
*History
of Education
Quarterly*

Summer 1987

V o l u m e
2 7
N u m b e r
2

History of Education Society

The History of Education Society is an international scholarly society. Its purposes are to encourage and facilitate research in the history of education; to promote and improve the teaching of history of education; to encourage cooperation among specialists in history of education; and to promote an appreciation of the value of historical perspective in the making of educational policy. The Society is affiliated with the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, and members of the Society are automatically members of the Standing Conference.

Officers (1987)

<i>President</i>	JOHN HARDIN BEST, <i>The Pennsylvania State University</i>
<i>Vice-President</i>	ELLEN CONDLIFFE LAGEMANN, <i>Teachers College, Columbia University</i>
<i>Secretary-Treasurer</i>	DAVID M. MENT, <i>Teachers College, Columbia University</i>
<i>Directors</i>	JOAN N. BURSTYN, <i>Past President, 1986, Syracuse University</i> NATALIE A. NAYLOR, <i>Hofstra University, 1984–1987</i> RONALD D. COHEN, <i>Indiana University–Northwest, 1985–1988</i> MARIS A. VINOVSIS, <i>University of Michigan, 1986–1989</i>

THE HISTORY OF EDUCATION SOCIETY AWARD: This award of \$250 will be made biennially to the best essay in the history of education published in any journal over the previous two years. The next award will be presented at the fall 1988 meeting of the History of Education Society. Any article published in 1986 or 1987 will be eligible for the award.

THE HENRY BARNARD PRIZE: This prize of \$250 is awarded biennially to the best essay in the history of education by a graduate student. The next award will be presented at the fall 1987 meeting of the History of Education Society. The recipient will receive an invitation from the Society to deliver the prize essay at its 1987 meeting and will have the essay published in the *History of Education Quarterly*.

The Society reserves the right not to make awards in years when the Prize Committee judges all entries to be of insufficient quality.

Inquiries regarding these awards should be directed to the chairperson of the Prize Committee: Jennings L. Wagoner, Jr., Curry School of Education, University of Virginia, 405 Emmet St., Charlottesville, VA 22903.

OUTSTANDING BOOK AWARD: This award of \$250 will be made biennially to the author of the best book published in the two previous years. The committee will accept nominations but will also make every effort to review all relevant works, whether or not they have been nominated. The first award, from books bearing 1985 and 1986 publication dates, will be announced at the annual meeting of the Society in 1987.

Inquiries regarding the Outstanding Book Award should be directed to the chairperson of the committee: Wayne J. Urban, Department of Educational Foundations, Georgia State University, University Plaza, Atlanta, GA 30303.

History of Education Quarterly

Editorial Staff

<i>Editor</i>	B. EDWARD McCLELLAN, <i>Indiana University</i>
<i>Associate Editor</i>	WILLIAM J. REESE, <i>Indiana University</i>
<i>Managing Editor</i>	AMY C. SCHUTT
<i>Subscriptions Manager</i>	DIANA L. BUSH
<i>Editorial Assistant</i>	JAYNE R. BEILKE

Editorial Board

- DAVID W. ADAMS, *Cleveland State University*
EDWARD R. BEAUCHAMP, *University of Hawaii*
ROBERT L. CHURCH, *Northwestern University*
LINDA L. CLARK, *Millersville University of Pennsylvania*
RONALD D. COHEN, *Indiana University–Northwest*
IAN E. DAVEY, *University of Adelaide*
LYNN D. GORDON, *University of Rochester*
PATRICK J. HARRIGAN, *University of Waterloo*
JURGEN HERBST, *University of Wisconsin–Madison*
KONRAD H. JARAUSCH, *University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill*
JOHN L. RURY, *The Ohio State University*
MICHAEL W. SEDLAK, *Michigan State University*
MAXINE SCHWARTZ SELLER, *State University of New York at Buffalo*
HAROLD SILVER, *Oxford, England*
JULIA WRIGLEY, *University of California at Los Angeles*

The *History of Education Quarterly* (ISSN US 00 182680) is published spring, summer, fall, and winter by the History of Education Society in cooperation with the School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Membership in the Society, which includes subscription to the *Quarterly*, is available at the following rates: students, \$15; others, \$25 (non-U.S. members add \$2 to cover additional postage, surface mail; add \$16 for overseas airmail). Institutional subscription rates are: \$47, U.S.; \$50, non-U.S. All payment must be made in U.S. dollars. Single copies of some back issues available at \$8. Second-class postage paid at Bloomington, Ind., and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405.

