewska, *Articulating British Classicism: New Approaches in Eighteenth-Century Architecture* (Aldershot, 2004). She also has an interest in architectural historiography and the latter volume included an essay by her on 'Populism versus Professionalism: John Summerson and the creation of "the Georgian"'. The current article derives from her research into approaches to the Georgian in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and she also has an article 'Representing the Georgian: Constructing Interiors in Early Twentieth-Century Publications, 1890–1930' in the *Journal of Design History* (autumn 2007).

DR LOUISE CAMPBELL is Reader in the History of Art Department at the University of Warwick. She studied at the University of Sussex and obtained her PhD from the Courtauld Institute. Her publications include *Coventry Cathedral: art and architecture in post-war Britain* (Oxford, 1996), and the millennial volume that she edited for the SAHGB, *Twentieth-century architecture and its histories* (2000). Her current research revolves around two projects, one on artists' habitats in the twentieth century and the other, 'The life and work of Sir Basil Spence, 1907–76: architecture, tradition and modernity', funded by the AHRC.

PROFESSOR MARK CRINSON is Professor of Art History at the University of Manchester. He studied art history at Sussex University, took an MA at the Courtauld Institute, and wrote his PhD at the University of Pennsylvania (on nineteenth-century British architecture in the Middle East and orientalism in Victorian architectural discourse). His books include *Modern Architecture and the End of Empire* (2003), *Empire Building: Victorian Architecture and Orientalism* (1996), and the edited volume *Urban Memory: History and Amnesia in the Modern City* (2005).