

VOLUME 25

NUMBER 2

APRIL 2016



# CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# CQ

**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

## EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat

<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Langone Medical Center, New York*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Denise Dudzinski, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*  
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*  
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Christine Mitchell, *Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*  
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh & West Virginia University*

## SECTION EDITORS

Bioethics and Literature  
Antonio Casada Rocha, *University of the Basque Country, Spain*

Bioethics (Re)Considered  
Raymond DeVries, *University of Michigan*  
Jill Fisher, *University of North Carolina*

Bioethics and Information Technology  
Kenneth W. Goodman, *University of Miami*

By Invitation  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*

The Great Debates  
D. Michah Hester, *University of Arkansas*  
Alissa H. Swota, *University of North Florida*

CQ Review  
Greg Loeben, A.T. *Still University-School of Health Management*

Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work  
Ruchika Mishra, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*

The Caduceus in Court  
Jennifer Chandler, *University of Ottawa, Canada*  
Ben A. Rich, *University of California, Davis*

Health and Human Rights  
Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancashire, England*

Dissecting Politics  
Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

Professionalism  
David Barnard, *Oregon Health and Science University*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh and West Virginia University*

Pediatric Ethics  
Kellie R. Lang, *Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Douglas J. Opel, *Seattle Children's Hospital*

## The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.  
[journals.cambridge.org/bioethics](http://journals.cambridge.org/bioethics)

## Clinical Neuroethics ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR  
Thomasine Kushner  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
[kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com)

ASSOCIATE EDITOR  
James Giordano  
*Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD  
Yves Agid  
*Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Épineière, France*

Jennifer Chandler  
*University of Ottawa, Canada*

Markus Christen  
*University of Zurich, Switzerland*

Joseph J. Fins  
*Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*

Paul J. Ford  
*Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*

Grant Gillett  
*University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*

John Harris  
*University of Manchester, England*

Judy Illes  
*The University of British Columbia, Canada*

Philipp Kellmeyer  
*University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*

Catherine Madison  
*California Medical Center, San Francisco*

Christine Mitchell  
*Harvard Medical School*

Erik Parens  
*The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*

John R. Shook  
*University at Buffalo*

Alan Yee  
*California Pacific Medical Center*

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 25, Number 2, April 2016

## CONTENTS

Contributors 163

### *The Road Less Traveled*

Murder, Sex, Neonates, and Other Forays into Bioethics  
JOHN J. PARIS 166

### *Special Section: Responsibility, Vulnerability, Dignity, and Humanity*

Guest Editorial: How to Be Human? Some Answers and  
New Questions  
MATTI HÄYRY AND TUIJA TAKALA 171

Humanity and Social Responsibility, Solidarity, and  
Social Rights  
JOHANNA AHOLA-LAUNONEN 176

Issues on Luck Egalitarianism, Responsibility,  
and Intercultural Healthcare Policies  
ADALBERTO DE HOYOS 186

Vulnerability: A Key Principle for Global Bioethics?  
THIAGO CUNHA AND VOLNEI GARRAFA 197

The Person in a State of Sickness: The Doctor-Patient  
Relationship Reconsidered  
VILHJÁLMUR ÁRNASON AND STEFÁN HJÖRLEIFSSON 209

Turning the Tables: The Vulnerability of Nurses  
Treating Anorexia Nervosa Patients  
KAREN WRIGHT AND DORIS SCHROEDER 219

Undignified Arguments: A Critique  
SØREN HOLM 228

Natural Good Theories and the Value of Human Dignity  
SEBASTIAN MUDERS 239

Artificial Intelligence: The Shylock Syndrome  
DAVID R. LAWRENCE, CÉSAR PALACIOS-GONZÁLEZ,  
AND JOHN HARRIS 250

Discursive Humanity as a Transcendental Basis for  
Cognitive (Dis)Ability Ethics and Policies  
MATTI HÄYRY 262

*Contents continued*

*Contents continued*

***Departments and Columns***

*Neuroethics Now*

Organ Transplantation for Individuals with  
Neurodevelopmental Disorders: Sandra Jensen's Legacy  
KIM J. OVERBY AND JOSEPH J. FINS 272

*Perspectives*

Bright New World  
OLE MARTIN MOEN 282

*Professionalism*

Vulnerability and Trustworthiness: Polestars of  
Professionalism in Healthcare  
DAVID BARNARD 288

*Bioethics Education*

Using a Scoring Rubric to Assess the Writing of  
Bioethics Students  
HUGH A. STODDARD, CORY A. LABRECQUE,  
AND TOBY SCHONFELD 301

*Bioethics and Information Technology*

How Should Health Data Be Used? Privacy, Secondary  
Use, and Big Data Sales  
BONNIE KAPLAN 312

*Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work*

The Case: A Clash between Culture and Care  
RUCHIKA MISHRA 330

Commentary: The Reluctant Surrogate  
THOMAS FOREMAN 330

Commentary: Looking beyond Treatment Refusal  
SHILPA SHASHIDHARA 333

Commentary: Cultural Issues in Decisionmaking  
RUAIM MUAYGIL 336

What Actually Happened 338

***Best Practices Guidelines for Publishing in the Bioethics Literature***