History of Education Quarterly Vol. 27 No. 2 Summer 1987

Copyright 1987 by the History of Education Society.

History of Education Society

INDIVIDUAL MEMBERSHIP: Membership is open to all persons interested in the study of the history of education. Membership provides for subscription to the *History of Education Quarterly*; subscription to *Network*, a newsletter published jointly with Division F of the American Educational Research Association; and receipt of the program of the annual meeting of the Society. Membership offers subscription to publications on a calendar-year basis only. Dues are \$15 for students, \$25 for others. Non-U.S. members should add \$2 to cover additional postage for surface mail; \$16 for airmail. The portion of dues designated for support of the *Quarterly* are \$15 of student dues, \$20 of other individual dues. To become a member, send a check for the appropriate amount in U.S. dollars only to the *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Make checks payable to History of Education Society. Indicate preferred mailing address and the calendar year in which your subscription should begin.

History of Education Quarterly

INSTITUTIONAL SUBSCRIPTIONS: Institutions may subscribe to the *History of Education Quarterly* directly (send checks to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405) or through subscription agencies. Rates are \$47, U.S.; \$50, non-U.S., U.S. dollars only.

BACK ISSUES: Some back issues are available (cost \$8 per issue).

INDEXES: Two indexes are available: Index to Vols. I-X (1961-1970), by Murray S. Shereshevsky (\$5) and Index to Vols. XI-XX (1971-1980), by Paul Mattingly and Marilyn Tobias (\$7). A set of both indexes may be purchased for \$10.

ARTICLE SUBMISSIONS: Contributions should be addressed to: Editor, *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Manuscripts should be prepared according to style A of *The Chicago Manual of Style* (13th ed.), double spaced, and submitted in duplicate. Notes should be double spaced and placed at the end of the article. Although longer articles will be considered, the editors prefer manuscripts of twenty-five pages or less, exclusive of notes. Authors are encouraged to include photographs and illustrations. When articles are accepted, authors will be asked to supply camera-ready copy for all charts and illustrations.

BOOK REVIEWS: Assignments of reviews are made from a file of potential reviewers by the associate editor. To have your name added to the file, send vita to William J. Reese, associate editor. Requests to review particular books cannot be honored.

The *History of Education Quarterly* is printed by Indiana University Printing Services. Design by Dennis H. Hill, Indiana University Publications.

History of Education Quarterly

Volume 27 • Number 2 • Summer 1987

Contents

Articles

- 167 History as Image: Changing the Lens
by Joan N. Burstyn
- 181 Southern Education in Transition: William Waugh
Smith, the Carnegie Foundation, and the Methodist
Church
by Robert A. Hohner
- 205 The Politics of Knowledge: The Carnegie Corporation
and the Formulation of Public Policy
by Ellen Condliffe Lagemann
- 221 Empowering Practitioners: Holmes, Carnegie, and the
Lessons of History
by William R. Johnson
-

Forum

- 241 The Origins of Public High Schools
*by Michael B. Katz, Edward Stevens, and Maris A.
Vinovskis*
-

Retrospective

- 259 Arthur Bestor's *Educational Wastelands*
by Theodore R.Sizer and Molly Schen
-

Book Reviews

- 265 Cleverley, *The Schooling of China*
by Charles Burgess
- 267 Farrell, *The National Unified School in Allende's Chile*
by Robert F. Arnove
- 270 Gallin, *Midwives to Nazism*
by Charles E. McClelland
- 272 Bailyn, Fleming, Handlin, and Thernstrom, *Glimpses of
the Harvard Past*
by Laurence Veysey
- 275 Levine, *The American College and the Culture of
Aspiration*
by Burton J. Bledstein
- 278 Webster, *Academic Quality Rankings of American
Colleges and Universities*
by Roger L. Geiger
- 281 Sernett, *Abolition's Axe*
by Linda M. Perkins
- 282 Hogan, *Class and Reform*
by William A. Link
- 286 Reese, *Power and the Promise of School Reform*
by Marvin Lazerson
- 289 Kornbluh and Frederickson, *Sisterhood and Solidarity*
by Richard J. Altenbaugh
- 292 Selden, *The Teacher Rebellion*
by Polly Welts Kaufman

295 **Book Notes**

THE PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS 1986



Joan N. Burstyn
President, History of Education Society
1986